

THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW

No. 48—October, 1901.

I.

ENGLISH THEISTIC THOUGHT AT THE CLOSE OF THE NINETEENTH CENTURY.

IN the ninth edition of the *Encyclopædia Britannica* Prof. Flint expresses the opinion in his article on "Theism" that far more labor had been expended on the theistic proofs during the twenty years immediately preceding (1865–1885) than during the entire previous part of the century. No one will question the truth of this assertion, nor, we suppose, of the one we venture to add—that theism has received far more attention since that statement was published than it did during the two decades referred to.

Several reasons may be assigned for this revival of interest in theistic questions. Philosophy, which has so often recognized a community of interest with theism in fundamental problems, seems disposed to-day to acknowledge this more than ever, and to admit to the area of discussion on equal terms with other proposed solutions the theistic theory of the universe with its bearing on such ultimate questions as those of epistemology, metaphysics, ethics, and æsthetics. So that Principal Fairbairn may say with little fear of contradiction that "Theism may with equal truth be described as either the last chapter of a philosophy or the first of a theology. Its methods, principles, formulæ, arguments are all philosophical; the systems it criticises are the philosophies; the authorities it invokes are philosophers."* It is but a step in the same direction when the Philosophy of Religion with its discussion as to the truth of theism is made by some writers—*e.g.*, Ladd, Külpe and Wundt†—a branch of philosophy, and coördinated

* *The Place of Christ in Modern Theology*, p. 402.

† Ladd, *Introduction to Philosophy*, p. 176; Külpe, *Introduction to Philosophy*, Eng. trans., pp. 20, 90–95; Wundt, *System der Philosophie*, S. 35, 642–654.

IV.

THE PRINTING OF THE WESTMINSTER CONFESSION.

I. IN BRITAIN.

THE history of the printing of the Confession of Faith presents some rather curious features. It was no less than four times privately printed—once in part and thrice in whole—before it was published. It was first published not in England where it had been made, but in Scotland. It probably had been published in no less than three editions, before its publication was authorized by the legislative body by the direction of which it was drawn up, and to which it was presented only as “humble advice.” It has always continued to be published—with the single exception of the normative edition issued by Parliament (June, 1648)—not in the form authorized by that body, but in the form in which it was set forth prior to that authorization. Though its use has extended to the very ends of the British empire, its publication for that empire up to to-day continues very much a Scotch monopoly. Only a single edition* has been issued in England since the early years of the eighteenth century (1717).† It has never been printed in Ireland. It has never been printed in the Dominion of Canada. No Welsh translation of it has ever been made. Some vernacular versions of it have, to be sure, been issued in India—which are, however, with one exception (made by missionaries of the Irish Presbyterian Church), the work of American missionaries. With the exception of these, throughout all the colonies and dependencies of Great Britain, it is only in Victoria and New Zealand‡ that the Confession of Faith has even up to to-day been put into print. As the

* The pamphlet edition is referred to, published by Mr. Wm. Carruthers recently, through the Publishing Office of the Presbyterian Church of England. See below, No. 137.

† Such editions as those of “Edinburgh, Robert Seton; and Whittaker & Co., London, 1855;” “Glasgow and London, 1859;” “London, Edinburgh and New York, T. Nelson & Sons, 1859 and 1860,” are scarcely exceptions to this statement. Neither are the editions of Shaw’s *Exposition*, “Blackie & Son, London and Glasgow, 1877;” and Hodge’s *Commentary*, “London: T. Nelson & Sons, Edinburgh and New York. 1870.”

‡ See below, Nos. 132, 133, 135.

vigorous bodies of Presbyterians planted in these several lands all trace their origin back to Scotland, so they still draw the needed supply of their symbolical books from the printing presses of Scotland.

The manner in which the Confession of Faith first got into print deserves a full description. Its first issues were private editions, printed strictly for the use of the bodies concerned with its formulation or authorization. The earliest of them contained only its first nineteen chapters. These were sent up to the House of Commons, September 25, 1646, in response to an order issued September 16, and received by the Assembly of Divines September 18. They were read in the House on Friday, October 9, and ordered to be printed, after the Divines should have "put in the margin the proofs out of the Scripture to confirm what they have offered to the House in such places as they shall think it most necessary." This order was brought to the Assembly by Mr. Tate on October 12, and a Committee was appointed "to consider of this order, how obedience may be yielded thereto." On the next day the Committee reported, deprecating the requirement of the addition of proof-texts before printing. This was made known forthwith to the House of Commons, whereupon it was "*Resolved*, etc., That five hundred copies of the Confession of Faith be forthwith printed for the service of the Houses, without annexing of the texts of Scripture for the present: Yet notwithstanding the House does expect that the Divines should send in the texts of Scripture with all convenient speed." This reply was brought by Mr. Marshall to the Assembly on October 14, and it was forthwith "*Ordered*—That the scribes do take care of the exact printing of the Confession of Faith." Accordingly the first nineteen chapters of the Confession were at once put to press and appeared duly in a small quarto volume under the title, *The humble advice of the Assembly of Divines, Now by Authority of Parliament sitting at Westminster, Concerning a part of a Confession of Faith, Presented by them lately to both Houses of Parliament.*

Meanwhile the Divines continued their labors on the remaining chapters, and by November 26 were able to record in their minutes, "The Confession of Faith was finished this day," and to resolve that "the whole Confession of Faith shall be transcribed and read in the Assembly and sent up to both Houses of Parliament." By December 4 this final reading and adjustment of the text was completed, and on that day it was sent up to the Commons, and on December 7 to the Lords. On December 10 an order was brought from the House of Commons directing that 600 copies of it, and no more, be printed for the service of the two

Houses and the Assembly, and that the care of the printing be devolved on the Assembly. It was accordingly ordered, as in the earlier instance concerning the first nineteen chapters, "that the Scribes take care of the exact printing of the Confession of Faith." The work was prosecuted so rapidly that Baillie could write on December 24, 1646, "All is now printed," and was able to carry up the printed book with him to Scotland, and to present it to the Commission of the General Assembly at their January meeting (January 21). It is a small quarto volume bearing the title, *The Humble Advice of the Assembly of Divines, Now by Authority of Parliament sitting at Westminster, Concerning a Confession of Faith, Presented by them lately to both Houses of Parliament.*

The work of preparing proof-texts in pursuance of the order of the House of Commons was fairly set on foot on January 6, 1647, and on April 5 following the entry was made again in the minutes, "The Confession was finished," *i. e.*, in Committee. It was not until the 26th, however, that the proof-texts could be ordered to be sent to the Houses; they were presented to them on April 29. On the same day the Commons ordered, "That six hundred copies, and no more, of the Advice of the Assembly of Divines concerning the Confession of Faith, with the quotations and texts of Scripture annexed, presented to this House, and likewise six hundred copies of the proceedings of the Assembly of Divines upon the Nine-and-Thirty Articles of the Church of England, be forthwith printed for the service of both Houses and of the Assembly of Divines; and the printer is enjoined at his peril not to print more than six hundred copies of each, or to divulge or publish any of them. It is further *Ordered*—That no person presume to reprint, divulge or publish the said Advice or proceedings, or any part of them, till further order be taken by both or either of the Houses of Parliament." This order was on the same day (April 29, 1647) reported to the Assembly of Divines, and it would appear that the work was carried through, in obedience to it, "with all speed as may be." The resultant volume was a small quarto similar to the former issues, and bearing the title, *The humble Advice of the Assembly of Divines, Now by Authority of Parliament sitting at Westminster, Concerning a Confession of Faith, with the Quotations and Texts of Scripture annexed, Presented by them lately to both Houses of Parliament.*

As we have already seen, the second of these issues—the complete Confession without proof-texts—was carried up to Scotland by Baillie, who left London probably in the last week of December, 1646 (before the 2d of January, 1647); and was pre-

sented to the General Assembly's Commission at their January meeting (January 21). The third issue—the complete Confession with proofs—had found its way to Scotland before the meeting of the General Assembly, which convened on August 4, 1647. Probably it was brought up by Gillespie, who took his leave of the Westminster Assembly on July 16. At the third session of this General Assembly a Committee was appointed “for examining the Confession of Faith, Rouse's Paraphrase, Catechisms, etc., to receive any scruples and objections and to report;” and an invitation was given at the fourth session to “all that had objections against anything in the Confession to repair to the Committee;” while at the fifth session (August 9) there was passed an “Act for Printing 300 Copies of the Advice of the Assembly of Divines in England, concerning a Confession of Faith, for the use of the Members of the Assembly.” This volume, also a small quarto, was accordingly printed by the King's printer, Evan Tyler, with the same title as before—*The Humble Advice of the Assembly of Divines . . . concerning a Confession of Faith*, etc.—and bearing the order of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland providing for the printing of “three hundred copies and no more.” It must have appeared during the sessions of the General Assembly, at the twenty-third session of which, August 27, 1647, an act of approbation of the Confession was passed.

So far the Confession had issued from the press only as a privately printed and, presumably, carefully guarded pamphlet. By the Act of the General Assembly of August 27, however, it had become the public Confession of Faith of the Church of Scotland. It was naturally, therefore, at once published. The first published edition was equally naturally a reprint of the copy printed for the use of the Scottish Assembly. It also bears the imprint of Evan Tyler, at Edinburgh, 1647; and like its privately printed predecessor it is a small quarto of fifty-six pages. Meanwhile matters dragged in the English Parliament, which had busied itself with a review of the text of the Confession that had resulted in some slight changes dictated by the growing Independent influence; and it was not until the 20th of June, 1648, that it was “Ordered—That the *Articles of Christian Religion*” (the Parliament's new name for the document) . . . “be forthwith printed and published;” while on the next day it was “Resolved, That the texts of Scripture be printed with the *Articles of Faith*.” Not till midsummer of 1648, therefore (June 27 at the earliest), was the Confession, under this new title and with certain alterations of text, consisting chiefly in the omission

of chapters xxx and xxxi and parts of chapters xx and xxiv, with some less important changes in chapter xxiii, published by the authority of Parliament. It is far from unlikely that there had already appeared in the interval not only a Scotch edition, bearing the imprint of "Edinburgh, 1648," but without the name of printer or publisher, which is notable as the first edition which contains in a single volume the Confession and the Catechisms; but also a London edition of the Confession by itself, printed in 1648 for Robert Bostock, under the old title of *The Humble Advice of the Assembly of Divines*, etc. It is certain, in any case, that this Parliamentary edition came into the world as an untimely birth, and that all subsequent editions derive from the Scotch edition of Evan Tyler as their *editio princeps*, and not from the authorized Parliamentary *Articles of Christian Religion*. Already in 1649 even the earlier title, *The Humble Advice to both Houses of Parliament*, had given way to the simpler *The Confession of Faith . . . agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster*, to which is added in the Scotch editions (and by 1652 in the English also), "And now appointed by the General Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland to be a part of Uniformity in Religion between the Kirks of Christ in the three Kingdoms."*

The book thus put into the hands of the public proved a very popular one, and became at once the object of a great demand. Before the end of the seventeenth century, at least as many as forty separate editions had been printed, seventeen of which were English and twenty-three Scotch; and, besides, translations had been made into both German (1648) and Latin (1656), and of the Latin version at least nine editions had been issued. By the time its first century was completed these forty editions had been at least doubled, and there had been added to the extant versions an Irish (Gaelic) translation (1725), which had already attained its second edition (1727), and was almost ready for its third (1756). The large popular call for the book, attested by the rapidity with which edition thus followed edition, is further illustrated by what may be called the evolution of the volume in which it was contained. This was such as to adapt it more and more to popular use and fit it ever more fully to meet purely popular needs.

* Principal Lee remarks on the incongruity of this statement persisting in the title of the Confession after the hope of the institution of such uniformity had long since passed away. (*Additional Memorial*, &c., p. 134,* where also other anomalies of this kind are recited.) The better form, "Of public authority in the Church of Scotland," seems to have been introduced first in Dunlop's *Collection*, 1719, and in the normative edition of Lumisden & Robertson, 1728. The *Collection* of Lumisden & Robertson, 1725, however, retained the old form, which naturally persists therefore in its reprints as well as in some other copies at least as late as 1745. (See below, Nos. 57, 58, 62, 63, 66, 90, 96, 97, 102.)

As at first published the volume contained nothing but the bare text of the Confession of Faith, accompanied by supporting references to the Scriptures. Thus the reader was "remitted to the Bible" for even the matter of the proofs: which, as Dunlop truly says in the Advertisement to his critical edition,* was "troublesome to him and in so far equivalent to the not printing the Scriptures at all." It was inevitable, therefore, that in the better adaptation of the book to popular use these references should be expanded into the adduction at large of the proof-passages themselves. It is rather odd that this was first done in a translation—in that early German version (1648) whose authors speak feelingly of the Confession as "a tractate rich in all particulars of the divine wisdom and teaching, drawn almost word for word from the Holy Scriptures," and as "a brief compend of the wholesome Word," out of which "shines brightly and clearly the light of the truth, for the comforting and strengthening of believing hearts." It was not till ten years later (in the Rothwell editions of 1658) that the same extension was made in English, "for the benefit," it is quaintly said, "of masters of families:" on the same occasion, for the further lessening the labor of using these texts, an attempt was made to point their lessons by emphasizing what was thought to be the salient words in them. By whom this expansion of the texts was done is not known: but the texts as thus first extended held the ground up to 1719, when for the first time they were subjected to critical scrutiny and reduced to more precise and scholarly shape by William Dunlop for his notable *Collection*—the earliest attempt (and it may almost be said the last as yet) to produce a scientific as distinguished from a popular edition of the Confession of Faith.

Meanwhile the volume was attracting to itself similar documents, and was ever growing in compass. Two principles of development early exhibited themselves. The one (and the weaker) tended toward making out of it a more complete ecclesiastical manual. The other (and more powerful) tended to make of it an ever more richly furnished popular book of religion. The two Catechisms were early added, as documents too closely similar to the Confession to be kept apart from it. The first edition containing them appeared at Edinburgh in 1648, and by 1649 they may be said to have already established themselves as its inseparable companions. Already in 1649 there was added to these three documents the Divines' "Humble Advice concerning Church Government and Ordination of Ministers" (Bostock's second edition [1649]; see also the London editions of 1650, 1651 and again

* Edinburgh: James Wat-on, 1719, p. clx.

1658). But the force of the stream was setting in the other direction: in 1650 "The Sum of Saving Knowledge" first appears in the volume (Edinburgh: Gideon Lithgow), and at the same time the Directory for Family Worship and the Solemn League and Covenant (the same, alternative copies; cf. London and Edinburgh editions of 1652). After a while the two streams united, and, after the fashion of popular books, the effort of publishers seemed to be to supply as comprehensive a collection as possible. Examples of these developed editions may be found in the Dutch-printed edition of 1679, and the so-called "fifth" London edition of 1717—the latter of which characteristically boasts on the title-page that it contains "all the additions that have hitherto been printed."* The former of these two issues already contains, besides the Confession and Catechisms, the Sum of Saving Knowledge, the National and Solemn Covenants, the Acknowledgment of Sins, the Directory for Public Worship, Propositions concerning Church Government, and the Directions for Private Worship. The latter contains, in addition to these, the Ordinance for calling the Assembly of Divines together, the vow taken by its members, the Advice on the ordination of ministers, and certain brief notes, including the Parliamentary order for the re-establishment of Presbytery in England, etc. In 1728 this evolution completed itself in an edition printed at Edinburgh by Thomas Lumisden and John Robertson, which is the first to contain the precise series of documents which have since become the invariable contents of the standard Scottish editions of "The Confession of Faith."

The regular contents of the Scottish editions, thus attained, embraces the following documents:—1. Preliminary matter, consisting of two introductory letters and a number of Ordinances and Acts. The introductory letters are (*a*) the commendatory letter "to the Christian Reader, especially Heads of Families," signed by forty-four Puritan Divines, and (*b*) "Mr. Thomas Manton's Epistle to the Reader." The Ordinances and Acts include: (*a*) The Ordinance of the Lords and Commons, July 12, 1643, convening the Westminster Assembly; (*b*) the Act of the Scottish Assembly, August 19, 1643, appointing Commissioners to the Westminster Assembly; (*c*) the Promise and Vow taken by the Members of the Westminster Assembly; (*d*) a List of the Divines who met at that Assembly, and of the Commissioners of the Church of Scotland; (*e*) the Act of the Scottish Assembly, Aug. 27, 1647, approving the Confession of Faith; (*f*) the Acts of Parliament Feb. 7, 1649, and 7th June, 1690, ratifying the Standards. 2. The Text of the Confession and Catechisms. 3. Adjoined matter, viz.: (*a*) The Sum of Saving Knowledge,

*As does also the so-called "fourth" edition, Edinburgh, 1708,

with the Practical Use thereof; (b) the National Covenant; (c) the Solemn League and Covenant; (d) the Acknowledgment and Engagement; (e) the Directory for Public Worship; (f) the Form of Presbyterial Church Government; (g) the Directory for Family Worship. Lastly, 4. The "Table." That the main contents of the volume—the Confession and Catechisms—may not be lost amid the accretions gathered about them, it is usual to put them into larger type than that used for the preliminary and adjoined matter, although the opening Commendatory Letter and the Form of Government are also ordinarily accorded the honor of this larger type.

Since the publication of the edition of 1728 little has been done for the Confession of Faith on British ground. The critical work of Dunlop in 1719 had prepared the definitive text and the final form of the proof-texts and even of the "Table"—*i. e.*, so to speak, had done the textual work. The edition of 1728 set finally, so to say, the canon of the collection. The British Churches holding to this Confession have ever since been content to do no more than repeat without intentional change the results thus registered for them. A single set of stereotyped plates—not quite of a sort to leave nothing to be desired on the score of either beauty or accuracy*—now supplies the whole world of British Presbyterianism with its *Confessions of Faith*. The only exception to this that needs be recognized probably is the carefully edited reprint of the text of the edition of May, 1647, along with the variations of the Parliamentary edition of 1648, which Mr. William Carruthers has issued in a small pamphlet through the press of the Presbyterian Church of England. Even the edition published at Melbourne for the Presbyterians of Victoria—almost a unique attempt among the British Colonial Churches to supply their own demand†—proves to be from the same plates. The same languidness has taken the place also of the early zeal to provide versions of the Confessions for peoples of other tongues. The Scottish missionaries seem not to have been accustomed to give the Confession to their converts in their several languages. Even in the British dependencies they have left this to others. As far as we are informed only a single missionary translation of the Confession has been prepared in our day by British hands—the Gujarati version made by the missionaries of the Irish Presbyterian Church. Scotch Presbyterians seem to have come to look upon their Confession much as they do on the

* Samples of errors in current editions are given by Mr. Carruthers in the edition recorded at No. 137. They all occur in this stereotyped text, though some of them are not in Dunlop, *e.g.*, those in ix. 1; xxii. 7. Add the error in Larger Catechism, 105: "Trusting in *unlawful* means."

† No other Colonial edition is known to us except one published in New Zealand.

sun and the rain—as a Divine blessing with which they have nothing to do but to receive and enjoy it, not without “some murmurings and disputings.”

There have come under our notice something less than one hundred and fifty British editions of the Confession of Faith. The time through which our search has been protracted has been too limited and the circumstances under which it has been carried on too unfavorable for us to venture to hope that we have met with more than, say, about half the whole number. We print the list therefore merely as

NOTES TOWARD A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE WESTMINSTER CONFESSION.*

I. BRITISH EDITIONS.

- [1. Oct., 1646] The humble | advice | of the | Assembly | of Divines, | Now by Authority of PARLIAMENT, | sitting at Westminster, | Concerning part of a *Confession of Faith*, | Presented by them lately to both | Houses of PARLIAMENT. || A certain number of Copies are Ordered to | be

* It would be impossible to mention all those to whom we have been indebted for assistance in this undertaking. Among printed books we have been particularly aided by Principal ROBERT LEE'S notes in his *Memorial for the Bible Societies in Scotland*, Edinburgh, 1824, with its supplement, *Additional Memorial, &c.*, 1826, to the latter of which is commonly attached an eight-page pamphlet, *Editions of Books of Public Authority in the Church of Scotland, not printed by Scottish Patentees*, reprinted in 1839; by the entries in Mr. WM. CARRUTHERS' Bibliography of the Shorter Catechism, published in his *The Shorter Catechism of the Westminster Divines, with Historical Account and Bibliography*, London, 1897; by Prof. ALEXANDER MITCHELL'S Baird Lectures for 1882 on *The Westminster Assembly, Its History and Standards*, 2d edition, Philadelphia, 1897, which contains an Appendix on *Early Editions of the Confession of Faith*; and by the recently published part of the British Museum Catalogue, embracing the printed books relating to “England—the Assembly of Divines” (London, 1900). From these we have drawn with the utmost freedom. We have also been kindly given access to three important collections of Confessions of Faith: one in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society at Philadelphia, one in the care of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, Secretary of the Presbyterian Board of Publication, Philadelphia, and one in the possession of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia. Nothing could exceed the patience and kindness that have been shown us by Drs. Craven and McCook. Similar kindness has been shown us also by other gentlemen, too numerous to name here, but to whom we wish to return thanks. Among them we must not omit to mention, however, Mr. Wilberforce Eames, librarian of the Lenox Collection, New York; the Rev. Dr. Charles R. Gillett, librarian of Union Theological Seminary, New York; the Rev. Jesse Lee Cotton, formerly librarian of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny; the Rev. Dr. Samuel T. Lowrie of Philadelphia; and the Rev. Dr. Dunlop Moore, of Pittsburgh. The notes to the several editions will, here and there, indicate others to whom we are particularly indebted.

Printed for the use of the Members | of both Houses onely,
to the end that they | may advise thereupon. || London, |
Printed for the Company of STATIONERS.*

Small 4to, the block of type measuring $6\frac{1}{2} \times 3\frac{3}{4}$ inches: pp. 32 numbered, the title-page (blank on back) not being included in the numbering. Facing the title the following authorization is printed: "*Die Veneris 23. Octobr. 1646.* Ordered, by the Commons Assembled in PARLIAMENT that five hundred and no more, of the *Advicc of the Assembly of Divines presented to this House, concerning part of a Confession of Faith*, be forthwith Printed, and that the care of the printing thereof be referred to the Assembly of Divines. And the Printer is enjoined (at his Perill) not to Print more than five hundred of them. It is further Ordered that no man presume to Reprint, Divulge, or Publish the said *Advicc*, or any part of it, till further order be taken herein by both or either of the Houses of Parliament. *H. Elsynge, Cler. Parl. Dom. Com.*"

For an account of this edition, see ALEXANDER F. MITCHELL, *The Westminster Assembly, its History and Standards*, 2d Ed., Philadelphia, 1897, pp. 375, 378, 526; WILLIAM A. SHAW, *A History of the English Church during the Civil Wars and under the Commonwealth*, etc., London, 1900, I, p. 361. Cf. SCHAFF, *Creeeds of Christendom*, New York, 1878, I, 757. Dr. Mitchell (p. 526) speaks of a copy in the British Museum, presumably "E. 336 (?)": but no copy is listed in the recently published part of the British Museum Catalogue of Printed Books relating to *England—Assembly of Divines* (London, 1900). There is a copy in the Ridgeway Branch of the Library Company of Philadelphia, bound with thirty-one other documents printed in 1645-7 (No. 925, U, p. 6): it is document No. 19 in the volume, No. 31 being *The Humble Advice, etc., Concerning a Confession of Faith, with the Quotations and Texts of Scripture annexed*, of 1647.

The chief facts leading up to the issue of this edition are the following. Under pressure of an order from the House of Commons, received September 18, 1646, requiring "the Divines of the Assembly to send in to this House, the Confession of Faith, or so much thereof as they have perfected" (*Minutes*, pp. 285-6), the first nineteen chapters were rapidly completed, a title provided for them (*Minutes*, pp. 286, 290), and a transcript of them sent to the House on September 25, and to the Lords on October 1. On October 9 this document was read in the House, and it was ordered to be printed, "and that the Divines be desired to put in the margin the proofs out of the Scripture to confirm what they have offered to the House in such places as they shall think it most necessary" (*Minutes*, p. 294). This order was conveyed to the Divines on October 12, but they raised difficulties as to the insertion of the proofs from Scripture, "w^{ch} is lyke to be a work of great length." Accordingly they represented, "If it be the pleasure of this honourable House that we should annex Scriptures, it is not possible that we should forthwith proceed to the printing of the Confession" (see the text of this petition in Mitchell's *Baird Lectures*, pp. 377-8). The House thereupon resolved: "That five hundred copies of the Confession of Faith be forthwith printed for the service of the

* For "The Stationers' Company" or "The Company of Stationers," and all matters concerning the registration of books at Stationers' Hall, and the exercise of censorship over books (by the Star Chamber from 1637 to 1640: then by Parliament, which ordered anew in 1644 that "no Book, Pamphlet or Paper shall be henceforth printed unless the same be first approved and licensed by such as shall be thereto appointed": ceased in 1693), see *Ency. Brit.*, IV, 39; *Chambers' Ency.*, sub. voc. "Press"; and for the history, PUTNAM, *Books and Their Makers in the Middle Ages*, as per Index, especially I, 219; II, 464, sq.

Houses, without annexing the texts of Scripture for the present : Yet notwithstanding, the House does expect that the Divines should send in the texts of Scripture with all convenient speed" (*Minutes*, p. 295). This order was brought to the Divines on October 14, and the Scribes were entrusted with the "care of the exact printing of the Confession of Faith" (*Minutes*, pp. 295-6). The work was apparently rapidly done. The certificate of the order for printing prefixed to the edition is dated October 23,* 1646, and Baillie seems to have sent three copies of the book to Scotland on October 27. Writing to George Young on December 1, he says : "With much adoe we have gone through, at last, the rest of our Confession : the first part I sent, to yow three only, in Mr. David's letter, long agoe" (*Letters and Journals*, etc., Laing's Ed., 1841, II, p. 411). The allusion seems to be to the letter to David Dickson, dated October 27 (*do.*, p. 406-7).

[2. Dec., 1646] "The Humble | Advice | of the | Assembly | of | Divines, | Now by authority of Parliament | sitting at Westminster, | concerning | a Confession of Faith, | presented by them lately to both Houses | of Parliament. || A certain number of Copies are Ordered to be Printed only for the use of members of both Houses and the Assembly of Divines to the end that they may advise thereupon. || London, | Printed for the Company of Stationers"—(DEXTER'S *Congregationalism*, etc., Bibl. No. 1287).

Small 4to, pp. (iv) 54. Facing the title there is an authorization for printing, similar to that in the former issue, but dated December 7, 1646, and bearing that six hundred copies and no more are to be printed for the service of the two Houses and of the Assembly. The volume contains the text of the whole Confession of Faith, but without the Scripture references.

For an account of this edition, see MITCHELL, *The Westminster Assembly*, etc., pp. 376, 378, 526; SHAW, *op. cit.*, I, 363. Cf. SCHAFF, *op. cit.*, I, 753, 757. There are copies in the British Museum, "E. 368. (3)"; and "873. e, 44"; also in the library of Harvard University.

The draft of the Confession was finished in the Assembly of Divines by November 26, 1646 (*Minutes*, p. 303); and the review of it by December 4. On the latter day the whole Assembly presented it to the House of Commons : and it was similarly presented to the Lords on December 7 (*Minutes*, pp. 303-9). Three days after receiving it the Commons ordered it to be printed for the use of the members, without delaying for the Scripture proofs, which were nevertheless still to be expected from the Divines (*Commons' Journal*, IV, 739; V, 2). This order was brought to the Assembly on December 10 (*Minutes*, p. 310), and the Scribes were instructed to take "care of the exact printing" of the on December 24 (*Letters and Journals*, II, 415) as "All is now printed," and document. The printing was expeditiously done; Baillie could speak of it as enabled to take it with him on his journey to Scotland, and to present it to the Commission of the General Assembly at their January meeting (January 21). This edition was therefore issued in December, 1646.

It is customary, to be sure, to date it in 1647—January of that year being presumably intended. In the British Museum Catalogue it is entered as of 1647;

* This date is surprising. Possibly it is a misprint for October 13, the date we should expect : or possibly it is the date of the issuing of the certificate, and not of the passage of the order. In the latter case, the certificate must have been actually drawn up only after the book was in type.

Dr. Mitchell speaks of it as issued in January, 1646|7 (*Minutes*, p. 418); and Dr. Schaff gives the date 1647 in his Bibliography (I, 753), though allowing the alternative between December and January at a later point (p. 757). The data that bear on the matter are the following. Writing from London on the day that the King's answer was communicated to the Houses of Parliament (*Letters and Journals*, II, 416: "this day"), that is on December 24, Baillie says (p. 415): "Our Assemblie, with much adoe, at last have wrestled through the whole Confession, and all is now printed": and writing from Edinburgh on January 26, 1647 (III, 2), he says: "The third point [of Uniformity], the Confession of Faith, I brought it with me, now in print." The journey from London to Edinburgh which lay between these two referenees he describes as "long and tedious." He had been preparing for it all autumn (*cf.* letter of October 27, II, 406): on December 1 (p. 411) he thinks "to obtain a dimission this week; yet it will be above twenty days ere I can take journey"; on December 8 (p. 414) he says that "within a twenty days sundry of us will be ready to take journey"; and on December 24 (p. 415), more explicitly: "The Chaneellour and Lauderdale propose to goe home the next week, and I, God willing, with them." On the basis of these notices, Dr. Laing, in the memoir of Baillie, accompanying his edition of the *Letters* (p. lvii), writes: "In December, 1646, . . . Baillie obtained his wish. . . . He traveled in company with the Lord Chaneellor and Lord Lauderdale; and at the meeting of the Commission of Assembly held at Edinburgh, in January, 1647, he presented the Confession of Faith and the new metrical version of the Psalms." Similarly, Dr. Mitchell (*Minutes*, p. 418) writes: "The Confession of Faith, as printed without proofs in January, 1646|7, was brought back by Baillie the same month, along with Rouse's Psalter, and presented by him to the Commission of the General Assembly." The two accounts are not quite in harmony—one implying that Baillie left London in December and the other not until January: and neither is probably quite exact in every point. Certain notices in the *Minutes* of the Assembly will come here to our aid. On December 24, 1646 (p. 314), we read: "Mr. Gillespie informed the Assembly that some of their number are about to return to Scotland." Accordingly, on the next day (December 25, 1646): "The Lord Chaneellor of Scotland came into the Assembly before his return into Scotland . . . and gave thanks to the Assembly. . . . Mr. Baillie, one of the Commissioners from the Church of Seotland, he also did thankfully aeknowledge the favours and respect of this Assembly, promising to make mention of this Assembly in his prayers, both public and private" (pp. 315-16). It was not, however, until January 12, 1647 (*Minutes*, p. 320), that "the Earl of Lauderdale, one of the Commissioners from the Church of Scotland, took his leave of the Assembly, having the next morning to set forward towards Scotland. . . ." It would seem therefore that the Earl of Lauderdale left London on Wednesday, January 13, and if Baillie and the Lord Chaneellor traveled in his company, that was the date of Baillie's leaving London. But, on the other hand, he and the Lord Chaneellor had taken leave of the Assembly a fortnight earlier, on Christmas Day, with the expectation of starting north before January 2 (Saturday)—for in his letter of December 24 he says that his party expected to start "the next week"—*i. e.*, some time during the week extending from Sunday, December 27, till Saturday, January 2. We must suppose, then, that Baillie left with the Chaneellor at least a fortnight before Lauderdale. This supposition is put beyond question by the *Records of the Commissions of the General Assembly*, lately published under the editorship of Drs. Mitchell and Christie. From these records it appears that Baillie appeared before the Commission on the 21st of January, and brought a letter from the Commissioners who were left behind in London. This letter (in the course of which it is mentioned that Baillie was bearing with him also the finished Confession of Faith)

is signed not only by Rutherford and Gillespie, but also by Lauderdale. Lauderdale (whose early approaching departure is adverted to in the letter) was therefore one of the Commissioners who stayed behind in London when Baillie left. Baillie therefore left London before January 13, when Lauderdale left. It is clear further that Baillie left London not long after December 27; for, after "a long and tedious" journey (*Letters*, III, 1), during the course of which "eight or nine days" had been spent at Newcastle (III, 4), he reached Edinburgh before January 21. It would seem, thus, that the most of the time intervening between December 27 and January 21 was spent on the journey, and that he could scarcely have left London later than the end of the year; he could not have left London certainly as late as January 13, which was only eight days before he appeared before the Commission in Edinburgh, if he spent eight or nine days in Newcastle on the way.

[3. May, 1647] The humble | Advice | of the | Assembly | of
 | Divines, | Now by Authority of Parliament | sitting at
 Westminster, | Concerning a Confession of Faith, with | the
 Quotations and Texts of Scripture annexed, | Presented by
 them lately to both | Houses of Parliament. || A certain num-
 ber of Copies are Ordered to be Printed | only for the use of
 Members of both Houses and | of the Assembly of Divines,
 to the end that they | may advise thereupon. || London, | Printed
 for the Company of Stationers.

Small 4to, the block of type measuring $9\frac{1}{2} \times 4\frac{3}{4}$ inches: pp. 56 numbered, the title-page (blank on back) not being included in the numbering: to these is added in new pagination pp. 1-11 containing "The Proceedings of the Assembly of Divines upon the Thirty-nine Articles of the Church of ENGLAND." On p. 56 the Confession of Faith is signed by: "Charles Herle, Prolocutor. Cornelius Burges, Assessor. Herbert Palmer, Assessor. Henry Robroughe, Scriba. Adoniram Byfield, Scriba." Then comes the "Finis." Again, at the end of the Fifteen Articles on (the second) p. 11 the signatures occur of "CHARLES HERLE Prolocutor. HENRY ROBROUGH Scriba. ADONIRAM BYFIELD Scriba." Then again comes "Finis." Facing the title-page the following authorization is printed: "April 29, 1647. Ordered by the Commons Assembled in Parliament, That Sixe hundred Copies and no more of the Advice of the Assembly of Divines, Concerning a Confession of Faith, with the Quotations and Texts of Scripture annexed, presented to this House, and likewise sixe hundred Copies of the Proceedings of the Assembly of Divines upon the thirty nine Articles of the Church of England, be forthwith printed for the service of both Houses and the Assembly of Divines; And the Printer is enjoined at his perill not to print more than sixe hundred Copies of each, or to divulge or publish any of them. It is further Ordered, that no Person presume to reprint, divulge, or publish the said Advice, or Proceedings, or any part of them till further order be taken by both or either of the Houses of Parliament. H. Elsynge, Cler. Parl. D. Com." The volume contains the text of the whole Confession of Faith with the Scripture proofs, adduced by references only and set down in the (side) margin. Also in the last (separately numbered) eleven pages the first fifteen of the Thirty-nine Articles, as revised by the Assembly of Divines.

For an account of this edition, see MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, pp. 377-8, 526; SHAW, *op. cit.*, I, p. 364; SCHAFF, *op. cit.*, I, pp. 753, 757-8. There are copies of it in the British Museum, "E. 516 (3)," and the Advocates' Library, Edinburgh: also in the libraries of the Theological Seminary at Princeton; of Union The-

ological Seminary, New York; and of the Ridgeway Branch of the Library Company of Philadelphia (No. 925, U, p. 6).

The preparation of the proof texts for the Confession, required of the Divines by Parliament, was begun on January 6, 1647 (*Minutes*, p. 318-19), and by April 5 was completed in first draft (*Minutes*, p. 345). On April 26 (*Minutes*, p. 354) a committee was appointed to carry them up to the two Houses, and they were presented to both on April 29; on which day order was taken by the House of Commons for the printing of six hundred copies of the Confession, "with the quotations and texts of Scripture annexed" (see the text of the order in *Minutes*, p. 354). On the same day it was reported to the Assembly that the "Confession of Faith with Scriptures and the old Articles" had been delivered to both Houses of Parliament; and that the House of Commons had appointed the Assembly to print 600 copies of them both (*Minutes*, p. 356). This edition may safely be said to have been issued in May, 1647.

[4. Aug., 1647] "The Humble Advice of the Assembly of Divines . . . concerning a Confession of Faith, etc. [With an order of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland that three hundred copies, and no more, be printed.] pp. 56. Printed at London and reprinted at Edinburgh by Evan Tyler, 1647. 4to. 3506. aaa. 24"—(BRITISH MUSEUM CATALOGUE).

4to, pp. 56. There is a copy in the British Museum, "3506, aaa, 24": and another in the St. Andrew's University Library. For an account of this edition, see MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 526, and also in the *Minutes of the Sessions of the Westminster Assembly of Divines*, etc., pp. 418-19; SCHAFF, *op. cit.*, I, 753, 759.

Baillie had taken to Scotland with him the completed text of the Confession without proofs (edition of December, 1646), and presented it to the Commission of the Assembly at their January meeting. The third issue (that of May, 1647) was probably brought up by Gillespie, who took leave of the Divines on July 16, 1647 (*Minutes*, p. 401; *cf.* p. 419). The General Assembly convened on August 4; and at its fifth session (August 9) there was passed an "Act for Printing 300 copies of the advice of the Assemblie of Divines in England concerning a Confession of Faith, for the use of the members of the Assembly" (Peterkin's *Records of the Church of Scotland*, p. 480). At the twenty-third session (August 27, 1647) the act of "Approbation of the Confession of Faith" was passed.

The present edition is a reprint of the third English issue (that of May, 1647) and, like it, it contains the text of the full Confession, together with the proof-texts, cited by reference only.

Evan Tyler, the printer of this edition, and Robert Young, a Londoner, were appointed joint printers for his Majesty for Scotland, in succession to Thomas Finlayson (who had held this office since 1612), by a patent dated June 30, 1641. Evan Tyler was the active member of the firm, and prosecuted his trade in Edinburgh until 1650, when he was considered as having forfeited his gift, and Charles II appointed another in his stead (who is not known, however, to have printed anything). Nevertheless he returned to his office in 1660. In the interval he resided in London, where he printed many books. Principal Lee thinks that it was not, however, as King's printer, but on the appointment of the Church, that he printed this privately printed and the next to be mentioned—the first published—editions of the Confession of

Faith. He pleads the act of the General Assembly, Sess. 26, December 20, 1638, by which it "unanimously, by virtue of their ecclesiastical authority, dischargeth and inhibiteth all printers within this kingdom, to print any act of the former Assemblies, any of the acts or proceedings of this Assembly, any Confession of Faith, &c., or any other treatise whatever that may concern the Kirk of Scotland, or God's cause in hand, without warrant subscribed by Mr. Archibald Johnston as clerk to the Assembly, and advocate for the kirk"; as also the complaint of the General Assembly, sess. 21, 1648, to the effect that "the General Assembly and their Commissioners are now deprived of their liberty of printing, confirmed and ratified by act of parliament; there being an inhibition to the contrary upon the printer, under the pain of death, by the Committee of the Estates"; as well as the custom of the day, according to which Evan Tyler, for example, printed many papers for the Assembly, despite this inhibition; and in particular the existence of contemporary editions printed by others, as, for example, those by Gidcon Lithgow, 1650, 1652, 1656, 1659, who was not King's printer, but printer to the University. He claims (as his brief required him to do) that, as a matter of fact, throughout the whole history of the Confession in Scotland, "the Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, and the Metrical Psalms" "were much less frequently printed by the King's printer than by others, till Sir D. Hunter Blair and Mr. Bruce came into office. We can produce," he adds, "more than seventy editions of the Confession of Faith between the years 1650 and 1785, many of them very excellent, and almost all of them equal or superior to any which have yet been printed by the present patentees, and yet not one of them was printed by a King's printer. . . . We defy the respondents to point out one-tenth the number of good editions printed by all their predecessors in office." We have met with only the following editions printed by King's printers: Evan Tyler, 1647, 1647; Andro Anderson [1657, before his patent (1671) was granted]; James Watson [1707, 1708, 1710, before patent was granted], 1719; Robert Sanders [1669, 1675, 1689, before granting of patent?], 1690, 1693, 1711; Alexander Kincaid, 1773, 1781, 1783; Mark and Charles Kerr, 1793; Blair & Bruce, 1810, 1815, 1841, 1845. Dr. Lee's list of seventy editions printed by others than the King's printer is given in the revised edition (1839) of the list of such editions of Books of Public Authority in the Church of Scotland which is usually bound in with his *Additional Memorial on Printing and Importing Bibles* (Edinburgh, 1826)—to which (especially pp. 76 *sq.*), along with the original *Memorial*, etc. (Edinburgh, 1824), especially pp. 113 *sq.*, 155 *sq.*, the reader may be referred for the whole subject.

[5. 1647] The Humble | Advice | Of the | Assembly | of
 | Divines, | Now by Authority of *Parliament* | sitting at
 WESTMINSTER, | Concerning | *A Confession of Faith*: | With
 the QUOTATIONS and TEXTS of | SCRIPTURE annexed. | *Pre-*
sented by them lately to both Houses of Parliament. | Printed
 at LONDON; | AND | Re-printed at EDINBURGH by *Evan*
Tyler, Printer to | the Kings most Excellent Majestie.
 1647.

Small 4to, pp. 56. There is a copy of this edition in the British Museum, "E. 418. (12)": also copies in the library of the Union Theological Seminary, New York, and in the Prince Collection, now deposited in the Boston Public Library, "H. 59, 34." A *fac-simile* of the title-page is given in Williamson's edition of Hetherington's *Hist. of the West. Ass.*, fourth edition (Edinburgh, 1878); and also in Schaff's *Creeeds of Christendom*, III, pp. 598-599. For an

account of it, see MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 526, and *Minutes*, p. 419; and SCHAFF, *op. cit.* I, 757-8.

This is the first published edition of the Confession, and its publication was the natural sequel of the adoption of the Confession by the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, although this adoption was not ratified by the Scottish Parliament until February 7, 1649. From it, as the parent edition, all current editions derive.

[6. 1648] “The | humble Advice of | the Assembly | of | Divines, | now by authority of Parliament | sitting at Westminster, | concerning | i A Confession of Faith : | ii A Larger Catechism. | iii A Shorter Catechism. | Presented by them lately to both | Houses of Parliament. | Printed at London and reprinted at | Edenbrough. 1648.”—(CARRUTHERS).

16mo, no pagination, but pp. 106 (sheets A to G). “This is the first edition in which the three documents appear in one volume. The proof references are given for the Confession, but are wanting in the Catechisms. . . . It is probable that this volume was published early in 1648. It is beautifully printed, but neither printer nor publisher have given their names, perhaps in fear of difficulties with the English Parliament” (CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 40).

For an account of this edition, see MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 527, and CARRUTHERS, *The Shorter Catechism of the Westminster Assembly of Divines, being a fac-simile of the First Edition*, etc. London, 1897, pp. 39-40. There is a copy in the British Museum, “3505. bb.” The British Museum Catalogue describes it as 12mo; Carruthers as 16mo; Mitchell as 8vo or 12mo.

[7. 1648] “The Humble Advice of the Assembly of Divines, Now by Authority of Parliament sitting at Westminster, Concerning a Confession of Faith, with the Quotations and Texts of Scripture annexed, Presented by them lately to both Houses of Parliament. London: Printed for Robert Bostock at the King’s Head, Paul’s Churchyard, 1648”—(MITCHELL).

4to, pp. 56. “At the end it has ‘*Imprimatur James Cranford, Dec. 7, 1647*’” (MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 527). There is an account of this edition in MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 527. There is a copy of it in the British Museum, “116, f. 20.”

[8. 1648] “ARTICLES | of | Christian Religion, | Approved and Passed by both Houses | of PARLIAMENT, | After Advice had with the Assembly | of | DIVINES, | by Authority of Parliament sitting at | Westminster. | London: | June 27, 1648 ”—(SCHAFF).

4to, pp. —. For an account of this edition, see MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, pp. 379 and 526, and *Minutes*, p. 412 *sq.* (especially 416); SHAW, *op. cit.*, I, 365; SCHAFF, *op. cit.*, I, 753, and especially 758-9. There are copies in the British Museum, “116, f. 19”; “E. 449”; “T. 191 $\frac{3}{8}$ ”; and also in the Bodleian.

The Confession of Faith with its proof-texts was presented to Parliament on April 29, 1647. On the same day the House of Commons “*Resolved*, etc.—That

on Wednesday next come sevensnight the first business, and nothing to intervene, the House do take into consideration the Confession of Faith, with the places of Scripture annexed . . ." (*Minutes*, p. 354). But it was not on May 12, as thus appointed, but on May 19 that "the House, according to former order, proceeded to the consideration of the humble Advice of the Assembly of Divines concerning a Confession of Faith, presented by the Assembly of Divines, with the texts of Scripture in the margin" (*Minutes*, p. 413). The "consideration" dragged along, however, with many long interruptions and was not finished until March 17, 1648. Conference with the Lords consumed more time still, and it was only on June 20, 1648, that the House "*Ordered*—That the *Articles of Christian Religion* sent from the Lords with some alterations, the which were this day read, and upon the question agreed unto, be forthwith printed and published." On June 21 it was "*Resolved*—That the texts of Scripture be printed with the *Articles of Faith*." The alterations made in the text of the Confession by Parliament consisted in the change of title—in order to conform it more nearly to the familiar title of the Thirty-nine Articles, and because the several sections do not commence with the words "I confess"—and in the omission of the whole of chapters xxx and xxxi and parts of chapters xx and xxiv, and in some less important alterations in chapter xxiii. They will be found marked in the edition of the *Confession of Faith of the Assembly of Divines at Westminster*, etc., published a few years ago under the editorial care of Mr. William Carruthers, at the Publication Office of the Presbyterian Church of England (see below, No. 137); and a list of them is given by Mitchell, as cited above.

This Parliamentary edition has exercised no influence on the history of the Confession of Faith. It was, to be sure, returned to in the spring of 1560, when the Long Parliament was reassembled: or rather the originally reported "Humble Advice" was returned to—only chapters xxx and xxxi being now objected to. These were "referred back to the same committee that brought in the Confession of Faith to consider thereof, and to confer with such persons thereupon as they shall think fit, and present their opinion therein to the Parliament." On the 5th of March an ordinance was passed declaring this Confession to be "the public Confession of Faith of the Church of England," ordering it to be printed and published, and referring to "Dr. Reynolds, Mr. Calamy and Dr. Manton to examine the same at the press, and also to examine the Scriptures for proof of every article, and insert the same in the margin of the book" (*Minutes*, pp. 417, 418). Dr. Schaff remarks: "Mitchell gives no information of copies of this edition" (*op. cit.*, I. 759, note 1). Probably it was never published. As Shaw says (I, § 67): "Needless to say that the enactment was perfectly futile and unregarded." The Westminster Confession has come down to us not as a series of English Articles of Religion authorized by Parliament, but as the Confession of Faith of the Church of Scotland, and in the form in which it was adopted and published by that Church.

The Parliamentary edition does not however lack historical significance. The changes it introduced into the Confession were the expression of the growing influence of the Independents in Parliament. It was distinctively the Independent recension of the Confession. When, therefore, the Independent divines were gathered in the autumn of 1658 (Sept. 29–Oct. 12) at the Savoy, to prepare a Confession of their own, it was naturally to this Independent recension of the Westminster Confession that they reverted as their model: the Savoy *Declaration of Faith* is in effect only a modification of the Parliamentary edition of the Westminster Confession. How the matter stood in the minds of the Savoy divines they themselves tell us in the Preface to their *Declaration*, penned, it is said, by the hand of John Owen:—

“In drawing up this *Confession of Faith*, we have had before us the *Articles of Religion*, approved and passed by both Houses of *Parliament*, after advice had with an *Assembly of Divines*, called together by them for that purpose. To which *Confession*, for the substance of it, we fully assent, as do our Brethren of *New England*, and the Churches also of *Scotland*, as each in their general Synods have testified.

“A few things we have added for obviating some erroneous opinions, that have been more broadly and boldly here of late maintained by the Asserters, then in former times; and made some other additions and alterations in *method*, here and there, and some clearer explanations, as we found occasion.

“We have endeavored throughout, to hold to such Truths in this our *Confession*, as are more properly termed *matters of Faith*; and what is of *Church-order* we dispose in certain Propositions by itself. To this course we are led by the example of the Honorable *Houses of Parliament*, observing what was established, and what omitted by them in that *Confession* the Assembly presented to them. Who thought it not convenient to have matters of *Discipline* and *Church-Government* put into a *Confession of Faith*, especially such particulars thereof, as there were, and still are controverted and under dispute by men Orthodox and sound in Faith. The 30th *cap.* therefore of that *Confession*, as it was presented to them by the Assembly, which is of *Church-Censures*, their *Use*, *Kindes*, and in *whom placed*: As also *cap.* 31. of *Synods and Councils*, by *whom* to be called, of *what force* in their *decrees* and *determinations*. And the 4th *paragr.* of the 20th *cap.* which determines what *opinions* and practices *disturb the peace* of the Church, and how such disturbers ought to be *proceeded against* by the *Censures of the Church*, and punished by the *Civil Magistrate*. Also a great part of the 24th *cap.* of *Marriage and Divorce*. These were such doubtful assertions, and so unsuitable to a *Confession of Faith*, as the *Honorable Houses* in their great Wisdom thought fit to lay them aside: There being nothing that tends more to heighten dissentings among Brethren, then to determine and adopt the *matter of their difference*, under so high a title, as to be an *Article of our Faith*: So that there are two whole Chapters, and some Paragraphs in other Chapters in their *Confession*, that we have upon this account omitted; and the rather do we give this notice, because that Copy of the *Parliaments*, followed by us, is in few men’s hands; the other as it came from the *Assembly*, being approved of in *Scotland*, was printed and hastened into the world before the *Parliament* had declared their Resolutions about it; which was not till *June 20*, 1648, and yet hath been, and continueth to be the Copy (ordinarily) onely sold, printed and reprinted for these *eleven* years.

“After the 19th *cap.* of the *Law*, we have added a *cap.* of the *Gospel*, it being a Title that may not well be omitted in a *Confession of Faith*: In which Chapter, what is dispersed, and by intimation in the *Assemblies Confession* with some little addition, is here brought together, and more fully under one head.

“That there are not Scriptures annexed as in some *Confessions* (though in divers others it’s otherwise) we give the same account as did the *Reverend Assembly* in the same case: which was this; *The Confession being large, and so framed, as to meet with the common errors, if the Scriptures should have been allcaded with any clearness, and by showing where the strength of the proof lieth, it would have required a volume.*” (*A Declaration of the Faith and Order Owned and Practiced in the Congregational Churches in England*. . . . London, 1658, pp. xx-xxii; as reprinted by WILLISTON WALKER in *The Creeds and Platforms of Congregationalism*, New York, 1893, pp. 362-3.)

See on the Savoy Declaration, WILLISTON WALKER, as cited, pp. 340-408, with the literature cited by him on p. 431: cf. SCHAFF, *Creeds and Christendom*, I, 829-833.

The Savoy Confession, it is true, fell still-born from the press, and exerted as little influence among the Churches for which it was prepared as the Parliamentary *Articles* themselves. But historical importance is given to it by its descendants. The Congregationalists of New England after adapting it to their own views with regard to the relation of Church and State—views diametrically opposite to those of the English Independents—made it their formal standard of doctrine. This was done by the Boston Synod of 1680 for the Churches of Massachusetts and by the Saybrook Synod of 1708 for those of Connecticut. As such it was published in a number of editions, and has enjoyed an influence, if we cannot say an authority, denied it in the land of its birth. Up to 1784 it remained the legally imposed standard of the Churches of Connecticut: and though it is now practically forgotten even in New England, it has never been formally dethroned from the place given it in 1680 and 1708 as the public standard of the American Congregationalist Churches, so far as such Churches can be spoken of as having a recognized common standard. See WILLISTON WALKER, as cited, pp. 353, 409 *sq.*, 463 *sq.*, where both a list of editions and an ample literature are given.

[9. 1648] Demütiger Bericht | Der | Versamleten jetzund aus
| Macht und Befehl | des | Parlaments | Zu | Westmünster |
Sitzenden Lehrern der heiligen | Schrift | Belangende | Ein
Glaubens-Bekantnis | beyden Häuser des Par- | laments |
neulich überreicht | Im Jahr nach Christi Geburt | 1648 |
Aus dem Englischen ins Teutsche | treulich übersetzt | Ge-
druckt im Jahr 1648.

Listed as 8vo, but the size of the page is only 6 x 3½ inches (block of type, 5½ x 3½); the pages are unnumbered, but besides the title page there are three given to the preface and 171 to the book proper. The text of the Confession is accompanied by the proofs from Scripture, generally printed in full. Dr. Mitchell says: "It is remarkable as being the first edition in which the Scripture proofs are inserted at length, instead of being merely indicated in the margin." This is, however, not without exception the case: in a number of instances the texts are cited only by references, though generally they are given in full. The commendatory preface is quoted completely in NIEMEYER's *Collectio Confessionum in Ecclesiis Reformatis Publicatarum*. Leipzig, 1840. Appendix, pp. iv and v: and largely in MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 527.

For an account of this translation, see NIEMEYER and MITCHELL, as just cited; and cf. SCHAFF, *op. cit.*, I, 754, but note that the version in BÜCKEL's *Bekennniß-Schriften d. evang. reform. Kirche*, pp. 683, *sq.*, is not a "new one," but is only revised from this early one. There is a copy of it in the Royal Library at Berlin, and we are indebted to the Rev. Kerr Duncan Macmillan, B.D., for a very careful and complete description of it. Nothing seems to be known about its origin: Mitchell supposes it was made from the Bostock edition just described (*op. cit.*, p. 527).

[10. 1649] "The | Confession | of | Faith, | and the | Larger
and Shorter | Catechisme, | First agreed upon by the | As-
sembly of Divines at | Westminster. | And now appointed by
the | Generall Assembly of the Kirk | of Scotland, to be a
part | of Uniformity in Religion | between the Kirks of |
Christ in the three | Kingdomes. | Edinburgh, | Printed by

Gedeon Lithgow, | Printer to the Universitie of | Edinburgh,
1649.”—(CARRUTHERS).

24mo, pp. [6] 184. “This is the first edition with the proof references to the three documents. . . . The Catechisms have distinct titles, but the pagination is continuous” (CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 40). An account of this edition is given by Carruthers, as cited. A copy of it is owned by the Rev. John Sturrock, of Edinburgh. The Larger Catechism was approved by the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland July 20, and the Shorter Catechism July 28, 1648.

[11. 1649] “The | Confession | of | Faith | and | Catechisms, |
Agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines at | Westminster :
| Together with their Humble Advice | concerning | Church
Government | and | Ordination of Ministers. | London, |
Printed for Robert Bostock, at the sign | of the Kings Head
in Pauls | Churchyard. | ”—(CARRUTHERS).

12mo, pp. 176, and Advice, 36. The distinct title to the Advice Concerning Church Government is dated 1648, but the title to the Shorter Catechism (and doubtless that to the Larger one also) seems to be taken from that of Gideon Lithgow’s edition just named, and thus the whole book seems to have been issued only in 1649. Dr. Mitchell (*op. cit.*, p. 527) appears to give the date “1648” as occurring on the general title to the volume, or at least on the special title for the Confession and Catechisms—in which case, doubtless, the copy described by him should be accounted an earlier issue than that described by Carruthers: but Carruthers (*op. cit.*, p. 41) seems to show that Mitchell is in error. The date of 1649 seems also to fit in better with an incident occurring in the House of Commons August 6, 1649. James Cranford had been appointed by Parliament in 1643 to licensc books: but on March 16, 1649, the Commons revoked the appointment. On the 6th of August the House “Ordered, That it be referred to the Committee for plundered Ministers, to examine whether the Book, intituled, ‘The Confession of Faith, and Catechisms agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines, at Westminster; together with their humble advice concerning Church Government, and Ordination of Ministers;’ lately printed for Robert Bostock, and licensc by James Cranford; were licensc by the said James Cranford, since he was discharged from licensc: with power for the said Committee to send for the printer; and to examine by what authority he printed the same; and to send for persons, witnesses and papers; and that Mr. Millington do give an account hereof to the House on Thursday morning next.” There is no record of Mr. Millington’s report. This book bears the *imprimatur* of James Cranford. It is, in all probability, the book intended: and if so, it must have appeared subsequently to March 16, 1649.

For an account of this edition, see CARRUTHERS and MITCHELL, *opp. cit.* There are copies of it in the British Museum: “E. 1419” and “E. 1214 a. 13.”

[12. 1649] “The | Confession | of | Faith | and the | Larger and
Shorter | Catechisme, | First agreed upon by the As | sembly
of Divines at | Westminster, | And now appointed by the
Ge | nerall Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland to | be a part
of Uniformity in Religion between | the Kirks of Christ in

the three Kingdomes. | Amsterdam, | Printed by Luice Else-
 vor, for Andrew Wilson, | and are to be sold at his shop in |
 Edinburgh. 1649."—(CARRUTHERS).

16mo, pp. 50 + (defective at the end.)

See MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 528; and CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 41. There is an imperfect copy in the Library of the New College, Edinburgh, containing only the Confession of Faith. The printer is the third of the name: the first Louis was the founder of the house, came from Louvain to Leyden in 1580, and established the printing house there (from 1592); his second son, Louis, opened the house at The Hague in 1590; his grandson, Louis, instituted the bookshop at Amsterdam in 1638, and carried it on alone until 1655. It was during this period—1649—that this edition of the Confession was printed.

[13. 1650] "The | Confession | of | Faith, | and the | Larger and
 Shorter | Catechisme, | First agreed upon by the | Assembly
 of Divines at | Westminster. | And now approved by the |
 Generall Assembly of | the Kirk of Scotland, | to be a part of
 Unifor | mity in Religion be | tween the Kirks of | Christ in the
 | three King | domes. | Edinburgh, Printed by Gedeon Lith-
 gow, | Printer to the University | of Edinburgh. 1650."—
 (CARRUTHERS).

18mo, pp. 258, [66] in the British Museum copy ("3504. a. 3"), described by Mr. Carruthers (*op. cit.*, p. 41). This copy contains the Confession and Catechisms provided with distinct titles, but paged continuously; and at the end, occupying the sixty-six unnumbered pages, the *Sum of Christian Knowledge*. This is the first appearance of the *Sum*; it afterwards became a well-nigh constant accompaniment of the Confession and Catechisms in Scotch editions. The Shorter Catechism ends at p. 258, which is the last page of sheet L. The *Sum* begins with sheet M. Another copy of this edition, in the library of the Rev. John Sturrock, of Edinburgh, lacks the *Sum*, and, instead, has, beginning (without pagination) with Sheet M, the Directions for Family Worship, followed by the Solemn League and Covenant: it apparently never had the *Sum*. The title-page of the *Sum* is already in this edition deformed by the error in punctuation which makes it appear a product of the Westminster Divines. That is to say, it runs: "A Brief Sum of | Christian Doctrine, | contained in | Holy Scripture, and holden | forth in the Confession | of Faith and Catechisms. | Agreed upon by the Assembly of Di- | vines at Westminster, and received | by the General Assembly of | the Kirk of Scotland." For a full account of the matter, see Dr. D. HAY FLEMING in the PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, x, 318-324, especially p. 323. Nearly all Scotch editions of the Confession after this include the *Sum* (that of Robert Sanders, Glasgow, 1675, is an exception, and so is the edition included in Dunlop's *Collection*). Dr. Hay Fleming records the following facts: With the punctuation "Catechisms. Agreed," Edinburgh, Lithgow, 1650; Edinburgh, Anderson, 1652; [Holland], 1679; Edinburgh, 1688; Edinburgh, Reid, 1689; Glasgow, Sanders, 1693; Glasgow, Bruce, 1714; London, Cruttenden & Cox, 1717. With the punctuation "Catechisms: Agreed," Glasgow, Hall, 1749; Glasgow, Knox, 1752; Edinburgh, Robertson, 1756. With the punctuation "Catechisms, Agreed," Edinburgh, Lumisden & Robertson, 1744. Without this form of title-page, Edinburgh, Swinton & Brown, 1671 (two editions), and the Lumisden and Robertson *Collection*, 1725. This enumeration is not exhaustive even for the period prior to Dunlop's *Collection* (e.g., the *Sum* appears in the

edition of Sanders, Glasgow, 1687). After the edition of Lumisden & Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728, which set the type of the regular Scotch editions subsequently, the appearance of the *Sum* in the volume is of course regular. The *Sum* does not appear to have ever been issued as a separate publication.

[14. 1650] “The Confession of Faith and Catechisms agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines, together with their humble advice concerning Church Government and Ordination of Ministers. London, 1650.”—(CARRUTHERS).

8vo. Bodleian Library. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 42.

[15. 1651] “The | Confession | of | Faith, | And the | Larger and Shorter | Catechisme, | etc. (as in 1649 Ed.). First Printed at Edenburg and now | reprinted at London for the Com | pany of Stationers. 1651.”—(CARRUTHERS).

12mo, pp. [6], 190, [2]. “A Directory for Publique Worship, Church Government and the Doctrinal part of Ordination of Ministers” is added, with distinct title and paging [pp. 82]. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 42. There is a copy in the British Museum, “3505. aa. 1.”

[16. 1652] The | Confession | of | Faith, | And the | Larger and Shorter | Catechism, | First agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines at | Westminster ; | And now approved by the | Generall Assembly of the Kirk | of *Scotland*, to be a part of | Uniformity in Religion | between the Kirks of | *Christ* in the three | Kingdoms. | Together with the solemn League and | Covenant of the three Kingdoms. | First Printed at *Edenburgh*, and now | reprinted at *London* for the Com- | pany of Stationers. 1652.

24mo, pp. [6], 182, [2], to which is added, with new title and pagination, pp. 1 to 91, containing the Directory for Worship, Administration of the Sacraments, etc. The unnumbered six pages at the beginning of the first section contain the Act of the Scotch General Assembly approving the Confession, and the unnumbered two at its end the Solemn League and Covenant. The Larger and Shorter Catechisms are provided with distinct titles. The Scriptural proofs are by reference only and are entered on the side-margin. The block of type measures $4\frac{5}{8} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches. It is recorded by CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 42. There is a copy in the library of Princeton Theological Seminary.

[17. 1652] “The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1649 Ed.). Edinburgh, Printed by the Heirs of George Anderson, 1652.”—(CARRUTHERS).

24mo, pp. 258. “The Summe of Saving Knowledge, Directions concerning Private Worship, and The Solemn League and Covenant,” are added without pagination. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 42. There is a copy in the British Museum, “3505. a. 1.” See also D. HAY FLEMING, *loc. cit.*, p. 323, who points out that this edition is like the Lithgow edition of 1650 in closing the pagination with p. 258 (at the end of the Shorter Catechism) : but the *Sum* in this case begins in the midst of sheet L, and not at the beginning of sheet M,

as in the former edition. The same error of punctuation occurs in the half-title of the *Sum* which is found in the edition of Lithgow, 1650.

[18. 1655] “The | Confession | of | Faith, | and the | Larger and Shorter | Chatechism, | Agreed upon by the As | sembly of Divines at | Westminster. | [London.] Printed for the Public Good. 1655.”—(CARRUTHERS).

24mo, pp. 192. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 42. There is a copy in the British Museum, “3505. a. 11.”

[19. 1656] The Confession of Faith, etc. “Edinburgh, by G. Lithgow. 1656, 18mo.”—(LEE).

18mo. See JOHN LEE. *Additional Memorial on Printing and Importing Bibles*, etc. Edinburgh, 1826: separately paginated Appendix p. 3, No. 4, and the enlarged reprint of this Appendix of 1839 entitled: “Editions of Books of Public Authority in the Church of Scotland, not printed by Scottish Patentees,” p. 4. These two tracts are ordinarily together bound in at the back of the *Additional Memorial*. The list of the Confessions, which numbered sixty in the edition of 1826, is increased to seventy in that of 1839.* Cf. CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 43.

[20. 1656] The Confession of Faith, etc. “London, for the Company of Stationers, 1656, 18mo.”—(LEE).

18mo, see LEE, *op. cit.*, p. 4: and cf. CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 42.

[21. 1656] “CONFESSIO FIDEI | in Conventu Theologorum autoritate | Parliamenti Anglicani indicto | Elaborata; | eidem Parlamento postmodum | Exhibita; | Quin et ab eodem, deinceps ab Ecclesia Scotiana | Cognita et Approbata; | unâ eum | CATECHISMO | duplici, MAJORI, MINORIQUE; | E Sermone Anglicano summa cum fide | in Latinum versa. | Cantabrigiæ: excudebat Johannes Field, celeberrimæ Academiæ typographus” —(SCHAFF).

The first edition appeared in 1656, 16mo, pp. 229: later editions appeared at Amsterdam, 1658; Cambridge, 1659; Glasgow, 1660, 1670; Edinburgh, 1670, 1671, 1689, 1694, 1708, 1711. The preface is signed by the initials “G. D.” Who they represent is unknown: some have filled out the “D” with Dillingham, some with Dupont; but in the former case we should expect the first initial to be W [illiam], and in the latter J [ames]. The Scripture proofs are given by reference only.

For an account of this translation, see MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 528; SCHAFF, *op. cit.*, I, p. 754, III, p. 600; CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, pp. 61–62; NIEMEYER, *op. cit.*, appendix, pp. iii, iv; LEE, *op. cit.*, list of 1826, p. 5 (not repeated in later edition); DEXTER, *Congregationalism as Seen in Its Literature*, Bibl., p. 83 (No. 1727) and p. 86 (No. 1803). There is a copy of the first edition (1656), an 8vo of pp. 229, in the British Museum, (“3505. b. 61”): as also of the editions of Cambridge, 1659 (8vo, pp. 229); Glasgow, 1660 (12mo, pp. 302); and Edinburgh, 1671 (12mo, pp. 182). There is a copy of the edition of Cambridge,

* Carruthers seems to have used the list of 1826 and not to have known of the enlarged reprint of 1839. We quote uniformly from the enlarged reprint.

1659, in the Prince Collection (69. 11. 15), deposited since 1870 in the Boston Public Library, and another in the collection of Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia (Dr. J. Lee's copy, with his autograph on the title-page and a note in his hand on the opposite fly-leaf). The text is accessible to all in its reprints in Niemeyer's *Collectio Conf.* (1840) and Schaff's *Creeeds of Christendom*, III (1878).

Principal Lee communicates the following piece of information bearing on the early felt need of a Latin version of the Confession (*op. cit.*, p. 57): "Edinburgh, Jan. 18, 1649.—The Commission of the General Assembly, considering how profitable it will be to the kirks abroad, that the Confession of Faith and Catechisme be translated in Latine, therefore they seriouslie recommend to Mr. John Adamson and Mr. Thomas Crawford to doe the same with diligence."

[22. 1657] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Edinburgh . . . by Andro Anderson. 1657, 18mo."—(LEE).

18mo, see LEE, *op. cit.*, p. 4: cf. CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 43. Andrew Anderson, who was originally of Glasgow, but came to Edinburgh and became first printer to the City and College, and afterward King's printer, was not esteemed very highly for accuracy. See an interesting account of him and his work, and the extremity of his claims to monopoly, etc., in Lee: *Memorial for the Bible Societies in Scotland*, 1824, pp. 116, 5q.

[23. 1658] The | Confession | of | Faith, | Together with | The Larger and Lesser | Catechisms, | Composed by the Reverend | Assembly | of | Divines | Sitting at Westminster, | Presented to both Houses | of Parliament. | Lately Published with the Scriptures at large, for | the benefit of Masters of Families. | With an epistle by several Ministers recommending this Excellent Work to them. || Deut. 6. 6. 7. [quoted in full] || London, Printed for the Company of STATIONERS, and | are to be sold by J. Rothwel at the Fountain in Cheapside. |

Small 4to, 7 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 5 inches, pp. [10], 108, 157, 43. The back of the title-page is blank. Then follows the promised epistle by several ministers, occupying seven pages, on the back of the last of which is the table of contents of the chapters of the Confession. This epistle begins with sheet No. A2: the ten pages occupied by the title and it contain thus two pages too much for the sheet: the last leaf is apparently the one added and appears to be mounted. But the first leaf of the sheet is cut off and the title-page mounted on the stub. The text of the Confession begins on the first page of sheet B, and with p. 1: it runs on to the midst of sheet Q, the last leaf being "Q. 3," and the last page numbered (erroneously), 108 (there are really 118 pages). At the bottom of p. 108 stands "*Imprimatur*. JAMES CRANFORD. FINIS."* The next leaf is

* For James Cranford, see under the two Bostock editions of 1648 and [1649], especially the latter. We are surprised to find his *imprimatur* at this late date (1658). His censorship closed in 1649; and he died April 27, 1657. Can it appear here only by mechanical repetition from printer's copy? If so, the Bostock editions may be supposed to have been the originals of the Rothwell editions, begun with this issue. See the articles on him in WOOD'S *Athenæ Oxonienses* (Bliss), III, 431, and (by S. G. Lee) in the *Dict. of Nat. Biog.*, XIII, 16.

the separate title for the Larger Catechism, bearing the imprint : "London, | Printed by A. Maxey for the Company of Stationers, and | J. Rothwell, at the Fountain in Cheapside." The signatures and pagination now begin afresh (with signature B), running on to p. 157 (erroneously numbered; it should be 155) and a new "Finis" (but no *imprimatur*). Then comes the separate title to the Shorter Catechism, bearing the imprint : "LONDON, | Printed by A. Maxey for John Rothwell at the Fountain in | Gold-smith's Row in Cheap-side, 1658." | The signatures and pagination again begin afresh, but the paging in this case includes the title: the back of title and p. 3 are blank; p. 4 contains the original Parliamentary order for printing, beginning "Die Lunæ 15. Septembr. 1648"; on p. 5 the text of the Catechism begins, and runs on to close on p. 42 with a catchword, showing that a page is missing. This particularity of description, which is taken from a copy in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, is occasioned by the fact that this edition seems to vary slightly in the make-up of its opening pages. There is a copy of it in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia, the make-up of which is as follows: pp. 12 unnumbered + 4 numbered + 108 numbered (giving the Confession) + 157 (the Larger Catechism) + 43 (the Shorter Catechism). It bears the same general title as the Princeton copy. The copy described by Carruthers (*op. cit.*, p. 43) is made up thus: "pp. [9], 4, 118 (errore 108), Larger Cat. 137 (errore 139), Shorter Cat. 43." It appears to have the same general title to the whole and the same separate titles to the Catechisms as the Princeton copy, but also a separate title to the Confession, which is lacking in the Princeton copy. Other copies want the general title, and have the separate title to the Confession in its place. This is true of the British Museum copy, and also of copies in the Lenox Library, New York, and the Union Theological Seminary, New York. This separate title runs thus: "The Humble | Advice | of | The Assembly | of | Divines, | by | Authority of Parliament | Sitting at Westminster; | concerning | a Confession of Faith: | with | the Quotations and Texts of | Scripture Annexed. | Presented by them lately to both Houses of Parliament: | Now Published with Scriptures at length, | for the good of Families. | London, | Printed by S. Griffin for the Company of Stationers and | to be sold by J. Rothwell at the Fountain in Cheapside | 1658." The make-up of the volume is as in Dr. Craven's copy [xi] 4, 108, 157, 43. A similar copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia, also lacks the general title; and the titles to the Confession and Larger Catechism have in this copy been interchanged: this copy was purchased from the library of the late Dr. Alexander F. Mitchell, of St. Andrew's.

All these copies contain the same edition of the Confession of Faith. The specialty of this edition is that it is the first (with the exception of the German translation of 1648) in which the Scriptural references are printed at length. They are placed in the side-margin, and when they occupy more room than it supplies they run beneath each section, so that each of these sections is accompanied by texts on one side and at the bottom. It is not known by whom the texts were extended: they were repeated as here given in subsequent editions (Glasgow, 1675; London, 1688, 1717; Edinburgh, 1708), but were superseded after 1719 by the form given them by Dunlop. For details, see Dunlop, I, p. clix, and Carruthers, p. 43. No promise is made on the title-page of "emphasizing" the proof texts in order to throw out more pointedly the exact words for which they are adduced: but they are so emphasized, although only for the first fourteen chapters of the Confession (not after chap. xiv and not in the Catechisms) *i. e.*, for pp. 1-50 of this edition.

This edition is the first of a series of the same general type, and is counted evidently by those responsible for their issue as "the first edition" of their enumeration. The "second edition" was "printed by E. M. for the Company

of Stationers," London, 1658, and exists in two forms: there are two "fourth editions," issued by R. Sanders, Glasgow, 1675, and James Watson, Edinburgh, 1708; the "third" (ignoring the Glasgow issue) appeared in London, 1688; and the "fifth" (perhaps recognizing the Glasgow or Edinburgh edition as entering into the enumeration) appeared in London, 1717. This last edition (1717) was apparently the copy used for the first American edition, published at Boston by D. Henchman and printed by S. Kneeland, 1723. It had no American successors of the same type and the series runs out with it. The feature of attempted emphasis in the proof-texts was not perpetuated in editions of other types: but it was revived as late as 1855 in an important edition published by Johnstone & Hunter, Edinburgh.

24. 1658] "The Confession of Faith, Together with the Larger and Lesser Catechisms. . . . Again Published with the Scriptures at large, and the Emphasis of the Scriptures in a different character. To which is added two sheets of Church Government with the Scriptures at large. [The Second Edition.] London, Printed by E. M. for the Company of Stationers, etc. 1658."—(CARRUTHERS).

4to, pp. [7], 4 [4], 329 [23]. There is a copy in the British Museum: "3554, bb. 11." And a copy is listed by Principal Lee. See CARRUTHERS, pp. 43, 44. The title is quoted above from Carruthers and may be filled out from the next entry, from which it is distinguished by its somewhat smaller size and by its reading "CATECHISMS" in Roman caps, instead of "Catechismes" in Roman lower case: the "first" Rothwell edition, given just above, has "CATECHISMES" in Roman caps and "WESTMINSTER" in italic caps, while both the "second" editions have the latter word in Roman caps. In both this and the edition immediately to be adduced, the enclosure of "The Second Edition" in square brackets is a feature of the title-page. The three Rothwell editions are closely related in text, and contain a number of common errors—*e. g.*, in the quotation from Rom. iii, 27, on p. 42, in each volume, which runs: "[v. 27] Where is boasting then, by what law of works, *but by the law of faith.*" This Carruthers justly calls "a muddle." A list of errata is printed in the last of the three editions.

- [25. 1658] The | Confession | of | Faith, | together with | the
Larger and Lesser | Catechismes. | Composed by the Reverend
| Assembly | of Divines, | Sitting at Westminster, | Presented
to both Houses of Parliament. | Again Published with the
Scriptures at Large, and the | Emphasis of the Scriptures
in a different Character. | To which is annexed two sheets of
Church Government with the | Scriptures at large. | [The
Second Edition.] || Deut. 6. 6, 7. . . . || London, Printed by
E. M., for the Company of Stationers, and are to be sold | by
John Rothwel at the Fountain in Cheapside. 1658.

Small 4to, 7½ x 4¾ inches (block of print); pp. [24], 302 [20]. This description is taken from a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia. Carruthers' description (p. 44) runs: pp. [9], 4 [6]; Conf. 1-56, 57-118 (errore 47-108); Larger Cat. 1-104 (errore 151-254), 105-155; Shorter Cat. 157-168, 169-194 (errore 139-164); Ch. Govt. 195-200 (errore 165-170), 201-212 (errore 300-302)." There is another copy of this edition in the

library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia. Copies of "[The Second Edition]" are also listed in the Catalogues of the New York State Library and of the library of Andover Theological Seminary: but it is not known to which of its two issues they belong. There is also a copy of this latest issue in the British Museum, "E. 751 (1.)." See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, pp. 43, 44; MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 528.

[26. 1659] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Edinburgh. . . . by Gideon Lithgow, 1659, 18mo."—(LEE).

18mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 4; CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 44.

[27. 1660] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1649 Ed.). First printed at Edinburgh and now reprinted at London for the Company of Stationers, 1660."—(CARRUTHERS).

12mo, pp. [6], 182 [2]. A copy in the British Museum, "3505. aa. 35." See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 45; MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 328.

[28. 1662] The Confession of Faith, etc. "London, . . . by J. H. for the Company of Stationers, 1662"—(LEE).

See LEE, as cited, p. 4; CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 45.

[29. 1669] The Confession of Faith, etc.—"Glasgow—by Robert Sanders, printer to the town, . . . 1669, 18mo."—(LEE).

18mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 4; CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 45.

[30. 1671] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . "The Summe of Saving Knowledge, etc.) 2 pt. *J. Glen & D. Trench*: Edinburgh, 1671"—(BRITISH MUSEUM CATALOGUE).

12mo. No. "3504. a, 19," in the British Museum.

[31 and 32. 1671] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in Ed. of 1649). Edinburgh, 1671."—(CARRUTHERS): "printed by Swinton & Brown"—(D. HAY FLEMING).

12mo, pp. 116. "The Summe of Saving Knowledge with the Practical Use Thereof" is added with separate title, without pagination (p. 55), beginning on sheet I, and extending to the middle of sheet L (Carruthers, p. 45). Dr. D. HAY FLEMING (*loc. cit.*, p. 323) speaks of two Edinburgh editions of 1671, printed by Swinton & Brown, of both of which the above is true. Apparently the error of punctuation on the half-title of the *Sum* in the Lithgow, 1650, etc., does not occur in this edition. Lee, *Memorial for the Bible Societies in Scotland*, 1824, p. 115, speaks of an edition of the Psalms "by Georg Swinton, 1671, in 12mo, bound with small Bibles or with the Confession of Faith."

[33. 1675] The | Confession | of | Faith, | Together with the | Larger and Lesser | Catechismes. | Composed by the Reverend Assembly of Divines, sitting at *Westminster*, | Presented to both Houses of | Parliament. | Again Published with the Scriptures at large, and the Emphasis of the | Scriptures in a different character. | To which is annexed two sheets of

Church Government with the Scriptures at large. | The fourth Edition, conform to the first original Copy diligently compared, all escapes corrected, | and more exact and correct than any that has been printed since. || Deut. vi, 6, 7. . . . || Printed at *London*, for the Company of Stationers, Anno 1658. And re-printed at *Glasgow*, by Robert | *Sanders*, Printer to the City and University, and are to be sold in his shop. 1675.

Small 4to; block of type, $6\frac{3}{4} \times 4\frac{1}{2}$ inches; pp. [22, partly unnumbered], 295, [7 = "Table"]. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 45. There is a copy in the library of the New College, Edinburgh: also copies in the libraries of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven and the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia. Why it is described as "the fourth Edition" is obscure: Carruthers (p. 45) thinks it is because "the person responsible for this issue seems to have been aware that three different issues were produced in 1658"—*i.e.*, the three Rothwell editions (the first unnumbered, the latter two both called "[The Second Edition]"). Dr. Mitchell (p. 528) does not mention this edition (possibly not having met with it), though he speaks of the (later) so-called "third" and the "fifth." These numbered editions run as follows: The first, though unnumbered, must be supposed to be the Rothwell first of 1658; then two Rothwell editions of 1658 are numbered "second;" the present edition of 1675 and an Edinburgh edition of 1708, "fourth;" the small London edition of 1688 "third;" and a large London edition of 1717 "fifth." Dr. D. HAY FLEMING, *loc. cit.*, p. 324, notes that this edition is notable for not containing the *Sum of Christian Knowledge*, the reason being obviously that it is a reprint of the Rothwell editions and is "conform to its first original copy," and does not represent the tradition meanwhile growing up in Scotland as to the contents of the volume. It was not until 1708 or 1717 that the *Sum* found its way into Confessions of this type: thence it was adopted into the first American edition of the Confession which appeared in Boston from the press of S. Kneeland in 1723. This American edition was the last published of this type.

[34. 1679] "The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . 1679"—(D. HAY FLEMING).

The "Advertisement" in the second volume of Dunlop's *Collection of Confessions* speaks of a copy of the Confession printed in Holland, in which occurs the well-known error in punctuation in the title to the *Sum of Saving Knowledge*, by which it is made to appear a document "agreed on by the Westminster Assembly." Dr. D. HAY FLEMING describes the volume in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for April, 1899 (x. 320-321): "The edition thus referred to as having been printed in Holland was probably that of 1679, which has neither printer's name nor place of issue, but bears an unmistakable resemblance to those covenanting books which were printed in Holland during the persecution. It contains the Confession, the Larger Catechism, the Shorter Catechism, the *Sum*, the National Covenant, the Solemn League, the Acknowledgment of Sins, the Directory for Public Worship, Propositions concerning Church Government, and the Directions for Private Worship. In all, it extends to 460 pages, and the pagination is continuous to the end." The *Sum* in it (unlike the Larger and Shorter Catechisms and the Directory) has not a separate title-page, but the half-title with which it opens is punctuated with a full stop after the word "Catechisms"—the error in question. This error was not, however, first perpetrated in this edition, as

Prof. Dunlop seems to have supposed, but goes back to the edition of Gideon Lithgow of 1650—the first edition in which the *Sum* appears. See the notes on that edition above; and in full D. HAY FLEMING, as cited.

- [35. 1687] “The Confession of Faith, and the Larger and Shorter Catechisms. First agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster. And now appointed by the General Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland, to be a part of Uniformity in Religion between the Kirks of Christ in the three Kingdoms. Together with the directions of the General Assembly concerning secret and private worship: and the Summe of saving knowledge, etc. 2 pt. Robert Sanders: Glasgow, 1687. 12mo.”—(BRITISH MUSEUM CATALOGUE).

12mo, pp. 153.

The British Museum number is “3506, aaa. 58. (1).” See also CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 46. Carruthers says “the Directories for Worship . . . and the Sum of Saving Knowledge added without pagination.”

- [36. 1688] The | Confession | of | Faith: | Together with the | Larger and Lesser | Catechisms. | Composed by the Reverend | Assembly of Divines, | Then sitting at | Westminster: | Presented to both Houses of | Parliament. | Again Published with the Scriptures at large, and | the Emphasis of the Scriptures in a different | character. | Licenced, April 30, 1688. | The Third Edition. Deut. 6. 6, 7. . . . || LONDON, Printed for the Company of Sta- | tioners, and are to be sold by *Tho. Parkhurst*, at | the *Bible and Three Crowns*, at the lower end | of *Cheapside*; and *Dorman Newman*, at the | *King's Arms* in the *Poultrey* | 1688.

16mo; block of type, 5½ x 2¾ inches; pp. 384. The proof-texts are put not in the margin, but *after* each section, in smaller type. The publisher ignores the Glasgow edition of 1675 which calls itself the “fourth,” and follows in immediate sequence the London Rothwells that call themselves “the second edition.” See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 46. There are copies in the libraries of the Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia.

- [37. 1688] “The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1649 Ed.). [Edinburgh.] Printed in the year 1688.”—(CARRUTHERS).

16mo, pp. 462. There is a copy in the library of the New College, Edinburgh. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 46. Cf. LEE, *loc. cit.*: “A neat and correct edition (used by the Presb. of *St. Andrew's*), . . . 1688, 18mo.” Cf. also D. HAY FLEMING, *loc. cit.*, p. 323, who notes that the pagination is continuous through the volume, and that the *Sum of Saving Knowledge* in it has the error in punctuation in its title noted in the case of edition 1650, Lithgow.

- [38. 1689] The Confession of Faith and the Larger and Shorter Catechisms. First agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster. And now approved by the General Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland, to be a part of Uniformity in

Religion between the Kirks of Christ in the three Kingdoms. Together with the sum of Saving Knowledge and the Practical use thereof. Edinburgh. Printed by John Reid, Anno Dom. MDCLXXXIX.

24mo, $4\frac{1}{2} \times 2\frac{1}{2}$ inches, pp. 340. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, of Philadelphia, purchased from the library of the late Prof. Mitchell. See also CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 46; and LEE, *loc. cit.*, p. 4; also D. HAY FLEMING, *loc. cit.*, p. 323, where it is noted that the title of the *Sum of Saving Knowledge* contained in this edition (pagination continuous) shows the same error of punctuation mentioned in the case of the Lithgow edition of 1650.

[39. 1690] The Confession of Faith, and the Larger and Shorter Catechisms first agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster, And now appointed by the General Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland, to be a part of Uniformity in Religion between the Kirks of Christ in the three Kingdoms. Together with the Directions of the General Assembly concerning secret and private Worship; and the Sum of Saving Knowledge with the practical Use thereof. Glasgow, Printed by Robert Sanders, One of His Majestie's Printers. 1690.

24mo, $4\frac{1}{2} \times 2\frac{1}{2}$ inches, pp. 146 + (defective at end). There is a copy in the library of Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia, purchased from the library of the late Prof. Mitchell. The proof-texts are not placed on the margin, but follow each section.

[40. 1690] The Confession of Faith, etc. 1690.

Folio: "After the Revolution, editions in 12mo, without the proofs printed at length, were published in Scotland in 1688-89 and 1690, and in the latter year one in folio for the use of Church Courts, which, like the copy engrossed in the records of the Scottish Parliament in the same year, does not contain the proofs, either in their abbreviated or lengthened form."—MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 528.

[41. 1693] "The Confession of Faith, etc., Glasgow, 1693" — (CARRUTHERS).

32mo, p. 195 (the Solemn Acknowledgment, etc., without pagination). See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 46. D. HAY FLEMING, *loc. cit.*, p. 323, notes a Glasgow edition (Robert Sanders) of 1693, which may be this one: in it the *Sum of Saving Knowledge* (paged continuously) exhibits the well-known error of punctuation in the title.

[42. 1694] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . "Edinburgh 1694, 18mo."—(LEE).

18mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 4.

[43. 1701] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Edinburgh by James Watson, Craig's Close 1701, 12mo."—(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 4.

- [44. 1703] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1649 Ed.). Glasgow, 1703"—(CARRUTHERS).
24mo, pp. 272. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 46.
- [45. 1707] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . "Edinburgh, . . . by James Watson, in Craig's Close. . . . 1707, 8vo."—(LEE).
8vo. See LEE, as cited, p. 4.
- [46. 1708] The | Confession | of | Faith, | Together with | The Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | Composed by the Reverend | Assembly of Divines | Sitting at Westminster | Presented to both | Houses of Parliament. | Again published with the Scriptures at large, and the | Emphasis of the Scriptures in a different character. | Together with the Directory, and all other Additions | that have been hitherto Printed. | The Fourth Edition. || Deut. 6. 6. 7. . . . || Edinburgh: Printed by James Watson, in Craig's Close. 1708 |
8vo, pp. 493. See LEE, as cited, p. 4. There is a copy in the Prince Collection, deposited in the Boston Public Library, "H. 69. 1." The numbering of the editions of this type is in a hopeless muddle. The Glasgow edition of 1675, printed by Robert Sanders, is also designated "The Fourth Edition." See further under the three Rothwell editions of 1658, and the London edition of 1717.
- [47. 1710] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . "Edinburgh, . . . by James Watson, opposite the Luckenbooths. . . . 1710, 8vo."—(LEE).
8vo. See LEE, as cited, p. 4.
- [48. 1711] The Confession of Faith, and the Larger and Shorter Catechisms: First agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster. And now appointed by the General Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland, to be a part of Uniformity in Religion, between the Kirks of Christ in the Three Kingdoms. Together with the Directions of the General Assembly concerning secret and private worship: and the Sum of Saving Knowledge with the practical use thereof. Glasgow, Printed by Robert Sanders, one of Her Majestie's Printers, 1711.
18mo, 5½ x 2½ inches, pp. 240. A copy is in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, of Philadelphia (from the library of the late Dr. Mitchell, of St. Andrew's).
- [49. 1714] The Confession of Faith; And the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, First Agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster. And now approved by the General Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland, to be a part of Uniformity in

Religion, between the Kirks of Christ in the Three Kingdoms. Together with the Directions of the General Assembly concerning secret and private worship, and the sum of saving knowledge with the practical use thereof. By Hugh Brown, Printer to the University of Glasgow, Anno Dom. M.DCC.XIV.

18mo, 4½ x 2½ inches; pp. 276. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, of Philadelphia. Cf. also CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 47, who describes it, however, as "12mo, pp. 277." See also LEE, as cited, p. 4, who adds: "the edition used by the Kirk Session of *Kirkaldy*." Also D. HAY FLEMING, *loc. cit.*, p. 324; the *Sum* is continuously paged and has the erroneous punctuation in the title.

[50. 1715] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1649 Ed.). Edinburgh, 1715"—(CARRUTHERS).

12mo, pp. 310. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 47. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. J. Sturrock, of Edinburgh. LEE, as cited, p. 4, enters an 18mo edition of 1715, printed by John Moncur, of Edinburgh. It is probably the same.

[51. 1717] The | Confession | of Faith, | Together with | the Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | Composed by the Reverend | Assembly of Divines | Sitting at Westminster, | Presented to both | Houses of Parliament. | Again published with the Scriptures at large, and the | Emphasis of the Scriptures in a different character. | Together with the Directory, and all the other Additions that have hitherto been Printed. | The fifth edition. || Deut. 6, 6, 7. . . . || London, | Printed for S. Cruttenden and T. Cox, at the Bible | and Three Crowns, in Cheapside, near Mercers- | Chappel. 1717. |

8vo, pp. 6½ x 3½ (block of type), pp. 400. Contains: (1) Confession; (2) and (3) the two Catechisms; (4) Church Government; (5) Ordinance for Calling the Assembly; (6) Vow Taken by its Members; (7) Advice on Ordination of Ministers; (8) certain notes, including the ordinance of 1648 reëstablishing Presbytery; (9) National Covenant and Solemn League and Covenant; (10) Directory for Public Worship; (11) for Private Worship; (12) the Sum of Saving Knowledge, etc. The proof-texts are arranged not at foot of the page, but after each section: the questions in the Catechisms are without the numbers. Dr. Mitchell (p. 528) says: "The fifth, bearing the date of 1717, is a large octavo, and perhaps the most handsomely printed of all these early editions of the Confession." Cf. also Carruthers, p. 47. There is a copy in the British Museum; also copies in the libraries of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia, and of the Massachusetts Historical Society. Lee tells us that this is "the edition used in the Presbytery of *Forfar*." D. Hay Fleming (*loc. cit.*, p. 324) tells us that the *Sum* is paged continuously and has the erroneous punctuation in its title. This edition was apparently the copy from which was prepared the first American edition, printed at Boston, in 1723, for D. Henchman, by S. Kneeland. There were no other successors in England or America of this type.

[52. 1719] The | Confession of Faith, | Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | with the | Directory | for | Family-Worship, | of Publick Authority in the | Church of Scotland. || [ornament] || Edinburgh, | Printed by James Watson, His Majesty's | Printer. MDCCXIX.

16mo (or small 8vo), $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type); pp. clv-clxviii + 1 — 458 + [25 = "Table"] in: "A | Collection | of | Confessions of Faith, | Catechisms, | Directions, | Books of Discipline, &c. | of Publick Authority in the | Church of Scotland, | &c. | Vol. I. | . . . Edinburgh, | Printed by James Watson, His Majesty's | Printer. MDCCXIX." After the long preface, which is devoted to a defense of creeds and confessions, a new title-page occurs, as above. This constitutes the remainder of the volume a separable entity, and it was accordingly issued also separately. The Confession of Faith, again, has itself a separate title: "The | Confession of Faith, | Agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines | at | Westminster: | With the Assistance of | Commissioners | from the | Church of Scotland; | Approved by the *General Assembly* 1647, | and ratified and established by *Act of Parliament* 1690, as the publick and a | vowed CONFESSIO^N OF THE CHURCH OF SCOTLAND: | With the Proofs from the Scripture. || [ornament] || Edinburgh, | Printed by James Watson, His Majesty's Printer. | MDCCXIX."

This is one of the most beautiful editions of the Confession of Faith ever printed (though some impressions were also issued on inferior paper), and certainly reached the high-water mark yet attained in its critical editing. The whole enterprise was never completed: its editor—the young and gifted William Dunlop, Professor of Divinity and Church History in the University of Edinburgh—having died in 1720 at the early age of twenty-eight, before the projected third volume could be published.* But the part published forms an admirable monument to his memory. He not only prefixed to the whole what Dr. Mitchell fitly calls "a memorable preface in defense of Confessions of Faith" † (*op. cit.*, p. 528), but he carefully edited the text and proof-texts alike and compiled a new "Table," which has superseded the older "Table" in all later editions. The work indeed marks an epoch in the publication of the documents it includes and has ever since ranked as the standard edition. The proof-texts are printed in greatly improved form, in two columns, occupying the lower portion of the page. The *Sum of Saving Knowledge* is omitted, as never having received "the publick approbation of the Church": whereabouts there arose something of a controversy, which issued in the publication of a rival "Collection" in 1725. For an account of this

* William Dunlop was born in 1692 and died in 1720. Besides his *Collection* and the separate publication of the *Preface*, he published an admirable sketch of the Life and Character of William Guthrie, prefixed to that author's *The Christian's Great Interest*. After his death there were published two volumes of his *Sermons Preached on Several Subjects and Occasions*, to which is prefixed a sketch of his *Life*. See, besides this, the article in the *Dict. of Nat. Biog.*, XVI, 209.

† This *Preface* was also separately published, 1720: and a second edition appeared at London, 1724 (8vo, pp. 195), and a third at Edinburgh, 1775. A new edition of it was put forth some years ago under the care of Dr. James Buchanan, of New College, Edinburgh. See concerning it, A. Taylor Innis, *The Law of Creeds in Scotland* (he calls it "the most respectable book in Scotland, and perhaps in the English tongue," on its subject), p. 107; also Lee's *History of the Church of Scotland*, I, 145; Wodrow's *Correspondence*, II, 176; III, 186, 200 sq.

edition, see CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, pp. 47, 48, and D. HAY FLEMING, *loc. cit.* There are copies in the libraries of the Princeton Theological Seminary and of Union Theological Seminary, New York, and of Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

The portion of the first volume containing the Confession of Faith (pp. clv-clxviii, 1-458 [25 = "Table"]) consists: (1) Of the title-page, already given, which constitutes p. clv. (2) On the back of this title-page is the following note: "Assembly 1649. Sess. 30. The General Assembly——ordains every Minister, with the Assistance of the Elders of their several Kirk-Sessions, to take Course, that in every House——there be at least one Copy of the Shorter and Larger Catechism, Confession of Faith, and Directory for Family Worship." The contents of this (separable) portion of the work is accordingly determined by this enumeration, and it therefore constitutes a handbook for the ends here contemplated. (3) An "Advertisement concerning this edition of the Confession of Faith and Catechisms," pp. clvii-clxii. (4) "A list of the Divines who met in the Assembly at Westminster," pp. clxiii-clxiv. (5) Separate title to the Confession, with obverse blank, pp. [clxv-clxvi]. (6) Contents of the Confession, pp. clxvii-clxviii. (7) Text of the Confession, pp. 1-160. (8) Text of Larger Catechism, with separate title, pp. 161-392 (with analytical headlines). (9) Text of the Shorter Catechism, with separate title, pp. 393-444 (headline continuously, simply "*The Shorter Catechism*," even when, as on pp. 441-444, the matter is rather the Ten Commandments and the Apostles' Creed). (10) The Directory for Family Worship, with separate title, pp. 445-458 (no headlines); the last page containing the "Acts of the General Assembly relating to Family Worship." (11) The "Table."

The "Advertisement" (pp. clvii-clxii) recites that this edition was prepared by the direction and assistance of a Committee of Ministers and Ruling-elders, appointed by the Commission of the General Assembly in pursuance of an order of the Assembly "to take care that the Confession of Faith, Catechisms, &c., might be rendered as correct and as complete as might be." Of this committee the gentlemen who undertook the publishing of this edition were members: and they had bestowed large labor on it and "employed all the Methods they could, to purge it from Errors which had crept into former Impressions, and to dispose everything in the most convenient Order, and render it at least tolerably perfect." For the Confession they had diligently compared the editions printed by order of the House of Commons December 7, 1646, and April 29, 1647, that printed by order of the Scotch Assembly, August 9, 1647, the Latin version, and several others, "particularly two London impressions in *quarto*, one of which is well-printed on a large fine paper." * Both text and proofs had been carefully corrected, and examples are given of the errors that had crept into the proof-texts and are here corrected. They had, however, avoided corrections by conjecture, even where an error seemed altogether probable or certain—of which examples are given, viz., in chapter v, § 3, where Job 34, 10, is printed, whereas 34, 20, is probably meant; chapter xviii, § 2, where Eph. 3, 13, 14, is given when Eph. 1, 13, 14, is certainly meant.

There seems to be distinctly expressed in this Advertisement a claim to authorization by the Church courts for the edition itself and to supervision by these courts of even its details. This became the occasion of considerable embarrassment to these courts when it appeared that certain features of the new edition were offensive to a considerable body of their constituency. Strong dissatisfaction was expressed particularly with the omission from the collection of the Solemn League and Covenant, the Act of Assembly of 1647 ap-

* Doubtless the Rothwell editions are meant. °

proving the Confession of Faith, and the Sum of Christian Knowledge. Moved by the agitation that was raised, the Commission of the Assembly busied itself to secure from the promoters of the enterprise a correction of the alleged faults in a promised third volume, and meanwhile sought to detach itself from any such responsibility for the details of the work as seemed to be implied. The principal facts seem to be as follows: The General Assembly of 1717 instructed the Commission "to take the most effectual course to get the printing, binding and importing of incorrect copies of the Holy Scripture, and of our Confession of Faith and Catechisms, stopped and prevented." James Watson and others, his friends, thereupon represented to the Commission that they designed to print the Confession and Catechisms, and desired that some members of the Commission should be appointed to oversee the printing and grant their assistance: and this the Commission acceded to, August, 1717. This committee reported on May 29, 1718, that they had performed their work, and recommended the appointment of a new committee to revise and correct the remaining books: this was done and the committee reappointed and enlarged, May 26, 1719. It seems to be quite clear from the records that the whole work of printing and publishing the edition was carried out under the supervision of this committee. "It was agreed in one of their meetings," we read in a report of a later committee set to ascertain the facts in the matter, "that the Westminster Confession of Faith, and the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, and Directory for Family Worship, should be published as the first volume, as being most necessary, which was accordingly done, and the committee was therein approved by the Commission, May 29, 1718." "Likeways," it is continued, "it was agreed in another meeting of the Committee, That the other Confessions of Faith, Catechisms, and Books relating to the Doctrine, Worship, Discipline, and Government of this Church, should be Correctly printed according to the order of time in which they were authorized." It is also acknowledged that the committee reported on the correctness and beauty of the first volume, and was approved therein by the Commission. Nevertheless in 1727-1728 the Commission repudiates anything more than general responsibility for the work, and specifically denies that it can be held chargeable for any omissions or imperfections which may be chargeable to it. The agitation resulted in the publication of another and rival "Collection," which issued from the press of Thomas Lumisden and John Robertson in 1725. In the preface to this it is said that just complaint had been made of the earlier "Collection" that "some things of no small moment belonging to such a Collection, and in use to be printed and bound with former editions of our *Westminster Confession* are left out; and that others that have no pretense thereto are inserted." For the whole matter, see LEE'S *Additional Memorial*, etc., p. 181, etc., of the Appendix, where the records of the Commission of the Assembly are extracted, and cf. p. 133* of the same volume and p. 190 sq. of his *Memorial*.

[53. 1719] The | Confession of Faith, | Larger and Shorter |
 Catechisms, | etc. [as in the immediately preceding entry].
 Edinburgh, | Printed by James Watson, His Majesty's
 | Printer. M.DCC.XIX.

16mo, pp. clv-clxviii, 458 + [25]. This is a separately issued impression of this portion of Dunlop's "Collection." There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia.

[54. 1721] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow,
 by James Duncan, printer to the city, 1721, 18mo."—
 (LEE).

18mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

- [55. 1723] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Edinburgh, by William Brown & Company, 1723, 12mo." —(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

- [56. 1725] The Confession of Faith Agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster with the Assistance of the Commissioners from the Church of Scotland as a part of the Covenanted Uniformity in Religion betwixt the Churches of Christ in the Three Kingdoms of Scotland, England and Ireland, with an Act of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, Anno 1647, Approving the Confession of Faith, Together with an Act of Parliament 1649, Ratifying and Establishing the Same. With Proofs from the Scripture. Edinburgh, Printed by Thomas Lumisden and John Robertson. MDCCXXV.

Small 8vo, 5½ x 3 inches (block of type), pp. 109-372, in :—"The Confessions of Faith, Catechisms, Directories, Form of Government, Discipline, etc., of publick Authority in the Church of Scotland: Together with the Acts of Assembly, concerning the Doctrine, Worship, Discipline and Government of the Church of Scotland. Also a collection of some Principal Acts and Ordinances of the Parliament of Scotland and England, and of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, in favor of the Covenanted Reformation. To which is added the Form of Process in the Judicatories of the Church of Scotland, with relation to Scandals and Censures: as also Several Acts and Overtures of the General Assemblies thereanent: And other things of a publick and interesting Nature. Edinburgh. Printed by Thomas Lumisden and John Robertson, and are to be sold by the Booksellers in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Stirling and Linlithgow. M.DCC.XXV." [8vo, pp. xx, 560.] This is the first edition of the rival "Collection" published on account of dissatisfaction with the "Collection" of 1719-1723, edited by Dunlop—because "some things of no small moment belonging to such a Collection, and in use to be printed and bound with former editions of our Westminster Confession" [the *Sum* and Solemn League and Covenant are particularly meant] "are left out, and others which have no pretense thereto are inserted." In printing the *Sum* here the error of punctuation is not repeated. The Form of Church Government and Directory for Worship precede the Confession and Catechisms. Other editions of this Collection were published in 1739, 1761, 1764, 1771 and 1785. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 48; D. HAY FLEMING, as cited, pp. 318, 321; LEE, as cited, p. 5. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia.

- [57. 1725] The Confession of Faith, Larger and Shorter Catechisms, Agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster, with the Assistance of Commissioners from the Church of Scotland, As a Part of the Covenanted Uniformity in Religion betwixt the Churches of Christ in the Three Kingdoms, Scotland, England, and Ireland. Translated into the Irish Language by the Synod of Argyle. Entered in Stationers' Hall. Edinburgh, Printed by Thomas Lumisden

and John Robertson, and sold at their Printing-house in the Fish-market. MDCCXXV.

12mo, pp. viii, 276. The Confession of Faith (Irish title, p. 3: Admhail an Chreidimh, etc.) occupies pp. 3-104; the Larger Catechism (Irish title, p. 105: An Cataichiosm, etc.), pp. 105-240; the Shorter Catechism (Irish title, p. 241: Foirceadul Aithghearn Coasmeich, etc.), pp. 241 *sq.* There is a copy in the British Museum, "875, a. 36;" and also in the Lenox Library, New York. A second edition, 12mo, pp. viii, 286, was published at Edinburgh, T. Lumisden & J. Robertson, 1727; and a third, 12mo, pp. viii, 285, at Glasgow, J. Orr, 1756, 1757. Copies of both are in the British Museum, Nos. "3504, a. 52" and "3505, a. 23."

As early as 1699 the General Assembly sought to have an Irish translation of the Confession made.* The circumstances attending the actual preparation of the version, however, are preserved in the records of the Assembly's Commission. A petition was presented by Thomas Lumisden, Printer, to the Commission of the Assembly, August 11, 1725, which recited the following facts. "There never having been any translation of the Confession of Faith and Catechisms of this Church in that language, the people are at a great loss thereby, and this having been under the Assembly's Consideration Anno 1708, they referred to the Synod of Argyle to prepare a translation of the said Confession and Catechisms in the Irish language, which they having done did make their Report to the General Assembly, 1709. But they not having a fund for printing the same; it lay over till the year 1713; that the Assembly did refer the matter to their Commission: But their funds being exhausted and considerable demands thereon for some time then to come, the Right Honorable John Campbell, Esq., now Lord Provost of Edinburgh, was pleased to give some encouragement of this undertaking, and thereupon the printing was begun. But the Printer having died a little thereafter, the book stopped, and the Petitioner having bought part of the types belonging to the Printers for the Church, as also got their rights to some accounts due by the Church, with some books on hand, and this among the rest, not then finished, and being employed for some time to print the Church's papers, the Petitioner did set about the finishing of this work, and now has got it complete." The petition goes on to state that the book was unsalable on account of the scarcity of money in the Highlands, that it was undertaken under the hope of a connection with the Church which had subsequently failed, and that only 2000 copies were struck off; and then to petition the Commission to purchase the edition for gratuitous distribution in the Highlands. This was ultimately done at the price of sixpence apiece, unbound.—See LEE, *Additional Memorial, etc.*, pp. 178 *sq.*

[58. 1727] The Confession of Faith, Larger and Shorter Catechisms, First agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster. And now Appointed by the General Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland, to be a Part of Uniformity in Religion between the Kirks of Christ in the Three Kingdoms. Together with the Sum of Saving Knowledge, and the Practical Use thereof. Glasgow, Printed by James Duncan, and

*Synod of Argyle recommended to translate the Confession of Faith, etc., into the Irish Language, 1699, xvi; 1708, ult.; 1713, 8 (Wilson's *Index to Acts, etc.*, 1863, p. 901).

are to be sold at his Shop in the Salt-market near Gibson's Wynd. M.DCC.XXVII.

18mo, $4\frac{7}{8} \times 2\frac{5}{8}$ (type), pp. 340. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia. See also LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[59. 1727] The Confession of Faith, "Edinburgh, by T. Lumsden and J. Robertson, 1727, 8vo."—(LEE).

8vo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[60. 1728] The | Confession of Faith, | The Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | with the Scripture-proofs at large. | Together with | the Sum of Saving Knowledge | (contain'd in the Holy Scriptures, and | held forth in the said Confession and Cat- | echisms) and Practical Use thereof, | Covenants National and | Solemn League, | Acknowledgment | of Sins and Engage- ment to Duties, | Directories, Form of Church-Government, etc. | Of Publick Authority in the | Church of Scotland. | With Acts of Assembly and Parliament, relative to, | and approbative of the same. || Deut. vi. 6, 7. || Edin- burgh, | Printed by *Thomas Lumisden* and *John Robertson*, and sold at | their Printing-house in the *Fish-Market*, and at the shops of | Mr. Andrew Martin, John Paton, Hugh Deans, and William | Sands, in the Parliament-Close. M.DCC.XXVIII.

12mo, 6 x $3\frac{3}{4}$ inches (type), pp. 552 [23 = "Table"]. This is the first edition in which are included the various documents found in the authorized editions of the Confession. The text is taken from Dunlop, so far as the documents are contained in his volumes" (CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 49). There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia.

[61. 1732] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow, by William Duncan, Saltmarket. . . . 1732, 18mo." —(LEE).

18mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[62. 1732] The | Confession of Faith, | Larger and Shorter | Catechisms; | First agreed upon by the Assembly of Di- | vines at Westminster: | And now appointed by the General Assembly of the | Kirk of Scotland to be a part of Uni- formity | in religion, between the Kirks of Christ | in the three Kingdoms. | Together with the Sum of Saving Knowledge, | and the practical use thereof. | Glasgow, | Printed by James Duncan, and are to be sold | at his Shop in the middle of the Salt-market | near Gibson's Wynd. MDCCLXXXII.

24mo, $5\frac{1}{4} \times 3\frac{1}{4}$ inches (type), pp. 344, 2. The last two pages (separately paged) contain, as a "Postscript," the long quotation from "a very learned and godly divine" that forms the bulk of "Thomas Manton's Epistle to

the Reader," which appears as the second piece prefixed to current Scotch editions of the Confession. This edition is mentioned by CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 49, and LEE, as cited, p. 5; and a copy of it is in the library of the Western Theological Seminary at Allegheny, Pa.

[63. 1735] The | Confession | of | Faith | with the Larger and Shorter | Catechisms | First agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines | at Westminster, | And now appointed by the | General Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland to | be a part of Uniformity in Religion, between the | Kirks of Christ in the three Kingdoms. | Together with the Sum of Saving Knowledge, and the practical use thereof. | Edinburgh: | Printed in the year M.DCC.XXXV.

12mo, 4½ x 3½ inches (type); pp. iv, 264, + (mutilated in the midst of the Form of Government). Contains: Confession, Larger and Shorter Catechisms, Sum and Practical Use, Covenants, Acknowledgment, Directory for Public Worship, Form of Government +. The proof-texts are given by reference only. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia.

[64. 1735] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . "Edinburgh, . . . by T. Lumsden and J. Robertson. . . . 1735, 8vo." —(LEE).

8vo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[65. 1736] "The Confession of Faith, &c. Glasgow, 1736."—(CARRUTHERS). "By Messrs. Carmichael and Miller"—(LEE).

12mo, pp. 312. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 49, and LEE, as cited, p. 5. There is a copy in the library of the New College, Edinburgh.

[66. 1739] "The Confession of Faith, &c. (as in 1725 Ed.). Edinburgh, 1739."—(CARRUTHERS). "By T. Lumsden and J. Robertson"—(LEE).

8vo, pp. 560. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 49; LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[67. 1741]¹ The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow. Collection of Confessions. . . . 1741"—(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[68. 1743] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow. . . . By Urie & Company, . . . 1743, 12mo."—(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[69. 1744] "The Confession of Faith, &c. (as in 1649 Ed.). Edinburgh, 1744"—(CARRUTHERS). "By T. Lumsden and J. Robertson"—(LEE).

16mo, pp. 314. See CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 49; LEE, as cited, p. 5 (LEE says 8vo). There is a copy in the United Presbyterian Hall, Edinburgh

The erroneous punctuation in the title to the *Sum*, by which it is made to appear that it was "Agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines," is corrected in this edition, the period after the word "Catechisms" becoming a comma. See D. HAY FLEMING, as cited, p. 324.

[70. 1744] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Edinburgh. . . .
T. Lumsdea & J. Robertson. . . . 1744, 12mo."—(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[71. 1745] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow, by
J. Robertson and Mrs. McLean. . . . 1745, 18mo."—(LEE).

18mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[72. 1746] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow, by
J. Robertson. . . . 1746, 18mo."—(LEE).

18mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[73. 1746] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow,
by D. Duncan. . . . 1746, 12mo."—(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[74. 1749] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow,
by J. Robertson and Mrs. McLean. . . . 1749, 8vo."—
(LEE).

8vo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[75. 1749] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow, by
Jo. Hall. . . . 1749"—(LEE).

— See LEE, as cited, p. 5. The error of punctuation in the title to *The Sum* is corrected in this edition ("Catechisms: Agreed on"): see D. HAY FLEMING, as cited, p. 324.

[76. 1749] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Glasgow, by
W. Duncan. . . . 1749, 8vo."—(LEE).

8vo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[77. 1752] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1728 Ed.).
Glasgow, James Knox, 1752."—(CARRUTHERS).

8vo, pp. 546 and Table. See CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 50; LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[78. 1753] The Confession of Faith, the Larger and Shorter
Catechisms with the Scripture Proofs at Large, together with,
etc. [as in the ed. Edinburgh, Lumisden and Robertson,
1728]. . . . Glasgow. | Printed by William Duncan, and
sold at his shop in the Salt-Market, in Gibson's Land.
MDCCLIII.

8vo, 6 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 3 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type), pp. 544 + "Table" (unnumbered).
Contains all the matter now included in the Scotch editions (as did the

Lumisdén & Robertson of 1728). There is a copy in the library of J. B. Walter, M.D., Solisbury, Pa.

[79. 1753] The Confession of Faith, etc. [as in the ed. Edinburgh, Lumisdén and Robertson, 1728]. . . . Glasgow, | Printed by John Robertson, Senior, and sold at his shop in the Salt-Market. MDCCLIII.

8vo, 4½ x 7 inches (block of type), pp. —. Listed also by LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[80. 1755] The Confession of Faith, etc., "Glasgow, by J. Bryce & D. Paterson, 1755, 12mo."—(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[81. 1756] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1728 Ed.). Edinburgh, 1756"—(CARRUTHERS). [E. Robertson?—(LEE).]

8vo, pp. 546 + "Table" (unnumbered), which is much contracted from the heading "Saints" (CARRUTHERS). See CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 50, and LEE, as cited, p. 5. There is a copy of this edition in the library of the New College, Edinburgh. Cf. D. HAY FLEMING, as cited, p. 324 (error of punctuation in title to *Sum* corrected).

[82. 1756] The Confession of Faith, etc. "Edinburgh, by E. Robertson. . . . 1756, 12mo."—(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[83. 1756] The Confession of Faith, etc. Glasgow, by Jo. Robertson, 1756"—(LEE).

— . See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[84. 1757] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1728 Ed.). Edinburgh, 1757."—(CARRUTHERS). "By E. Robertson"—(LEE).

12mo, pp. 321. See CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 50; LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[85. 1757] The | Confession of Faith, | The Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | with the Scripture-proofs at large. | Together with | the Sum of Saving Knowledge (con- | tain'd in the Holy Scriptures, and held forth in the | said Confession and Catechisms) and Practial | Use thereof, Covenants, National and | Solemn League, Acknowledgment | of Sins and Engagement to Duties, | Directories, Form of Church-Go- | vernment, etc. | Of publick Authority in the | Church of Scotland, | With | Acts of Assembly and Parliament, relative to, and | approbative of, the same. | Deut. vi. 6, 7. . . . | Glasgow: | Printed by Archibald McLean, | For John Orr, Bookseller in the Salt-Market. | M,DCC,LVII. |

Small 8vo, 6½ x 3⅞ inches, pp. (continuous paging throughout) 546 [22].

Each part has its separate title-page with full imprint as above. There is a copy in the library of the Union Theological Seminary, New York. See also LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[86. 1761] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1725 Ed.). Glasgow, 1761"—(CARRUTHERS). "For R. Duncan, Salt-market"—(LEE).

8vo, pp 560, 72. See CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 50; LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[87. 1761] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . "Glasgow, . . . by John Bryce, 1761"—(LEE).

12mo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[88. 1762] The | Confession of Faith, | The Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | etc. (as in the ed. Edinburgh, Lumisden and Robertson, 1728). . . . Glasgow: | Printed by William Duncan, and sold at his shop in | the Salt-Market, in Gibson's Land. M.DCCLXII.

8vo, $6\frac{3}{8} \times 3\frac{5}{8}$ inches (type), pp. 546 + [22 = "Table"]. See also LEE, as cited, p. 5. There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, and of Harvard University.

[89. 1763] The | Confession of Faith, | etc [as in ed. Edinburgh, Lumisden and Robertson, 1728]. . . . Glasgow: | Printed in the year M.DCC.LXIII.

8vo, $7 \times 3\frac{7}{8}$, pp. 544 [22 = "Table"]. See also LEE, as cited, p. 5. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Cravcn, Philadelphia.

[90. 1764] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . [as in the ed. of the Collection, published in 1725]. . . . Printed in the year 1764.

Small 8vo, $5\frac{3}{8} \times 2\frac{7}{8}$ inches (type), pp. 265-334, in:—"The | Confessions of Faith, | Catechisms, Directories, Form of Church | Government, Discipline, etc., | —[as in edition of 1725]—Glasgow: | Printed and sold by John Bryce, at his shop | in the Salt-market, 1764. | " 12mo, pp. 632. There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, and of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia. See also CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 51; LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[91. 1765] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1728 Ed.). Glasgow, R. and A. Foulis, 1765"—(CARRUTHERS).

8vo, pp. 597 and Table. See CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 51; LEE, as cited, p. 5. Lee remarks that "this edition is used by the Presbytery of *Nairn*."

[92. 1766] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . Glasgow, 1766.

8vo. Listed in the catalogue of the library of the Boston Athenæum. There is apparently a (mutilated) copy also in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[93. 1767] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . Glasgow, 1767.

8vo. Listed in the catalogue of the library of Andover Theological Seminary.

[94. 1768] The Confession of Faith, "Glasgow, for Alexander Weir, Paisley 1768, 8vo."—(LEE).

8vo. See LEE, as cited, pp. 5. The catalogue of the library of Andover Theological Seminary enters a copy, "Glasgow, 1768," which may be this.

[95. 1768] The | Confession of Faith, | The Larger and Shorter
| Catechisms | with the Scripture Proofs at large, | Together
with, etc. [as in the ed. Edinburgh, Lumisden and Robertson,
1728]. | Printed in the year MDCCLXVIII.

Small 8vo, 6 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (type), pp. 546 + "Table" (unnumbered). The matter is so disposed on the title-page that the enumeration of the pieces contained, from "the Sum of Saving Knowledge" to "Form of Church Government," falls into two parallel columns. This edition is a rather puzzling one. It has on the general title-page no place of issue or publisher's name, but on some of the distinct titles it bears to have been printed at Glasgow. It contains the matter usual to the type of Confession following that of 1728 and now current in the authorized Scotch editions. Four copies of it have been examined. In all the separate title to the Confession of Faith is the same, to wit:—"The | Confession of Faith, | Agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines | at | Westminster, | with the Assi-stance of | Commissioners | from the | Church of Scotland, | as | a part of the Covenanted Uniformity in Religion betwixt | the Churches of Christ in the Kingdoms of Scotland, | England and Ireland. | Approved by the General Assembly 1647, and ratified and | established by Act of Parliament 1649, as the public and | avowed Confession of the Church of Scot- | land. | With the proofs from the Scripture. | Printed in the year MDCCLXVIII." And in all the text of the Confession exhibits the same phenomenal corruption: *e. g.*, p. 33, title to chap. iii, "Of God's Eternal Decrees" (*sic.*: plural); p. 65, title to chapter ix, "Chap. x (*sic.*, *Of Free Will*"; p. 70, chap. x, § 3, "Elect infants by (*sic*) dying in infancy." But the separate titles to the other pieces in the volume do not always correspond with its professed date. In a copy, for example, in the library of the Rev. Dr. Eugene Daniel, of Raleigh, N. C., the separate title to the Larger Catechism (p. 165, in the midst of sheet L, which runs through pp. 161-176) is dated 1768; that to the Shorter Catechism (p. 379, in the midst of sheet Aa = pp. 369-334) bears the imprint "Glasgow: | Printed in the year MDCC,LXX"; that to the *Sum* (p. 423, in midst of sheet Dd. = pp. 417-432) is dated 1755, and the same date (1755) appears also on the distinct title-pages of "The Confession of Faith of the Kirk of Scotland" (p. 451), of the Solemn League (p. 463), of the Acknowledgment (p. 471), of the Directory (p. 481), of the Form of Government (p. 511), and of the Directory for Family Worship (p. 541). Another copy, the property of Mr. Joseph Coles, of Blackwood, N. J. (an ancestor of whom bought it in 1772 from Benjamin Chestnutt), bears the date of 1755 on the distinct title to the Shorter Catechism and all that follows after it. To cap the climax of confusion in dates, a (mutilated) copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, has the name of a former owner written on the top of p. 3, thus: "Allen W. Lane, Philadelphia, 1760"—*i. e.*, eight years before it pro-esses to have been printed, according to its separate title to the Confession on p. 19 (1768). There is a copy also in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[96. 1769] "The Confession of Faith, with the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, etc. (as in 1649 Ed.). Glasgow, 1769" —(CARRUTHERS). "By J. Robertson"—(LEE).

24mo, pp. 288. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 51; LEE, as cited, p. 5. A copy is in the possession of the Rev. John Sturrock, of Edinburgh.

[97. 1771] The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1725 Ed.). . . . Glasgow: Printed by Robert & Thomas Duncan, and sold at | their shop, Pope's-Head Salt-Market | MDCCLXXI.

8vo, pp. 265-323 in: "The Confessions of Faith, Catechisms, etc.," of this date (see first edition of 1725). 8vo, pp. 632. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia; and another in the library of the New College, Edinburgh. See also CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 51.

[98. 1771] "The Confession of Faith, etc. Glasgow, 1771, 16mo"—(CARRUTHERS).

16mo. See CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 51. There is a copy in the library of New College, Edinburgh.

[99. 1771] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . "Edinburgh, . . . 1771, 8vo."—(LEE).

8vo. See LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[100. 1773] The Confession of Faith, the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, with the Scripture Proofs at large, together with, etc. (as in the ed. Edinburgh, Lumisden and Robertson, 1728). . . . Edinburgh, Printed for Alex. Kincaid, His Majesty's Printer. M.DCC.LXXIII.

8vo, $6\frac{3}{4} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches, pp. 546 [22 = "Table"]. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[101. 1781] The Confession of Faith; | the | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the Scripture Proofs at Large. | Together with, etc. (as in the ed. Edinburgh, Lumisden and Robertson, 1728). . . . Edinburgh: | Printed by the Assigns of Alexander Kincaid, His Majesty's Printer. | MDCCLXXXI.

12mo, $5\frac{1}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{2}$ inches (type), pp. 600 [24 = "Table"]. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[102. 1785] The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in the ed. of 1725). . . . GLASGOW: | Printed by JOHN BRYCE. | Sold by W. MARTIN, *Edinburgh*; W. KNIGHT, *Aberdeen*; W. CLYDE, *Perth*, etc. . . . | MDCCLXXXV.

8vo, $6\frac{1}{4} \times 3\frac{1}{2}$ (type), pp. 215-266, in: "The Confessions of Faith, Catechisms, etc. [as in the first edition of this collection, 1725]. Glasgow. | Printed by John Bryce | 1785." 8vo, pp. 522. Proofs given by reference only. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia. See also CARRUTHERS, as cited, p. 52; LEE, as cited, p. 5.

[103. 1788] The | Confession of Faith; | The | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the | Scripture-Proofs at large: | Together with | The Sum of Saving Know- | ledge, (con-

tained in the | Holy Scriptures, and held | forth in the said
 Confession | and Catechisms,) and | Practical Use thereof. |
 Covenants, National and | Solemn League. | Acknowledg-
 ment of | Sins, and Engagement | to Duties. | Directories for
 Publick | and Family Worship. | Form of Church-govern- |
 ment, etc. | Of public authority | in the | Church of Scot-
 land. | With | Acts of Assembly and Parliament, relative to,
 and | approbative of the same. || Deut. vi. 6, 7. [Five lines of
 italic type]. || Edinburgh: | Printed by the Assigns of Alex-
 ander Kincaid, His Majesty's Printer. | MDCCLXXXVIII. |

8vo, $6\frac{1}{2} \times 3\frac{9}{16}$ inches, pp. 600, + "Table." The matter on title-page from
 "The Sum of Saving Know-" to "ment," &c. | is printed in two columns
 divided by two parallel lines. The first column ends with the word
 "League." See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 52. There are copies in the British
 Museum ("3505. bb. 19") and in the library of the Union Theological
 Seminary, New York.

[104. 1793] The | Confession of Faith: | The | Larger and
 Shorter Catechisms, | with the Scripture-Proofs at Large: |
 Together with, etc. (as in the ed. Edinburgh, Lumisden and
 Robertson, 1728). . . . Edinburgh: | Printed by Mark and
 Charles Kerr, His Majesty's Printers. | MDCCXCIII.

16mo, $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches (type), pp. 600 [26 = "Table"]. There are copies in
 the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton and of the Rev. E. R.
 Craven, Philadelphia.

[105. 1810] "The Confession of Faith; etc. (as in 1728 Ed.).
 Edinburgh, Sir D. Hunter Blair and J. Bruce, 1810"—(CAR-
 RUTHERS).

8vo, pp. 600 + "Table." See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 54. This is the ear-
 liest edition of this form that we have met with, but the patent creating them
 royal printers, with "the sole and unique privilege of printing in Scotland Holy
 Bibles, New Testaments, Psalm Books, Books of Common Prayer, Confessions
 of Faith, Larger and Shorter Catechisms in the English language," in suc-
 cession after Alexander Kincaid, was dated November 2, 1788, and came into
 operation July, 1798, when the preceding patents terminated (see LEE, *Memo-
 rial for the Bible Societies in Scotland*, Edinburgh, 1824, pp. viii, ix).

[106. 1815] The | Confession of Faith; | the | Larger and Shorter
 Catechisms, | with the | Scripture-Proofs at Large; | together
 with, etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edin-
 burgh, 1728). . . . Edinburgh: | Printed by Sir D. Hunter
 Blair and J. Bruce, | Printers to the King's Most Excellent
 Majesty. | 1815.

12mo, pp. 600 [24 = "Table"]. There is a copy in the library of the Pres-
 byterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[107. 1841] The | Confession of Faith; etc. (as in the ed. of Lum-
 isden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . | Printed by

Authority. | Edinburgh : Printed by Sir D. Hunter Blair and M. S. Tyndall Bruce, | Late Printers to the Queen's Most Excellent Majesty. | MDCCCXLI.

12mo, 6 x 3½ inches (type block), pp. 600 [23 = "Table"]. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia.

[108. 1842] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1728 Ed.). Glasgow, 1842."—(CARRUTHERS).

12mo, pp. 370. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 55.

[109. 1843] The | Confession of Faith ; | the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the | Scripture-Proofs at large, | together with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge, etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . | Printed by Authority : | Glasgow : Francis Orr & Sons. | 1843.

12mo, 5½ x 3½ inches, pp. 370 + 14 renumbered for the "Table." This is the first edition we have met with issued by the house of Francis Orr & Sons, who are still doing business under the same name. A letter to them elicited no definite information—"all our records having been utterly consumed by fire as far back as 1857" (letter from J. Wyper, Esq., March 12, 1901). There is a copy of this edition in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia.

[110. 1845] The | Confession of Faith ; | the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | With the Scripture-Proofs at large | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . | Glasgow : Francis Orr and Sons. | MDCCCXLV.

12mo ; pp. 370 + [14 (= "Table").] ; 5½ x 3⅞ inches (type). There is a copy of this edition in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[111. 1845] The | Confession of Faith ; | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . Edinburgh : Printed by Sir D. Hunter Blair and M. S. Tyndall Bruce ; | Late Printers to the Queen's Most Excellent Majesty. | MDCCCXLV.

12mo, pp. 370 + [14 unnumbered = "Table"], 5½ x 3⅞.

[112. 1845] An Exposition of the Confession of Faith of the Westminster Assembly of Divines. By the Rev. Robert Shaw. Edinburgh : Johnstone, 1845, and again 1847.

8vo, pp. xxxvi, 333. We have not seen a copy of these editions, but take the title of the earlier from the Catalogue of the British Museum and of the later from the English [Booksellers] Catalogue. A new edition was issued by Blackie & Son, London and Glasgow, 1877, 8vo, xxviii, pp. 316 (a copy is in the British Museum). The text of the Confession (with proof-texts by reference) is printed in full, with extended practical comments accompanying each section.

[113. 1851] The | Confession of Faith ; | the Larger and Shorter Catechisms ; | with the Scripture-proofs at Large ; | together with, etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . | Edinburgh : Johnstone & Hunter. | MDCCCLI.

Small 8vo, pp. 1-424, in :—"The | Subordinate Standards, | and | Other Authoritative Documents | of the Free Church of Scotland. | Published by Authority of the General Assembly. | Edinburgh : | Johnstone and Hunter. | M.DCCC.LI." This volume consists of a complete Confession of Faith, with all its ordinary accompaniments in Scotch editions, including Dunlop's Table (pp. 413-424); to which is prefixed the "Act and Declaration anent the Publication of the Subordinate Standards, and other Authoritative Documents of the Free Church of Scotland," passed May 31, 1851 (pp. v-xv); and affixed certain "Authoritative Documents of the Free Church of Scotland" (pp. 425-464). The "Act and Declaration" (pp. v-xv) tells nothing of the preparation of the documents for the printers, but only sanctions "the publication of a volume containing the Subordinate Standards and other authoritative documents of this Church."* For this end the ordinary stereotyped edition of the Confession of Faith, as published by Johnstone & Hunter, was utilized by simply prefixing and affixing to it, in binding, the other papers mentioned. Cf. CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 56.

This is the earliest issue of the common stereotyped edition of Johnstone & Hunter we have met with. In reply to our inquiry, Mr. R. Hunter, Esq., has kindly written us as follows: "I cannot fix a date when we first issued it [the Confession of Faith], but it must have been about 1842 or 1843 in the 12mo size. We set up a library edition in larger type, demy 8vo, cloth, selling at 7|6, and some on larger paper, royal 8vo, cloth, ditto, 10|. This was in 1854, I think. However, in 1856 we sold the stereotyped plates of both these editions to Thomas Nelson & Sons, here, but both were destroyed by a fire in their warehouse which took place a few years after this. We set up anew about 1860, and have kept it in print ever since. It is now the only edition in the market in this country, or anywhere else as far as I know. We have supplied both Thomas Nelson & Sons and Francis Orr & Sons, Glasgow, with copies as required, both in sheets and in cloth, and think Orrs' edition would be ours with a fresh title-page added (the license at front will tell that)" † (letter of April 10, 1901).

Mr. Hunter adds the following interesting details as to the supervision of the editions under the old license law. "The royal license, as affixed to former editions granted by the Bible Board, was done away with in 1893 for both the Confession of Faith and the Catechisms. They can now be issued without such license. You must understand that we stereotyped the pages after the first setting of the types was certified as correct, and reprinted all future editions as the sales demanded from the stereotyped plates. This was always mentioned when applying for sanction to issue a new edition, and a copy of the last certified copy sent along with the application to print from the stereotyped plates. The plates had to be carefully looked over and any breakages repaired before printing, when, if found correct by the reader of the Bible Board, the edition was sanctioned. But all bonds and securities had to be executed for each edition, as in accordance with the requirement of the Bible Board."

* It may be also consulted in A. TAYLOR INNIS' *The Law of Creeds in Scotland*, p. 457.

† Cf. below for an edition of Orr (1863), which is *not* one of this type.

How inefficient this elaborate control of the printing was for securing accuracy of text may be illustrated by an odd error in Q. 105 of the Larger Catechism. This answer recites, among other things forbidden in the first commandment, "using unlawful means and trusting in lawful means." Nothing could be a more typical printers' error than the corruption of this into: "Using unlawful means and trusting in unlawful means." We find this corruption in the editions published by "Sir D. Hunter Blair and M. S. Tyndall Bruce, Late Printers to the Queen's most excellent Majesty," at Edinburgh in 1841 and 1845. Doubtless it occurs also in the earlier editions of Sir D. Hunter Blair and J. Bruce, 1810 and 1815, which appear to be the same book: and, indeed, it must go back to a considerably earlier date, since it is found in the first edition printed under the auspices of the American Presbyterian Church (Philadelphia, Thomas Bradford, 1789) and in its reprint of 1792;* and, though it was already eliminated from the American editions in the revised text of 1797 (Philadelphia, Robert Aitken), it crept again from Scotch sources into the Standard text published by the United Presbyterian Board of Publication (Pittsburgh, 1895). The point now to be made is that the same error occurs apparently throughout all the issues printed from the stereotyped plates of Johnstone & Hunter. We find it, for example, not only in Johnstone & Hunter's own issues from 1851 to 1894, but also in the editions of Francis Orr & Sons of 1843 and 1845, and in the Melbourne edition of M. L. Hutchinson of 1893. Probably no current British issue is without it.

[114. 1852] The | Confession of Faith; | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . Printed by authority. | Edinburgh: | Johnstone & Hunter. | MDCCCLII.

12mo, 6 x 3 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches, pp. 424, including Table. License signed by J. Moncrief, October 4, 1851. A copy is in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[115. 1853] The | Confession of Faith; | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . Edinburgh: | Johnstone and Hunter. | MDCCCLIII.

12mo, 6 x 3 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches, pp. 424. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia. See also CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 56.

[116. 1855] The Confession of Faith; | the Larger and Shorter Catechisms; | with the Scripture-proofs at Large: | together with | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728†). Edinburgh: Johnstone & Hunter. | M.D.CCC.LV.

Small 8vo, pp. 1-424, in: "The Subordinate Standards, | and | Other Authoritative Documents | of the Free Church of Scotland. | Published by Authority of the General Assembly. | Edinburgh: | Johnstone and Hunter. | M.DCCC.LII." Small 8vo, pp. xv, 456 + additional separately paged portions = 496 in all.

*The editions of Charles and Mark Kerr, 1793, and the Assigns of Alex. Kincaid, 1788, 1781, appear also to be the same book as the editions of Blair & Bruce; and the Kincaid editions are early enough to have served as "copy" for the Bradford editions.

† Except that the reference to "the Church of Scotland" is omitted.

The contents of the volume are arranged as in the similar issue of 1851. The copy used for this description (in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society of Philadelphia) is peculiar in embodying a Confession of Faith dated 1855 in a volume dated as a whole three years earlier, 1852. Doubtless other copies of the "Subordinate Standards" of 1852 have other issues of the Confession of Faith incorporated with them. The incorporation is purely mechanical.

- [117. 1855] The | Confession of Faith ; | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . | Printed by Authority. | With the special words of the proof-passages printed in italic type. | Edinburgh: Johnstone and Hunter. | M.D.CCC.LV.

8vo, $7\frac{1}{8} \times 4$ inches (type), pp. 438. A beautiful edition in the large paper edition (= $9\frac{1}{8} \times 5\frac{1}{2}$ inches). License signed by J. Moncrief, dated January 2, 1855. Cf. CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 56. There are copies in the libraries of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny, Pa., and of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, and of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia; also in the Congressional Library, Washington (*Cat.* 1869, p. 1597). The emphasizing of the proof texts is a revival of the attempt made in the seventeenth-century editions of Rothwell.

- [118. 1855] The | Confession of Faith ; | The | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the | Scripture-Proofs at large : | Together with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge, | (Contained in the Holy Scriptures, and held forth in the said | Confession and Catechisms,) and practical use thereof ; | Covenants, National and Solemn League ; | Acknowledgment of Sins, and Engage- | ment to duties ; Directories for publick and family wor- | ship ; | Form of Church Government, etc. | Of publick authority in the Church of | Scotland ; | With Acts of Assembly and Parliament, re- | lative to, and approbative of, the same. || Deut. vi, 6, 7. . . . || [Coat-of-arms.] | Printed by authority. | Edinburgh : | Printed at the University Press | for Robert Seton, George Street, and | Whittaker & Co., London. | MDCCCLV.

8vo, pp. 150. Following parts have separate title-pages, but without imprint. Total pages, 561. $6\frac{3}{8} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches. There is a copy in the library of the Union Theological Seminary, New York.

- [119. 1856] The Confession of Faith ; | the | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | With the | Scripture-Proofs at Large : | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . | Printed by Authority. | Edinburgh : | Johnstone and Hunter. | MDCCCLVI.

12mo, $6\frac{1}{8} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches, pp. 424.

- [120. 1857] The | Confession of Faith ; | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . Glasgow :

| W. R. McPhun, 84 Argyle Street, | Publisher to H. R. H.
Prince Albert. | M.DCCC.LVII.

12mo, 5 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (type), pp. 370 + 14 = "Table," numbered separately at bottom.

[121. 1859] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1728 Ed.).
Glasgow and London, 1859"—(CARRUTHERS).

8vo, pp. 370 and Table. See CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 56.

[122. 1859] The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728, except that the reference to the Church of Scotland is omitted). . . . London :
| T. Nelson and Sons, Paternoster Row ; | Edinburgh ; and
New York. | M.DCCC.LIX.

8vo, pp. 1-424 (inclusive of "Table") in :—"The | Subordinate Standards,
| and | Other Authoritative Documents | of the | Free Church of Scotland. |
Published by Authority of the General Assembly. | London : | T. Nelson &
Sons, Paternoster Row ; | Edinburgh ; and New York. | M.DCCC.LVII." 8vo,
pp. xv, 424 + 40 separately paged (but referred to in the "Contents" as pp.
427-461, etc.). Cf. the similar editions of Johnstone & Hunter, 1851, 1855. It
is to be observed that this Confession of 1859 is incorporated in a volume dated
1857 : doubtless other combinations exist.

[123. 1860] The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . London : | T.
Nelson & Sons, Paternoster Row ; | Edinburgh ; and New
York. | MDCCCLX.

12mo, pp. 424.

[124. 1863] The | Confession of Faith | the | Larger and Shorter
Catechisms | etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson,
Edinburgh, 1728). . . . | Confession of Faith. Printed by
Authority. | Glasgow : Francis Orr & Sons, | Publishers of
Bibles, Testaments, Prayer and Psalm Books | Confession of
Faith, Catechisms, etc. | By Royal Authority. | [1863]

12mo, 5 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches (type), pp. 370. The license on obverse of title is
signed by J. Moncrief, Edinburgh, April 17, 1863, and grants license to James
Cowan Wyper to print at No. 26 St. Enoch Wynd, Glasgow, occupied by
James Kay as a printing office, an edition of the Confession of Faith "in
Brevier type, Duodecimo size, consisting of two thousand copies, as proposed
in his declaration of 12 March, 1863."

[125. 1867] The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . Edinburgh :
Johnstone, Hunter & Co. | MDCCCLXVII.

12mo, pp. 336.

[126. 1870] A Commentary on the Confession of Faith. With
questions for theological students and Bible Classes. By the

Rev. Archibald Alexander Hodge, D.D., etc. [Edited by Prof. Gould.] London: T. Nelson & Sons, Paternoster Row; Edinburgh and New York, 1870.

Post 8vo, pp. xvi, 436, sold at 3|6. Dr. Hodge's Commentary on the Confession was prepared in 1868-9, and issued in America (Presbyterian Board of Publication) in 1869: 12mo, pp. 549. This English edition was cared for by Prof. Gould: there is a copy of it in the British Museum. A new American edition with new Preface and Appendices was issued in 1885. The volume contains the text of the Confession with proof-texts by references, each section being accompanied by an extended doctrinal comment.

[127. 1874] The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in the ed. of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . Edinburgh: Johnstone, Hunter & Co., 1874.

Reported by the Rev. Dr. T. Watters, of Pittsburgh.

[128. 1877] "The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1749 Ed.). Edinburgh, 1877"—(CARRUTHERS). Doubtless, "Johnstone, Hunter & Co."—(WATTERS).

8vo, pp. 336. See CARRUTHERS, p. 58: the date "1749" in the description is an obvious misprint: 1649 or, more probably, 1728 is meant: and in every probability it is the Johnstone, Hunter & Co. edition of this date (a copy of which is reported to us by Rev. Dr. T. Watters, of Pittsburgh). Mr. Carruthers adds: "Several times reissued."

[129. 1880] The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1728 Ed.). Edinburgh: Johnstone, Hunter & Co., 1880.

Reported by the Rev. Dr. T. Watters, of Pittsburgh.

[130. 1880] "Subordinate Standards of the United Presbyterian Church, with Basis of Union and Summary of Principles. Printed by Authority. Edinburgh, 1880"—(CARRUTHERS).

8vo, pp. 115. Manual of Distinctive Principles, pp. 16. (Shorter Catechism, pp. 78-90.) This is listed by CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, p. 59. It probably contains the Confession of Faith.

[131. 1881] The Westminster | Confession of Faith. | With Introduction and Notes. | By the Rev. John Macpherson, M.A., | Findhorn. | Edinburgh: | T. & T. Clark, 38 George Street. | 1881.

Small 8vo, or 16mo, pp. 171. Introduction = pp. 1-28; the Confession of Faith is printed, section by section, with extended historical and doctrinal comment, pp. 26-168; Index = pp. 167-171. One of the series of *Handbooks for Bible Classes*, edited by Rev. Marcus Dods, D.D., and Rev. Alexander Whyte, D.D.

[132 18'81] The People's Edition | of the | Westminster | Confession of Faith. | Price Threepence. | Melbourne: | M. L.

Hutchinson, Presbyterian Book Depôt, | 15 Collins Street West. | 1881.

8vo, 6 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 4 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches (type), pp. 16, double columns : contains text only without proofs. The publication of this interesting edition was occasioned by a controversy aroused over a paper on the "Atonement" by the Rev. Charles Strong, then minister of the Scots' Church, Melbourne, and now ministering to the (Independent) "Australian Church" of the same city. The Melbourne *Argus*, championing the course of Mr. Strong, printed on its broadside one morning the entire Confession of Faith, with a view to enabling the public to see how impossible it would be to expect one to subscribe it. It had the opposite effect : and this publication was a factor in settling the controversy favorably to the Presbyterian Church. When the Confession thus appeared on the broadside of the Melbourne *Argus*, Mr. Hutchinson asked from the management the privilege of using the set-up type for a "people's edition ;" and, permission being accorded, the present pamphlet was the result. The pamphlet was very widely circulated throughout Victoria. This information has been kindly given by the Rev. Dr. M. Macdonald, Principal of Ormond College, Melbourne.

[133. 1887] The Confession of Faith, etc. . . . Dunedin and Wellington, New Zealand : New Zealand Tract and Bible Society, 1887.

8vo, pp. 112-136, in : "The Book of Church Order," published in 1887 by the New Zealand Bible, Tract and Book Society, 23 George St., Dunedin, and 14 Lumbton Quay, Wellington, New Zealand. This information has been given by the Rev. David Sidey, of Napier, New Zealand, Clerk to the General Assembly of New Zealand : and has been kindly communicated to us by the Rev. Dr. M. Macdonald, Principal of Ormond College, Melbourne.

[134. 1889] The Confession of Faith, etc. (as in 1728 ed.). Edinburgh : Johnstone, Hunter & Co., 1889.

Reported by the Rev. Dr. T. Watters, of Pittsburgh. Also listed as No. 3184 in the catalogue of Burgersdijk en Niermans, of Leyden.

[135. 1893] The | Subordinate Standards | and Formularies | of the | Presbyterian Church of Victoria. | Issued by Authority of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian | Church of Victoria, 23d November, 1893. | [ornament] | Melbourne : M. L. Hutchinson, | Presbyterian Book Depot, | 305 and 307 Little Collins Street | [no date].

8vo, 6 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 3 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (type), pp. [6], 3-331. Contains : Introduction [p. 3] ; Contents [p. 4] ; Bastard Title [p. 5] ; To the Christian Reader, etc , pp. 3-6 ; Manton's Epistle, pp. 7-9 ; the usual Ordinances and Acts, pp. 10-14 ; Distinct title to Confession, p. 15 ; contents of Confession, p. 16 ; text of Confession, pp. 17-100 ; Larger Catechism (with distinct title), pp. 101-222 ; Shorter Catechism (with distinct title), pp. 223-250 ; the Directory (with distinct title), pp. 251-266 ; the Form of Church Government (with distinct title), pp. 267-286 ; the Directory for Family Worship (with distinct title), pp. 287-290 ; the Table, pp. 291-302 ; the Second Book of Discipline, with modernized spelling, pp. 303-326 ; the Declaratory Statement of the Victorian Church of 1882, pp. 327-328 ; Questions and Formula, pp. 328-331. The book, it will be seen, consists

of (1) a complete copy of the ordinary Scotch Confession of Faith, page for page and line for line, the same as, *e. g.*, the edition of Johnstone, Hunter & Co., 1894, up to p. 250—then (omitting pp. 251-284 = the *Sum, Covenants and Acknowledgment*) again from the Directory to the end of the "Table," but now newly paged (pp. 269-302 instead of pp. 285-336); to which (2) a new title-page, introduction, general contents and bastard title (pp. [i-vi]) has been prefixed; and (3) the Second Book of Discipline, Declaratory Statement, and Questions and Formula affixed. It would seem clear that the whole of part (1) has been printed from Johnstone, Hunter & Co.'s plates: though the pagination has been corrected to fit the omission of a section (pp. 251-268), the *sheet* numbers have not been altered. The Shorter Catechism (p. 250) still ends in the midst of sheet Q, and the Directory still begins in the midst of sheet S: the last six pages of Q, the whole of R, and the first twelve pages of S are lacking. The modernizing of the Second Book of Discipline was done by the Rev. Principal M. Macdonald, D.D., of Ormond College, Melbourne. The book was issued in 1893. We are indebted for a copy of this volume to the Rev. Dr. M. Macdonald, Principal of Ormond College, Melbourne.

[136. 1894] The Confession of Faith; | the | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the | Scripture-proofs at large: | together with, etc. (as in the edition of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728). . . . Edinburgh: Johnstone, Hunter & Co. | MDCCCXCIV.

Small 8vo, $6\frac{1}{2} \times 3\frac{1}{8}$ inches (type), pp. 336.

[137. 18--] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Assembly of Divines | at Westminster | with the Texts of Scripture annexed. | From the Original Edition printed, under the care of the Assembly, by order of | the House of Commons in 1647; and collated with the Edition issued by Parlia | ment in 1648. | [ornament] | London: Publishing Office of the | Presbyterian Church of England, | 14 Paternoster Square. | [no date].

Demi 16mo, $4\frac{1}{8} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type), pp. 64. Proofs by reference only and entered in side-margin. With historical preface (pp. 5-6) signed by "Wm. Carruthers."

This edition was prepared by Mr. William Carruthers, of London, and is designed to restore both the text and the proofs of the Confession of Faith to their original form. To this end Mr. Carruthers has reprinted the text of the edition of April, (May) 1647, and adduced in the margin the variations of the Parliamentary edition of 1648. On the second page of the (paper) cover he has printed a note in which he illustrates the nature and extent of error that has crept into the text of the modern editions of the Confession. Some of these errors are petty. "The following," he says, "are of somewhat more importance:—

Chap. ix, ¶ i, *it* is inserted in current editions.

Chap. ix, ¶ v, *do* is inserted.

Chap. xiii, ¶ ii, *abideth* should be *abiding*.

Chap. xx, ¶ ii, *Contrary to His Word, or beside it in matters of faith or worship*—should be, *Contrary to His Word; or beside it if matters of faith or worship*.

Chap. xxii, ¶ vi, *Which is not in his power, and for the performance whereof he hath no promise of ability from God*—should be, *Which is not in his own power, and for the performance whereof he hath no promise or ability from God.*

Chap. xxv, ¶ ii, *The visible Church . . . consists of all those throughout the world that profess the true religion, together with their children*—should be, *The visible Church . . . consists of all those throughout the world that profess the true religion, and of their children.*

“Some of the errors in the Proofs,” he adds, “are very extraordinary. An imperfect figure has been misread, or a dropt figure has been overlooked, and verses are now printed which have no bearing on the doctrine to be proved. Thus :

Chap. v, ¶ iii, Job xxxiv, 10, should be 20.

Chap. v, ¶ v, Psalm lxxvii, 1, 10, 12, should be 1 to 12.

Chap. xxi, ¶ i, Deut. xv, to the 20th verse, should be iv, 15-20.

Chap. xxviii, ¶ iv, Gen. xvii, 7, 9, should be 7, 9, 10.

Chap. xxix, ¶ iv, 1 Cor. x, 6, should be 16.”

This little pamphlet is the only attempt made in Britain since the issue of the “Collections” of the early eighteenth century to set forth a critically perfected text of the Confession. And this confines itself to a reprint of the original edition, with the variations of the edition authorized by Parliament—an edition, it may be remarked, entirely without significance to the adherents of the Confession.

PRINCETON.

BENJAMIN B. WARFIELD.

THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW

No. 49—January, 1902.

I

THE SCRIPTURAL DOCTRINE OF THE LOVE OF GOD.*

THE love of God occupies a more prominent place than any other divine attribute in present-day Christian consciousness. Obviously the causes of this prominence must not be sought in the sphere of doctrinal thinking, but in certain practical tendencies of our modern religious life. Not for the sake of its theological significance as a constituent factor in the divine character, but for the sake of its bearing upon human conduct and destiny has the love of God been exalted to this position of supremacy among its sister-attributes. It were idle to pretend that the scientific theology of to-day is more successful than the theology of previous ages in deducing from the one principle of love everything that Scripture and experience teach concerning God's method of dealing with His creatures. On the contrary, to the thinking mind the impossibility of doing this has perhaps never stood out more clearly than it stands out at present, in the light of what Biblical research has shown to be the truth of revelation, and of what modern science has shown to be the reality of life. And yet, in the very face of this impossibility, there has developed a widespread demand that God's love, and nothing but His love shall be made the keynote of every message Christianity has to bring to the world.

The shifting of the emphasis in religion from the intellect to the will and the emotions has undoubtedly had something to do with producing this result. So long as the intellect retained its

* Address delivered at the opening of the ninetieth session of Princeton Theological Seminary.

III.

THE PRINTING OF THE WESTMINSTER CONFESSION.

II. IN THE UNITED STATES.

THE Westminster Confession was slow in finding its way into print in America. This was not because it was distasteful to the American Churches: the Puritanism of the Colonists was doctrinally the same as that of England, and they gave a hearty welcome to this Puritan formulary. It was due in the first instance to the lack of facilities in the Colonies at that early day for printing: and afterward to the Independency of the New England Churches, which naturally preferred the "Savoy Declaration," put out by the English Congregationalists in 1658, to the original "Westminster Confession," now become distinctively the creed of the Scottish Presbyterians.

When the Westminster Confession was first given to the public (1647), there was but a single printing press in the Colonies. This had been brought out in 1638 and set up at Cambridge, where from the beginning of 1639 it had been kept busy, under the supervision of the Rev. Henry Dunsler, the first President of Harvard College. The actual printer up to about 1649 was one Stephen Day, who had come out with the press in 1638 for the purpose of operating it, but whose works do not accredit him as a skilled handicraftsman. He was succeeded in 1649 by Samuel Green, the first of a family of printers who for many years carried on their work in New England; but he was apparently without training in the art, and only gradually acquired ability to turn out good work. A new press and equipment were sent out, indeed, during the course of the years 1654-1658 by the Corporation for Propagating the Gospel among the Indians, and in 1660 the same Corporation sent out the first skillful printer to come to New England, Marmaduke Johnson—to assist Samuel Green in printing the Indian Bible. By these accessions the Cambridge establishment was greatly improved in capacity and efficiency. It enjoyed an absolute monopoly in the Colonies until 1674, when John Foster's press was set up in Boston; and indeed during the latter por-

tion of this period it was protected in this monopoly by a law which forbade printing within the jurisdiction of the General Court of Massachusetts, "except in Cambridge" (1664). In none other of the Colonies was a press established for yet ten years more. In these circumstances, the reprinting of British books in America was not to be thought of. American books were rather customarily sent to England to be put into type, and the best that could be done in America was to overtake in some form or other the absolutely necessary local demands. Accordingly when the Cambridge Synod of 1646-1648 had done its work, only its "Platform of Church Discipline"—which was original with it—was printed (and exceedingly rudely printed) by Samuel Green (1649) at Cambridge; while the Confession of Faith adopted by it—which was accepted from the hands of the Westminster Assembly—was expected to be imported from abroad.

The Westminster Confession, it will be remembered, though previously privately printed (in whole or in part) three times in London for the use of members of Parliament and the Assembly itself, and once in Edinburgh for the use of the members of the Scottish Assembly, was not published until after the rising of the Scottish Assembly in the latter part of August 1647, and then only in Edinburgh and without authorization from the English Parliament. It was not until June 20, 1648, that the Parliamentary edition was given to the world; and the earlier issue in that same year at Edinburgh and London of what must be looked upon as surreptitious editions can have antedated this but a few weeks. It may be held as quite certain, therefore, that no copies of the Confession had found their way to New England by October 27, 1647, when the General Court of Massachusetts added to the duties with which the Cambridge Synod, in session that year, were already charged, the additional task of preparing a Confession of Faith; and appointed a Committee to draw up a draught of it against the next meeting of the Synod. Before the Synod reconvened, however (midsummer, 1648), copies of the Westminster Confession had arrived, though not (we may feel sure) copies of the Parliamentary issue of June 20th of that year: and it proved so satisfactory to the delegates that the Synod was enabled to decline the labor of preparing a Confession of its own in favor of a simple acceptance of this. The story is told by John Cotton in the Preface to the *Platform*. We read:

"Having perused the publick confession of faith, agreed upon by the Reverend assembly of Divines at Westminster, and finding the summ and substance thereof (in matters of doctrine) to express not their own judgements only, but ours also: and being likewise called upon by our godly Magistrates, to draw up a publick confession of that faith, which is constantly taught, and generally pro-

fessed amongst us, wee thought good to present unto them, and with them to our churches, and with them to all the churches of Christ abroad, our professed and hearty assent and attestation to the whole confession of faith (for substance of doctrine) which the Reverend assembly presented to the Religious and Honorable Parlemēt of England : Excepting only some sections in the 25 30 and 31. Chapters of their confession, which concern points of controversie in church-discipline ; Touching which wee refer our selves to the draught of church-discipline in the ensuing treatise. The truth of what we here declare, may appear by the unanimous vote of the Synod of the Elders, and messengers of our churches assembled at Cambridge, the last of the sixth month, 1648 : which joyntly passed in these words ; *This Synod having perused, and considered (with much gladness of heart and thankfulness to God) the cōfession of faith published of late by the Reverend Assembly in England, doe judge it to be very holy, orthodox, and judicious in all matters of faith : and doe therefore freely and fully consent thereunto, for the substance thereof. Only in those things which have respect to church government and discipline, wee refer our selves to the platform of church-discipline, agreed upon by this present assēbly : and doe therefore think it meet, that this confession of faith, should be cōmended to the churches of Christ amongst us, and to the Honoured Court, as worthy of their due consideration and acceptance.* Howbeit, wee may not conceal, that the doctrine of vocation expressed in *Chap, 10. S 1.* and summarily repeated *Chap, 13. & 1.* passed not without some debate. Yet considering, that the term of vocation, and others by which it is described, are capable of a large, or more strict sense, and use, and that it is not intended to bind apprehensions precisely in point of order or method, there hath been a generall condescendency thereunto."

The court acquiescing in this decision and desiring to incite the languid churches to make their returns to its request for their judgment, by a vote passed June 19, 1650, desired

"y^e every church will, by the first opportunity, take order for the p^recuringe of that booke, published by the synod at London, concerninge the doctrine of the gosple, that the churches may consider of that hooke also, as soone as they can be gotten."

This, it will be observed, is an order for a wholesale importation of copies of the Westminster Confession. We cannot press the phraseology that designates the volume to be imported as "that booke, published by the synod at London." The whole language of the order is popular and general, rather than technically precise : and as a matter of fact no edition of the Confession of Faith was in the strict sense "published by the synod at London." The Parliamentary edition of 1648, entitled *Articles of Christian Religion*, was adjusted to Independent opinion, and would doubtless have been most acceptable to the feelings of Congregationalist New England : but there is no reason to believe that this edition was especially in the mind of the Court, as it certainly was not in the mind of the Synod, seeing that they made exception to Articles not contained in this edition : and the early printed copies of the Confession which have been preserved in the libraries of New England to our day are not of this edition. By 1650 some thirteen issues of the Confession had already been made in Britain :

but besides the privately printed issues and the Parliamentary edition of 1648, only three of these had been published at London, viz., the two Bostock editions of 1648 and 1649 and an edition of 1650. It was probably from these editions that the Massachusetts Churches were expected to supply themselves; though doubtless they actually purchased whatever editions were most easily procurable in the London markets. These were all, of course, at least ultimately, of Scotch origin. The authors of the Preface to the "Savoy Declaration" in 1658 make it a matter of complaint that "that Copy of the Parliaments, followed by us, is in few mens hands; the other as it came from the *Assembly*, being approved of in *Scotland*, was printed and hastened into the world before the *Parliament* had declared their Resolutions about it; which was not till *June* 20, 1648. and yet hath been, and continueth to be the Copy (ordinarily) onely sold, printed and reprinted for these *eleven* years."

So things went on for a generation until the Reforming Synod of 1679 and 1680 met at Boston, charged, among other things, with the task of setting forth the faith of the new generation. In the interval the English Independents had issued (1658) their modification of the Westminster Confession—the so-called "Savoy Declaration"—based on the Parliamentary *Articles of Christian Religion* of 1648; and it was but natural that the New England Congregationalists should now wish to give their adherence rather to this than to the unaltered Confession of Westminster. This was rendered the more inevitable by the fact that Mather and Oates, the two leading members of the Committee appointed by the Synod to draw up a Confession of Faith, had been in England in 1658, and were on terms of personal friendship with the Independent divines who had framed the "Savoy Declaration." Accordingly it was the Savoy Declaration, only slightly but significantly altered (and that in a sense the direct opposite to the mind of the British Independents in the point of the relation of the Civil Magistrate to the Church), that was reported to the Synod May 12, 1680. On June 11, 1680, the General Court ordered it published: and it appeared in the same year at Boston, from the press of John Foster, and was several times reprinted subsequently. The Churches of Connecticut adopted the same document at the Saybrook Synod of 1708. They say:

"We agree that the Confession of faith owned and Consented unto by the Elders and Messengers of the Chhs assembled at Boston In New England May 12, 1680 being the Second Session of that Synod be Recommended to the Hon^{ble} the Gen^l Assembly of this Colony at the next Session for their Publick testimony thereto as the faith of the Chhs of this Colony."

In October of that year the General Court of Connecticut accord-

ingly enacted this Confession as the Confession of Faith of Connecticut, and this it continued legally to be until 1784. At its next session, May, 1709, the Court provided for its printing. It appeared at New London in 1710—the first book printed in Connecticut—and again in 1760; and it has repeatedly been published subsequently. Thus the “Savoy Declaration,” which exerted no influence and wrought out no history in England, was given, in a slightly modified form, life and influence in America, and even bade fair entirely to supersede in this land the original Westminster Confession.

In these circumstances it is not strange that the Westminster Confession in its unaltered form had to wait until near the close of the first quarter of the eighteenth century before it found its way into print in America. The circumstances which secured its printing in the first instance even then are obscure. Possibly there had arisen a demand for it among New England Congregationalists themselves; it is certain that it was the Westminster Confession, and not the Savoy modification of it, which was in use among the English Independents of the time;* and there is no reason why many in New England may not have wished (to say nothing more) to have in their hands the formularies of their English brethren. It is of course possible, however, on the other hand, that the demand which it was sought to supply by the publication of the book arose from the Presbyterian Scotch-Irish, who were now beginning to make themselves felt as an element in our Colonial life. In any event, the earliest American-printed edition of the Westminster Confession we have met with, is an octavo volume of 161 pages containing the Confession and Larger Catechism (the Shorter Catechism being omitted, doubtless, because otherwise fully accessible), printed in Boston in 1723 by the eminent printer Samuel Kneeland, for the still more eminent bookseller Daniel Henchman, who was probably the most enterprising American publisher prior to the Revolution. As the title-page suggests, it is taken not from the current Scotch editions, but from that rather peculiar series, published chiefly though not exclusively at London, which began with the Rothwell issues of 1658, and proceeded in subsequent issues called the “[second edition],” 1658, “third edition,” 1688, “fifth edition,” 1717, all published in London—while the two forms of the so-called “fourth edition” alone of the series are Scotch (Glasgow, 1675, Edinburgh, 1708). This circumstance undoubtedly raises a degree of probability for the Congregationalist origin of this edition.

It can hardly be doubted, on the other hand, that the second

* NEAL, *Puritans*, II, 178.

American edition which we have met with, was called out by a purely Presbyterian demand. This was issued in 1745 at Philadelphia, from the press of Benjamin Franklin, and was a finely manufactured 16mo volume of 588 pages, following the type of the normative Edinburgh edition of Lumisden and Robertson of 1728, and containing all the documents included in that edition and ever subsequently constituting the fixed contents of Scotch editions. It came from the press, it will be observed, the year of the formation of the Synod of New York, and it may well be that the disruption of the Synod of Pennsylvania, and the controversies out of which that disruption grew and which had been disturbing the Church since 1740, were the occasion of its preparation. That only these two editions were issued in America until, as the century was drawing to a close (1789, 1799), the two greater Presbyterian bodies established in this country began to publish their amended editions of the Confession, is readily accounted for by the continued dependence of Presbyterians at large on Scotland for their supply of Confessions. This dependence is attested by the very large number of Scotch Confessions bearing dates in the eighteenth century which are found scattered through America to-day. There are even traces of prominent pastors acting as something like regular importing agencies for greater or smaller communities, and busying themselves with seeing that the Confession of Faith was circulated as widely as possible among their own and contiguous flocks. Benjamin Chestnut,* for example, seems to have added this to the many other good works by which he fulfilled the office of a bishop for the whole of South Jersey. Some of the smaller branches of Presbyterianism in America to this day seek much or all of their supply abroad, though reprints of the Scotch book, containing the whole series of documents which have found their way into it, have also continued to be issued in America up to to-day.

The real history of the publication of the Westminster Confession in America begins thus in 1789. The infancy of Presbyterianism in the New World, and even its lusty youth, was then already a thing of the past; and it was celebrating the attainment of its majority by constituting a General Assembly and preparing a complete Constitution for its future direction. The Doctrinal Standards embodied in this Constitution were borrowed from those prepared by the Westminster Assembly, with only such alterations in their teaching as to the relation of the civil magistrate to the Church and to spiritual things, as were thought necessary to adapt them to a free Church in a free State. But the American

* See for him, Dr. Alfred Nevin's *Presbyterian Encyclopædia*, *sub. nom.*

Church looked upon them, as thus adjusted, as distinctively its own Standards, in contradistinction to the Standards of the Church of Scotland, and consistently spoke of them and acted toward them as such. The whole process of the framing of a Constitution was begun by raising a Committee, which was instructed to "take into consideration the Constitution of the church of Scotland and other Protestant churches, and agreeably to the general principles of Presbyterian government, to compile a system of general rules for the government of the Synod, and the several Presbyteries under their inspection, and the people in their communion." And the completed series of documents was set forth, at the end, as unitedly composing "the Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America," thus consciously differentiated from all other Churches in Christendom. The printing of this distinctive Constitution was in these circumstances a matter of course: and for a while the Assembly retained the publication and diffusion of it entirely in its own hands. There were issued in this way, directly by the Assembly, four editions—one in 1789 from the press of Thomas Bradford (a new impression was issued in 1792), one in 1797 from the press of Robert Aitken, one in 1806 from the press of Jane Aitken, and one in 1815 through the publishing house of W. W. Woodward. There were 1000 to 1500 copies issued in the first of these editions, possibly increased by another 1000 by its second impression; 4000 copies in the second; 5000 in the third; and doubtless quite as many more in the fourth. The book had meanwhile been improved, by a careful and expert revision and the adjunction of proof-texts, in the second edition; and by exquisite typographical skill in the third. Meanwhile the demand for it had become sufficiently great to tempt private enterprise, and "unauthorized editions," the ventures of booksellers on their own account, began to appear as early as 1801. In these circumstances the Assembly was led after the issue of its fourth edition (1815), to adopt the new policy of committing the publication of its *Constitution* to private initiative, only reserving the right of revision and certification of the text as issued, and claiming a percentage on the value of the issues. From 1821, when the first edition under this new arrangement appeared, until 1839, when it was receded from, there were sent forth at least fifteen editions, all except the first of which (Finley, 1821) appear to come from a single set of stereotyped plates. How many copies were thus put into circulation we can only conjecture; but we presume 20,000 would be a low estimate.

In 1838 the great division of the Church into Old and New School bodies took place, and each division went its own way in the pub-

lication of the *Constitution* common to the two. The Old School branch at once withdrew the general permission to booksellers to print its book, and placed it exclusively in the hands of the Board of Publication, which it had adopted from the Synod of Philadelphia (1839). Stereotyped plates were at once made; and a new set again in 1853—a somewhat unfortunate set, from the point of view of accuracy of text. From these the Board issued during the years intervening between the Division and Reunion (1870) no less than 80,000 copies, besides 2000 copies of an *edition de luxe*. In the same period it issued also 28,000 copies of the Confession in a cheaper (pamphlet) form; and 2750 copies of a German translation of it. During this same period there had been issued under the auspices of the New School branch of the Church at least six editions (from 1845); and at least three issues had been put forth by private enterprise. Moreover the new division of the Church consequent on the Civil War had created a vigorous Church in the Southern States, which had put forth a first edition of its Standards, early in the '60s, of some 20,000 copies. After the reunion of the Old and New School Churches in 1870, the old plates of the Board of Publication were continued in use to supply the united Church, and 40,500 copies were printed from them up to 1891, when they were happily supplanted by a carefully corrected new set, from which there have already been printed, up to 1900, 10,000 copies. To these must be added 500 copies of the *edition de luxe* issued in 1884; 250 copies of the German version, issued in 1891; and 50,250 issues of the Confession in pamphlet form. The grand total of copies put out by the Board of Publication from 1839 to 1900 thus aggregates no fewer than 224,000 copies. To this must be added 35,818 copies issued by the Southern Church, as well as those issued between 1839 and 1870 by the New School branch and private enterprise. So that it can scarcely be thought excessive to suppose that more than 325,000 copies of the Confession have been put into circulation by the Presbyterian Church since 1840: and perhaps it would not much overshoot the mark to say that throughout its whole history, from 1789 to 1900, there have been put into circulation not many fewer than a half-million copies of the Confession of Faith in the form given it by the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America.

What the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America did for its *Constitution* in 1789, that the Associate Reformed Church did for its in 1799. The first edition of its Constitution, containing the Confession of Faith as modified by the Associate Reformed Synod to the same general effect as had been done by the sister Church ten years before, appeared in that year, and

introduced a new series of issues of the Confession of Faith which still continues to be put forth to-day—both in simple reprints of the original Associate Reformed book (still issued by the Associate Reformed Synod of the South), and in the form given it by the United Presbyterian Church in issues beginning in 1859. We have met with only seven editions of the Associate Reformed book; and with only five editions of the United Presbyterian book. But we cannot suppose these to do more than represent a series of much more numerous issues which have escaped our search: and we cannot doubt that a very considerable addition to the total number of copies put into circulation by the American press has been contributed by this series of editions.

The purpose for which the Westminster Confession of Faith has been printed in America has ever been distinctly an ecclesiastico-practical one. Very little scientific interest has intruded itself in the preparation of either the text or its accompaniments. The first editions issued by the several churches have apparently been taken from whatever texts lay conveniently at hand. In the case of the Southern Presbyterian Church this was unfortunately the unusually inaccurate text then (since 1853) current in the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America: in the case of the other Churches it was the current British texts of the time. Now and then, however, an effort has been made to produce a corrected text. An early instance of this is afforded by the text of the edition of 1797 (Robert Aitken), in which important textual corrections were made. A very notable instance is supplied by the care taken in correcting the text by the Committee of the New School Assembly to which was committed the task of preparing the edition issued by that body in 1850+. And the editions published by the Presbyterian Board of Publication and Sabbath-school Work since 1891 are the product of a very exact scrutiny and reach the high-water mark of accuracy of printing in the American editions. But even in this text there are conserved a number of readings which have originated rather in printers' slips than in ecclesiastical revisions, and which have been retained in the revised text apparently as distinctively American readings. One would think that it would be better to restore the text in all points, where direct ecclesiastical warrant for change cannot be adduced, to the text of the *principes*—i. e., the edition of Evan Tyler of 1647.

The history of the accompaniments of the text runs parallel with that of the text itself. The proof-texts, for example, in the reprints of the British editions made for the smaller branches of the Church, and as well in the editions deriving from the Associate

Reformed book of 1799, do not intentionally vary from those of Westminster, and are taken uncriticised from the current British editions. The first edition of the Constitution of the Presbyterian Church of the United States of America was printed without proof-texts. And when, shortly afterward, it was proposed to add them, the work was characteristically undertaken as if it were an independent enterprise of a new Church. There was no reference made to the Westminster proofs in the initiation of the work or in the appointment of the Committee to prepare the new texts; and no open profession was made on the part of the Committee of having based their work on the Westminster proofs, or indeed of having even consulted them. It was only when the new proofs were submitted to a new Committee for revision that directions were given that they should be compared with the Westminster proofs. The new proofs cannot, however, be *à posteriori* spoken of as prepared in independence of the Westminster proofs: nor can they be thought an improvement upon the Westminster proofs. A peculiar feature connected with them is the inclusion among them of certain footnotes, of an expository or even argumentative character. Some of these—particularly that on the word “man-stealing” in the 142d Question of the Larger Catechism—were of inordinate length and polemic in character, and subsequently gave trouble and were officially removed from the margin of the Standards in 1816. Nevertheless these hastily prepared and unsatisfactory proof-texts—with only the removal of the above-mentioned objectional notes, accomplished in 1816—held their place in the Standards of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America from 1797 to 1896, and still hold their place in the Standards of the Presbyterian Church of the United States until to-day. Since 1896 they have been replaced in the Standards of the former of these two Churches by a new and much improved set of proofs, which were prepared by a Committee appointed in 1888, and were approved by the Assembly in 1894. In the whole period from 1789 to 1896, moreover, the Shorter Catechism as published in the *Constitution* of these Churches was unprovided with proof-texts, a note advising the reader to turn for them to the corresponding Questions of the Larger Catechism. The current form of the Westminster proofs was accustomed to be printed with the Shorter Catechism as separately published by these Churches. Since 1896, however, the Shorter Catechism as published by the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America has been provided with its own appropriate texts, prepared by the Committee of 1888–1894.

After a history of about a century and three-quarters, at the

opening of the twentieth century the Westminster Confession is still in wide circulation in America, and is accessible in several forms. Copies of the British edition are still imported, especially perhaps those issued by T. Nelson & Sons, with a New York as well as British imprint. Reprints of the Scotch book are still made by the Associate Presbyterian Board of Publication, with a Philadelphia imprint, but doing business at Eau Claire, Pa. The old Associate Reformed book is still issued by the Publication Committee of the Associate Reformed Synod of the South, at Atlanta, Ga. But especially three great publishing houses are engaged in supplying a large Presbyterian public with the Confession of Faith, in several different forms: the Presbyterian Board of Publication and Sabbath-school Work, at Philadelphia; the Presbyterian Committee of Publication, at Richmond, Va.; and the United Presbyterian Board of Publication, at Pittsburgh, Pa. From these three houses several thousands of copies of the Confession are put into circulation annually. Little has been done in the meantime to supply the multitudinous foreign population that has crowded to our shores with the Westminster Confession of Faith in their own tongues. A German translation was published by the Presbyterian Board of Publication in 1857, and is still kept on sale. A Spanish translation, based on an earlier one published in Mexico, is now issued at Albuquerque, N. M. But what are these among so many? American Presbyterian missionaries have, on the other hand, been especially faithful in translating and circulating the Confession among the peoples to whom they have carried the Gospel: but this is not the place to speak of these rather numerous versions made and printed outside of the United States.

In the search we have been able to make we have met with some eighty-eight editions of the Confession of Faith printed in the United States. We suppose ourselves to have catalogued almost a complete list of the editions issued by the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America. We cannot suppose ourselves to have been so fortunate, however, in the case of the issues of other Churches: no doubt we have missed quite the half of these. We are able to print, therefore, nothing more than

NOTES TOWARD A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE WESTMINSTER CONFSSION.*

II. AMERICAN EDITIONS.

1. REPRINTS OF THE BRITISH BOOK.

[i. 1723] The | Confession of Faith, | Together with the | Larger Catechism; | composed by the Reverend | Assembly of Divines | Then sitting at Westminster. | Presented to both Houses of Parliament. | With a brief sum of Christian Doctrine, | Contained in Holy Scripture, And | holden forth in the Confession of | Faith and Catechism. || Deut. 6. 6, 7—And these words . . . when thou risest up. || Boston in N. E. | Reprinted by S. Kneeland, for D. Henchman, at his | Shop in Corn-Hill | 1723.

8vo, pp. (2), 161, (1); 6 x 3½ inches (block of type). An account of this edition is given by WILBERFORCE EAMES, *Early New England Catechisms*, etc. (Worcester, Mass.: Charles Hamilton, 1898), p. 76. There is a copy of it in the Lenox Library (Fifth avenue and Seventieth street), New York. The Confession of Faith occupies the first fifty-six pages; the Larger Catechism, pp. 57-124; the Sum, pp. 125-161.

The form of title-page here given is, among British editions, peculiar to a series of issues beginning with a quarto edition published in London in [1658] by J. Rothwell,† and running through two issues of a so-called "[second edition]," both of 1658, London, John Rothwell; two of a so-called "fourth edition," Glasgow, Robert Sanders, 1675, and Edinburgh, John Craig, 1708; a so-called "third edition," 1688, London, Parkhurst and Newman; and a so-called "fifth edition," 1717, London, Cruttenden and Cox.‡ In these editions alone the title-page bears the words: "Composed by the Reverend Assembly of Divines sitting at Westminster." Of them, the so-called "third edition" (1688) alone reads: "*Then sitting at Westminster.*" The "fifth edition" (1717) alone§ contains the *Sum of Saving*

* It is as impossible in this case as in that of the British editions (see this REVIEW for October, 1901, p. 614) to mention all those to whom we have been indebted in this undertaking. As there, so here, we are particularly indebted to the Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia, who have not only placed the extensive collections of Confessions in their possession at our disposal, but have exhibited unwearied patience in resolving our inquiries. We must not neglect to name also the Rev. Dr. Charles R. Gillett, Librarian at Union Theological Seminary, New York; the Rev. Jesse Lee Cotton, formerly Librarian of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny, Pa.; the authorities at the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, whose large collection has provided much of our material; the Rev. Prof. John McNaugher, of the Allegheny Theological Seminary, Allegheny, Pa.; the Rev. Dr. James K. Hazen, of Richmond, Va., and the Rev. Dr. S. A. Agnew, of Bethany, Miss. The notes to the several editions will here and there indicate others also to whom we have been especially indebted.

† See the Bibliography in the October, 1901, number of this REVIEW, p. 629, No. 23.

‡ See the Bibliography in the October, 1901, number of this REVIEW, pp. 631, 632, 634, 636, 637, Nos. 24, 25, 33, 36, 46, 51.

§ Possibly the Edinburgh form of the "fourth edition" (1708) does also: it boasts on the title-page of containing "all the other additions that have been hitherto printed."

Knowledge—with the following half-title (on p. 375): “A Brief Sum of | Christian Doctrine, | Contained in | Holy Scripture, and holden forth in the Con- | fession of Faith and Catechisms. | Agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster, | and received by the General Assembly of the Kirk | of Scotland. With the Practical Use thereof. | ” It seems clear that the original from which Kneeland’s edition is made must be sought in this series: possibly both the so-called “third edition” (1688) and the so-called “fifth edition” (1717) were used. From the former the “then” of the title-page may have been derived: from the latter, the *Sum* seems to have been taken.

Nothing is known of the circumstances leading to the publication of this edition. It seems to have been taken from London and not from Scotch originals. It contains only documents not easily accessible in eighteenth century New England: the unaltered Westminster Confession,* the Larger Catechism† and the Sum of Saving Knowledge.‡ This was a period of increasing sympathy in New England, and especially in Connecticut, with Presbyterianism; and during it a desire might well grow up in the Churches to become better acquainted with the Presbyterian formularies. And this desire would be reinforced by their use among the Independent Churches of this time in England.§ For these reasons the publication of such a volume in New England might appear easy to account for from a purely Congregationalist demand. We must nevertheless bear in mind that the Scotch-Irish immigrants had already made the Presbyterian element a factor of importance in Colonial life; though the make up of the book seems hardly such as would naturally respond to a Presbyterian call. On the whole, it seems not unlikely that this edition was meant to meet a demand for the Westminster formularies which was felt in the New England Churches themselves.

Of the publisher, Daniel Henchman, we are told that he “was the most eminent and enterprising bookseller that appeared in Boston, or indeed in all British America, before the year 1775; and since that period few have excelled him as a publisher.” In connection with his publishing business he built the first paper-mill in New England. See ISAAH THOMAS, *History of Printing in America*, etc. (Ed. I, Worcester, 1810), II, 423; cf. I, 213, 305. The printer, Samuel Kneeland, was almost as eminent in his own sphere as Henchman was in his. He was born in Boston, where he began business as a printer in 1718, and where he carried on his printing work successfully until his death in 1769. He learned his trade in the office of Bartholomew Green, and for twenty-five years of his career (1727–1752) prosecuted it in partnership with Timothy Green the younger: thus he came into the closest relations with that great family of printers sprung from Samuel Green the elder—the second American printer—who began in 1649 the work of printing, in which his descendants were still engaged when Thomas published his history in 1810. The first English Bible printed in America is accredited by Thomas to Kneeland, working in this instance, too, for Henchman: it was, he says, published with a London imprint in order to avoid prosecution for infringement of patent. Modern bibliographers have failed to verify the statement.|| See on Kneeland, THOMAS, as cited, I, pp. 302 *sq.*, II, 213, 429.

* The New England Churches had adopted (in 1680 for Massachusetts and 1708 for Connecticut) the Savoy revision of the Westminster Confession as their standard of doctrine: and it alone (somewhat modified) had been made accessible by reprints.

† Two later editions of the Larger Catechism are recorded by EAMES (as cited, pp. 76–77), viz., Boston, 1750 and 1762 (both apparently from Scotch originals); but none earlier.

‡ The *Sum* seems only on this one single occasion to have ever been published in New England.

§ NEAL, *Puritans*, II, 178.

|| See O’Callaghan, *List of Editions of the Holy Scriptures and parts thereof printed in America previous to 1860* (Albany: 1861).

[ii. 1745] The | Confession of Faith, | The Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | with the | Scripture Proofs at large. | Together with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge (contain'd in | the Holy Scriptures, and held forth in the said *Con- | fession* and *Catechisms*) and Practical Use there- | of; Covenants National and Solemn | League, Acknowledgment of Sins and | Engage- ment to Duties, Directories, | Form of Church Government, &c. | Of Publick Authority in the | Church of Scotland. | With Acts of Assembly and Parliament, rela- | tive to, and approbative of the same. || Deut. vi. 6, 7. . . . || Philadel- phia : | Printed and Sold by B. Franklin | M.DCC.XLV.

16mo, pp. 567 + 21 unnumbered for the "Table"; 6¼ x 3½ inches (block of type). There are separate titles to the Confession of Faith; Larger Catechism (p. 165); Shorter Catechism (p. 367); the Sum (p. 403); the National Covenant (p. 441); Solemn League (p. 463); the Directory for Public Worship (p. 483), etc.; all dated 1745. The proof-texts are arranged in double columns under the text. The book is well printed and well manufactured. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia; and a mutilated copy in the possession of the Rev. Dr. Thomas H. Robinson, of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny.

The title-page and contents follow those of the edition of Thomas Lumisden and John Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728, which is the first to contain all the documents which have become the regular contents of Scotch editions, and which, therefore, with its good text (derived from Dunlop, 1719) and completed "canon," is in some sense the norm of the Scottish editions.* Franklin's edition, thus, as it is probably the first American edition printed for the use of Presbyterians, so reproduces the standard Scotch text and canon alike.

[iii. 1813] The | Confession of Faith : | the | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the Scripture-proofs at Large : | the Cove- nants, | National and Solemn League, | the Acknowledge- ment of Sins, And Engagement to Duties : | the Directories for Public and Family Worship : | And the Form of Church Government : | with Acts of Assembly and Parliament relative to, and Appro- | bative of, the same : | Of Public Authority in the Church of Scotland : | And also | in the Associate Church, And the Reformed Church, | in the United States of America. | Together with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge, | (contained in the Holy Scriptures, and held forth in the | said Confession and Catechisms,) | And the Practical Use thereof. || And these words . . . dili- gently | unto . . . way, | and . . . risest up. Deut. v. 6, 7. || Printed and Published by W. W. Woodward, | No. 52, South Second, corner of Chestnut Street, Philadelphia | 1813.

12mo, pp. 542 + 20 unnumbered containing "The Table" (the Confession

* See the Bibliography in the October, 1901, number of this REVIEW, p. 643, No. 60.

occupying 133 pages); $6\frac{1}{4} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). Proof-texts at large. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia, and another is reported by Prof. John McNaugher, D.D., of the Allegheny Theological Seminary.

As the title-page bears, this edition was prepared for the use of the Associate Church and the Reformed Church. It follows the current Scotch editions, the type of which was set by the edition of Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1728; but it allows itself certain liberties on the title-page, the most marked of which is the new place given to the phrase "together with . . . and the Practical Use thereof."

[iv. 1821] The | Confession of Faith, | agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines | at | Westminster, | with the assistance | of Commissioners | from | the Church of Scotland, | as | a part of the covenanted uniformity of religion betwixt the | churches of Christ, in the Kingdoms of Scotland, | England and Ireland. | Approved by the General Assembly, 1647, and ratified and established by | Acts of Parliament, 1649 and 1690, as the public and avowed | Confession of the Church of Scotland, | with the | proofs from the Scripture. | Haverhill, N. H. | Printed by Sylvester T. Goss. | 1821.

8vo, pp. 147; paper, uncut; $6\frac{5}{8} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$. There is a copy in the library of the Union Theological Seminary, New York.

The title-page of this edition is of the type of the edition published by Lumisden and Robertson, Edinburgh, 1725,* reprinted in 1739, 1764, 1771, 1785. It is apparently the only copy of the Westminster Confession published in New England subsequently to the American *editio princeps* of 1723.

[v. 1829] The | Confession of Faith, | the | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the | Scripture Proofs at Large: | together with | the Sum of Saving Knowledge, | (contained in the Holy Scriptures, and held forth in the said Confession | and Catechisms) and Practical Use Thereof; | Covenants, National and Solemn League; | Acknowledgement | of Sins, and Engagement to Duties; Directories for | Public and Family Worship; Form of Church Government, etc. | Of Public Authority in the Church of Scotland: | With Acts of Assembly and Parliament, relative to, and | Approbatory of, the same. || Deut. vi. 6. 7. . . . || Printed from the Last Edinburgh Edition. | Philadelphia: | Towar and Hogan, No. 255, Market Street. | Albany—Webster and Wood. | 1829.

16mo, pp. 600 + 24 unnumbered for the "Table"; $6\frac{3}{4} \times 3\frac{5}{8}$ inches (block of type); proof-texts at large and in two columns. There are copies in the libraries of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven and the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia.

The "last Edinburgh edition" prior to 1829 which we have met with is the edition of Sir D. Hunter Blair and J. Bruce of 1815, which is of the type of the Lumisden and Robertson 1728 and (like this) consists of pp. 600 [24]. This edition may very well have been taken directly from it, or from one of its reissues.

* See the Bibliography in this REVIEW for October, 1901, p. 641, No. 56. Cf. Nos. 66, 90, 97, 102.

[vi. 1838] The | Confession of Faith, etc. [as in the edition of 1829]. . . . || Printed from a recent and correct Edinburgh edition. | Philadelphia : | William S. Young, 173 Race Street | 1838.

8vo, pp. 624 (including "Table"); 6 x 3½ inches (block of type); proofs at large in two columns. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia; and another is reported by the Rev. Jesse L. Cotton, of Coraopolis, Pa. The publisher, Mr. William S. Young, was a ruling elder in the Associate Presbyterian Church. This edition would seem to be a reprint of that of 1829.

[vii. 1842] The | Confession of Faith, etc. [as in the edition of 1829]. . . . || Printed from a recent and correct Edinburgh Edition. | Philadelphia : | William S. Young, 173 Race Street. | 1842.

12mo, pp. 564; 6 x 3½ inches (block of type); proof-texts at large. There are copies in the libraries of the Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia; and also in the collection of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[viii. 1853] The | Confession of Faith, | etc. [as in the edition of 1829]. . . . || Printed from a recent and correct Edinburgh edition : | Philadelphia : | William S. Young, 173 Race Street. | 1853.

12mo, pp. 564, 8 x 5 inches (outside measurement of page). Reported by the Rev. Jesse L. Cotton, Coraopolis, Pa.

[ix. 1856] The | Confession of Faith, etc. [as in the edition of 1829]. . . . | Philadelphia: | William S. Young, 173 Race Street. | 1856.

. 12mo, pp. 564, 6 x 3½ inches (block of type).

[x. 1859 +] [The Confession of Faith, etc. [as in all editions of the type of 1728, cf. the ed. of 1829 above]. . . . || Printed by Authority. | London : | T. Nelson & Sons, Paternoster Row ; | Edinburgh; and New York. | M.DCCC.LIX. Again M.DCCC.LX].

8vo, pp. 424. See this REVIEW, Oct., 1901, p. 655, Nos. 122, 123.

[xi. 1863] The | Confession of Faith, etc. [as in the edition of 1829]. . . . || Printed from a recent and correct Edinburgh Edition. | Philadelphia : | William S. Young, 1023 Race Street. | 1863.

[xii. 1874] The | Confession of Faith, etc. [as in the edition of 1829]. . . . || Printed from a recent and correct Edinburgh Edition. | Philadelphia: | Associate Presbyterian Board of Publication. | 1874.

12mo, pp. 564; 6 x 3½ inches; proof-texts at large in two columns. There is a

copy in the library of the Rev. A. M. Malcom, of Eau Claire, Pa. This edition was printed from the stereotyped plates acquired from Mr. W. S. Young.

[xiii. 1881 +] The | Confession of Faith, etc. [as in the edition of 1829]. . . . | Printed from a recent and correct Edinburgh Edition: | Philadelphia: | Associate Presbyterian Board of Publication. | [no date].

12mo, pp. 564; 6 x 3½ inches; proof-texts at large in two columns. There is a copy in the library of the Princeton Theological Seminary: and another is reported by the Rev. Dr. D. B. Willson, of the Reformed Presbyterian Theological Seminary, Allegheny: and copies are kept in stock by the Associate Presbyterian Board of Publication, now doing business at Eau Claire, Pa. The Board of Publication of the Associate Presbyterian Church (which passed in 1858 into the hands of the United Presbyterian Church) was revived in 1874 by the remnant left on the formation of the United Presbyterian Church, and issued that same year an edition of the Confession of Faith from the stereotyped plates of Mr. William S. Young, which it had acquired. Subsequently to that date, the dating has not appeared on the title-page: but new issues have been made from the plates in 1881, 1888 and 1898. These plates have been in use apparently since 1842. The text they present is a good one, but it contains the errors noted by Mr. Carruthers as occurring in most current editions, at ix, 1, 5, xiii, 2, xx, 2, xxv, 2. See his list in the October number of this REVIEW, p. 653, under No. 137.

2. THE BOOK OF THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN THE U. S. A.

[xiv. 1789] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America | containing | the | Confession of Faith, | the | Catechisms, | the | Government and Discipline, | and the | Directory for the worship of God, | Ratified and adopted by the Synod of New York | and Philadelphia, held at Philadelphia | May the 16th 1788, and continued by adjourn- | ments until the 28th of the same Month. | Philadelphia: | Printed by Thomas Bradford, | In Front-street, fourth Door below Market-street. | M DCC LXXXIX.

12mo, pp. [vii] 215 (Confession = 1-48); 5½ x 2½ inches (block of type). Bastard-title and title: separate bastard-titles to Larger Catechism, Shorter Catechism, Form of Government and Directory. No proof-references. At the words: "he descended into hell" in the Creed at the end of the Shorter Catechism (p. 130), the usual note is given in an inset on the right margin: "*i. e.*, continued in the state of the dead and under the power of death until the third day." At the word "Bishop" in the Form of Government, chap. iii, the usual note, retained until to-day, occurs (p. 138) at the foot of the page. A note also occurs at Form of Government, xiv, 4, directing how to fill up a blank in the form under discussion. The new Introduction to the Form of Government drawn up by the Synod of 1788, appears as an Introduction and is printed in italics. The Form of Government is partly (not uniformly) supplied with insets in left margin, giving the contents of paragraphs. In the answer to Q. 105 of the Larger Catechism there is found the error: "using unlawful means and trusting in *unlawful* means," which has deformed the Scottish editions apparently until to-day:* it was eliminated from the series of American texts in 1797. The volume is lettered on the outside

* See the October number of this REVIEW, p. 653, in the remarks under No. 113.

“The Confession of Faith,” and this inaccurate lettering is continued on all copies of the Constitution until 1896. There are copies of this edition in the libraries of the Theological Seminary at Princeton; of the Union Theological Seminary, New York; of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia; and of Drs. E. R. Craven and Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia.

Thomas Bradford, the printer of this edition, was the great-grandson of William Bradford, the first printer of Philadelphia and afterward the first printer of New York: he is one of a series of Bradfords who carried on the trade of printer for an unbroken period of 160 years. He was born May 4, 1745, and died May 7, 1838. See on the Bradfords, I. THOMAS' *History of Printing in America*, Ed. i, Vol. ii, as per index; and the *American Dictionary of Printing and Book-Making*, *sub. nomm.* “Andrew” and “William Bradford” (pp. 66–67); Lamb's *Biographical Dictionary of the U. S.* (edited by J. H. Brown, Boston, 1900), *sub. nom.*

The circumstances connected with the publication of this first edition of “The Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America” are as follows. The original Synod had adopted the Westminster Confession and Catechisms in 1729, under the terms of a “Declaratory Act.” It had declared “the said Confession and Catechisms to be the confession of their faith, excepting only some clauses in the twentieth and twenty-third chapters, concerning which clauses the Synod do unanimously declare, that they do not receive those articles in any such sense as to suppose the civil magistrate hath a controlling power over Synods with respect to the exercise of their ministerial authority; or power to persecute any for their religion, or in any sense contrary to the Protestant succession to the throne of Great Britain.” They had at the same time “earnestly recommended” “the directory for worship, discipline and government of the church, commonly annexed to the Westminster Confession,” to all their members, “to be by them observed as near as circumstances will allow, and Christian prudence direct” (*Minutes of 1729*, p. 93,* *Digest of 1898*, p. 4). As the time approached, however, for the Synod to divide itself and to constitute a General Assembly, provision was made, among other things, for the adjustment of its Standards. The Synod of 1786 referred the “book of discipline and government” to a Committee “to digest such a system as they shall think to be accommodated to the state of the Presbyterian Church in America” (*Minutes of 1786*, p. 525). This Committee reported the draught of a plan of government and discipline at the next Synod, and that Synod after having considered and amended it ordered it printed for distribution among the Presbyteries and Churches for their consideration (*Minutes of 1787*, p. 539); at the same time directing the same Committee to revise the Westminster Directory for public worship, and have their draught of it printed for consideration. We read further: “The Synod took into consideration the last paragraph of the twentieth chapter of the Westminster Confession of Faith; the third paragraph of the twenty-third chapter; and the first paragraph of the thirty-first chapter; and having made some alterations, agreed that the said paragraphs, as now altered, be printed for consideration, together with the draught of a plan of government and discipline. . . . And the Synod agreed that when, the above proposed alterations in the Confession of Faith shall have been finally determined on by the body, and the Directory shall have been revised as above directed,

* The page references to the *Minutes* are in every case up to 1835, to the volumes of *Minutes* (3 vols.) issued by the Presbyterian Board of Publication in 1841 and [1847]. The first of these volumes, covering the Synodical period, bears the title, *Records of the Presbyterian Church*, etc.: it has been twice issued—the first issue bearing the date 1841, the second having no date. We have used the issue of 1841; the pagination of the later issue is advanced by two numerals, so that those who would verify our citations in the later issue must add two to each cited page-numeral.

and adopted by the Synod, the said Confession thus altered, and Directory thus revised and adopted, shall be styled, 'The Confession of Faith, and Directory for public worship, of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America'" (*Minutes* for 1787, p. 539-40). In 1788 the revised draughts having come in, they were considered, and after amendments, adopted and ordered printed (*Minutes* of 1788, pp. 545-6-7). The action with reference to the Confession of Faith is found in the following notes: 26 May, afternoon: "Ordered, To proceed in the consideration of the draught [of the Form of Government and Discipline]; and also of the proposed amendments of the Confession of Faith, and having finished the same, Adjourned. . . ."—28 May, forenoon: "And they order that a correct copy [of the Form of Government and Discipline] be printed, and that the Westminster Confession of Faith, as now altered, be printed in full along with it, as making a part of the constitution." The alterations made at this time in the Doctrinal Standards consisted, in the Confession of Faith, in omitting the last clause of chap. xx, § 4 ("and by the power of the Civil Magistrate"), recasting chap. xxiii, 3, adding a sentence to xxxi, 1, and omitting xxxi, 2 (see them all plainly marked in Schaff, *Creeds of Christendom*, III, 600 *sq.*); and in the Larger Catechism, in omitting the words "tolerating a false religion" in Q. 109.*

With respect to the printing itself we note that at the Synod of 1788, it was "Ordered, That Dr. Duffield, Mr. Armstrong, and Mr. Green, be a committee to superintend the printing and publishing of the above said Confession of Faith and Catechisms, with the Form of Government and Discipline, and the Directory for the Worship of God, as now adopted and ratified by the Synod, as the Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, and that they divide the several parts into chapters and sections properly numbered" (*Minutes* of 1788, p. 547; *Digest*, p. 14). The year passed by, however, without seeing the printing of the book accomplished. At the meeting of the first Assembly accordingly (May 22, 1789), "The committee appointed to superintend the printing and publishing of the constitution, etc., was ordered to call on Mr. Bradford, the printer whom they employed to print said constitution, and to inquire of him the reasons why the publication has been so long delayed, and what assurances he can give to the Assembly as to the time in which it shall be published, and to make report in the afternoon" (*Minutes* of 1789, p. 6; *Digest* of 1893, p. 14-15). There does not appear any record of the report of the Committee that afternoon, but on May 25, we read: "Col. Bayard and Mr. Snowden, were added to the committee to receive proposals from Mr. Bradford, and to make a specific agreement with him for printing the constitution etc., . . . of this church; and the committee is ordered to make report in the afternoon" (*Do.*, p. 9). In the afternoon (p. 10) we read, however: "The committee for printing, etc., inform the Assembly, that they are not ready to report, and beg leave to defer it till to-morrow morning; which was granted." The next morning accordingly (*Do.*, p. 13; cf. *Digest*, p. 15): "The committee for printing the constitution reported two proposals from Mr. Thomas Bradford: 1. To print it at his own expense, with a copy-right for seven years. 2. To print it at a certain price. On which the General Assembly . . . Resolved, That the constitution be printed at the expense of the General Assembly; and that the committee, or a majority of them, enter into an agreement with Mr. Bradford; and that, on the best terms they can, they have a number of copies, not less than a thousand, nor greater than fifteen hundred, printed and bound in such a manner

* Compare *Life of Ashbel Green*, by Rev. J. H. Jones, p. 183. Dr. Green, p. 184, seems to state distinctly that the alteration in Q. 109 was the only one made in the Larger Catechism. Some of the editors of the Confession have been inclined to treat the word "depredation," which in the earliest American editions takes the place of "depopulations" in Q. 142, as also introduced at this time. See below under Nos. xlvi, xlix and lxvii.

as may best promote the sale; and that the committee draw for the price of printing and binding, on the Treasurer of the Assembly, who is hereby ordered to pay it out of the present moneys in the funds. And the Assembly earnestly recommend it to the different Presbyteries, to pay particular attention to have the fund reimbursed out of the sales of the book." From these notices it would appear that the book had been expected to be printed in the interval between the Synod of 1788 and the Assembly of 1789, and that an agreement had been entered upon with Mr. Bradford to that effect. The work had not, however, been done, possibly owing to some uncertainty on the part of the printer as to what his and the Assembly's respective relations to the book and the expenses incurred in printing it would be. Accordingly the agreement above recited was made and it is probable that the book was issued during the summer or autumn of 1789.

There seems to be no allusion to the book in the *Minutes* of 1790 beyond the following blind note: "The committee appointed to superintend the printing of the constitution etc., were ordered to deliver in a report of their proceedings as soon as it can be prepared" (*Minutes*, 1790, p. 24). At that Assembly, however, a Committee seems to have been appointed (or, perhaps, continued*) to "superintend the printing and dispersing of the Confession of Faith and Constitution of this Church." For we read in the *Minutes* of 1791 (May 19, afternoon, p. 33): "The committee appointed last year to superintend the printing and dispersing of the Confession of Faith and Constitution of this Church, reported,—That by the death of Dr. Duffield, one of the members of said committee, and who had the management of the business principally in his hands, they have been much embarrassed in their endeavours to settle it; that it is not yet brought to a close; and that, in their opinion, it would contribute to an accurate and final settlement if the General Assembly would direct the Presbyteries present, to give such information, in regard to the number of the books which they have severally received, as may be in their power.—Whereupon, Ordered, That such information be now given; which was accordingly done, and the committee directed to make, if possible, a final report to the General Assembly of next year." Even the next year, however, the Committee was not able to make a final report: we read (May 18, 1792, *Minutes*, pp. 49-50): "The committee appointed to superintend the printing and dispersing of the Confession of Faith, who were ordered by the Assembly of last year to endeavour to make a final settlement of the business committed to them at the present time, reported: That they had made all the exertions in their power to close the transactions which they were appointed to manage, but, by reason of a number of embarrassing circumstances, had not been able to issue the business: whereupon—Ordered, That the said committee continue their exertions, and endeavour to make a final report to the next General Assembly." Things seem to have been but little better, however, next year: we read (May 17, 1793, *Minutes*, p. 67): "The committee appointed to superintend the dispersion of the Confession of Faith, etc., of this church, made report. Whereupon—Ordered, That said committee be dismissed, and that the final settlement of this concern be committed to the Treasurer of the Assembly." It seems to be inferrible from these notices that the business responsibility assumed by the Assembly in publishing its Constitution in pursuance of the order of May 26, 1789, did not prosper. The Assembly had taken the financial responsibility of the printing and binding, expecting to recoup itself by sales of the book made through the agency of the Presbyteries. The Committee in whose charge the whole business was placed, appears to have found collecting from the Presbyteries an annoying undertaking: and it was accordingly impossible to close out the transaction with Mr. Bradford. So the matter seems to have dragged on until 1793—through four full years—when the

* This seems much the more likely as the Committee appears to be the same as that appointed in 1788, and its function seems to be that then given it.

Committee was dismissed and the completion of the matter placed in the hands of the Treasurer, the amount still due having presumably shrunk to manageable proportions.

Meanwhile, however, before the business complications attending the first issuing of the Confession were cleared up, a second impression (1792) had been issued by Mr. Bradford; and preparations were already making for an improved edition which should contain proof-texts. Concerning these see *post*, in the notes on the editions of Thomas Bradford, 1792, and of Robert Aitken, 1797.

[xv. 1792] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America ; | containing | the | Confession of Faith, | the Catechisms, | the | Government and Discipline | and the | Directory for the Worship of God, | Ratified and adopted by the Synod of New York | and Philadelphia, held at Philadelphia | May the 16th 1788, and continued by adjourn- | ments until the 28th of the same Month. | Philadelphia : | Printed and Sold by Thomas Bradford, | No. 8, South Front Street. | M DCC XCII.

12mo, pp. [vii] 215; $5\frac{1}{2} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). Apparently an exact reprint of the edition 1789: the bastard-title, title, and 3 pages of Contents with which the book opens are in a different type and display, but with same line-lengths on the title-pages; in the imprint the words "and sold" are inserted, and the location is given differently. Otherwise this edition is apparently exactly like the former one. There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, and of the Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia.

There seems to be no notice of this edition in the printed *Minutes* of the Assembly. In 1792 inquiry was made by the Assembly, indeed, as to the expediency of making a new impression of the Confession (*Minutes*, p. 50), and it was reported to the Assembly that "there were still a considerable, though not a sufficient, number of copies on hand," and recommended that preparation should be begun for a new edition with proof-texts. This recommendation was followed and the result was ultimately the edition of Robert Aitken, 1797, though the Assembly in 1792 seemed to suppose that the proof-texts might be prepared for report to it in 1793 (*Minutes*, p. 59). We may possibly infer that the impression of 1792 was issued late in the year, with a view to supplying the Church meanwhile, when it had become evident to the Committee having the matter in hand that the new proof-text edition could not be immediately ready. Perhaps the words "and sold" added in the imprint may have a significance beyond what appears on the surface: was this issue a venture of Mr. Bradford's own, with which the Assembly had no concern? In any event, this impression must be accounted only a new issue of what the Assembly constantly speaks of as the "first edition" of its Constitution (that of 1789), while it as constantly speaks of the edition of 1797 as the "second edition" (see *e.g.*, *Minutes*, 1816, p. 230).

[xvi. 1797] The | Constitution | of the Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America | containing | the Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, | the Government and Discipline, and the | Di- | rectory for the Worship of God. | Ratified and adopted by the Synod of New York and Philadelphia, held | at Philadelphia May the 16th 1788, and continued by ad-

| jourments until the 28th of the same month. | Philadel-
 phia: | Printed by Robert Aitken, No. 22, | Market Street. |
 M DCC XCVII.

12mo, pp. vii, 468; $5\frac{1}{2} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). The Confession occupies pp. 1-153. There are separate titles for the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, both dated 1797. The Form of Government has the Introduction in italics, and "Ch. I. Of the Church" (as in editions of 1789, 1792). The error in the Larger Catechism Q. 105, found in edd. of 1789, 1792 ("trusting in *unlawful means*"), is corrected in this edition. This is the first edition, printed for the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, provided with proof-texts; they occupy the lower part of the page, in two columns; and they were newly prepared for this edition. There are copies in the libraries of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia; of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia; of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia; and of the Union Theological Seminary, New York.

Robert Aitken, the printer of this edition, is famous as the printer of the first American edition of the Bible, or at least of the first edition with an American imprint*—a 12mo, brevier type, 1782. For the Aitken Bible see O'Callaghan, *List of Editions of the Holy Scriptures and parts thereof printed in America previous to 1860* (Albany, 1861): in Introduction, pp. xx, for Aitken. Robert Aitken was an elder in the Associate Presbyterian Church (see Thompson, *History of the Presbyterian Churches in the United States*, 1895, p. 60; cf. Jones, *Life of Ashbel Green*, p. 319), born at Dalkeith, Scotland, 1734; he came to Philadelphia as a bookseller in 1769, and opened a printing office in 1774. He died July, 1802, and was succeeded in his publishing business by his daughter Jane. See THOMAS, as cited, p. 76.

The circumstances connected with the publication of this edition were as follows. On May 18, 1792 (*Minutes*, p. 50), "Drs. Robert Smith and McCorkle, with Messrs. Wm. Wilson, Van Artsdalen, and Woodhull, were appointed a committee to inquire whether it be expedient that a new impression of the Confession of Faith and Form of Government and Discipline of this Church should be made, and if so, to suggest in what manner it may most properly be done, and to report to the house on Monday morning next." The report was hauded in on Monday afternoon, May 21st: "The committee appointed to consider the expediency of a new impression of the Confession of Faith, Form of Government and Discipline of the Church reported, That upon inquiry they found that the demand for the book was increasing; that there were still a considerable, though not a sufficient, number of copies on hand; that, therefore, another impression appeared expedient, in which, if the Scripture proofs were inserted at length, it would become more acceptable and might be of greater utility to the churches; and proposed that a committee be appointed properly to select and arrange the Scripture texts to be adduced in support of the articles in the Confession of Faith, Form of Government and Discipline, and prepare the same to be laid before the next General Assembly.—*Resolved*, That Dr. Robert Smith and Messrs. Mitchell and Grier be a committee to carry the above into execution." Progress was reported the next year (May 17, 1793, *Minutes*, p. 66, where a letter from Mr. A. Mitchell, to whom the task had fallen to prepare the texts for the Confession of Faith, is given in full: it details his whole method of procedure), and "the business was recommitted, and the Moderator [the Rev. James Latta] added to the committee in the place of the

* For the possibility of an earlier American Bible (with British imprint), published by D. Henchman and printed by S. Kneeland, see above, p. 72, under No. i. "The Bible," says Bancroft, "was never printed here in English until the land became free."

Rev. Dr. Robert Smith, deceased, and they were directed to report to the Assembly in 1794." In 1794 (May 19, *Minutes*, p. 85) the Committee announced their report as ready, and (May 20, *Minutes*, p. 88) it was heard, "examined and approved, as a specimen of the work. Whereupon Dr. Green, Messrs. John B. Smith, James Boyd, William M. Tennent, Nathaniel Irwin, and Andrew Hunter were appointed a committee to compare the proofs prepared by said committee and now reported to the General Assembly, with the proofs annexed to the Westminster Confession of Faith, Catechisms and Directory, to revise the whole, prepare it for the press, to agree with the printer for its publication, and to superintend the printing and vending of the same. And said committee were further instructed to secure the copy-right of said book according to the law of the United States in such cases provided." Nevertheless, the Committee was able to report progress only at the next meeting of the Assembly (May 23, 1795, *Minutes*, p. 97), while at the next following (May 24, 1796, *Minutes*, p. 114) they reported: "That they had made considerable progress in the work, and had part of the book ready for publication, but that for want of sufficient funds they were not able to proceed in the publication of it." Whereupon it was, "on motion, *Resolved*, That the committee proceed to have an impression of the Confession of Faith, etc., struck off as soon as in their power, and that they take the best measures they can devise to have it executed and upon the most reasonable terms, and that there be four thousand copies struck off; and that subscription papers be prepared as soon as possible, and distributed throughout the bounds of the General Assembly, and the members are hereby requested to interest themselves in procuring subscribers for assisting the funds of the General Assembly in defraying the expenses of the work. *Resolved*, also, That the price of the book be one dollar to subscribers. Ordered, That the Treasurer of the General Assembly pay into the hands of the committee the sum of three hundred dollars, to enable them to prosecute the business. *Resolved*, That the committee be empowered to employ a proper person to correct the proof-sheets, to assist in the business generally, and that they be authorized to draw on the Treasurer for such sums as may be thought a reasonable compensation; and in case there is no money in his hands, then the Treasurer is directed to borrow money on as good terms as he can for that purpose." Under this comprehensive authorization the Committee was enabled to arrange for the publication of the book; but whether it was actually issued prior to the next meeting of the Assembly does not certainly appear. On May 20, 1797 (*Minutes*, p. 122): "The report of the committee to superintend the printing of the Confession of Faith, was brought in, read and approved. Whereupon,—Ordered, That the committee be continued; and they were directed to make a statement of their accounts and lay it before the next General Assembly. It was also on motion—Ordered, That the same committee be directed to report to this Assembly on Monday morning next, a suitable person to be employed in vending the books, and the commission he may require on the business." On "Monday morning next" accordingly (*Minutes*, p. 125) it was on the recommendation of the Committee, "*Resolved*, That Mr. Robert Aitken [the publisher himself] be employed to dispose of the books, and that Dr. Green, Mr. John McCulloch, and Mr. Robert Ralston, be a committee to agree with Mr. Aitken, in regard to the commission that he shall receive on the business entrusted to him, to give all other necessary directions relative to the business; and that they make report to the next General Assembly." This report was duly made in 1798 (*Minutes*, p. 150), but the financial settlement dragged on until the next year (*Minutes*, 1799, p. 175; cf. also p. 185). A brief *précis* of the transaction is printed in the *Digest of 1898*, p. 15.

The chief distinction of this edition is, of course, that it is the first edition containing the American proof-texts. As the citations from the *Minutes* of the Assembly made in the preceding paragraph show, the preparation of these proof-texts was determined upon in 1792 and a Committee, consisting of Dr. Robert Smith

and Messrs. Mitchell and Grier, appointed to do the work. This Committee so divided the work between them that the preparation of the proofs for the Confession and the Form of Government fell to Mr. Mitchell, those for the Larger Catechism to Dr. Smith, and those for the Shorter Catechism to Mr. Grier. Dr. Smith died April 15, 1793, and at the Assembly of that year Dr. James Latta was put into the vacant place and, we must believe, the papers of Dr. Smith which had been transmitted to the Assembly (p. 66) placed in his hands. There were no proofs prepared for the Shorter Catechism, the omission being excused, when the work came to be published, by the following note, printed at the opening of the Shorter Catechism: “*The Shorter Catechism is, simply, an abridgment of the larger; so that the proof of both must be the same. The reader, therefore, who desires to see the Scripture authorities for any doctrine taught in this catechism, will turn to that doctrine in the Larger Catechism, which may very easily be done, and there he will find the necessary texts fully referred to, or inserted. It was judged unnecessary to print the very same texts twice over” (p. 343). The whole labor of preparing the proof-texts was performed therefore by the Rev. Mr. Alexander Mitchell, pastor since 1785 of the Churches of Upper Octorara and Doe Run (see a short notice of him in the *Encyclopædia of the Presbyterian Church*, edited by Dr. Alfred Nevin, Philadelphia, 1884, p. 530, and also in a monograph on the Upper Octorara Church by J. Smith Futhey, Philadelphia, Lippincott, 1870), and the Rev. Dr. Robert Smith, since 1750 pastor of Pequea (see Sprague’s *Annals of the American Pulpit*, iii, 172), complemented by the Rev. Dr. James Latta, since 1771 pastor of Chestnut Level (see *Sprague*, as cited, p. 199). They were all good scholars and men held in esteem among the brethren; and they were settled in the same district, so that conference between them was easily possible. On Mr. Mitchell the bulk of the labor fell, and the texts for the Confession of Faith were wholly his work. In a letter addressed to the Assembly of 1793 (printed in a footnote, *Minutes*, p. 66) he gives us an insight into his point of view and method of work. The proofs for the Confession were already at that time completed. He had cited in full the texts that appeared to him “to be most adequate and suitable to the design”; others, conceived as “parallel, or corroborating,” he had cited by reference only. “Had it been pardonable, I should have taken the liberty to have altered some of the terms and phraseology in our translation, as more correspondent to the original; but to depart from established customs in religious matters is dangerous. I would also have abridged the proofs; but this would have raised a clamour among the people at large, that we had departed from the ancient faith.” During the course of the next year, Mr. Mitchell completed the proofs for the Form of Government, and Dr. Latta (doubtless on the basis of Dr. Smith’s work transmitted to the Assembly of 1793) completed those on the Larger Catechism. The whole was reported to the Assembly of 1794 and placed in the hands of a new Committee (consisting of Dr. Green and Messrs. John B. Smith, James Boyd, William M. Tennent, Nathaniel Irwin and Andrew Hunter), to be compared with the proof-texts of the Westminster Assembly, revised, and printed. What modifications of the work of Messrs. Mitchell, Smith and Latta were introduced by this new Committee we have no means of knowing: but it seems scarcely likely that any very radical alterations were expected of a Committee whose work was not to be supervised by the Assembly. It appears probable that the proof-texts have come down to us substantially as prepared by the original Committee.

The relation of these new proof-texts to those attached to the documents by the Westminster Assembly raises some interesting questions. It is quite clear from the result that the later were not prepared in entire independence of the earlier series. The Rev. Dr. Samuel T. Lowrie, in an informing paper published in *The Presbyterian Review* for July, 1888 (ix, p. 443), has analyzed the proofs for the first ten chapters of the Confession and the first sixty-six questions of the Larger Catechism, with the effect of showing that the American series can be looked upon as

little more than a rather careless revision, chiefly in the way of abridgment, of the Westminster texts. In the first ten chapters of the Confession, seventy-eight of the Westminster texts are omitted, thirty-one abbreviated, and three curtailed of the precise words of proof, while sixteen new texts are added, besides one attached to the wrong clause. It scarcely seems likely, however, that the work was undertaken professedly as a revision of the Westminster texts. There is nothing to that effect in the *Minutes*, and it does not seem that Mr. Mitchell's remark in his letter of 1793 about abridging the proofs compels this inference. On the whole it appears likely that his object was to draw up an independent series: but that he sought aid from the Westminster texts, and made perhaps a larger use of this aid than he was fully aware of: possibly also the revising hand of the second Committee may have brought about a closer agreement than at first obtained. The relation between the two series of texts in the Larger Catechism appears to be somewhat less close than in the Confession. The whole work was done with apparent haste, not very carefully, and with very inadequate supervision: the result was not particularly creditable to the Church. Yet these proof-texts held their place in all editions of the Confession published by or for the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America for a century (until they were replaced by a new set adopted in 1894), and they still hold their place in the editions published by the Presbyterian Church in the United States (the "Southern Presbyterian Church"). On the whole subject see Dr. S. T. Lowrie's "An Account of the Scripture Proofs Attached to the Confession of Faith and Larger Catechism," in *The Presbyterian Review*, ix, 443 sq. (July, 1888), and also his reports to the General Assembly (*Minutes*, 1891, p. 129 sq., and *Minutes*, 1894, p. 157 sq.; cf. *Digest* of 1898, p. 21 sq.).

Among the proof-texts prepared for this edition there were incorporated certain footnotes, which afterward created considerable stir and which deserve remark as constituting part of the distinction of this edition. Those that occur in the proofs to the Confession of Faith, though impertinent, are of little importance and remained undisturbed. These included not only instances of brief interjected interpretations (at chap. 28, § 3, *m*; chap. 28, § 4, *o*; chap. 29, § 8, *j*): but also instances of argument substituted for Scripture, such as, at chap. 28, § 7, *u*, "N.B.—There is no command, and no adequate example, for the repetition of baptism;" chap. 29, § 4, *b, c*, "Because there is not the least appearance of a warrant for any of these things, either in precept or example, in any part of the Word of God. See all the places in which the ordinance is mentioned; the most important of which are cited above." In the Larger Catechism, however, the case is different. The comment on 1 Cor. xi. 26 inserted in note *e* to Q. 35, "[Till he come to judgment: for he had come in the Spirit long before this time.]" is not very dissimilar, to be sure, to what we have found in the Confession. But there is no parallel in the Confession to the long note inserted at the word "man-stealing" in Q. 142 (p. 277). It runs as follows: "*b.* 1 Tim. i. 10. (The law is made) for whoremongers, for those that defile themselves with mankind, for men-stealers. [This crime among the Jews exposed the perpetrators of it to capital punishment; Ex. xxi. 16, and the apostle here classes them with sinners of the first rank.—The word he uses, in its original import, comprehends all who are concerned in bringing any of the human race into slavery, or in detaining them in it. *Hominum fures, qui servos vel liberos abducunt, retinent, vendunt vel emunt.* Stealers of men are all those who bring off slaves or freemen, and keep, sell, or buy them.—To steal a freeman, says Grotius, is the highest kind of theft. In other instances we only steal human property, but when we steal or retain men in slavery, we seize those who, in common with ourselves, are constituted, by the original grant, lords of the earth. Gen. i. 28. *Vid. Poli Synopsis in loc.*]" The notes to the Form of Government were in the main what still are found in it as published in the later editions: but that on the heading of chap. x, "Of the Synodical Assem-

bly" (now chap. xi, "Of the Synod"), ran thus: "As the proofs already adduced in favour of a presbyterial assembly in the government of the church, are equally valid in support of a synodical assembly (since a synod is only a larger presbytery) it is unnecessary to repeat the Scriptures to which reference has been made under chap. ix, or to add any other." How such a note as that in the Larger Catechism, Q. 142, could have been inserted without remark in the Standards of a Church embracing slaveholders in its membership, can be accounted for only by the desultory manner in which the whole business connected with the preparation of these proof-texts was prosecuted. It is equally remarkable, however, that it was permitted without effective protest to retain its place in these Standards for a period of nearly twenty years. At length, however, in 1816 the matter was called to the attention of the Assembly and an order passed for omitting from future editions this note as well as the parenthesis in the note on chap. x of *The Form of Government*; and ordering the insertion of a note in the then current edition reciting this action of the Assembly (*Minutes*, 1816, pp. 608, 611, 613, 628, 629, 630; cf. 1821, p. 24, 1836, pp. 248, 271, 272-3; cf. the *Digest* of 1886, pp. 52-53, but observe that the extract from the *Minutes*, 1836, p. 248, given on p. 54, is taken from a report which was not adopted by the Assembly: although it expresses an obvious truth and one already affirmed by the Assembly of 1816, pp. 629-30, it is yet not in this form an Act of the Assembly).

The report on these Notes by the Committee of 1816 (pp. 629-30) contains an interesting historical passage which may properly be transcribed here. After reciting the facts that the Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A. was first printed "without any Scripture proofs, or any notes of any description whatsoever," and that "not a single note" had ever been constitutionally added to the Standards, so that no notes appearing in the volume can be esteemed part of the Constitution, it continues: "If, then, it be inquired how these notes obtained the place which they now occupy, and what is the character, as to authority, which they possess, the answer is this: when a second edition of the Standards of our Church was needed, it was thought by the General Assembly, that it would be of great use in itself, highly agreeable to the members of our church generally, as well as conformable to the example of the church of Scotland, from which we derive our origin, if the Scripture proofs were added, in support of the several parts and clauses of the Confession of Faith, catechisms, and form of government. A committee was accordingly appointed by the Assembly to select the Scripture proofs, and to prepare them for being printed in the second edition of the book. The work of this committee was, the following year, referred to another, and ultimately the committee charged with preparing the Scripture proofs, reported, along with these proofs, the notes which now appear in the book, and which were approved by the General Assembly, and directed to be printed with the proofs, in the form in which they now appear. These notes, then, are explanations of some of the principles of the Presbyterian Church, given by the General Assembly, and which, of course, the General Assembly may modify or altogether exclude, at their pleasure, whereas the articles of the constitution must govern the Assembly themselves, and cannot be altered or abrogated, but in the manner pointed out in the constitution itself." The Committee by whom this report was prepared consisted of Dr. Ashbel Green and the Rev. Robert Finley, of the Presbytery of New Brunswick, and Mr. Zachariah Lewis, of the Presbytery of New York. Dr. Ashbel Green, it will be remembered, was also chairman of the Committee which was ultimately charged with the revision and printing of the proof-texts and notes in 1794 (*Minutes*, p. 88). In this report therefore we have a history of the preparation of the edition of the Constitution of 1797, written by the chief agent in its preparation himself.

[xvii. 1801] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | in the | United States of America. | Containing, | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, the | Government and Discipline, and the Direc- | tory for the Worship of God. | Ratified and adopted by the Synod of New York and Philadelphia, | held at Philadelphia, May the 16th, 1788, and continued by | Adjournments, until the 28th of the same Month. | Wilmington: | Printed and sold by Bonsal and Niles. | Also sold at their Book-Store, No. 173, Market-Street, | Baltimore. 1801.

12mo, pp. iv, 407; $5\frac{3}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type); back of title-page blank, with no mark of copyright, certificate or authorization; "Contents" begins p. iii. Proof-texts in two columns on bottom half of page. Larger Catechism, Q. 105 right. There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society, and of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia.

The editions of 1789, 1792 and 1797 were issued by the General Assembly, and under its authority. The present edition is the first edition of *The Constitution*, etc., issued by a private party on his own responsibility. The Assembly looked upon such editions as "unauthorized," and refused to "recognize them as accurate or recommend them to the churches under their care," and decreed that "no edition of the said Confession of Faith ought, in future, to be purchased or encouraged by the churches in their communion, except such as may be published by the authority of the Assembly" (*Minutes*, 1803, p. 282). The relations in which the Assembly stood to the edition published for it by Mr. Robert Aitken, the publisher of the "authorized" edition now current, no doubt required of it that it should, so far as this at least, protect its copyright. We find it, as late as 1807-8-9 (*Minutes*, 1807, p. 376, 1808, p. 397, 1809, p. 414), after the publication of the next "authorized" edition (1806), with unsold Aitken copies on hand, for the sale of which it had to provide.

[xviii. 1803] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | in the | United States of America. | Containing, | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, the Go- | vernment and Discipline, and the Directory for | the Worship of God. | Ratified and adopted by the Synod of New York and Philadelphia, held | at Philadelphia, May the 16th, 1788, and continued by Adjournments, | until the 28th of the same Month. | Wilmington: | Printed and sold by Bonsal and Niles. | Also sold at their Book-Store, No. 173, Market-street, | Baltimore. | 1803.

12mo, pp. iv, 339; $6 \times 3\frac{5}{8}$ inches (block of type); back of title blank, as in ed. 1801; proof-texts in two columns; Larger Catechism, Q. 105 right. There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society, and of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia, and of the Union Theological Seminary, New York.

The appearance of this second "unauthorized" edition so soon after that of 1801 may have had something to do with the vigor of the protest made by the Assembly of 1803 against such issues. See the note under the edition of 1801.

[xix. 1806] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America. | Containing | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, and the | Directory for the Worship of God: together with | the Plan of Government and Discipline as amended | and ratified by the General Assembly at their | sessions in May, 1805. | Philadelphia, | Printed by Jane Aitken, No. 62, | North Third Street. | 1806.

12mo, pp. xiv, 470; $5\frac{1}{4} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type); elegantly printed, with wide margins; proof-texts in two columns; Larger Catechism, Q. 105 right, and Q. 142 with note as in ed. 1797. The book is provided with "an Index to the whole book (the want of which in former editions was much regretted)"—as the Assembly of 1806 (*Minutes*, p. 372) expresses it. On the back of title-page there is a certificate of copyright in the name of A. Green, N. Irwin, E. Hazard, on behalf of the Trustees of the General Assembly, dated March 25, 1806. There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, of Drs. H. C. McCook and E. R. Craven, Philadelphia, and of the Andover Theological Seminary.

Jane Aitken, daughter of Robert Aitken (for whom see under the edition of 1797), carried on the business of printing after her father's death in 1802 with great success. The productions of her press won a deservedly high reputation. One of the best known is the translation of the Bible made by Charles Thomson, Secretary of the Continental Congress (1803). See concerning her, THOMAS, as cited, vol. ii as per index.

The circumstances leading up to the publication of this edition were as follows. The demand for copies of the Confession of Faith seems to have been ever increasing, while the machinery for their distribution from the authorized publishing house does not appear to have been perfected. The result was the publication of the "unauthorized" editions of 1801 and 1803, which in turn led to the following action of the Assembly of 1803 (*Minutes*, p. 282): "Whereas, This Assembly have been informed, that one or more unauthorized editions of the Confession of Faith, and the Form of Government and Discipline of this Church, have been published within a short period,—*Resolved*, That the Assembly cannot recognize as accurate, or recommend to the churches under their care, any edition of the said Confession of Faith published since that which was printed by Robert Aitken, in the year 1797, under the direction of the General Assembly. And the Assembly would further declare to the churches in their communion, that no edition of the said Confession of Faith ought, in future, to be purchased or encouraged by them, except such as may be published by the authority of the Assembly." At the same time (*Do.*, p. 282) looking to the future, the Assembly "*Resolved*, That the Rev. Drs. Blair, Tennent, and Green, the Rev. Messrs. Irwin, Milledoler, Potts, Linn, and Janeway be a committee to take into consideration the expediency of publishing a new edition of the Confession of Faith, etc., of this Church; to consider whether any, and if any, what alterations ought to be made in the said Confession of Faith, etc., to make such preparatory arrangements on this subject as they shall judge proper, and to report to next Assembly." The need of a new edition was emphasized by a request proffered to the next Assembly by the Synod of Kentucky to be itself permitted to print and publish an edition of 1000 copies for circulation within its own bounds (*Minutes*, 1804, p. 293): a request which was denied (*Do.*, p. 310) on the express ground that a new and much amended edition of the Constitution was at the moment in preparation by the Assembly, the appearance of which was to "be expected in the course of one or two years at farthest"; meanwhile, as a substitute for

granting this request, the Assembly forwarded to the Synod of Kentucky "350 copies of the Confession, printed by Robert Aitken, to be disposed of by them at such price as they shall judge proper, and account to the Assembly for the amount." At the same meeting (1804) the Committee appointed in 1803 reported (pp. 297, 302), that no alteration in the Confession of Faith or Catechisms was required, but that a number of specified amendments to the Form of Government, etc., should be proposed to the Presbyteries. This was done, and the reports on these amendments came in the next year (*Minutes*, 1805, pp. 331-2), all having been approved by the Presbyteries. The opportunity was taken by the Presbyteries of New York and Albany to suggest yet other amendments this year (*Minutes*, 1805, p. 337); but the Assembly (p. 340) "*Resolved*, That although this Assembly wishes to pay due respect to every communication from the subordinate judicatories, especially on so important a subject; yet as the adopting and sending to the Presbyteries for their opinion, any further amendments at this time, would delay the publication of the book (so much wanted by the churches) another year at least, the Assembly deem it inexpedient to consider, at this time, the amendments proposed by the Presbyteries of New York and Albany." Accordingly it was "*Resolved*, That the Trustees of the General Assembly be requested to take measures for publishing a new edition of the Confession of Faith and Catechisms, the Plan of Government, Discipline, and Directory for worship of the Presbyterian Church in these United States. And whereas, all the amendments proposed by last Assembly have been approved by a majority of the Presbyteries, and this approbation certified by them in writing to this Assembly,—*Resolved*, That the Trustees cause these said amendments to be incorporated in the Plan of Government and Discipline, the copy-right to be secured to the General Assembly, and draw warrants from time to time, for the sums of money which may be necessary, during the progress of the whole work." The completion of the task thus devolved on the Trustees of the General Assembly was duly reported to the Assembly of 1806 (p. 372), to wit: "That agreeably to the orders of last Assembly, they have caused to be printed an edition of the Confession of Faith, Catechisms, Government, and Discipline of the Presbyterian Church, etc.; with the amendments, consisting of five thousand copies, whereof two hundred and fifty copies are bound and subject to the order of the General Assembly; and that the copy-right of the edition has been secured according to law." On receiving this report the Assembly expressed satisfaction, and provided for the sale and wide distribution of the volume (p. 372).

[xx. 1815] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church |
 in the | United States of America. | Containing | The Confes-
 sion of Faith, | the Catechisms, | and the | Directory for the
 Worship of God: | together with | the Plan of Govern-
 ment and Discipline, | as amended and ratified by the General
 Assembly at their | sessions in May, | 1805. | Philadelphia:
 | Printed for and published by W. W. Woodward, | corner
 of Second and Chestnut streets. | Griggs & Dickinsons, Prin-
 ters, | 1815.

12mo, pp. viii, 424; $5\frac{1}{2} \times 3\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type); proof-texts in two columns; Larger Catechism, Q. 105 right; notes present at Q. 142 and at Form of Government X. On back of title-page is the copyright notice in the name of Dr. Ashbel Green, Rev. N. Irwin and Ebenezer Hazard, on behalf of the Trustees of the General Assembly. There are copies in the libraries of Drs. E. R. Craven and Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia; and in the Congressional Library at Washington. In

Dr. Craven's copy, at least, there has been inserted at the end two unnumbered pages giving the minute made by this Assembly of 1816 relative to the footnotes (see above under the edition of Robert Aitken, 1797), signed by "J. J. Janeway, Stated Clerk." This was, of course, intended, as far as possible, to bring up to date the remainders of this edition in band after 1816: and was provided for by the Assembly of 1816 in the order, "That the foregoing resolution with the report of the committee, sanctioned by the Assembly on the same subject, be printed and connected with the last edition of the Confession of Faith, Catechisms, Form of Government, etc., of this Church" (*Minutes*, p. 630). This edition is probably to be accounted the *fourth* issued under the authority of the Assembly.

The history of the preparation of this edition does not seem to be recorded in the printed *Minutes* of the Assembly. It is alluded to, however, in the *Minutes* of 1816, p. 630, as "the last edition" (see the minute quoted just above); and also in the *Minutes* of 1817 (p. 648), where we are told it was published by a definite contract made by the Trustees of the Assembly "with a bookseller," which extended "to the disposal of the whole edition," of which 2000 copies remained unsold in 1817. This appears to be the last edition published thus directly by the Trustees of the General Assembly, contracting "with a bookseller" for the work. Subsequent editions were published by booksellers at their own risk, by permission of the Assembly (whose Trustees still held the copyright), accorded only on the correctness of their texts being certified by a Committee appointed by the Assembly.

[xxi. 1821] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in
the | United States of America : | containing | The Confession
of Faith, The Catechisms, and the Direc- | tory for the Wor-
ship of God : together with the Plan | of Government and
Discipline, as amended and rati- | fied by the General Assem-
bly, at their session in | May, 1821. | Philadelphia : | Pub-
lished by Anthony Finley, Corner of Chestnut and | Fourth
Streets. | 1821.

12mo, pp. 507 ; $5\frac{1}{2}$ x $2\frac{5}{8}$ inches (block of type) ; the proof-texts are printed in one column at bottom of page. On the back of the title-page there is a certificate setting forth that the book was published under the supervision of Jacob J. Janeway, William Neill, and Ezra Stiles Ely, appointed by the Assembly of 1821 : this is dated June 25, 1821. The note inserted in the editions since 1797 at Larger Catechism, Q. 142, is deleted ; and also the parenthesis in the note at Form of Government x (chap. xi in this book). The Introduction to the Form of Government now becomes chap. i (with the subsequent chapter-numbers adjusted to the new enumeration), explained by the following note : " * NOTE :—This Introductory Chapter, with the exception of the first sentence, was first drawn up by the Synod of New York and Philadelphia, and prefixed to the Form of Government, etc., as published by that body in 1788. In that year, after arranging the plan on which the Presbyterian Church is now governed, the Synod was divided into four Synods and gave place to the General Assembly, which met for the first time in 1789." The note on the words "he descended into hell" in the Creed, printed at the end of the Shorter Catechism, is in this edition, for the first time, enlarged by the addition : "See the answer to the 50th question in the Larger Catechism, p. 188." Complete copies of this edition are provided with an engraved pre-title, printed on plate paper, bearing a picture of the First Presbyterian Church of Philadelphia, and the following wording in ornate letters : "Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States | of America || [picture of the church with the description under it : 'First Presbyterian Church, Washington Square, Philad.'] ||

Philadelphia | Published by A. Finley | 1821 | Kneass Sc. | ” There are copies in the libraries of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, of the Union Theological Seminary, New York ; of Dr. E. R. Craven, Dr. Henry C. McCook, and the Presbyterian Historical Society, of Philadelphia ; and in the Congressional Library at Washington.

This edition is the first published under the new arrangement inaugurated by the Assembly in 1821 for the publication of the Confession, and bears accordingly the certificate of the Committee of the Synod of Philadelphia, certifying its accuracy. The way for this new arrangement seems to have been prepared by a petition sent up from the Presbytery of Jersey to the Assembly of 1817 (*Minutes*, p. 639) praying “permission for booksellers generally to publish the Confession of Faith, without requiring anything for the copy-right.” This petition was denied, “at present,” on account of the existence of a definite contract on the part of the Trustees “with a bookseller” concerning “the present edition”—*i. e.*, the edition of 1815 (p. 648). This contract and the remnant unsold, 2000 copies of “the present edition” (1815), did not prevent the Trustees, however, from soon afterward making a new contract for the publication of a new edition. We read in the *Minutes* for 1818 (p. 688) : “It having been stated to the Assembly that the Trustees had made a contract for publishing a new edition of the Confession of Faith, the following resolution was submitted to the Assembly and adopted, *viz.*,—*Resolved*, That the Trustees of the General Assembly be requested to suspend the publication of a new edition of the Confession of Faith, until the contemplated alterations in the Book of Discipline shall have been effected.” These “contemplated alterations in the Book of Discipline” had been set on foot in 1816, and the business was not completed until 1821 (*Minutes*, p. 9). Whereupon, at once (May 18, 1821), “Drs. Blatchford, McDowell and Wilson, and Messrs. Herron and Wm. Williams, were appointed a Committee to determine upon the plan of printing a new edition of the Confession of Faith, and Constitution of the Church” (*Minutes*, 1821, p. 9).* This Committee reported a scheme on May 24, which seems to take a hint from the Jersey overture of 1817 (p. 17) : “Whereupon the Assembly *resolved*,—1. That the Rev. Dr. Ely be appointed a committee to procure in the name of the Trustees of the General Assembly, the privilege of a copy-right for the publishing of the Confession of Faith, and Constitution of the Church ; and that he be charged with seeing that every part of the law concerning the securing such right be fully complied with. 2. That any printer, so disposed, may print any number of copies of said book, as he shall think proper, subject to the following restrictions. 3. That to secure authentic copies of so important a publication, three ministers of each of the Synods of our church be designated as a Committee in their respective bounds, whose duty it shall be to form contracts for the payment of the premium hereinafter mentioned, and carefully to examine the proof-sheets of said book. Their signatures shall be regarded as necessary certificates of authenticity. 4. That each printer of said book, for the privilege of printing, shall pay the sum of three cents per copy to the treasurer of the General Assembly ; to be equally divided between the missionary funds belonging to this Assembly, and the funds of the Theological Seminary at Princeton. 5. That the Committee of the Synod of Philadelphia be directed to have the book printed as speedily as possible” (*Minutes*, 1821, pp. 17-18). The Assembly then proceeded to appoint the twelve Synodical Committees thus provided for, and passed resolutions requiring the full list of them to be printed on the last page of each book issued under this arrangement,† and making the members of each Committee sev-

* The appointment of Mr. William B. Adford as “Printer and Distributer” of the General Assembly, June 1, 1820 (*Minutes*, p. 739), had reference only to the occasional printing of that body and did not contemplate such work as editions of the Constitution.

† This provision does not seem to have been complied with—at least widely. We have met with no copy in which such a list is found.

erally responsible for the accuracy of the editions which might be printed under the superintendency of each. The work thus set on foot was at once taken in hand: for "Dr. Ely, of the committee in the Synod of Philadelphia, for the publication of the Confession of Faith," appeared in the Assembly on May 29 (*Minutes*, 1821, p. 24) and asked instructions as to certain details; and next year (May 28, 1822, *Minutes*, pp. 55-56) duly reported that the copyright had been properly secured.

Under this arrangement the Confession seems to have been published up to 1839. Modifications of it were introduced, to be sure, in 1834 and 1835, but these modifications touched only details. In 1834 (*Minutes*, p. 452) it was "*Resolved*, That any person may be at liberty to publish the standards of our church, or any part of them, as the same are now authorized by the General Assembly, under the supervision of the Assembly's Committee in any Synod, without any deduction for the benefit of the Assembly."* But in 1835 (*Minutes*, p. 491) it was "*Resolved*," That this act "be and is hereby repealed; and that hereafter no person shall be allowed by any committee to print an edition of our standards without paying to said committee \$50 for every 1000 copies, which sum shall by said committee be paid without delay to the contingent fund of the Assembly." In 1839, however, this whole elaborate scheme was set aside in the Old School branch of the Church, and the publication of the Constitution reserved exclusively to the "Presbyterian Board of Publication," the new name given to "The Presbyterian Tract and Sabbath School Book Society," which had been established by the Synod of Philadelphia in 1833 and adopted by the Assembly the previous year (1833). For the origin and early history of this Board, besides the *History of the Board of Publication* by Dr. Rice, see the *Minutes of the Assembly*, 1838, p. 23 sq.; 1839, pp. 170, 172, 177. The arrangements for the publication of the Constitution after the division of the Church that were made by the New School branch, committed the whole matter to a *Committee ad interim* with power (*Minutes*, New School, 1840, p. 20): but no edition was issued before 1845 by this branch of the Church.

[xxii. 1821] [Stereotype Edition.]† | The | Constitution | of the |
 Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America : |
 containing the | Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, | and |
 the Directory for the Worship of God ; | together with the
 | Plan of Government and Discipline, | as amended and rati-
 fied by the General Assembly, | at their sessions in May,
 1821. | Elizabethtown, N. J. | Published by Mervin Hale. |
 Abraham Paul, Printer. | 1821.

12mo, pp. 466; 5 x 2½ inches (block of type); proof-texts in one column; Larger Catechism, Q. 105 right and note at Q. 142 absent—*i. e.*, the edition is conformed to the text of 1816, first published in 1821. Besides copyright, the back of the title-page contains a certificate from John McDowel, John B. Romeyn, and Stephen N. Rowan, as Committee of the Synod of New York and New Jersey, dated December, 1821. Hence the book was published at the very end of the year. There are copies of this edition in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society and of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia.

This is the first edition of the Confession of Faith which professes to be stereo-

* No advantage seems to have been taken of this freedom to print, so soon to be withdrawn. We have met with but a single edition of 1834, and that is a reissue of a former one.

† These square brackets occur on the title-page of this edition and similar editions subsequent to it.

typed, and very likely it is the first that was stereotyped. The first American stereotyper was John Watts,* an Englishman, who came to the United States about 1804-5, and succeeded in 1813 in producing the first stereotyped book produced in America. This was a copy of the Larger Catechism as set forth by the Rev. Dr. McLeod. There is a copy of it in the New York State Library, and it appears listed in the *Catalogue* published in 1855, as follows: "Westminster (The Larger) Catechism, agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster: revised by W. McLeod, D.D., New York, 1813. 12mo. *First book stereotyped in America.*" John Watts quit business, however, in 1816 and removed to Vienna in 1819. The real introducer of the art of stereotyping in America was therefore David Bruce, a Scotchman, born at Wick, Caithness, November 12, 1770, who did business in New York. He went to England to learn the art in 1812, and in 1814 he produced a stereotyped bourgeois New Testament and a nonpariel School Bible: these books are usually considered the first fruits of American stereotyping. By 1820 the number of stereotypers in New York was five; by 1830 there were eight or nine: the art was introduced into Philadelphia by Jedediah Howe and into Boston by the Boston Type Foundry. The art, it will be seen, was still in its infancy in 1821, when this edition of the Confession was produced: and in 1815, when the immediately preceding edition appeared, it was practically not existent. Nevertheless it is worthy of notice that the General Assembly as early as 1816 contemplated the stereotyping of the Confession. A Committee was appointed at the afternoon session of May 21, 1816 (*Minutes*, p. 613), "to report some plan for more extensively circulating the Confession of Faith and the Book of Discipline of our Church." This Committee reported at the morning session of May 26 (p. 626), recommending among other things "that the Trustees of the General Assembly be authorized and directed to inquire into the expediency of stereotyping the Confession of Faith, Catechisms, and Form of Government, and to report to the next General Assembly." Their report was (*Minutes*, 1817, p. 647), "that in their opinion it would be inexpedient," and "their report was approved."

This edition owed its possibility to the new arrangements for publishing the Confession inaugurated by the Assembly of 1821 (see the account of them in the notes under the edition of Anthony Finley, 1821): and accordingly bears the certificate of the Committee of the Synod of New York and New Jersey. It is apparently the second issue under these new rules. It is presumable that the whole series of editions now to be enumerated, viz., Mervin Hale, 1821, 1822, 1822; William Williams, 1822, 1824; Towar and Hogan, 1826, 1827; Alexander Towar, 1833, 1833, 1834, 1837; Haswell, Barrington and Haswell, 1838; Ed. Barrington and George D. Haswell [no date], are all printed from the same plates; as also two later editions, viz., Lippincott, 1856, 1859.

[**xxiii.** 1822] [Stereotype Edition.] | The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America: | etc. [as in the similar edition of 1821] | . . . Elizabethtown, N. J. | Published by Mervin Hale. | Abraham Paul, Printer. | 1822.

12mo, pp. 466; 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type), etc., as in preceding edition. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia.

[**xxiv.** 1822] [Stereotype Edition.] The | Constitution . . . etc. [as in the similar editions of 1821 and 1822] . . . | Eliza-

* Cadwallader Colden had communicated certain ideas on the subject to Dr. Franklin as early as 1743; and Benjamin Mecom, a nephew of Franklin's, had succeeded in 1775 in casting plates for several pages of the New Testament. On Mecom see Thomas, *as cited*, I, p. 215.

bethtown, N. J. | Published by Mervin Hale. | Johnstone & Van Norden, Printers, 192 Front Street, New York. | 1822.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc., as in the preceding edition. A copy was seen and examined in the summer of 1900 on the shelves of the bookstore of the Presbyterian Board of Publication and Sabbath School Work, Philadelphia.

[xxv. 1822] [Stereotype Edition.] The | Constitution, etc. . . . [as in the similar editions of 1821 and 1822] | Utica : | Printed and Published | By William Williams, | No. 60 Genesee Street. | 1822.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc., as in the similar editions already described. On the back of title the same certificate is found as in the Mervin Hale edition of 1821, dated, as that is, December, 1821. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[xxvi. 1824] [Stereotype Edition.] The | Constitution, etc. [as in the similar editions of 1821 and 1822] . . . | Utica : | Printed and Published | by William Williams, | No. 60 Genesee Street, | 1824.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc. Same certificate on the back of title (December, 1821) as in the others of this series. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia.

[xxvii. 1826] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | etc. [as in the edition of Mervin Hale, 1821] . . . | Philadelphia : | Published by Towar and Hogan, | No. 255 Market Street. | 1826.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type); proof-texts in one column, etc. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[xxviii. 1827] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | etc. [as in the edition of Mervin Hale, 1821] . . . | Philadelphia : | Published and for sale by Towar and Hogan | No. 255. Market Street | 1827.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc.; certificate on back of title from the Committee of the Synod of Philadelphia, dated June 1, 1827. There are copies in the libraries of Princeton Theological Seminary and Princeton University, and in the Mercantile Library (Tenth street above Chestnut), Philadelphia.

[xxix. 1833] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | in the | United States of America : | containing | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, and the | Directory for the Worship of God : | together with the | Plan of Government and Discipline, | as amended and ratified by the General Assembly, | at their sessions in May, 1821. | Philadelphia : | Alexander Towar, 19 St. James street, | Hogan & Thompson, 139 $\frac{1}{2}$ Market-St. | D. M. Hogan, Pittsburg ; D. Woodruff, Tuscaloosa, (Ala.) | 1833.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc.; certificate by the Committee of the Synod of

Philadelphia. There is a copy in the library of the Union Theological Seminary, New York.

[xxx. 1833] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition] . . . | as ratified by the General Assembly, at their sessions | in May, 1821; and amended in 1833. | Philadelphia: | Alex. Towar, No. 19 St. James Street, etc. [as in the preceding edition] | 1833.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc., with certificate from Committee of Synod of Philadelphia. There are copies in the libraries of Drs. E. R. Craven and H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[xxxi. 1834] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition] . . . | Philadelphia: | Alex. Towar, etc. [as in the immediately preceding editions] | 1834.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc. There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society and of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[xxxii. 1837] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | etc. [as in the edition by same publishers immediately preceding]. . . | Alex. Towar, No. 19 St. James St. | Hogan & Thompson, N. Fourth St. | D. M. Hogan, Pittsburgh; D. Woodruff, Tuscaloosa (Ala.) | 1837.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches. On the back of title occur the signatures of two Committees, one dated June 16, 1834, "Ezra Stiles Ely, A. Barnes, and H. A. Boardman," and one dated August 22, 1834, "Cors. C. Cuyler, John McDowell, S. G. Winchester": the copyright is signed by D. Caldwell. There is a copy in the library of Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia, and another in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton.

[xxxiii. 1838] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition] | Philadelphia: Haswell, Barrington & Haswell (successors to Alex. Towar), 293 Market Street. 1838.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc. Identical apparently with the edition of Alex. Towar, etc., of 1837, immediately preceding, and containing the same certificates on the back of title. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[xxxiv. 1839 ±] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition] . . . | Philadelphia: | Ed. Barrington and Geo. D. Haswell, | 293 Market Street. | [no date.]

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches. On the back of title there are the two certificates that occur in the 1837 edition of Alex. Towar and the 1838 edition of Haswell, Barrington & Haswell: the copyright is dated 1821. The book was issued certainly before 1852, as it is listed in Roorbach's *Catalogue of American Publica-*

tions from 1820-1852, p. 443. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[xxxv. 18—] [Confession of Faith, etc. Philadelphia: Thomas Davis. 12mo, sheep.]

[xxxvi. 18—] [Confession of Faith, etc. Philadelphia: Thomas, Coppertwhaite & Co. 18mo, sheep.]

We find these two editions (among others) listed in the *Bibliotheca Americana: Catalogue of American Publications from 1820-1852*, compiled by O. A. Roorbach (New York, 1852), at pp. 126, 443, respectively. We have found no further trace of them. Their inclusion in this catalogue suggests that they were published somewhere between 1820 and 1852.

[xxxvii. 1839] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America: | containing | The Confession of Faith, | the Catechisms, and the Directory for the Worship of God: | together with the | Plan of Government and Discipline, | as ratified by the General Assembly, at their Sessions in | May, 1821; and amended in 1833. | Philadelphia: | Presbyterian Board of Publication, | William S. Martien, Publishing Agent, | 1839.

18mo, pp. 536, 5 x 2½ inches (block of type); the proof-texts printed in a single column at the bottom of the page. The Act of the General Assembly, May 29, 1839, confining the right to publish the Confession of Faith exclusively to the Board of Publication, is prefixed. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia.

A short notice of Mr. Martien will be found in Dr. Alfred Nevin's *Encyclopædia of the Presbyterian Church* (Philadelphia, 1884), p. 471. A *History of the Presbyterian Board of Publication, etc.*, by the Rev. Willard M. Rice, D.D. (Philadelphia: no date), has been published by the Board (apparently about 1887).

Previous to the division of the Church in 1838, the publication of the Constitution of the Church had been left for many years (since 1821) to the initiative of private publishers, who undertook the work at their own risk and to their own profit, the Assembly only reserving, under the ægis of the copyright, the supervision of the text printed and a small tax on the issue. But immediately after this division the Old School branch of the Church, which had in 1838 adopted the "Presbyterian Tract and Sabbath-school Book Society," established by the Synod of Philadelphia in 1833, reserved the publication of the Constitution exclusively to it, now (1839) became "The Presbyterian Board of Publication." The terms in which this was done are as follows: "Resolved, That the permission heretofore granted by the Assembly to publish the Confession of Faith in contravention of the copy-right be and the same is hereby revoked.—Resolved, That the Presbyterian Board of Publication is hereby directed to take the charge, oversight, and agency of printing and selling the authorized copy of the Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, and that they open a separate account therefor, and pass all the credits of the operation quarterly to the general objects of their institution.—Resolved, That the standing committees to supervise the publication of the Constitution, within the bounds of the several Synods, be and the same are hereby abolished" (*Minutes*, 1839, p. 177). Acting under the terms of this authorization the Presbyterian Board of Publication immediately prepared a set of stereotyped plates and issued their first edition in 1839. These plates continued in use until 1853 and during that period 47,000 copies were

printed from them. There were besides 2500 copies from the same plates taken on larger paper, making a 12mo edition of fine appearance; these were issued at intervals from 1840 to 1854. A new imprint appears on the title-page in 1841, 1842, and several times subsequently: and a new Index was introduced in 1842, swelling the book from 536 to 549 pages. Except for this, the volume remains the same throughout the series.

[xxxviii. 1840] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the United States of America: | containing | The Confession of Faith, | the Catechisms, and the Directory for the Worship of God: | together with the | Plan of Government and Discipline, | as ratified by the General Assembly at their Sessions in | May, 1821; and amended in 1833. | Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, | William S. Martien, Publishing Agent, | 1840.

18mo, pp. 536, 5 x 2 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type); the proof-texts printed in a single column at the bottom of the page. The Act of the General Assembly, May 29, 1839, confining the right to publish the Confession of Faith exclusively to the Board of Publication, is prefixed. There are copies in the libraries of Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and Henry C. McCook, and of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia. The edition differs in nothing but the date from the immediately preceding one.

[xxxix. 1840 +] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition].

12mo, pp. 536, 5 x 2 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). An *edition de luxe* on large and high quality paper, in every respect like the parallel 18mo editions from the same plates. There were issued 2500 copies of this edition between 1840 and 1854.

[xl. 1841] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | etc. [as in the immediately preceding editions] | Philadelphia: | Presbyterian Board of Publication, | James Russell, Publishing Agent. | 1841.

18mo, pp. 536, 5 x 2 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches. There is a copy of this edition in the 12mo fine paper form in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton. This edition is from the plates of 1839.

[xli. 1842] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | etc. [as in the immediately preceding editions] | Philadelphia: | Presbyterian Board of Publication, | Paul T. Jones, Publishing Agent. | 1842.

18mo, pp. 549. 5 x 2 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches; from the same plates as the editions of 1839, 1840 and 1841. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, and another in the library of the Rev. Jesse L. Cotton, Coraopolis, Pa.

The only difference between this issue (with its successors) and those of 1839, 1840, 1841, consists in the new and much improved Index, here substituted for the old one. The old Index had been prepared for and first appears in the edition of 1806 (Jane Aitken). The new Index which now appears held its place until 1891. It was carried over bodily to the plates of 1853, with only the necessary adjustment of numerals: and was merely eked out with a "Supplementary Index" in the

issues from these plates after 1885 and 1888, when much alteration had been made in the latter portion of the book. A new Index was prepared for the projected new plates of 1883, and it is this, very much extended and improved, which has been printed in the editions subsequent to 1891. These three Indices characterize, therefore, (1) the editions from 1806 to 1841; (2) the editions from 1842 to [1891], in which year 500 copies were issued from the old plates; (3) the editions from 1891 +. To them should be added: (4) The Index which was prepared for the New School editions of 1850 *sq.*, which was new and more copious than that which had hitherto been in use (from 1806 to 1846).

[xlii. 1843-52] The | Constitution | of the Presbyterian Church, | etc. [as in the immediately preceding editions] | Philadelphia: | Presbyterian Board of Publication | [no date].

18mo, pp. 549, 5 x 2½ inches; from the plates of 1839. There is no date on the title-page, and no number of publishing house. There were issues of from 1000 to 6000 copies made every year from 1843 to 1852 inclusive, aggregating 43,000 (only 4000 had been printed between 1840 and 1842). There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society and of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, of Philadelphia; and also in the University Library, Princeton. With these issues, the impressions taken from the plates made in 1839 cease, 49,500 copies in all having been printed from them. The new plates (inferior in text to the old) were made in June, 1853.

[xlili. 1845] [The Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America: containing the Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, the Form of Government, the Book of Discipline, and the Directory for the Worship of God; as ratified by the General Assembly at their sessions in May, 1821, and amended in 1840. Philadelphia: Perkins and Purves, 1845.]

We have met with no copy of this edition, and the form of title-page we have assigned to it is, of course, hypothetical. The existence of the edition is, however, undubitable. It is attested not only by the reference on the title-page of the next edition to be mentioned, which claims to be "the second edition" of its type; and by the description of it in the certificate of the supervising Committee of the Synod of Pennsylvania, which is printed on p. 4 of the said "second edition;" but also by the explicit mention of it on p. 33 of the *Minutes* of the New School General Assembly for 1846, to the following effect: "This Assembly hereby authorize and approve of the edition of our Constitution as published by Messrs. Perkins and Purves, in 1845." The "second edition" of 1846 is doubtless only a reproduction of this first edition of 1845, and the description of the one may be supposed to apply equally well to the other.

This is the first edition published under the auspices of the New School Church. There had been introduced into the Assembly of that Church, in 1839, a series of overtures proposing radical changes in the principles of order embodied in the existing formularies, and these were all declared in 1840 to have been adopted by the Presbyteries. Among the changes introduced, one made the meetings of the Assembly triennial instead of annual. This involved the appointment of a "*Committee ad interim*" or "Consulting Committee" to attend to the business of the body during the long interval before the next Assembly. This Committee consisted of five ministers and five ruling elders (with the three Clerks of the Assembly as *ex-officio*

members), and very large powers were committed to it. Its first membership consisted of the Rev. Drs. Samuel H. Cox, Philip C. Hay, David H. Riddle, the Rev. Messrs. William Adams and Albert Barnes, and Elders James Ruthven, G. U. Richards, F. A. Raybold, Matson Smith and C. P. Robert, together with Dr. Erskine Mason and the Revs. E. W. Gilbert and Henry A. Rowland, Clerks. The extensive alterations required in the lesser Standards by the changes which had been declared adopted, naturally demanded a new edition of the Constitution, and accordingly we read in the *Minutes*, 1840 (p. 20): "Resolved, further, That the subject of *publishing our standards*, with our Form of Government and Book of Discipline, as now adopted by the Assembly, be referred to the Consulting Committee." By the *Committee ad interim* in turn the task was devolved on a Sub-committee. At its meeting at New York, November 6, 1840, "the subject of publishing an edition of the Confession of Faith and Form of Government was referred to Messrs. Cox and Mason with power." Accordingly under these auspices the revised Form of Government was published in 1842, but beyond this the matter does not seem to have been carried at this time. Ultimately, however, the whole *Constitution*, etc., incorporating this revised Form of Government, was published in 1845. In the *Minutes* of the Assembly of 1846 we read (p. 23): "The Rev. E. S. Ely, D.D., offered resolutions in reference to a new edition of the Confession of Faith, which was referred to the Rev. Messrs. E. S. Ely, D.D., E. F. Hatfield, E. W. Gilbert, D.D., A. E. Campbell, S. Haynes, S. H. Cox, D.D., and H. Bushnell." Again (p. 33): "The Rev. E. S. Ely, D.D., reported the following resolutions in regard to the new edition of the *Confession of Faith*, which were adopted, viz.: The Committee to whom was referred the publication of the Constitution of the Presbyterian Church, beg leave to report, that, under the direction of a committee of the Synod of Pennsylvania, Messrs. Perkins & Purves, of Philadelphia, have stereotyped and published 'The Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, containing the Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, larger and shorter, the Form of Government, the Book of Discipline, and the Directory for Worship,' as the same was adopted by the fathers of the Presbyterian Church in 1788, except so far as the same have been subsequently amended and ratified in conformity to said constitution; therefore,—Resolved, That the Assembly hereby authorize and approve of the edition of our Constitution as published by Messrs. Perkins & Purves in 1845; and direct the Stated Clerk of this Assembly by his certificate to authenticate the same.—Resolved, That the Stated Clerk be, and hereby is, directed to authenticate any future edition of the Constitution which may be submitted to his inspection, and found by him to correspond perfectly with this first approved edition already published by Messrs. Perkins & Purves."

[xliv. 1846] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America : | containing | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, the Form | of Government, the Book of Discipline, | and the Directory for the Worship of God ; | As ratified by the General Assembly at their | sessions in May, | 1821 ; amended in 1840 ; and ratified and | approved in May, 1846. | Second Edition : | Published by authority of the General Assembly. | Philadelphia : | Perkins and Purves. | 1846.

16mo, pp. 468, 6½ x 4 inches. On p. 3 there is printed the "Report of the Committee appointed by the General Assembly of 1846, on the subject of the publication of the Confession of Faith, &c.," signed by the names of the whole Committee (as given above, in the notes to the edition of 1845). Following this

is printed the "Certificate of the Stated Clerk," dated "New York, June, 1846," and signed "Edwin F. Hatfield, Stated Clerk." On p. 4 there is given the certificate of the Committee of the Synod of Pennsylvania of the preceding year: "The undersigned, having been appointed by the Synod of Pennsylvania, at their sessions held October, 1844, a Permanent Committee to superintend the publication of the Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, the Directory of Worship, and the Plan (Form) of Government and Discipline of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, and after examining the proof-sheets, to authenticate by their signature, at the time of publication, every edition, as it may be issued, in the name and on behalf of the Synod, have examined," &c. This is signed by Thomas Brainerd, E. W. Gilbert, and Robert Adair, Com., and is dated "Philadelphia, July 1, 1845." There is a copy of this edition in the library of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny: and the above description has been kindly furnished us by the Rev. Jesse L. Cotton, formerly librarian there. See the notes under the edition of 1845 for further information about the origin and contents of this edition.

[xlv. 1846] An Exposition | of the | Confession of Faith | of the Westminster Assembly of Divines. | By the | Rev. Robert Shaw. | Revised by the Committee of Publication. | Philadelphia: | Presbyterian Board of Publication | [no date].

12mo, pp. 360; there is no date on the title-page, but the certificate of copyright is dated 1846. This is an American edition of Shaw's well-known *Exposition*, adapted to the American Confession by changes in text and exposition at the places which the American revision affects. The Contents are as follows: Advertisement to the American edition, pp. 7-10; Preface, pp. 11-12; Text, pp. 13-352; Index, pp. 353-360. For the British edition see the PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, October, 1901, p. 651 (No. 112). There is a copy in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, and it is kept on sale at the bookstore of the Presbyterian Board of Publication and Sabbath-school Work, Philadelphia. It contains the text of the Confession (with the proofs by reference), accompanied by full practical comments.

[xlvi. 1850] The | Confession of Faith | of | The Presbyterian Church | in | The United States of America. | New York: | Published by Mark H. Newman & Co. | No. 199 Broadway. | 1850.

24mo, pp. [2] 657-695 (= parts of Sig. 55, Sig. 56 [Sig. 57 is passed over inadvertently in the numbering], and part of Sig. 58); $5\frac{1}{4} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches: pamphlet with outside title precisely the same as the inner, except that it bears the date of 1851; contains only the Confession of Faith, with proof-texts by reference only.

In the *Minutes* of the New School Assembly of 1851 we read (p. 16): "A communication was received from Messrs. Mark H. Newman & Co., publishers of the Assembly's Hymn Book, directing attention to some new editions of the Hymn Book, together with a donation of several copies of the Confession of Faith, Shorter Catechism, Doddridge's Rise and Progress, and Baxter's Call, in a cheap form, for general circulation, which was accepted with thanks." The present edition appears to be the one referred to in this note. We have not ascertained the work of which the signatures extracted to make this pamphlet were a part; the conjecture lies near at hand that it was the Hymn Book which these publishers were publishing for the New School Church. The copy which we have used for this description was kindly put

into our hands by the Rev. Dr. C. R. Gillett, of the library of the Union Theological Seminary, New York, in which library copies may be found.

[**xlvii.** 1850-1] [The Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America: containing the Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, the Form of Government, the Book of Discipline, the Directory for the Worship of God, and General Rules for Judicatories: as ratified by the General Assembly of 1821, and amended by the General Assemblies of 1826 and 1833. Published by authority of the General Assembly. Philadelphia: Perkins and Purves, 1850, or 1851.]

We have not met with a copy of this edition; but we infer its existence from two entries in the *Minutes* of the New School Church. One of these (*Minutes*, 1850, p. 318) is as follows: "A Letter was received from Mr. Henry Perkins, of Philadelphia, in reference to a new edition of the Standards of the Church, informing the Assembly that he was ready to make the stereotype plates of the Constitution, published by him, by authority of the Assembly of 1846, conform to any alterations the Assembly may direct; and to submit the Book, before publication, to the inspection of the Stated Clerk, or any Committee they may appoint. Whereupon it was Resolved, that the Stated and Permanent Clerks be a Committee to publish a new and correct edition of the Standards of the Church, and that they be directed to employ Mr. Perkins as the printer of the Book." The other (*Minutes*, 1851, p. 10) is as follows: "The Committee appointed to prepare and publish a new edition of the Constitution of the Church reported that a new edition had been published by Mr. Henry Perkins, of Philadelphia; copies of which, handsomely bound and lettered, were presented to the Assembly for the use of the Moderator and Clerks. The thanks of the Assembly were tendered to Mr. Perkins for his acceptable donation." It would appear, then, that there was an edition published in the interval between the Assemblies of 1850 and 1851, by Perkins & Purves.

The circumstances that led to the publication of a new edition of the Constitution at this time were as follows. The precipitation with which the radical changes in the lesser Standards, recorded in the editions of 1845 and 1846, were carried through began to create widespread uneasiness as to their legality, as soon as these editions were put in circulation. A movement was therefore inaugurated in 1847 (*Minutes*, pp. 140, 141, 142, 144, 148, 149) to inquire into the entire history of the alterations thus made. The Committee appointed for this purpose reported at the next Assembly (1849), to the effect that there was every reason to believe that the changes had been unconstitutionally made (see the report, *Minutes*, 1849, pp. 195 *sq.*). Accordingly the Book was ordered to be restored "to the form in which it was published previous to the year 1840;" and a series of overtures covering the main points in dispute was sent down to the Presbyteries (*Minutes*, 1849, p. 183; cf. pp. 169, 173, 175). These overtures were all lost; whereupon the Assembly declared (*Minutes*, 1850, p. 318) "that a majority of the whole number of the Presbyteries has decided against each and all of the proposed changes in the Constitution. The Book, therefore, remains as in 1840; or as it was before the division of the Church." It was at this point that Mr. Perkins' letter proposing to correct the plates of the edition of 1846, as recited above, came in. Thus the series of New School editions of the Constitution took a new beginning from 1850-1851.

Dr. Hatfield's report on "The Revision of the Standards," published in the *Minutes* of 1849, pp. 195-212, is a very able survey of the whole history of the Standards in the Presbyterian Church up to that date: every one interested in the

subject should consult it. And the editions of the Confession of Faith published under his supervision—of which the present one is the first—were easily the most scholarly and best of their time, surpassing in correctness of text the Old School plates of 1853, which were unfortunately adopted for the editions of the Reunited Church (after 1870). As a preparation for these editions the Committee of which he was chairman had collated the current text with “the revised edition of the Constitution” published in 1797 (that is, Robert Aitken’s); with an Edinburgh edition of 1781; with the Lumisden & Robertson edition of 1739; with the Rothwell edition of 1658; and with the Latin version of 1656. The collation had revealed a number of typographical errors in the current text, and the following catalogue is given of “some of the prominent inaccuracies [in the text of the Confession] of our present and all American editions of recent date”: I, § 9, *may be searched* for “must be searched;” ix, 2, *that which is good* for “that which was good;” ix, 3, *that which is good* for “that good;” xxii, 4, *indifference in religion* for “difference in religion” (right in 1797); xxxii, title[?], *resurrection from the dead* for “resurrection of the dead.” A similar catalogue is given for the rest of the doctrinal Standards. The first-mentioned of the errors in the Confession is still retained in the Confession of 1896, although “must” is clearly the original reading (being found in the editions of May, 1647, and of Evan Tyler, autumn of 1647, alike). The second is also retained in the edition of 1896, but the case against it is not so clear: the edition of May, 1647, reads “was,” but that of Evan Tyler, autumn of 1647, is reported by Schaff as reading “is.” The third is correctly given in the edition of 1896, as it stands also in both the early editions we have mentioned: and the same is to be said for the fourth and fifth.

Probably the corrections indicated by this collation were made in the edition of 1850-1, and the edition of 1852-5, to be immediately mentioned, is doubtless only a reprint of this earlier one. See the notes under the next edition, from which it will be seen that it fulfills the conditions laid down for the new series of editions.

[xlvi. 1852-5] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America : | containing | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, the Form of | Government, the Book of Discipline, the Direc- | tory for the Worship of God, and Gene- | ral Rules for Judicatories : | as ratified by the General Assembly of 1821, and amended by the | General Assemblies of 1826, and 1833. | Published by Authority of the General Assembly. | Philadelphia : | Tract Publication Committee | of the | General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church. | [no date.]

16mo, pp. iii, 473; 5½ x 2¾ inches (block of type); no copyright or other indication of date. Certain new features are claimed for this edition, viz.: a table of contents for the book, chapter-designations at top of the page for the Confession and Form of Government, and a new and more copious index. This information is given in a preface of two pages, signed by Edwin F. Hatfield, Stated Clerk, and E. W. Gilbert, Permanent Clerk, as Committee; this states that this edition was prepared agreeably to a resolution of the Assembly of 1850, arranging for the publication of “a new and correct edition of the Standards of this Church,” and reciting the editions that had been compared in the attempt to correct the text. These were: (1) London, 1858—no doubt the inevitable, but in no sense authoritative, Rothwell; (2) the Latin version “by G. Dillingham, Cambridge, 1656;” (3) Dunlop’s Collection, 1719; (4) Lumis-

den & Robertson's Collection, Edinburgh, 1739; (5) an Edinburgh edition of 1781, which, from its date, is supposed to have been in use by the American Fathers of 1785-1788—no doubt the edition of Alexander Kincaid's Assigns of that date. The text framed by these critical comparisons is an unusually good one, but through its very critical care it, oddly enough, introduced one reading which may possibly be called in an American text a corruption—restoring in the Larger Catechism, Q. 142, "depopulations" from the British sources for the American "depredation." There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia.

The (New School) "Tract Publication Committee" was established in 1852 (*Minutes*, 1852, p. 176), and its name was changed to "The Presbyterian Publication Committee" (New School) in 1855 (see Dr. Rice's *History*, as cited, p. 51). This edition, it would thus appear, was published somewhere between 1852 and 1855.

[xliv. 1853 +] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America : | containing | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, and the | Directory for the Worship of God : | Together with the | Plan of Government and Discipline, | As ratified by the General Assembly at their sessions in May, | 1821 ; and amended in 1833. | Philadelphia : | Presbyterian Board of Publication, | 265 Chestnut Street. | [no date.]

18mo. pp. 547, 5 x 2½ inches (block of type).

In June, 1853, the (Old School) Board of Publication made a new set of plates for *The Constitution* and this is the first issue from them. These plates were used continuously until 1891, and 73,500 copies were issued from them. Meanwhile the title-page was altered at least four times, so that there are at least five title-pages from these plates: (1) the title-page given above, bearing the imprint "265 Chestnut street;" (2) the same title-page, but with the imprint "821 Chestnut street," this new number having been given to the Publishing House about 1856; (3) the same title-page, but with the imprint "1334 Chestnut street," whither the Board removed in 1870; (4) a title-page bearing the same imprint and house number, but reading "as adopted, amended by the Presbyteries, and ratified by the General Assembly, 1821-85;" (5) a title-page bearing the same imprint and house number, but reading "as ratified and adopted by the Synod of New York and Philadelphia in the year of our Lord 1788; and as amended in the years 1805-1888." The amendments made in the lesser Standards during the course of this long stretch of time—nearly half a century—were numerous and required much alteration of plates: an entirely new Book of Discipline, for example, was adopted in the years 1884-1885. But none of these changes affected the text of the Doctrinal Standards, except a single one, by which a clause was struck out in chap. xxiv, § 4. This was effected in 1886-1887, and for registering it the plates were altered only in a couple of pages.

The text of the plates of 1853 does not deserve high praise for critical exactitude. A number of errors entered through them, which retained their place throughout the whole half century of their reign, and indeed continue yet to mar the copies in circulation in the Presbyterian Church, South. The most noteworthy of these are the following four: Confession, ch. iii, title "Decrees" (*sic*, plural); [Larger Catechism, Q. 142, "depopulations" (instead of "depredation," which seems to be treated by the editors as the proper American reading—whether rightly or not, we do not now stop to inquire)]; Directory i,

2, "wholly" for "holy;"* iii, 1, "congegation" for "congregation."† It was a copy of the Confession of Faith taken from these plates that Dr. Schaff used in collating what he calls "the American revision" with the *editio princeps* of the Confession—that of Evan Tyler, 1647 (*Creeds of Christendom*, iii, pp. 600 sq.).‡ The variations which he notes mark, therefore, the degree of corruption of the text of 1853, although all of these corruptions were not introduced for the first time in 1853, or even in America.

There are copies of the first issues from these plates (bearing the imprint of "265 Chestnut Street") in the libraries of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny; of Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia; and of Dr. John DeWitt, Princeton. Copies of this type are to be dated between 1853 and 1856-7.

[i. 1855] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian | Church | etc. [as in the edition of "Tract Publication Committee of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church," assigned to 1850-1851] | Presbyterian Publication Committee. | Presbyterian House, | 1334 Chestnut Street, Philadelphia. | [no date.]

16mo, pp. 474 (p. 474 being taken up with a note giving the legend of the origin of the definition of God in the Shorter Catechism). Same Preface as in the previously mentioned similar New School edition (above, p. 101, No. xlvi). There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[ii. 1856 +] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | etc. [as in the issue of the Board of Publication, 265 Chestnut St., above No. xlix] . . . | Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication. | 821 Chestnut Street. | [no date.]

18mo, pp. 547, 5 x 2 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). From the same plates as the edition bearing the imprint "265 Chestnut St." The renumbering of the houses on Chestnut street seems to have been done about 1856. This new imprint belongs, therefore, to a date subsequent to that. There are copies bearing this imprint in the libraries of Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia, and of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny.

[iii. 1856] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America: | containing | the Confession of Faith, the Catechisms and the | Directory for the Worship of God: | together with the | Plan of Government and Discipline, | as ratified by the General Assembly, at their sessions in May, 1821; and amended in 1833. | Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & Co. | 1856.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches. On the back of the title-page there occur two certificates, dated respectively Philadelphia, June 16, 1834, and Philadelphia, August 23, 1834, and signed respectively by the Committee of the Synod of

* This subtle error was not detected and eliminated from the issues of the Board of Publication until 1894; the others here enumerated were eliminated when the new plates were first used, in 1891.

† Eliminated before 1885.

‡ See below, *Appendix*, p. 116.

Delaware and the Committee of the Synod of Philadelphia; also the certificate of copyright, dated 1821: that is to say, precisely the material that occurs on the back of the title-page of the editions issued by Alexander Towar, 1837, Haswell, Barrington & Haswell, 1838, Barrington & Haswell [no date]. In fact, this edition is evidently a new impression of the stereotyped plates from which the series of stereotyped editions from 1821 to 1838 were printed, and preserves even the certifications of the later of these issues. There is a copy in the Mercantile Library, Tenth street, above Chestnut, Philadelphia.

[liii. 1858] Constitution | der | Presbyterianischen Kirche | in den
| Vereinigten Staaten von Amerika, | enthält das | Glaubens-
bekenntniss, die beiden Katechismen | und die | Ordnung
des Gottesdienstes, | zugleich mit dem | Entwurf der Kirchen-
ordnung und Kirchenzucht, | wie es bestätigt wurde | durch
die General-Versammlung in ihren Sitzungen im Mai | 1821
und verbessert im Jahre 1833. | Uebersetzt nach der authen-
tischen Ausgabe der General-Versammlung. | Philadelphia. |
Presbyterianische Board für Veröffentlichung religiöser |
Schriften | [no date].

18mo, pp. 438, 4 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 2 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type). On the back of the title there is printed (in German translation) the resolutions of the Assembly of 1839 confining the publication of the Constitution to the Board of Publication. A *Vorrede* occupies pages 3-8. The text of the Confession, with the footnotes in full (in one column, occupying the lower portion of the page), follows, pp. 9-177, at the end of which is, oddly enough,* the following note: "Unterschrieben ist dieses Glaubensbekenntniss, und aufgestellt in der General-Versammlung zu Westminster im Jahre 1648 von folgenden Männern, welche die Abfasser desselben zu sein scheinen:" then follow the signatures of Herle, Burges, Palmer, Robbroughe and Byfield, the officers of the Westminster Assembly. Page 178 is blank; the Larger Catechism occupies pp. 179-230, the Shorter Catechism pp. 231-308, the documents at the end of it being increased by the addition, after the Apostles' Creed, of "Die Einsetzung der Taufe" and "Die Einsetzung des heiligen Abendmahls,"—*i. e.*, the words of our Lord in Mark xvi. 15, 16, and 1 Cor. xi. 23-25. The Form of Government and Discipline occupy pp. 309-403; the Directory for Worship, pp. 407-443; General Rules for Judicatories, pp. 444-452; and the Index, pp. 453-468. The plates were made in 1858, in which year 1250 copies were printed (August 7); by 1891, 3750 copies had been issued. There is a copy in the library of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny; and the book is kept on sale at the Book Store of the Presbyterian Board of Publication and Sabbath-school Work, Philadelphia.

In the *Vorrede* prefixed to the volume it is recited that the translation originated in an order of the General Assembly of 1857, met at Lexington, Ky.; and a short history of the origin of the Westminster Confession is given,—in which we are told that "it was in the year 1648, at the command of the so-called Long Parliament, which consisted for the greater part of Presbyterians, that the Westminster Confession was composed";† the old German translation of 1648 is then adverted to and its Preface quoted. This *Vorrede* is signed by "the Presbyterian Board for the Publication of Religious Works" and dated

*The misinformation seems to be derived from Niemeyer's *Collectio Conf.*, Appendix, p. v.

† Again from Niemeyer.

1858. The translation seems to be independent of the old German version of 1648, which was probably known to the translator only through the notice in Niemeyer's *Collectio Confessionum*.

The translation owes its origin, of course, to the sense of responsibility which was very keenly felt by both Presbyterian Churches for our German fellow-citizens, so rapidly increasing in numbers about the middle of the century. In the New School Assembly also an attempt had been made to prepare a German version of the Standards (see *Minutes*, 1853, p. 324, 1854, p. 485, 1855, p. 16): but this does not seem to have reached the stage of performance. In the Old School Church a resolution was offered by Mr. Phelps in 1856 (*Minutes*, p. 519) to the effect "that in view of the rapidly increasing German population of our country," and so forth, "the Board of Publication be instructed to issue as speedily as possible an edition of the Confession of Faith in German," and further that it be bound with the English version on opposite pages. This was referred to the Board, "to act at its own discretion" (p. 527). Next year (*Minutes*, 1857, p. 45) an Overture came up from the Presbytery of Dubuque, and was favorably reported, asking that the Board be required to publish a German edition; but "Mr. Schenck [then Secretary of the Board of Publication] made statements respecting the designs of the Board of Publication in relation to this matter, and the Overture and Report were laid on the table." From the minutes of the Executive Committee of the Board of Publication we may learn what the statements were that Mr. Schenck made to the Assembly. It appears that on May 5, 1857, "a communication was received from the Presbytery of New York, urging the publication of the Confession of Faith in German. It was resolved to take measures to comply with this request, and the Publishing Agent was authorized to confer with Mr. Steins, of New York, as to translating the Book of Discipline and Form of Government." It was doubtless this action of the Board that was communicated to the Assembly. On June 2, 1857, the minutes of the Executive Committee bear: "A letter from the Rev. F. Steins, offering to translate the Confession of Faith into German for \$100.00, was read and the offer accepted." On Oct. 7, 1857, "The Rev. F. Steins presented through the Publishing Agent a translation into German of the Confession of Faith, which he had been engaged to make." The work of putting it into type was entered upon at once. On January 5, 1858, it was resolved that a thousand copies should be printed: on January 12 this order was increased to 1250. At the next Assembly, accordingly, the Board reported that "the Confession of Faith has been published in German" (*Minutes*, 1858, p. 339).

The Rev. Frederick Steins was pastor of the "German Church" of the Presbytery of New York, from 1851 to 1868, in which year the *Minutes* of the Assembly report his death. Presumably the Board employed him as the translator on the recommendation of members of the Presbytery of New York, in compliance with whose request the task was undertaken. The report of the Board to the General Assembly of 1858 contains the following notice: "The Confession of Faith has been translated into the German language by one of the pastors in the City of New York who has peculiar qualifications for such a work. After undergoing careful examination by competent judges, the translation has been published, and the Board is now ready to furnish them whenever needed and to any extent."* It cannot be said that the translation is an excellent piece of German composition, but it is very literal and conveys the sense; and certainly it was produced at a phenomenally small outlay for the

* We are indebted for these extracts from the minutes of the Executive Committee of the Board of Publication, and for other facts here recorded, to the kindness of the Rev. Dr. W. M. Rice, Recording Clerk of the Board.

Board. A modernizing revision of the old German translation of 1648 would from a literary point of view have been better.

[liv. 1859] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | etc.
[as in the edition of same publishers, 1856] . . . | Phila-
delphia : | J. B. Lippincott & Co. | 1859.

12mo, pp. 466, 5 x 2 $\frac{5}{8}$ inches: an exact reprint of the edition by the same publishers, 1856.

[lv. 1858] [The Confession of Faith and Shorter Catechism.
Philadelphia: Presbyterian Publication Committee, 1858.]

—, pp. 57. "A cheap edition, in paper covers, for general distribution." We have not met with a copy of this edition and the title given above is hypothetical. It is entered here on the authority of the report of the Presbyterian Publication Committee to the New School Assembly of 1859 (see *Minutes*, 1859, p. 67).

[lvi. 1859 +] The | Confession of Faith, | and | Shorter Cate-
chism. | Philadelphia : | Presbyterian Board of Publication.
| . . . | [no date].

12mo, pp. 63, 5 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 3 $\frac{3}{8}$; proof-texts to Confession only and by references only. On the back of title-page there is a historical note. The plates for this edition were made early in 1859, and on January 11 of that year the first impression of 2000 was taken, and before the end of the year 28,000 had been issued. Up to 1891, 41,000 copies had been issued. There have been no changes made in the pamphlet except in the imprint on the title-page. We have seen only the two latest imprints. The latest reads: "Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication | and Sabbath School Work. | No. 1334 Chestnut street |" The earlier omits the line "and Sabbath School Work." This edition does not share the error in the title of chap. iii ("Decrees," plural) of the Confession of Faith, common to all the issues of the *Constitution* made by the Board of Publication from 1853 to 1891.

[lvii. 1859 +] The | Confession of Faith | of | The Presbyterian
Church | in | the United States of America | with the
Shorter Catechism. | Philadelphia : | Presbyterian Board of
Publication | . . . | [no date].

18mo, pp. 190, about 5 x 2 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches; proof-texts in full; title to chapter iii, "Dēcrees" (plural). The plates of this edition seem to be the same as those for the *Constitution* of 1853 +: the first impression of 2000 was taken May 17, 1859, since which up to 1896, 40,250 copies have been issued. We have seen only the latest imprint, viz.: "Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication | and Sabbath School Work, | No. 1334 Chestnut Street. |"

[lviii. 1862-3] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church |
in the | United States, | consisting of | The Confession of
Faith, the Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, the Form of
Government, the | Book of Discipline, and the Directory | of
Worship, | as ratified by the | General Assembly, at Augusta,
| Georgia, Dec. 4, 1861. | Richmond : | Presbyterian Com-
mittee of Publication | [no date].

16mo, pp. 264, 4 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 2 $\frac{5}{8}$ inches (block of type); proof-texts by references

only; reset from the 1853 + editions of the Presbyterian Board of Publication and retaining the erroneous title to chap. iii ("Decrees," plural). This edition was probably issued about 1862 or 1863. There was an edition of 20,000 issued (letter of Rev. Dr. James K. Hazen, of Nov. 17, 1900). There are copies in the libraries of the Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia.

This is the first edition published by the "Presbyterian Church in the United States" (Southern).

[lix. 1869 +] A | Commentary | on | The Confession of Faith. | With Questions for Theological Students | and Bible Classes. | By the | Rev. Archibald Alexander Hodge, D.D. | Author of | "The Atonement," and Professor of Didactic and Polemical Theology in the | Western Theological Seminary of Allegheny, Pa. | Philadelphia: | Presbyterian Board of Publication, | 1334 Chestnut Street | [no date].

12mo, pp. 549; copyrighted in 1869, and Preface signed April 30, 1869; probably the first issue, therefore, lacked the words "1334 Chestnut Street" on the title. It contains the text of the Confession, with proof-texts by references, accompanied by a full doctrinal comment. A British edition was issued in 1870, by T. Nelson & Sons, London, Edinburgh and New York, edited by Prof. Gould, and a new American edition in 1885. A Spanish translation of the first edition, by the Rev. Plutarcho Arellano, was published in Mexico in 1897 (8vo, pp. xxii, 379).

[ix. 1870 +] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America, | containing | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, and the | Directory for the Worship of God: | together with the | Plan of Government and Discipline, | as ratified by the General Assembly, at their sessions | in May, 1821; and amended in 1833. | Philadelphia: | Presbyterian Board of Publication, | No. 1334 Chestnut Street | [no date].

18mo, pp. viii, 547; 5 x 2 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type). This is the form of title-page given the impressions from the plates of 1853 after the Reunion in 1870, and retained until 1886. Meanwhile there were a good many amendments made to the lesser Standards, especially to the Form of Government, and these were from time to time entered into the text. Accordingly the copies of this imprint differ a good deal in the text of the lesser Standards, and may be dated by the presence or absence in them of this or that amendment. For example, a copy bought in 1873 embodies the amendment to the Form of Government, chap. x, 2 (see the list given in the *Digest of 1898*, p. 13), though in a bungling form,* which required subsequent adjustment; and none others in that list. Another copy examined has already entered the amendments in the Form of Government, x, 2 (made in 1871), xi, 1 (1881), xi, 4 (1885), xii, 4 (1885), xiii, 8 (1875); but has not entered the amendment of xii, 2 (made in

* Namely, thus: "A Presbytery consists of all the ministers and one ruling elder from each congregation, within a certain district, in number not less than five." This was soon corrected to the form now standing in the current editions.

1885), and has not incorporated either the revised Book of Discipline (1884) or the revised form of the Directory of Worship, x (now xii) (1884). It may be safely dated in 1885: and it is worth noting that in it the error "congregation," which still persists in the copy bought in 1873, is corrected (1885) and appears as "congregation." There are copies bearing this imprint in the libraries of the Theological Seminary and of the University at Princeton, and of the Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and H. C. McCook, of Philadelphia.

[Ixi. 1878] *Bibliotheca Symbolica Ecclesiae Universalis.* | The Creeds of Christendom, | with | a History and Critical Notes. | By | Philip Schaff, D.D., LL.D., | Professor of Biblical Literature in the Union Theological Seminary, N. Y. | In Three Volumes. | Volume III. | The Evangelical Creeds, with Translations. || New York: | Harper & Brothers, Publishers, | Franklin Square. | 1878.

Svo, pp. vii, 880. The Westminster Confession, in English and Latin, is printed in parallel columns, pp. 600-673. The English text is taken from the edition of Evan Tyler, 1647. The Latin is the version first published at Cambridge, 1656. The readings of what is called "the American revision" are noted throughout: they are those of a copy of one of the impressions taken from the plates of 1853.* The proof-texts are given by reference only. A second edition has also appeared.

[Ixii. 1882 +] The Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States, | containing | The Confession of Faith, the Larger and | Shorter Catechisms, | as ratified by the General Assembly, | at Augusta, Ga., Dec. 1861, | together with | The Book of Church Order, | adopted 1879, | The Directory for the Worship of God, | With Optional Forms, | adopted 1894, | Rules of Parliamentary Order, | adopted 1866. | Richmond, Va.: | Presbyterian Committee of Publication. | 1001 Main Street. | [no date].

18mo, pp. v, 404 + 190, in separate pagination, for the Book of Church Order, etc. (as per title-page), 5 x 2 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type). The first part, pp. 1-404 (the Confession and Catechisms), is precisely the same book with that portion of the *Constitution* published by the "Presbyterian Church in the United States of America" from the plates of 1853; it appears to be printed from electrotyped plates of that edition. These plates were acquired by the Presbyterian Committee of Publication (Southern Church) in 1882, and since then 15,818 copies have been printed from them. The details of the latter portion of the title-page have, of course, been adjusted from time to time to the exigencies of the incorporated amendments to the lesser Standards. The copy from which the title printed above is taken is the last issued in the nineteenth century, kindly sent us, as such, by the Rev. Dr. James K. Hazen, Secretary of the Presbyterian Committee of Publication, November 6, 1900. There are copies of this edition also in the libraries of the Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[Ixiii. 1885 +] A | Commentary | on | The Confession of Faith. | With Questions for Theological Students | and Bible Classes.

* See below, p. 116.

| By the | Rev. Archibald Alexander Hodge, D.D. | Profes-
 sor of Didactic and Polemic Theology in the Theological |
 Seminary of the Presbyterian Church at Princeton, N. J. |
 With Appendix. | Philadelphia : | Presbyterian Board of
 Publication | and Sabbath School Work | 1901.

12mo, pp. 559. A new edition of Dr. Hodge's Commentary, originally issued in 1869, was issued in 1885 : the new Preface is dated 1885. There are two new Appendices : (1) on the sense in which the Confession of Faith is accepted by initiants into the ministry ; (2) the Auburn Declaration of 1837 and Declaratory Act of the U. P. Church of Scotland, 1879. The title-page given above is taken from a copy issued in 1901, but the book belongs to 1885 +.

[Ixiv. 1886 +] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church
 | in the | United States of America, | containing | The Con-
 fession of Faith, the Catechisms, and the | Directory for the
 Worship of God : | together with the | Plan of Government
 and Discipline, | As adopted, amended by the Presbyteries,
 and | ratified by the General Assembly, 1821-85. | With the
 Rules for Judicatories. || Philadelphia : | Presbyterian Board
 of Publication, | No. 1334 Chestnut Street | [no date].

18mo, pp. 556, 5 x 2½ inches. A new impression from the plates in use since 1853, issued in 1886 (the copy from which the above description is taken was purchased August 20, 1886). Its chief distinction is that it contains the new Book of Discipline, which was adopted in 1884-5. Some copies also contain the amendment in the Confession of Faith, xxiv, 4—the plates of pp. 136-137 being altered by the omission of the last clause of this section and heavily leaded to fill the space : the work is so clumsily done that the proof-texts for the omitted clause are retained and the number referring to them attached to the preceding clause (cf. LOWRIE, *Presbyterian Review*, July, 1888, p. 454). This amendment was made in 1886-1887. There is a copy of this title-page containing it in the library of Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia.

[I xv. 1888 +] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church
 | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition] . . . | to-
 gether with the | Plan of Government and Discipline as Rati-
 fied | and adopted by the Synod of New York and | Philadel-
 phia | in the year of our Lord 1788, | and as amended in the
 years | 1805-1888. | Philadelphia : Presbyterian Board of
 Publication | and Sabbath School Work. | No. 1334 Chestnut
 Street | [no date].

18mo, pp. 556, 5 x 2½ inches. This is the last form of title-page given to the impressions from the plates of 1853. The new name was given to the Board in 1887 (see Rice's *History*, etc., p. 167).

[I xvi. 1888] Edition for Revision. | The | Constitution | of the |
 Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America. |
 Containing | The Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, and
 the | Directory for the Worship of God ; | together with

the | Plan of Government and Discipline as ratified and |
 adopted by the Synod of New York and Phila- | delphia in the
 year of our Lord 1788 ; | and as amended in the years |
 1805-1888. | Philadelphia : | Presbyterian Board of Publica-
 tion | and Sabbath-school Work, | 1334 Chestnut Street | [no
 date].

16mo, pp. 405, $5\frac{7}{8}$ x $3\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type); the copyright certificate is dated 1888. Page 3 contains the Act of the Assembly, May 29, 1839, confining the publication of the Constitution to the Board of Publication, and the Act of May 31, 1886, appointing the Stated and Permanent Clerks a Committee of Supervision. The Confession occupies pp. 1-120, and on the inner corner of the upper margin of the pages there is a running headline indicative of the chapters and sections on the several pages. There are copies in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia; of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia; and of the Theological Seminary at Princeton.

This edition was a privately printed one of fifty copies only, taken from new plates ordered in 1835 but not completed until July 19, 1888. From these plates these fifty copies were struck off and distributed for examination and revision, with a view to perfecting them before they were put to use. In making the plates, however, nothing had been done to correct the text; and therefore the present edition is only a beautiful textual reproduction of the plates of 1833, as these plates had been gradually adjusted to the amendments from time to time made by the Church. It still reads "Decrees" in the title to Confession, chap. iii, "depopulations" in Larger Catechism, Q. 142, "wholly" in Directory for Worship, I, 2; and still retains, attached to the preceding clause, the proof-texts belonging to the clause excluded from Confession, xxiv, 4. These plates formed the basis for the subsequent editions published by the Board: but fortunately they were not put to use until there had been made a thorough revision of the text—the only worthy attempt at a revision of the text of the Confession made in the American Church since that undertaken for the New School edition of 1850 (1855).

[Ixvii. 1891] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church |
 in the | United States of America, | containing | The Confes-
 sion of Faith, | the Catechisms, and the | Directory for the
 Worship of God, | together with | The Plan of Government
 and Discipline : | as ratified and adopted by the Synod of
 New York and | Philadelphia in the year of our Lord 1788 :
 | and as amended in the years 1805-1883. | Philadelphia : |
 Presbyterian Board of Publication | and Sabbath-school
 Work, | 1334 Chestnut Street. | 1891.

16mo, pp. 405; $5\frac{3}{8}$ x $3\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type). The copyright certificate on the back of the title-page is dated 1888: the Act of Assembly of August 29, 1839, and May 31, 1886, and the "Attestation," signed by William H. Roberts and William E. Moore, Clerks, as a Committee of Supervision over all editions of the Constitution, certifying the authoritativeness of the text, are printed on p. 3. And on p. 4 there is a "Historical Summary" concerning the Constitution in the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A.

This is the first edition printed from the new plates, of which the "Edition for Revision" of [1888] was only a trial impression. The editorial care that

had meanwhile been expended in perfecting the text was very great. The editions of 1789 (regarded as the *princeps*), 1797, 1815, 1821 [1885] [1888] had been carefully compared, and the text fixed. A list of the principal textual emendations which were thus made is given in the *Minutes* for 1891, pp. 34-37 (see also *Digest of 1893*, p. 18 *sq.*). Those for the Confession are the following: iii, title, *Decree*, instead of *Decrees*; vii, 3, *offereth* instead of *offered*; xi, 3, punctuation corrected so as to read: "*Yet, inasmuch as He was given by the Father for them; and His obedience and satisfaction accepted in their stead; and, both freely,*" etc.; xiii, 1, punctuation altered so as to place a colon after "*dwelling in them:*" and a semicolon after "*weakened and mortified;*"; xv, 6, a semicolon after "*pardon thereof;*"; xxi, 6, *unto* instead of *into*; xxiii, 4, *the* before *people* omitted; xxix, 2, *once* instead of *one* (against the *consensus* of the British editions). Among other changes "depredation" was restored for "depopulations" in Larger Catechism, Q. 142. But the word "wholly" (for "holy") still stands in Directory, i, 2 (p. 347), and held its place there until 1894. From these plates 5000 copies were struck off between 1891 and the early part of 1896.

[Iviii. 1894] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church |
etc. [as in edition of 1891]. . . . | and as amended in the
years 1805-1892 | together with | the Constitutional Rule |
adopted in 1893. | Philadelphia | Presbyterian Board of Pub-
lication | and Sabbath-school Work | 1894.

16mo, pp. 407; $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{16}$ inches (block of type). A new act of the Assembly is inserted on p. 3, viz., adding the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven *ex-officio* to the Permanent Committee on Editions of the Constitution, and declaring the text as now settled constitutional, in which no change is hereafter to be made "except after report to the General Assembly, and due constitutional procedure"—which is, after all, a pity, since there remain in the Confession of Faith and Catechisms as here printed a number of readings which originated in printers' errors, and there seems no good reason why the text should not be assimilated to the *editio princeps* of Evan Tyler, 1647, except where it has been altered by "due constitutional procedure." In accordance with this new Act, Dr. Craven's name is added to the signatures of the "Attestation." The error in Directory, i, 2, "kept wholly," is corrected in this impression (p. 349).

[Ixix. 1895] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church |
etc. [as in the edition of 1894] | Philadelphia | | 1895.

16mo, pp. 407, $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{16}$ inches, etc., as in the edition of 1894.

[Ixx. 1896] The | Constitution | of the Presbyterian Church |
etc. [as in the edition of 1894] | Philadelphia | | 1896.

16mo, pp. 407; $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{16}$ inches, etc., as in the edition of 1894. This impression was issued during the early months of the year, before the meeting of the General Assembly, and completes the 5000 copies issued from the new plates since 1891.

[Ixxi. Sept., 1896] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian
Church | in the | United States of America: | containing |
the Standards Subordinate to the Word of God, viz. | The
Confession of Faith, the Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, the
Form of Government, the | Book of Discipline, and the

Director for the Worship of God | as ratified and adopted
by the Synod of New York | and Philadelphia in the year of
our Lord 1788 | and as amended in the years 1805-1894 |
together with | the Constitutional Rule adopted in 1893, and
| administrative Acts of the Assembly | of a General Nature
| Philadelphia | Presbyterian Board of Publication | and
Sabbath-school Work | 1896.

16mo, pp. 525, $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type). To the copyright certificate on back of title, dated 1888, there is added: "Revised Edition, Copyright, 1896." The "Acts of the General Assembly," and "Attestation" on p. 3, are the same as in the editions of 1894, 1895, 1896. The title-page indicates the changes in the text, except the most important change of all—the incorporation of the new proof-texts. This is indicated, however, in the "Historical Summary," on p. 4, which is adjusted to this edition. A noteworthy change in the form of the title-page itself consists in the insertion, between the word "containing" and the enumeration of the documents contained, the line: "The Standards Subordinate to the Word of God, viz." This was altered by the Assembly of 1896, however, so as to make it read, instead of: "containing . . . viz."—" | Being | Its Standards Subordinate to the Word of God, viz. | " (see *Minutes*, 1896, p. 168): and it so appears in later issues. An external change of some interest is the replacing of the legend "The Confession of Faith," which had hitherto (ever since 1889) stood on the back of the volume, by the more truly descriptive "The Constitution of the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A."

The distinction of this edition is its incorporation of the new proof-texts, which were prepared by a Committee appointed in 1888, and were approved by the Assembly in 1894. A full account of the work of preparing these new proof-texts will be found in the reports of the Chairman of the Committee charged with the labor (the Rev. Dr. Samuel T. Lowrie), in the *Minutes* of the Assembly for 1891, pp. 129-134, and 1894, pp. 157, 160 (see also the *Digest of 1898*, p. 21 *sq.*): Dr. Lowrie's paper in *The Presbyterian Review*, July, 1888, should also be consulted for the previous history of the proof-texts. The incorporation of these proof-texts involved a resetting and restereotyping of the greater portion of the volume: this work was done between 1894 and 1896, and the volume issued for the first time in its new form in September of the latter year. For the first time in the editions of the Constitution of the Presbyterian Church of the U. S. A., the Shorter Catechism is provided with proof-texts in this edition. One thousand copies were printed off in September, 1896, and a thousand each were printed in the years 1897, 1898, and 1900.

[**Ixxii.** 1896] Constitución | de la | Iglesia Presbiteriana | en los |
Estados Unidos de America, | conteniendo | La Confesión de
Fe, Forma de | Gobierno, Libro de Disciplina y | Directorio
para el culto publico | de Dios, | según fueron ratificandos y
adoptados por | el Sinodo de Nueva York y el de Filadelfia
| en al año de Nuestro Señor 1788, | y corregidos en los años
de | 1805-1892. | La Obra de Tratados en Español, | Al-
buquerque, New Mexico, | 1896.

Small 8vo, pp. 153 [5], $5\frac{3}{4} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). The Confession of Faith occupies pp. 5-58. The text is printed with the references to proof-texts interjected, within parentheses, at the proper places. The translation seems to

have been made from the edition of 1894. There is an occasional footnote inserted. Those at Confession xxviii, 7, on the repetition of baptism, and at Confession xxix, 4, on carrying the Sacrament to private houses, belong, of course, to the English proofs translated; but that at Confession vi, 1, on the Divine permission of sin, is without warrant in the text translated. The translation here printed was made by the Rev. Plutarcho Arellano, on the basis of the earlier Spanish version of Dr. H. C. Thomson, which was printed at Monterey, in 1880. The press at Albuquerque is operated by the Rev. John Menaul.

[Ixxiii. 1897] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America : | being | its Standards subordinate to the Word of God, viz., | etc. [as in the second edition of 1896] . . . | Philadelphia | Presbyterian Board of Publication | and Sabbath-school Work. | 1897.

16mo, pp. 525, $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{8}$ inches, etc. The text is precisely the same as the issue of 1896, except for certain corrections in the plates of the lesser Standards to incorporate amendments.

[Ixxiv. 1897] The | Confession of Faith | of | The Presbyterian Church | in | The United States of America | Adopted by the General Synod in 1729, and Amended and | Ratified in 1788 | Philadelphia | Presbyterian Board of Publication | and Sabbath-school Work | 1897.

16mo, pp. 137, $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{8}$ inches. Contains the Confession of Faith only, from the new plates of 1896. The title-page lacks all indication that the text as printed was amended in 1887. The "Historical Summary" on p. 6 is roughly adapted to the separate publication of the Confession by adding this "Note.—The above Summary applies to all the Standards. This publication contains only the Confession of Faith." The "Contents," pp. 7 and 8, is the section concerned with the Confession of the "Contents" of the larger book, and still retains the (here meaningless) "I" at its head. Six thousand copies were printed in 1897.

[Ixxv. 1899] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | etc. [as in the edition of 1897] . . . | together with | The Constitutional Rules adopted in 1893–1897, | and Administrative Acts of the Assem- | bly of a General Nature | Philadelphia | Presbyterian Board of Publication | and Sabbath-school Work | 1899.

16mo, pp. 527, $5\frac{7}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{8}$ inches. The title-page exhibits the additional materials entered.

[Ixxvi. 1900] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America : | being | its Standards Subordinate to the Word of God, viz. | The Confession of Faith, the Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, the Form of Government, the | Book of Discipline, and the Direc- | tory for the Worship of God | as ratified and adopted by the Synod of New York | and Philadelphia in the year of our Lord 1788

| and as amended in the years | 1805-1895 | together with | the Constitutional Rules Adopted in 1893-1897, | and Administrative Acts of the Assembly of a General Nature | Philadelphia | Presbyterian Board of Publication | and Sabbath-school Work | 1900.

16mo, pp. 527, 5 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type). One thousand copies were printed of this edition in 1900.

In the sixty-one years between 1839 and 1900, during which the Board of Publication has had charge of the printing and publishing of the Confession of Faith, it has put out (in English and German) eighty-four separate impressions of *The Constitution*, with an annual average of 2241 copies: the total number of copies of the Confession of Faith published by the Board during these sixty-one years is 224,000, an annual average of 3672. In order to obtain an estimate of the number of copies of the Confession in this form put into circulation during this period we must add to these the six editions published by the New School Church, the three published by private enterprise, the two published by the "Presbyteriau Church in the United States" (aggregating 35,818 copies), the Spanish translation, and the three editions of Commentaries on it containing the whole text. These certainly will aggregate 100,000 copies, which would give a total of about 325,000 copies or an annual average of more than 5000 copies.

By the kindness of Dr. E. R. Craven, of the Presbyterian Board of Publication and Sabbath-school Work, we are able to add the following extract from the records of the Board, which will give a complete conspectus of its issues of the Confession since 1839:

I. 18MO EDITION OF THE CONSTITUTION.

1839	} 3,000	1852—June 22...	2,000	1874—Apr. 16...	2,000	
1840		Dec. 6....	2,000	1875—Aug. 10...	2,000	
1841		} Aug. 30 .. 1,000	1853—Jan. 11 ...	2,000	1876—Oct. 10....	2,000
1842			May 3....	2,000	1878—Feb. 2....	2,000
1843—May 25...	1,000	1854—Mar. 21...	2,000	1879—Mar. 13...	2,000	
Sept. 29...	2,000	May 9....	2,000	1880—Nov. 9....	2,000	
1844—Feb. 20...	2,000	1855—May 8....	2,000	1882—Mar. 13...	2,000	
May 14...	2,000	Oct. 9....	3,000	1883—Nov. 13...	2,000	
1845—Nov. 25...	1,000	1856—May 6....	3,000	1884—Mar. 11...	2,000	
1846—June 16...	2,000	1857—Feb. 7....	3,000	1885—June 9....	500	
1847—Apr. 9....	1,000	1858—Apr. 13...	3,000	1886—Feb. 9....	2,000	
Aug. 3. . .	1,000	1859—Jan. 25...	3,000	July 13 ...	2,000	
1848—Feb. 22...	2,000	1860—Mar. 13...	3,000	1887—Sept. 23...	2,500	
Sept. 12....	2,000	1861—Dec. 17...	3,000	1888—June 12...	2,500	
Dec. 5....	2,000	1863—Aug. 11...	2,000	1889—Mar. 4....	500	
1849—Oct. 30...	2,000	1865—Oct. 24...	2,000	June 11... ..	2,000	
1850—Apr. 9....	2,000	1867—July 9....	2,000	Sept. 23... ..	500	
July 9....	2,000	1868—Jan. 23...	2,000	1890—Feb. 11...	2,500	
Nov. 19...	2,000	1869—Sept. 14...	2,000	Mar. 12 .. .	500	
1851—Mar. 11...	2,000	1871—Jan. 25 ...	2,000	Nov. 11... ..	500	
July 8....	2,000	1872—May 13...	2,000	1891—May 31...	500	
Dec. 16...	2,000	1873—Apr. 22...	2,000			
					120,500	

II. 12MO FINE EDITION OF CONSTITUTION.

1840	500	1853—Oct. 4	250
1843—Apr	500	1884—Mar. 9.....	500
1846—Feb. 20.....	250		
1849—Aug. 21.....	500		2,500

III. 18MO PAPER EDITION OF CONFSSION AND SHORTER CATECHISM.

1859—May 17 ...	2,000	1880—Mar. 9....	1,000	1889—Sept. 23...	2,000
Sept. 30...	2,000	1881—Apr. 12...	500	1890—Jan. 14 ...	2,000
1860—June 5....	3,000	1882—Feb. 14...	1,000	Feb. 11...	2,000
1867—Apr. 24...	1,000	1883—Jan. 9....	500	Mar. 11...	3,000
1869—Jan. 29...	1,000	June 12...	1,000	May 13 ...	1,000
1871—Mar. 14...	1,000	Nov.	1,000	1892—Nov. 8....	250
1872—July 9 ...	1,000	1884—Feb. 12...	2,000	1893—Nov. 16...	1,000
1874—May 12 ...	500	June 10...	1,000	1894—Nov. 13...	500
1875—Jan. 26 ...	1,000	1885—June 9....	2,000	1895—June 11...	500
Nov. 23...	500	1886—Dec. 4....	1,000	1896—Feb. 11...	1,000
1878—June 25...	500	1888—Apr. 10...	1,000		
1879—Aug. 12...	500	Sept. 11...	1,000		40,250

IV. 12MO PAPER EDITION OF CONFSSION AND SHORTER CATECHISM.

1859—Jan. 11...	2,000	1872—Jan. 27 ...	1,000	1884—Feb. 12...	1,000
Feb. 15...	2,000	Sept. 10...	1,000	1885—June 9....	1,000
Mar. 8....	6,000	1875—Jan. 13....	1,000	1888—Nov. 13...	1,000
Mar. 15...	6,000	1877—Nov. 27...	1,000	1890—May 13 ...	1,000
Apr. 26...	6,000	1879—June 10...	1,000	1891—Jan. 13 ...	2,000
July 12 ...	6,000	1883—May 8....	1,000		
		June 12...	1,000		41,000

V. 16MO EDITION OF THE CONSTITUTION.

1891—Mar. 10.....	5,000	1898—Dec. 13.....	1,000
1896—May 7.....	1,000	1900—Apr. 13.....	1,000
Sept. 8.....	1,000		
1897—Nov. 9.....	1,000		10,000

VI. 16MO PAPER EDITION OF CONFSSION AND SHORTER CATECHISM.

1897—Mar. 6.....	1,000
Oct. 12.....	5,000
	6,000

VII. GERMAN EDITION OF CONSTITUTION.

1858—Aug. 7.....	1,250	1873—May 13.....	500
1860—June 20.....	1,000	1891—Apr. 14.....	250
1867—May 28.....	500		
1872—Oct. 8.....	250		3,750

SUMMARY.

Out of print	{	18mo ed. of Constitution, 1839-1891.....	120,500
		12mo fine ed. of Constitution, 1840-1854.....	2,500
		18mo paper ed. Confession and Catechism, 1859-1896..	40,250
			163,250
In print	{	16mo paper ed. Confession and Catechism, 1859-1891..	41,000
		16mo ed. Constitution, 1891-1900.....	10,000
		16mo paper ed. Confession and Catechism, 1897.....	6,000
		German ed. of Constitution, 1858-1891.....	3,750
			60,750
Total in all.....			224,000

APPENDIX--THE AMERICAN TEXT OF THE CONFESSION.

In his *Creeeds of Christendom*, iii, pp. 600 *sq.*, Dr. Schaff prints the Confession from the *editio princeps* (Evan Tyler, autumn of 1647), and at the foot of the page gives the readings of what he calls "the American revision,"—*i.e.*, the text of the edition current in the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A. from 1853–1886. These readings will enable us to estimate the extent of the American corruption of the text. Only the major changes of xx, 4; xxiii, 3; [xxiv, 4]; xxxi, 1 and 2, are intentional revisions. We add the readings of the revised text of 1896: in the majority of cases, it will be seen, it simply follows the customary American text.

- i, 5: esteem *of* the holy Scripture. American, 1853, *for*; 1896, *of*.
- 9: *must* be searched. Am., 1853, *may*; so 1896.
- iii, title. *Decree*. Am., 1853, *Decrees*; 1896, *Decree*.
- v, 5: support *unto* himself. Am., 1853, *upon*; so 1896.
- ix, 1: that *is* neither forced. Am., 1853, that *it is*, etc.; so 1896.
- x, 4: come *unto* Christ. Am., 1853, *to*; so 1896.
- xi, 1: *nor* by imputing. Am., 1853, *not*; so 1896.
- xvi, 4: requires *as* that. Am., 1853, omit *as*; so 1896.
- xx, 1: and willing mind. Am., 1853, and *a* willing mind; so 1896.
- 2: *commands*, Am., 1853, *commandments*; so 1896.
- 2: requiring *of* an. Am., 1853, omit *of*; 1896, *of*.
- 4: the *power*. Am., 1853, *powers*; so 1896.
- 4: *and by the power of the Civil Magistrate*. Am., omits.
- xxi, 1: limited *to*. Am., 1853, *by*; so 1896.
- 1: *reprcsentations*. Am., 1853, *representation*; so 1896.
- 5: oaths, vows. Am., 1853, oaths *and* vows; so 1896.
- 5: *several* occasions. Am. 1853, *special*; so 1896.
- 6: in spirit and truth. Am., 1853, in spirit and *in* truth; so 1896.
- xxii, 6: for *the* obtaining. Am., 1853, omit *the*; so 1896.
- 7: *respect*. Am., 1853, *respects*; so 1896.
- xxiii, 2: *occasion*. Am., 1853, *occasions*; so 1896.
- 3: Am., recasts the section.
- 4: of people. Am., 1853, *of the* people; 1896, of people.
- [xxiv, 4: Am. (after 1887) omits last clause.]
- xxv, 2: *and of* their children. Am., 1853, *together with*, etc.; so 1896.
- xxvi, 3: *propriety*. Am., 1853, *property*; so 1896.
- xxvii, 2: and *the* effects. Am., 1853, omit *the*; so 1896.
- xxx, 3: from *the* later. Am., 1853, omit *the*; so 1896.
- xxxi, 1: Am. adds a sentence.
- 2: Am. omits the section.
- xxxii, title: state of *men*. Am., 1853, *man*; so 1896.

3. THE ASSOCIATE REFORMED AND UNITED PRESBYTERIAN BOOKS.

A. *The Associate Reformed Book.*

[Ixxvii. 1799] The | Constitution | and | Standards | of the | Asso-
 ciate-Reformed Church | in North America. | New York |
 Printed by T. & J. Swords, No. 99 Pearl-street. | 1799.

Svo, pp. 614, 6 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type); proof-texts at large; on back of

p. 613 (unnumbered p. 614) is printed a list of *errata*. The volume contains the Act of the Synod of Greencastle, May 31, 1799, with reference to the Standards of the Church; the Confession of Faith (pp. 9-174); the Larger and Shorter Catechisms; the Government, Discipline, Directories for Public and Private Worship; together with Appendices, giving Forms of Ecclesiastical Papers, Rules of Procedure in Judicatories, Solemnization of Marriage, Burial of the Dead; and also the Sum of Saving Knowledge and the Practical Use thereof. There is a separate title to the Confession: "The | Confession of Faith, | agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines at Westminster, | with the assistance of | Commissioners | from the | Church of Scotland, | as received by the | Associate-Reformed Church | in | North America. | With the | Proofs From the Scripture. | New York: | Printed by T. and J. Swords, No. 99 Pearl-street. | 1799."

The Synod of the Associate Reformed Church was formally organized out of Presbyteries of the Associate and of the Reformed Churches, October 31, 1782. This Synod declared the Doctrinal Standards of the new Church to be the Westminster Confession of Faith and the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, but added: "This declaration, however, does not extend to the following sections of the Confession of Faith, which define the power of civil government in relation to religion: chap. xx, sec. 4; chap. xxiii, sec. 3; chap. xxxi, sec. 2. These sections are reserved for a candid discussion on some future occasion as God shall be pleased to direct." (See SCULLER, *History of the United Presbyterian Church of North America*, chap. v: in *The American Church History Series*, vol. xi, p. 185 [Christian Literature Company, New York: 1894].) This candid discussion continued sixteen years, the Synod living meanwhile under this "Declaratory Act." At the Synod's meeting at Greencastle, Pa., May, 1799, the sections excepted to were modified, and a modification made in Q. 109 of the Larger Catechism; and these documents thus modified were set forth as the doctrinal Standards of the Church: or in the statement of the Synod itself, it "judicially ratified the *Westminster Confession of Faith*, and *Catechisms*, *Larger and Shorter*, with a modification of the doctrine concerning the power of the civil magistrate in matters of religion," together with "the Overture for the *Government and Discipline* of the Church, and the *Directory for Worship, Public and Private*," and declared them to be "The Constitution and Standards of the Associate Reformed Church," etc. (Preface to the present edition; Scouller, as cited, p. 192). The alteration made in Q. 109 of the Larger Catechism consisted merely in substituting the word "authorizing" for "tolerating." Those in the Confession of Faith were more extensive and remodelled the sections involved. Some slight changes were introduced also into the *Sum of Saving Knowledge*, as published at the end of this volume: this document was not treated, however, as a part of the Standards of the Church.

The present is the *editio princeps* of the Associate Reformed series. It is a large and handsomely printed volume. There are copies of it in the libraries of the Presbyterian Historical Society of Philadelphia, and of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia.

[Ixxviii. 1827] The | Constitution | and | Standards | of the | Associate-Reformed Church | in | North America. | Pittsburgh | Printed by Johnston and Stockton | 1827.

8vo, pp. 597. This description has been kindly furnished by the Rev. Dr. S. A. Agnew, Bethany, Lee Co., Miss.

[Ixxix. 1827] The | Constitution | and | Standards | of the | Associate-Reformed Church | in | North America. | Salem, N. Y.

| Printed and sold by Dodd and Stevenson | Sold also by
Collins & Hannay, New York, and by D. Steele | and Son,
Albany. | 1827.

8vo, pp. 489, 6 x 3½ inches (block of type). A separate title to the Confession: "The | Confession of Faith | Agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines at Westminster, | with the assistance of | Commissioners | from the | Church of Scotland, | As received by the | Associate-Reformed Church | in | North America | with the | Proofs from the Scripture. |" The Confession occupies pp. 1-134. We are indebted for this description to the Rev. Prof. John McNaugher, D.D., of the Allegheny Theological Seminary, Allegheny, Pa.

[Ixxx. 1832] The | Constitution | and | Standards | of the | Associate-Reformed Church | in | North America | Pittsburgh: | Published by Johnston and Stockton. | 1832.

8vo, pp. 479, 6½ x 3¼ inches (block of type). Separate title to Confession as in Salem edition of 1827: Confession occupies pp. 1-128. Reported by Rev. Prof. John McNaugher, D.D., Allegheny, Pa.: and there is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[Ixxxii. 1850] The | Constitution | and Standards | of the | Associate-Reformed Church | in | North America | Pittsburgh: | Elliott & English, Wood St. | 1850.

8vo, pp. 452, 6½ x 3½ inches (block of type). Separate title to the Confession as in the preceding edition; Confession occupies pp. 1-144. Reported by Rev. Dr. John McNaugher, Allegheny, Pa.; and also by Rev. Dr. S. A. Agnew, Bethany, Miss. The contents of the volume are the same as in the edition of 1799.

[Ixxxiii. 1874] The | Constitution and Standards | of the | Associate-Reformed Church | in | North America. | Philadelphia: | W. S. Young, 727 Jayne Street. | 1874.

Reported by the Rev. Dr. S. A. Agnew, Bethany, Miss. This is the first edition published by the direction of the Associate-Reformed Synod of the South. The following extracts from the *Minutes* of that Synod will tell its story: "Dr. Boyce from the Committee to publish a new edition of the Constitution and Standards of the Associate-Reformed Church reported that said edition was now in press and would soon be ready for distribution. The action of the Committee was approved. One dollar per copy was fixed upon as the price. . . ." (*Minutes of Synod held at Mt. Zion, Lincoln Co., Mo., October, 1873*, p. 16). "Dr. Boyce on the New Edition of the Constitution of the Associate-Reformed Church reported that 900 copies were issued at the press of William S. Young of Philadelphia. . . . His report was adopted" (*Minutes of Synod held at Hopewell, Maury Co., Tenn., September, 1874*, p. 8).

[Ixxxiiii. 1896] The | Constitution and Standards | of the | Associate-Reformed Church | in | North America. | Atlanta | Publication Committee of the Associate Reformed Church | [no date].

—, pp. 533. This is the current edition published for the use of members of the Associate-Reformed Synod of the South. Reported by the Rev. S. A. Agnew, D.D., Bethany, Miss.

B. The United Presbyterian Book.

[Ixxxiv. 1859] The Confession of Faith Agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster as received by the United Presbyterian Church of North America, with references to the proofs from the Holy Scriptures. Philadelphia: William S. Young, 1023 Race Street. Pittsburgh: William S. Rentoul. 1859.

18mo, pp. 94. The union of Associate Presbyterians and Associate-Reformed, by which the United Presbyterian Church was formed, was consummated in 1858 (see SCULLER'S *History* as cited, p. 232 *et seq.*): this edition is likely therefore to be the first published after the formation of that Church. The specialty of the United Presbyterian editions of the Confession is that at xx, 4 xxiii, 3, xxxi, 2, both the original Westminster text and a modification of it prepared at the union of the two churches are printed in parallel columns. There is a copy of this edition in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[Ixxxv. 1867] The | Subordinate Standards | of the | United Presbyterian Church | of | North America. | Published by Authority of the General Assembly. | [Copyright secured according to Law.]* | Pittsburgh: | United Presbyterian Board of Publication. | 1867.

16mo, pp. v, 593 + 76 (Government and Discipline) + 24 (Directory for Worship) + 12 (Rules of Order). There is a copy in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton.

[Ixxxvi. 1873] The | Subordinate Standards | of the | United Presbyterian Church | of | North America. | Abridged Form. | Pittsburgh: | United Presbyterian Board of Publication | 1873.

16mo, pp. 708, $5\frac{1}{2} \times 2\frac{7}{8}$ inches. Contains the Confession, the Larger and Shorter Catechism, with the proof-texts, etc. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, of Philadelphia.

[Ixxxvii. 1880] The Confession of Faith Agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster as received by the United Presbyterian Church of North America, with references to the Proofs from the Holy Scriptures. Pittsburgh: United Presbyterian Board of Publication. 1880.

16mo, pp. 63, $5\frac{1}{8} \times 3$ inches, bound in limp cloth. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[Ixxxviii. 1895] The | Subordinate Standards | of the | United Presbyterian Church | of | North America. | Published by Authority of the General Assembly. | [Copyright secured ac-

* These square brackets are given in the title.

ording to law.]* | Pittsburgh : | United Presbyterian Board of
Publication. | 1895.

16mo, pp. xiv, 708, 5 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 3 inches. Proof-texts at large for both the Confession and Catechisms : Larger Catechism Q. 105 has the wrong reading, "in unlawful means." The volume contains, besides the Confession and Catechisms, "The Testimony," together with the Government and Discipline of the United Presbyterian Church of North America, the Directory for Worship of the United Presbyterian Church of North America, and the Rules of Order in the General Assembly of the United Presbyterian Church, adopted in 1872. There are copies in the libraries of the Rev. Drs. E. R. Craven and H. C. McCook, Philadelphia.

PRINCETON.

BENJAMIN B. WARFIELD.

* These square brackets are in the title.

THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW

No. 50—April, 1902.

I.

CURRENT OLD TESTAMENT DISCUSSIONS AND PRINCETON OPINION.*

N EARLY ninety years ago, in the first year of the existence of Princeton Theological Seminary, Dr. Archibald Alexander, the sole professor and the incumbent of the chair of Dogmatic and Polemic Divinity, informally inaugurated the work of the Old Testament department by giving instruction in the original languages of the Scriptures and in the laws and customs of the Hebrews. In 1822 a distinct department of the curriculum was erected for Oriental and Biblical literature, and the Rev. Charles Hodge was appointed professor. As planned and organized, the new department embraced the literature of both the Old and the New Testaments. A separation began to be made in 1834, when Joseph Addison Alexander was chosen to be an assistant to Dr. Hodge in the department of Oriental literature; and the instruction in the Pentateuch and Psalms and in Biblical archæology was devolved upon him. In fact, this appointment inaugurated a new era in Old Testament work in the Seminary. The erection of the Biblical department in 1822 had been a harbinger of the coming day. The dawn appeared when the elder Alexander, while occupying the chair of Dogmatics, published a small book on the canon of Scripture, covering both the Old and the New Testaments, which obtained notable recognition on both sides of the Atlantic. But the morning of the new era was not yet. Dr.

* An address delivered on Tuesday, October 8, 1901, in the chapel of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, by appointment of the Board of Directors, to mark the transfer of the author from the Chair of Semitic Philology and Old Testament History to the Chair of Oriental and Old Testament Literature.

IV.

THE PRINTING OF THE WESTMINSTER CONFESSION.

III. IN TRANSLATION.

THE history of the diffusion of the Westminster Confession by means of translation is sufficiently obscure, but by no means lacking in points of curious interest. The work was certainly begun betimes. The Westminster Confession was not published until the autumn of 1647 (in Edinburgh); and not until the next spring did a surreptitious edition of it appear in London, while the authorized Parliamentary edition lingered until midsummer. Within a year of its first appearance, and so hot on the heels of its first publication in London that it must be treated as contemporaneous with the Parliamentary edition itself, a German translation had already appeared in Germany (1648). And by the opening of the next year (January 18, 1649)—before any further effort had been made to circulate the Confession in English*—official steps were already taking looking to the preparation of a Latin version, which, however, did not appear until several years afterwards (1656). But with this first burst of enthusiasm the primitive zeal for translation seems to have exhausted itself. It was not until the Confession was three-quarters of a century old that it was given the clothing of yet another speech (Gaelic, 1725), and after that all effort so to diffuse it ceased for more than a century. Toward the latter half of the nineteenth century, however, it once more showed a tendency to find its way into the divers tongues of the earth; and by the close of the first two hundred and fifty years of its life it was to be read in at least fifteen different languages.

It is remarkable how little is discoverable of the origin of the earlier versions. Of the German version of 1648 absolutely nothing seems to be known except what can be inferred from the unique copy of it that has been preserved in the Royal Library of Berlin. Without father, without mother, this Melchizedek of

* The only editions published prior to 1649 were the first Scotch of 1647, an Edinburgh ed. of 1648, the first London of 1648 and the Parliamentary of 1648.

versions simply is: it had passed entirely out of the memory of men when it was brought to light again by the description given by Niemeyer in 1840 of the only remaining copy of it. Similarly all record of the making of the Latin version of 1656 has perished: only the initials "G. D.," at the foot of the little preface which introduces it, remain to quicken conjecture as to the personality of the scholar who was so much afraid that his reputation for writing fluent Latin would be spoiled by the spissitude of the material with which he had in this case to deal, his capacity for rhetorical ornament be thrown into doubt by the exceeding gravity of its style. These two versions differ from the whole series of their successors, moreover, in that they can scarcely be thought the product of missionary zeal, but were rather intended, probably, to give information to their Continental brethren of the teaching of the Churches of Britain. The first properly so-called missionary version—that is, the first version the sole purpose of which was to extend the distinctly ecclesiastical use of the Confession—was the "Irish" translation of 1725, which was prepared by the Synod of Argyle, at the instance of the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, for the benefit of the Gaelic-speaking Scots. It was also the last version prepared by the Church of Scotland or under its auspices: and indeed the last but one which has hitherto emanated from a British source. Missionaries of the Irish Presbyterian Church have in our own day put forth a version in one of the languages of India (Gujarati, 1888): but with this exception it seems that there has been no translation of the Confession made by British hands since 1725.

The task of giving the Confession to the world in its several languages has been taken up since 1842, however, with some energy by the American Presbyterians; and eleven versions have been made by them during the last sixty years. One of these has been intended to meet needs arising on the home field itself—the German version of 1858. The rest are the product of distinctly foreign-mission zeal and mark so far the planting of the Church in virgin soil. Two are, to be sure, into languages which have long ago learned to speak with a Christian accent—Portuguese and Spanish. But the remainder are incursions into heathen precincts, and offer this text-book of pure and undefiled Christian truth to the study of those to whom Christianity itself is a novelty. These all are the product of American workers, lisping no doubt in these strange tongues; but by the grace of God they may plant seed which shall hereafter bear a harvest of Christian thinking, by means of which whole nations may be blessed.

The eleven versions prepared by American missionaries during

the last sixty years are, in the order of their date, the following : Hindustani, 1842 ; Urdu, 1848 ; German, 1858 ; Siamese, 1873 ; Portuguese, 1876 ; Spanish, 1880 ; Japanese, 1881 ; Chinese, 1881 ; Arabic, 1883 ; Benga, 188- ; Persian, 188-. Some of them, such as the Spanish and Portuguese and Urdu, have already been thoroughly revised, and either sent forth or at least prepared to be sent forth in better literary form for wider influence. Several are being diligently used in the instruction of ministers of the Word. And though some of them, such as notably the Japanese, have been permitted to fall into desuetude, and others have scarcely yet been launched (such as the Arabic, Persian and Benga), it is to be hoped that root will ultimately be taken by all and that many more will shortly be added to their number. The Presbyterian Churches owe it to their own sincerity to see that their doctrinal Standards, embodying, as they profess to believe, the very truth of God which is revealed in the Scriptures, are put in the possessions of all whom they can reach with their propaganda. Otherwise, how shall they give an account of the "talents" entrusted to them ?

Meanwhile it is something that the Westminster Confession now exists in some fifteen languages. It is true many of the more cultured and influential languages are lacking from this list. There does not seem to exist any version of the Westminster Confession in Dutch or French or Italian or any of the tongues of northern or eastern Europe. It must needs be confessed, further, that the versions that exist in the languages of culture are not always couched in the language of culture, and can proffer little claim to a place in the "literature" of those languages. How different in this respect is the history of the translation, say, of Calvin's *Institutes*. Every version of the *Institutes* was literature, the product of a master in the idiom in which he worked : the Italian poet Giulio Cesare Paschali ; the English scholar, jurist and statesman Thomas Norton ; the Spanish *litterateur* Cypriano de Valera ; the Dutch scholar Charles Agricola ; the Bohemian hymnist George Strejc—these names are but examples of the class : in every tongue the *Institutes* flowed out from the hands of master craftsmen. On the other hand, the translations of the Confession have almost never proceeded from writers "to the manner born." For the most part they are the work of foreigners, handling the language with stiff and inflexible—often, no doubt, with bungling—fingers.

We may even go further and note that the several versions of the Confession have ordinarily failed to find entrance not merely into the literature but even into the regular channels of the

book-trade of the several languages into which it has been rendered. The experience of Niemeyer, astonishing as it is, and in his case indicative chiefly of the disgraceful insularity of German scholarship a half-century ago, would be more legitimately the experience of the average seeker after knowledge in most of the book-marts of the world. He had published his *Collectio Confessionum in Ecclesiis Reformatis Publicatarum* (Leipzig, 1840) without the Westminster formularies; and he actually tells us in the Preface to an Appendix he added nine months later, for the purpose of including them, that he had sought them in vain and had "taken it very hard" that he could never lay his hand on a single exemplar of the Westminster Confession! Of course he needed only to send to Edinburgh or to Philadelphia to get a cartload of exemplars of current issues; and a man of learning, engaged in the scientific study of symbolics, ought to have known that. And his friend Reboulius seems to have had no difficulty in turning up even in the Royal Library of Berlin a German and three Latin copies, which appear to have been lying there for the inspection of any one who cared to look at them. But the incident certainly illustrates how little the Westminster Confession had found its way into the channels of ordinary information and trade of the Germany of 1840—though there had been in existence for two hundred years a German translation, and a "literary" version at that. There has been a Spanish version in existence since 1880, a Portuguese one since 1876; but the chances of a Spanish or Portuguese reader coming accidentally across a copy in the most frequented book-shops of Madrid or Lisbon—or shall we not even say of Mexico or Rio de Janeiro?—or even succeeding in "unearthing" a copy by diligent inquiry in the most enterprising book-shops of these cities, would probably be very small. The Westminster Confession may exist at the opening of the twentieth century in fifteen languages; but it is another matter whether it can be said to be very much in evidence in these fifteen languages, or even, in any broad sense of the word, accessible in them. Or, perhaps we should rather say, in any one of them—even in English. We were credibly told, a couple of years ago, that a copy of it was sought in vain in the largest book-shops of Glasgow! It is obviously very easy to overestimate the significance of the existence of the Westminster Confession in fifteen languages.

It is also very easy to underestimate it. That it has found its way into these languages, for the most part, without finding its way into their literature or book-marts is a feature of its history which it shares with the Scriptures themselves, and, indeed, is paralleled by the mode of entrance of Christianity itself into

the world. It belongs, in short, to the "servant-form" of Christianity. Christianity has always propagated itself by appeal, in the first instance, to the humble, whose interest has been in content rather than form: and its "literature," in the first instance, has in every race sought none of the ornaments of literary elaboration to give it wings. The very characteristic of the first literature of Christianity, in the eyes of the philologist,* is just its "formlessness": and it was all the product of alien pens. The same has been true of it ever since, as it has found entrance into this or that land. It is the idea that seeks to make its way into the mind of a nation first of all; and this idea is planted as seed, in the first instance, in the hearts of the humble who occupy no great place in the world. It is only after a while, when it takes root and grows, that it blossoms spontaneously into beauty. It has been, therefore, not only inevitable but fully in accord with the fitness of things—with that "servant-form" which our Lord Himself took when he came into the world and offered Himself to the babes and sucklings—that the Confession too has only struggled into other languages, transferring itself into new tongues by the painful efforts of men born aliens to them; and has been put into circulation only among those simple ones who have by their very simplicity been prepared for it. Thus and thus only will it ever find a path into a nation's heart. And it should not in the least discourage us to see it only thus making its way in the world.

What seems discouraging is that several of the fourteen translations which have been made of the Confession do not seem, for one reason or another, to be receiving that opportunity to plant themselves in the hearts of even the "simple" which alone we expect or crave for them. The Latin version of course was not intended for popular use and is now no longer in any sort of circulation. The old German version has perished, and only a single exemplar of it is known to remain in existence; while the modern German version (1858) is practically confined in its use to the German-speaking Presbyterians of the United States. The Japanese version has been given no real opportunity of life, and is no longer to be had. The Siamese version is almost out of print. The Arabic, Persian and Benga versions have never been published; and although the two latter are locally in use they can hardly be said to have been given to the world. The use of the Gaelic version must necessarily grow less and less extensive. There remain only the versions in Spanish and Portuguese, Chinese, Hindustani, Urdu and Gujurati, for which we can hope for a future of growing usefulness. An increase of zeal may add new ones or resuscitate old

* See Eduard Norden's *Die Antike Kunstsprosa*, Vol. II *ad init.*

ones—such as the Japanese and Siamese—but at the moment there are, after all, only seven or eight versions (including the German and Gaelic) which are really “in circulation.” Even after the comparatively energetic work of the last sixty years, the Presbyterian Churches have no reason to blame themselves for undue zeal in propagating their professed doctrines by means of translations of their Confession.

In the following notes we have brought together the information we have been able to gather as to the translations of the Confession. We have included in the list even those versions which have, because produced either in Britain or the United States, been already mentioned in the lists of editions published in these countries. Thus the list contains the full series of versions brought to our attention. There may well be others which have escaped our search: but it is likely that we have been able to include nearly all.*

NOTES TOWARD A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE WESTMINSTER CONFSSION.

III. TRANSLATIONS.

[**A.** *German.* 1648] Demütiger Bericht | Der | Versamleten und jetzund aus | Macht und Befehl | des | Parlaments | Zu | Westmünster | Sitzenden Lehrern der heiligen | Schrift | Belangende | Ein Glaubens-Bekantnüs | beyden Häusern des Par- | laments | neulich überreicht | Im Jahr nach Christi Geburt | 1648 | Aus dem Englischen ins Teutsche | treulich übersetzt | Gedruckt im Jahr 1648.

Small 8vo, 6 x 3½ inches (block of type, 5½ x 3½): pages unnumbered (title, 1; preface, 3; text, 171): there are no running titles at the head of the pages but there are catch-words at the foot: there is no signature attached to the preface or any other hint in the volume of its authorship: the signatures of the officers of the Assembly appear at the end of the Confession in the forms, Carle Herle, Cornelius Burges, Herher Palmer, Henrich Robroughe, Adoniram Byfield. The text of the Confession is accompanied by the proofs from Scripture, generally quoted in full, though sometimes only in part and sometimes only by references. The right-hand margin is given to the Scripture-proofs, and the relative space occupied by the text and proofs varies very greatly: sometimes, especially in the latter portion of the volume, the text takes up nearly the whole page, in which case the proofs occupy an inset on the right margin or may even be relegated to the foot of the page; sometimes there are only a few words of text on the page and the proofs fill the

* Few of these translations are to be found in the collections of editions of the Confession. We have been indebted for our knowledge of them, therefore, mostly to the missionaries by whom they are used, and our thanks are due to them for their readiness to supply both copies of the books and information about them. We have tried to give credit for these courtesies, in general, as we have spoken of each version in turn. But it has been impossible to do justice to the kindness we have experienced or even to mention the names of all who have extended it.

entire remainder (e.g., VIII, 1, 4; V, 1), or even more (e.g., II, 1 the proofs cover two whole pages): ordinarily the text and proofs somewhat equitably divide the page between them, the one on the left and the other on the right hand. The text is printed in strong German type, giving a very black appearance to the pages: the proofs in smaller type: the block is occasionally imposed crookedly on the page.

So far as is known, this edition persists only in a unique exemplar preserved in the Royal Library at Berlin. It is described by NIEMEYER in the preface to the Appendix of his *Collectio Confessionum in Ecclesiis Reformatis Publicatarum*, Leipzig, 1840, pp. IV-V: he quotes the entire Preface. Compare also MITCHELL'S *The Westminster Assembly, its History and Standards* (Baird Lecture for 1882), 2d Ed., Philadelphia, 1897, pp. 527-8; SCHIAFF'S *Creeeds of Christendom*, New York, 1878, I, p. 754; BÜCKEL'S *Bekennniss-Schriften der Evang.-reform. Kirche*, Leipzig, 1847, pp. 683, sq. Böckel reprints the entire text, slightly revised, chiefly in the interest of modernization of the German. The volume has been examined afresh for us by the Rev. Kerr Duncan Macmillan, B.D., to whom we are indebted for a careful description and tracings. Compare what has been said in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, October, 1901, p. 624, No. 9.

No contemporary notice of this version seems to have been preserved: and nothing appears to be known of its origin except what can be gathered from the book itself. From the preface, which speaks of the Confession as having "lately come to us in Germany in the English language," it would seem likely that the translation was made in Germany and by one of deeply-rooted Reformed sentiments. He speaks of the Confession as a "tractate rich in all its parts in the Divine wisdom and doctrine, drawn almost word for word from the Holy Scriptures," and as "a brief compend of the wholesome Word," out of which "shines brightly and clearly the light of the truth for the comforting and strengthening of believing hearts." He has translated it into High German out of love for God's Church, and prays that the pious reader may use it to his edification and continue instant in prayer and labor for the welfare of Christ's people. The English exemplar used for the translation would seem to belong to the year 1648, to have borne the title of "The Humble Advice, etc.," and to have been provided with proof-references, but not with the proof-passages themselves. The only edition known meeting all the conditions appears to be that printed for Robert Bostock in 1648 (see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, October, 1901, p. 621, No. 7), and Dr. Mitchell (*op. cit.*, p. 527) accordingly supposes a copy of this to have been the copy used. "In order that the basis of the doctrine presented may stand out before the eye," the Preface tells us, "the passages that are attached to every proposition are set forth word for word,—a thing which is not done in the English exemplar." And so in fact this German translation is the first edition of the Confession of Faith in which the Scripture-proofs are inserted at length and not merely by references. So far as is known the first edition in English in which this was done was the Rothwell edition of 1658 (see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, October, 1901, p. 629, No. 23).

Apparently only a single issue of this version appeared. But after two hundred years it was slightly modernized and reprinted by E. G. ADOLF BÜCKEL in his *Die Bekennniss-Schriften der evangelisch-reformirten Kirche* (1847), under the name of *Das puritanische Glaubensbekenntniss*. The extent of the revision made by Böckel may be estimated from the specimens of the two texts which we give below. Naturally the archaic syntax which allowed the verb to stand in the midst of subordinate sentences is corrected; as well as such usages as the double negative in III, 4: "und ist derselhen Zahl so gewiss das die *nicht*, weder vermehret noch" (Böckel: "dass sie weder vermehret noch"). Other alterations concern such minor matters as II, 1, "ohne Leib, Theile, etc.," for "ohne Leib, stücken, etc."; II, 2, "bedarf nicht der Creaturen" for "nicht benötigt einiger Creaturen"; III, 8, "Fürsorge" for "Fürsichtigkeit"; "reichlichem Trost" for "überflüssigen

trost"; and the like. The following specimens are drawn from the first section of the first chapter and the first two sections of the third chapter, and will give a fair sample of the version itself as well as of the relations to one another of the two forms of the text.

EDITION OF 1648.

I, § 1. OB zwar dz Licht der Natur und die Wercke der schöpfung un̄ fürschung, die Güte, Weisheit un̄ Macht Gottes so weit offenbahren, dz der Mensch keine entschuldigung hat ; So vermögen sie ihn doch nit zu dem zur seligkeit nohtwendigen Erkäntnusz Gottes und seines Willens zubringen. Darumb hat es Gott gefallen zu verschiedenen Zeiten und auff mancherley wiese, sich un̄ solchen seinen Willen seiner Kirchen zu offenbahre unnd zu erklären ; Und hernachmals, damit die warheit so viele besser erhalten unnd vortgepflantzet ; auch die Kirche wider die Verderbnusz des Fleisches und des Satans und der Welt boszheit, so viel gewisser hevástiget und gestärcket würde, dasselbe alles in Schrift verfassen zulassen : Daher es kompt, dz die Schrift ganz nohtwendig ist : Nachdem die vorige Art un̄ weise der offenbahrung, göttlichē Willens au sein Volck, nunmehr auffgehört hat.

III, § 1. . GOtt hat von aller Ewigkeit her, nach dem allerweisesten und heiligsten Raht seines eigē Willens freywillig un̄ unwandelbah geordnet alles was jemals geschiehet. Doch so fern, das dadurch weder GOtt zu einer ursache der Sünden gemacht, noch dem willen der Creaturen einige Gewalt angethan, noch die Freyheit order Zufälle der unteren Ursachen aufgehoben, sondern viel mehr bestättiget werdē.

§ 2. Ob zwar GOtt weisz alles und Jedes was auff alle gesetzte Bedinge geschehen kan und mag : So hat dennoch Gott darumb nichts beschlossen, dasz er zuvor gesehen hat, das es zukünftüg sein, oder das es auff solche und solche Bedinge geschehen würde.

BÖCKEL'S EDITION.

Cap. I, § 1. Ob zwar das Licht der Natur und die Werke der Schöpfung und Vorsehung die Güte, Weisheit, und Macht Gottes so weit offenbaren, dass der Mensch keine Entschuldigung hat ; so vermögen sie ihn doch nicht zu der zur Seligkeit nohtwendigen Erkenntniss Gottes und seines Willens zu bringen. Darum hat es Gott gefallen, zu verschiedenen Zeiten und auf mancherley Weise sich und solchen seinen Willen seiner Kirche zu offenbaren und zu erklären ; und hernach, damit die Wahrheit so viel besser erhalten und fortgepflanzt, auch die Kirche wider die Verderbniss des Fleisches und des Satans und der Welt Bosheit so viel gewisser befestigt und gestärkt würde, dasselbe alles in Schrift verfassen zu lassen ; daher es kommt, dass die Schrift ganz nohtwendig ist, nachdem die vorige Art und Weise der offenharung göttlichen Willens an sein Volk nunmehr aufgehört hat.

Cap. III, § 1. Gott hat von aller Ewigkeit her, nach dem allerweisesten und heiligsten Rath seines eigenen Willens, freiwillig und unwandelbar geordnet alles was jemals geschieht. Doch sofern, dass dadurch weder Gott zu einer Ursache der Sünden gemacht, noch dem Willen der Creaturen einige Gewalt angethan, noch die Freiheit oder Zufälle der untern Ursachen aufgehoben, sondern viel mehr bestätigt werden.

§ 2. Ob zwar Gott weiss alles und Jedes, was auf alle gesetzte Bedingungen geschehen kann und mag, so hat dennoch Gott nichts darum beschlossen weil er zuvorgesehen hat, dass es zukünftig sein oder dass es auf solche und solche Bedingungen geschehen würde.

[? *Dutch*. 1649]

Dr. Mitchell (as cited, p. 528) remarks: "Possibly a Dutch edition may have been published about the same time [as the German version of 1648], and in 1649 a rare and much-prized edition in English issued from the Elzevir press." In Dr. Williamson's edition of Hetherington's *History of the Westminster Assembly*, p. 457, a Dutch edition is attributed to "Luice Elsever for Andrew Wilson, Bookseller, Edinburgh." If a Dutch version is intended by this, it is a manifest confusion with the "edition in English issued from the Elzevir press," for which see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for October, 1901, pp. 625-6, No. 12. It may be suspected that this same confusion lies at the basis of Dr. Mitchell's notice also. If there ever has been made a Dutch translation of the Confession it has escaped our search. Neither Dr. Geerhardus Vos, of Princeton, nor Dr. N. M. Steffens, of Dubuque, nor Dr. Rutgers, of the Free University of Amsterdam, nor Dr. Herman Bavinck, of Kampen, has been able to find any traces of it. Dr. Bavinck, for example, writes under date of May 1, 1901: "All my inquiries have thus far been fruitless. In the libraries of our Universities nothing is known of it. The Professors with whom I have consulted know just as little of it. . . ."

[B. *Latin*. 1656 +] CONFESSIO FIDEI | in Conventu theologorum
 autoritate | Parliamenti Anglicani indicto | Elaborata; |
 eidem Parlamento postmodum | Exhibita; | Quin et ab
 eodem, deinceps ab Ecclesia Scotiana | Cognita et Appro-
 bata; | unà cum | CATECHISMO | duplici, MAJORI, MINORIQUE;
 | E Sermone Anglicano summa cum fide | in Latinum versa.
 | Cantabrigiæ: excudebat Johannes Field, celebrimæ
 Academiæ typographus. | 1656.

8vo, pp. 229; with a short preface signed by the initials "G. D.": the Scripture-proofs are given by reference only. There is a copy in the British Museum (3505, b. 61). Later editions appeared at Amsterdam, 1658; Cambridge, 1659 (8vo, pp. 229; British Museum; Prince Collection in Boston Public Library, 69, 11, 15; Library of Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia); Glasgow, 1660 (12mo, pp. 302; British Museum), 1670, 1674; Edinburgh, 1660, 1671 (12mo, pp. 182; British Museum), 1680, 1689, 1694, 1708, 1711. It has also been printed by NIEMEYER in the Appendix to his *Collectio Conf.* (Leipzig, 1840) from the Cambridge edition of 1559, with the aid of the two later editions of Glasgow, 1660, and Edinburgh, 1694; and by SCHAFF in the third volume of his *Creeeds of Christendom* (New York, 1878) from (apparently) the Cambridge edition of 1656. The later editions do not seem to diverge intentionally from the first, except that after the Cambridge editions of 1656 and 1659 the word Testamentum is substituted for Instrumentum in the titles of the Old and New Testaments (*e.g.*, I, 2 "omnes illi libri tam Veteris quam Novi Instrumenti," Cambridge, 1656 and 1659, but "tam Veteris quam Novi Testamenti," Glasgow and Edinburgh edd.). The initials "G. D." at the end of the preface in the ed. of 1656 seem also to fall away subsequently.

For an account of this translation, see MITCHELL, *op. cit.*, p. 528; SCHAFF, *op. cit.*, I, p. 754, III, p. 600; CARRUTHERS, *op. cit.*, pp. 61-62; NIEMEYER, *op. cit.*, appendix, pp. iii, iv; LEE, *op. cit.*, list of 1826, p. 5 (not repeated in later edition); DEXTER, *Congregationalism as Seen in Its Literature*, Bibl., p. 83 (No. 1727) and p. 86 (No. 1803). Compare also THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for October, 1901, p. 628, No. 21.

Practically nothing seems to be known about the origin of this translation except

what may be inferred from the book itself. It was natural that the Westminster formularies should have early been presented to the public in the language of the whole scholarly world, and it is not surprising that there are traces from the beginning of an intention of doing so. Principal LEE (*op. cit.*, p. 57) communicates the following item from the Minutes of the Assembly's Commission: "*Edinburgh, Jan. 18, 1649.*—The Commission of the General Assembly, considering how profitable it will be to the kirks abroad, that the Confession of Faith and Catechism be translated in Latine, therefore they seriouslie recommend to Mr. John Adamson and Mr. Thomas Crawford to doe the same with diligence." Whether, however, the actual version printed at Cambridge in 1656 has any connection with this action, we do not know. The only hint of its authorship is contained in the initials "G. D." which are affixed to the preface. A happy conjecture supposes these to be the Latin initials of William Dillingham, D.D., Master of Emanuel College, Cambridge: but it remains merely a conjecture. The brief preface adds no hint whatever to aid in the identification of the author: it merely in the crispest way admonishes the benignant reader to observe that the numbering of the chapters and verses set down for the references in the margin follows that of the English version of the Bible, and begs him to attribute any lack of fluency he may find in the Latin to the compactness of the matter, any lack of ornament to its solemnity.

[C. *Gaelic*. 1725] The Confession of Faith, Larger and Shorter Catechisms, agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster, with the assistance of Commissioners from the Church of Scotland, as a part of the Covenanted Uniformity in Religion betwixt the Churches of Christ in the three Kingdoms, Scotland, England, and Ireland. Translated into the Irish language by the Synod of Argyle. Entered in Stationers' Hall. Edinburgh: Printed by Thomas Lumisden and John Robertson, and Sold at their Printing house in the Fish-market. MDCCXXV.

Admhail an Chreidimh, air an do Reitigh air ttus Coimhthionol na n Diaghairadh, aig Niarmhonister, an Sasgan; leis an Daontuighe ard-seanadh Eagluis na Halbann, chum na bheith na chuid eigin, do Choimhreite Creidimh, edir Eaglaisibh Chrìosd annsna trì Rìoghachdaibh. Air na chur a Ngaidheilig, le Seanadh Earraghaidheal. Air na Chlodhbhualadh (a nois an chead uair) aig Duineuduinn le Thomais Lumisden agus Eoin Robertson, a Mbliaghan ar Dtighearna, MDCCXXV.

12mo, pp. viii, 276. The Confession of Faith occupies pp. 3-104; the Larger Catechism (Irish title, p. 105: An Cataichiosm, etc.), pp. 105-240; the Shorter Catechism (Irish title, p. 241: Foirceadul Aithghearn Coasmeich, etc.), pp. 241, *sq.* There is a copy in the British Museum, "875, a. 36"; and also one in the Lenox Library, New York. A second edition, 12mo, pp. viii, 286, was published at Edinburgh, T. Lumisden & J. Robertson, 1727; and a third, 12mo, pp. viii, 285, at Glasgow, J. Orr, 1756, 1757. Copies of both are in the British Museum, Nos. "3504, a. 52" and "3505, a. 23." In the first issue the printing was carelessly done. The Act (Charles I, Parl. II, Sess. 2. Act 16) quoted at the beginning is dated 1649, instead of 1649; and the title to the Shorter Catechism strangely states that this is the eighth edition, and yet "printed now for the first time at Edinburgh by the Heirs of Andrew Anderson," who printed the sixth edition in 1715. The "first time"

refers back to the Confession. The second edition was merely a reprint of the former, continuing many of its errors. The third edition was more carefully printed and exhibited many changes. A general account of the origin of this version is given in the *THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW* for October, 1901, p. 642 (No. 57), which may be consulted. The following account has been kindly written for us by the Rev. G. LAWSON GORDON, of River John, Nova Scotia.

The Synod of Argyle was presumed to be the most literary of the Gaelic-speaking Synods of Scotland. Hence when Gaelic work was to be done by an ecclesiastical court, this one was chosen for the undertaking. The Scottish General Assembly in 1699 enacted "that the Synod of Argyle translate the Confession of Faith of this Church and Larger Catechism into the Irish language, and exactly notice any typographical errors in the late impression of the Irish Bible that may be amended in a new impression." (Act 16, 6.) That the Scottish Gaelic is not now Irish is not the fault (as so often hinted) of the religious leaders of Scotland. As above indicated, they foisted first an Irish Bible (the edition by R. Kirke of Bedell's Bible in Roman characters, 1690) and then an Irish Confession of Faith upon the Highlands, whose people spoke quite another language. There seems to have been some element of resistance to the Assembly's order, and five years later it was renewed with the addition: "with a vocabulary of the most necessary and usual terms in Divinity." (1704, Act 17.) Does this indicate that the landward and northern members of the Synod resisted the Irishisms of the coast and southern peninsula? Again in 1708 the Assembly repeated its order to the Synod of Argyle. In the following year the Synod reported the work of translation completed. The Synod proceeded no further in the matter for lack of funds; and in 1713 the Assembly referred the publication to its Commission. But the Commission had otherwise to face a deficit and could do nothing for the Confession. Now it was that private benevolence came to the assistance of the enterprise and John Campbell, Esq., who subsequently became Lord Provost of Edinburgh, contributed sufficient funds to begin the printing. In 1725 a petition was presented to the Commission of Assembly by Thomas Lumisden, a printer of Edinburgh, which, after reciting a part of the above history of this attempt to supply an Irish version, proceeded to say that the death of the printer stopped the work, that the petitioner had bought the rights of this and other books and accounts of the Printer for the Church, that the work now was completed, that money was too scarce in the Highlands to permit of its inhabitants purchasing the books, and that he petitioned the Commission to purchase the whole edition of two thousand copies for free distribution. The petition was granted and the books were sold at the nominal price of sixpence apiece, unbound. They had a double title, in English and in Gaelic, as given above.

The language used in this translation was the Gaelic of Argyle which, because of the proximity of that part of Scotland to Ireland, approached the Irish in orthography, vocabulary and grammatical forms more closely than the Gaelic of the rest of the Highlands. It will be readily understood that under these circumstances a revision of the work of the Synod of Argyle was desirable. Such revision was undertaken by Mr. G. MacDonald, schoolmaster in Edinburgh, in 1804. The first edition of his work seems to have been:

Leabhar Aideachaidh A' Chreidimh, maille ri Leabh-raichean
Farsuing agus Aithghearr a' Cheasnachaidh, agus Suim
an Eolais Shlainteil, air an Eadar-theangachadh Le G.
MacDhonnail, maighstir-sgoil an Dun eidin, do'n Chuideachd
Urramach, a ta chum eolas criosduidh a sgaoileadh feadh
Gaidhealtachd agus Eileana na h-Alba. Dun Eidin: Clodh-
bhualt le Andreas Balfour. MDCCCXVI.

18mo. This is the first edition with the Sum of Saving Knowledge, although this was translated and published with the Shorter Catechism in 1767. It has no English title-page. Probably some exception was taken to the expression "air an Eadar," etc., "translated by G. MacDonald," for this was but a reprint, with improved orthography, of the edition of 1757. At any rate there was issued in 1821 an edition of the book of 1816 with a new title-page which does not claim so much for MacDonald :

Leabhar Aideachaidh A' Chreidimh, maille ri dà Leabhar a' Cheasnachaidh, agus Suim an Eòlais Shlainteil, air an cur a mach Le G. MacDhonnail, maighstir-scoile an Duneidin. Duneidin: Clodh Bhuailte le Andreas Balfour, MDCCXXI.

18mo. "Issued by G. MacDonald" is the cautious expression now used. An advertisement, dated 1821, June 1, while mentioning the edition of 1725, makes no reference to that of 1816, as if the author were a little ashamed of its title-page. The contents were printed on the back of the title-page, a precedent followed in the subsequent editions.

MacDonald did not attempt so large a change of vocabulary and grammatical form as was needed to reduce the work to the language of the people. A more thorough revision was published in 1837, the text of which is still in use.

Leabhar | Aideachaidh A' Chreidimh, | le | Dà Leabhar a' Cheasnachaidh, | maille ri | Suim agus Feum an Eòlais Shlainteil: | Eadar-theangaichte o'n Bheurla | chum Gaelic Albannaich, | air tus le | Seanadh Earra- | ghaeil 's a' bhliadhna MDCCXXV; | a ris le | Deòrsa | Macdhòmhnail, s' a' bhliadhna MDCCCIV; | agus a nis ath-leasaichte chum na Cànain | Ghnàthaichte, 's a' bhliadhna' | MDCCCXXXVII.|| Duni-eidin: | William Whyte & Co. | Booksellers to the Queen Dowager. | MDCCCXXXVII.*

16mo, pp. viii, 261, 2,—the last 2 containing a list of Gaelic books sold by the publishers. The "Advertisement" giving supposed necessary explanations in English occupies two pages; then follows "Earail," a very affectionate exhortation to the study of Christian truth, in four pages. The Confession follows without a separate title-page, but having its title on the same page as "Caib. I," the first Chapter, and giving that title, word for word, as the Synod of Argyle wrote it, down to the word Rìoghachdaibh, changing only the grammatical form and the orthography. The Larger Catechism begins at page 81, also without a separate title-page. The Sum of Saving Knowledge comes between the Catechisms, at page 183, with a separate title-page, a distinction which also belongs to the Shorter Catechism at page 237. The Commandments, the Lord's Prayer and the Creed conclude the text of the volume.

The G. of MacDonald's name was understood to stand for George, "Deòrsa," by the editors of 1837. That this was a mistake was indicated by them later by putting "Gileabart"—i. e., Gilbert—for "Deòrsa" on the title-page. This, with the name of the publisher, is the only change we have noted in the whole book

* That is to say: "Book | of the Confession of the Faith | along with | the two Books of the Catechising | together with | The Sum and Use of Saving Knowledge | translated from the English | into Gaelic Scottish | at first by | the Synod of Argyle in the year 1725; | again by | George Macdonald in the year 1804; | and now revised into the speech | common, in the year | 1837 | etc."

since 1837. The latest edition bears the imprint: Edinburgh: John Grant, 1898. With the two exceptions on the title-page noted above, this is page and line and letter a reprint of the stereotyped edition of 1837, in fact, probably from the same plates. Much of the unsightly orthography of the first edition is still continued, such as, *fuidh* for *fo*, *ainmanna* for *ainmean*, but yet the common people can and do read it to edification.

It would not be possible to give an exact impression of the amount of revision each edition underwent in its successor otherwise than by printing paragraphs from each in parallel columns. The changes are of orthography (thus *aontuighe* becomes *aontuich*: *ttus* becomes *tùs*), vocabulary (thus *tiocfaidh* becomes *thig*) and grammar (thus *admhail an chreidimh* becomes *aidmheil a' chreidimh*). Perhaps the general description of the nature of the progressive revision given above will be sufficient to convey an adequate idea of its extent.

[D. *Hindustani*. 1842] I' sawí Maslon ká khulása. | Jis par | Presbiterían ke kalísa ke log ímán rakhte haiñ. | The Confession of Faith | of the | Presbyterian Church in America, | In Hindustání. | Allahabad: | Presbyterian Mission Press. | 1842.

24mo, pp. vi, 94; $4\frac{3}{8} \times 2\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type); bound in cloth. Roman type throughout: proof-texts by references only. There are copies of this version in the libraries of the Theological Seminary at Princeton and of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[E. *Urdu*. 1848 and 1864] Aqáid-Náma, | Aur | Suwál o Jawáb | I Mukhtasar, | Jo Hind Kí Shimálí Atráf Kí Sinad | Ke Hukm Se Mashhúr | Kiyá Gayá, | San 1848. | Allahabad: | Printed at the Allahabad Mission Press. | 1848.

That is to say: "Confession of Faith and Shorter Catechism, printed and published by order of the Synod of India in the year 1848." 32mo, pp. 171 (The Confession, pp. 1-131; The Shorter Catechism, pp. 133-171); $4\frac{1}{4} \times 2\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type). Roman type throughout: proof-texts to the Confession only and by references only (at foot of page). A second edition was issued in 1864, a copy of which, kindly presented by the Rev. Dr. E. M. Wherry, of Lodiana, is in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton. Dr. Wherry writes (January 16, 1901): "It was made and published in 1848 and has gone through two editions in Roman Urdu, that is, in the Urdu language and the Roman character. The proof-texts are indicated but nowhere printed in full. . . . At the end of the little book there is a translation in Urdu of the Shorter Catechism. We have also a translation of the Larger Catechism. There is in existence a Committee which has prepared a revised translation of the Confession in the Urdu language, but owing to the revival of the revision movement at home the publication has been deferred."

[F. *German*. 1858] Constitution | der | Presbyterianischen Kirche | in den | Vereinigten Staaten von Amerika, | enthält das | Glaubensbekenntniss, die beiden Katechismen | und die | Ordnung des Gottesdienstes, | zugleich mit dem | Entwurf der Kirchenordnung und Kirchenzucht, | wie es bestätigt wurde | durch die General-Versammlung in ihren Sitzungen im Mai | 1821 unñ verbessert im Jahre 1833. | Uebersetzt nach

der authentischen Ausgabe der General-Versammlung. | Philadelphia. | Presbyterianische Board für³ Veröffentlichung religiöser Schriften | [no date].

Small 12mo, pp. 468, $4\frac{1}{2} \times 2\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type). On the back of the title there is printed (in German translation) the resolutions of the Assembly of 1839 confining the publication of the Constitution to the Board of Publication. A *Vorrede* occupies pages 3-8. The text of the Confession, with the scripture-proofs in full (in one column, occupying the lower portion of the page), follows, pp. 9-177: at the end of this is the following note derived from Niemeyer's mistaken inference (p. v.): "Unterscriben ist deises Glaubensbekenntniss, und aufgestellt in der General-Versammlung zu Westminster im Jahre 1648 von folgenden Männern, welche die Abfasser desselben zu sein scheinen,"—then follow the signatures of Herle, Burges, Palmer, Robroughe and Byfield, the officers of the Westminster Assembly. Page 178 is blank; the Larger Catechism occupies pp. 179-280, the Shorter Catechism pp. 281-308, the documents at the end of it being increased by the addition, after the Apostles' Creed, of "Die Einsetzung der Taufe" and "Die Einsetzung des heiligen Abendmahls,"—i.e., the words of our Lord in Mark xvi. 15, 16, and 1 Cor. xi. 23-25. The Form of Government and Discipline occupy pp. 309-406; the Directory for Worship, pp. 407-443; General Rules for Judicatories, pp. 444-452; and the Index, pp. 453-468. The plates were made in 1858, in which year 1250 copies were printed (August 7); by 1891, 3750 copies had been issued. There is a copy in the library of the Western Theological Seminary, Allegheny; and the book is kept on sale at the Book Store of the Presbyterian Board of Publication and Sabbath-school Work, Philadelphia.

In the *Vorrede* prefixed to the volume it is recited that the translation originated in an order of the General Assembly of 1857, met at Lexington, Ky.; and a short history of the origin of the Westminster Confession is given,—in which we are told, deriving again from Niemeyer, that "it was in the year 1648, at the command of the so-called Long Parliament, which consisted for the greater part of Presbyterians, that the Westminster Confession was composed"; the old German translation of 1648 is then adverted to and its Preface quoted. This *Vorrede* is signed by "the Presbyterian Board for the Publication of Religious Works" and dated 1858. The translation seems to be independent of the old German version of 1648, which was probably known to the translator only through the notice in Niemeyer's *Collectio Confessionum*.

The translation owes its origin, of course, to the sense of responsibility for our German fellow-citizens, so rapidly increasing in numbers about the middle of the century, which was very keenly felt by both Presbyterian Churches. In the New School Assembly also an attempt had been made to prepare a German revision of the Standards (see *Minutes*, 1853, p. 324, 1854, p. 485, 1855, p. 16); but this does not seem to have reached the stage of performance. In the Old School Church a resolution was offered by Mr. Phelps in 1856 (*Minutes*, p. 519) to the effect "that in view of the rapidly increasing German population of our country," and so forth, "the Board of Publication be instructed to issue as speedily as possible an edition of the Confession of Faith in German," and further that it be bound with the English version on opposite pages. This was referred to the Board, "to act at its own discretion" (p. 527). Next year (*Minutes*, 1857, p. 45) an Overture came up from the Presbytery of Dubuque, and was favorably reported, asking that the Board be required to publish a German edition; but "Mr. Schenck [then Secretary of the Board of Publication] made statements respecting the designs of the Board of Publication in relation to this matter, and the Overture and Report were laid on the table." From the Minutes of the Executive Committee of the Board of Publication we may learn what the statements were that Mr. Schenck made to the Assembly. The following extracts from these Minutes have been kindly communicated to us

by the Rev. Dr. W. M. Rice, Recording Secretary of the Board. *May 5, 1857*: "A communication was received from the Presbytery of New York, urging the publication of the Confession of Faith in German. It was resolved to take measures to comply with this request, and the Publishing Agent was authorized to confer with the Rev. Mr. Steins of New York as to translating the Book of Discipline and Form of Government." *June 2, 1857*: "A letter from the Rev. F. Steins, offering to translate the Confession of Faith into German for \$100.00, was read and the offer accepted." *July 7, 1857*: "The German Shorter Catechism was ordered to be stereotyped." *October 6, 1857*: "The Rev. F. Steins presented through the Publishing Agent a translation into German of the Confession of Faith, which he had been engaged to make." *January 5, 1858*: "Resolved, That an edition of 1,000 of the Confession of Faith in German be printed." *January 12, 1858*: "It was resolved to print an edition of 1,250 instead of 1,000 of the Confession of Faith in German." At the next Assembly, accordingly, the Board reported that "the Confession of Faith has been published in German" (*Minutes*, 1858, p. 339). The Rev. Frederick Steins, the translator of the volume, was pastor of the "German Church" of the Presbytery of New York from 1851 to 1868, in which year the Minutes report his death. Presumably, the Board employed him as the translator on the recommendation of members of the Presbytery of New York, in compliance with whose request the publication was made. The Report of the Board of Publication to the General Assembly, 1858, has the following notice: "The Confession of Faith has been translated into the German language by one of the Pastors in the city of New York who has peculiar qualifications for such a work. After undergoing careful examination by competent judges, the translation has been published, and the Board is now ready to furnish them wherever needed and to any extent." The German of this version is thought to be somewhat over-literal and even inelegant. In order that its independence may be observed we give a specimen of it for comparison with the same sections of the earlier version of 1648 (revised in Böckel) as given above (p. 261, No. A):

I, 1. Obgleich das Licht der Natur und die Werke der Schöpfung und Vorsehung, die Güte, Weisheit und Macht Gottes schon so weit offenbaren, dass die Menschen sich nicht entschuldigen können, so sind sie dennoch nicht hinreichend die Erkenntniss Gottes und seines Willens uns zu verschaffen, die nothwendig ist zu unserer Seligkeit; deshalb gefiel es dem Herrn, sich manchmal und auf mancherlei Weise sich und diesen seinen Willen seiner Kirche zu offenbaren und auch diesen später schriftlich zu hinterlassen, wodurch er sowohl für die Erhaltung als Fortpflanzung seiner Wahrheit sorgte, damit nicht seine Kirche gegen das Verderben des Fleisches und wider die Bosheit des Satans und der Welt, ohne Schutz und ohne Trost wäre.

Darum denn auch, nachdem alle früheren Wege, auf welchen Gott seinen Willen seinem Volke offenbarte, angehört haben, die heilige Schrift durchans nothwendig ist.

III, 1. Gott hat nach dem allweisen und allheiligen Rathe seines eigenen Willens frei und unabänderlich, was irgend wie geschieht von aller Ewigkeit her verordnet doch so, das Gott nicht dabei zum Urheber der Sünde gemacht, noch dem Willen der Geschöpfe Gewalt angethan, noch die Freiheit oder die zufällige Wirkung neben beiwirkender Ursachen aufgehoben, sondern vielmehr bestätigt werden.

III, 2. Obgleich Gott Alles weiss, was unter allen angenommenen Bedingungen geschehen mag oder kann, so hat er doch nichts beschlossen, weil er es als zukünftig voraussah, oder als solches, was unter solchen Bedingungen geschehen würde.

Compare what is said of this version in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January, 1902, p. 104, No. liii.

[G. Siamese. 1873] . . . || The Confession of Faith | Translated

| by | S. G. MacFarland. | Bangkok | Presb. Mission Press.
| 1873.

12mo, pp. 59; $4\frac{1}{2}$ x 7 inches (full sheet): bound in paper: no marginal notes or references. The upper portion of the title-page is occupied by the Siamese title in Siamese characters: the lower portion contains the title in English, as above. The book is printed throughout in the Siamese characters. There is a copy in the Foreign Mission Library of the Board of Foreign Missions of the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A., 156 Fifth avenue, New York: and we are indebted for a description of it to the librarian, Miss Susie A. Pinder.

[H. *Portuguese*. 1876] A Confissão de Fe' | da | Igreja Presby-
teriana | no | Brazil. | Rio de Janeiro: | Livraria Evangeli-
ca, | No. 15 Travessa da Barreira. | 1876.

12mo, pp. 96, $5\frac{3}{8}$ x $3\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type). Page 2 (back of title) is blank. Page 3 is occupied by a brief *Prefacio*, of historical character, in which are recounted the origin of the Confession, its adoption as their constitution by the Presbyterian Churches of Great Britian, the United States and the British Colonies, and its character as a concise and complete formulation of the Evangelical doctrine, and its relation to Scripture, not as a substitute for it, but simply as a convenient and useful coördination of its doctrines. "The following translation," it is remarked, "corresponds exactly to the Confession of Faith adopted by the Presbyterian Church of the United States." Page 4 is blank. The Confession occupies pp. 5-73, while p. 74 presents its table of contents: the text is accompanied with proof-references only, at the bottom of the page. Pages 75-76 contain the Apostles' Creed and the Ten Commandments. The rest of the volume is occupied by an epitome of the Form of Government and Discipline of the Presbyterian Church, [and of the Directory for Divine Worship], prepared by a Committee of the Presbytery of Rio de Janeiro (pp. 77-96).

This translation was made by the Rev. Dr. A. L. Blackford and the Rev. F. J. C. Schneider, members of the Brazilian Mission of the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A., aided by some of the native ministers. A thorough revision of it has been made by a Committee appointed by the Synod of Brazil at its first meeting, September, 1888; but it has not been found possible as yet to get the revised text printed, though long since ready for the press and greatly needed in the Mission. The Larger Catechism has been translated by and under the supervision of the Rev. Dr. J. Rockwell Smith, of the Brazilian Mission of the Presbyterian Church in the U. S., but has not yet been printed. Several editions of the Shorter Catechism have been issued.

There is a copy of this version of the Confession in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, for which it is indebted to the Rev. J. Beattie Howell, of Philadelphia.

[I. *Spanish*. 1880] Doctrinas | y | Reglamentos | de la Iglesia
Presbiteriana, | formulados | por la | Asamblea de Westmin-
ster; | conteniendo | La confesion de fé, Forma de Gobierno,
| Disciplina, | Directorio de culto | y Reglas para los tribu-
nales; | traducidos del Ingles | por | H. C. Thompson, | y | el
Catecismo menor. | Monterey. | Tipografia del Comercio. |
A. Lagrange y Ano. | 1880.

8vo, pp. 334; $6\frac{1}{2}$ x $4\frac{1}{4}$ inches (block of type). Page 2 (back of title) is blank. Page 3 contains a translation of the preface prefixed to the 12mo edition of *The*

Confession of Faith and Shorter Catechism, issued by the Board of Publication as tract No. 211 (from 1859)—see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January, 1902, p. 106, No. lvi. The Confession of Faith occupies pp. 5-161: the text of each section being followed by the proof-texts *in extenso*, in slightly smaller type. Page 162 is blank. The Shorter Catechism occupies pp. 163-210, closing with the Lord's Prayer, Ten Commandments and Creed on pp. 211-212: the text of each Question being followed by the proof-texts *in extenso*, in somewhat smaller type. Page 213 is a new title-page: Gobierno y Disciplina | de la | Iglesia Presbiteriana. The rest of the volume accordingly (to p. 323) is occupied by these two "books"—closing on p. 323 with a "Reconocimiento," signed by "H. C. Thompson, Traductor," thanking the Rev. T. F. Wallace for having translated the major part of what precedes. Pages 324-334 contain an "Indice," a "Fé de Erratas" occupying the lower quarter of p. 334.

The Rev. Dr. Henry C. Thompson, the translator of this version, was for twenty-one years a missionary in Mexico: he is said to have been aided in his work of translation by the Rev. Panfilo Prieto. The book ever since its issue has been constantly used as a text-book for the training of candidates for the ministry. When the edition was exhausted, a new translation was made from the English, on the basis of Dr. Thompson's, by the Rev. Plutarcho Arellano, under the supervision of the Rev. Dr. Hubert W. Brown. For this revision, see below, No. P.

There is a copy of this translation in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, for which it is indebted to Dr. H. W. Brown's kindness.

[J. *Japanese*. 1880] [In Japanese characters:] Uesutomisuteru shinko kajō zen.

That is to say: "Westminster Articles of Faith, Complete." 6½ x 4 inches (block of type), pp. 2 [= Errata], 4 (= Table of Contents), 109 (= Text), [1 = blank], with cover on which is pasted a slip bearing the title. There is no title-page; and no date, name of printer or place of issue, is recorded.

The history of this translation is embodied in the following two extracts from letters. "The original Constitution of what is now (since 1890) called the Church of Christ in Japan opens with this paragraph: 'The Canons of the Synod of Dort, the Westminster Confession of Faith and Shorter Catechism and the Heidelberg Catechism, as received in this Church, are the recognized Standards of Doctrine, and all office-bearers are required not to teach or maintain any doctrine contrary to said Standards.' The first Presbytery of the Church was organized in October, 1877. At that time the Shorter Catechism had been translated and printed; and the Heidelberg Catechism also, I think. The other Standards had not been translated. Accordingly, at the meeting of the Presbytery held in October, 1879 [1878?], Dr. Hepburn was appointed to translate the Westminster Confession, and Dr. Verbeck to translate the Canons of the Synod of Dort. Their translations were presented to the Presbytery at its meeting in October, 1879, and formally adopted at the meeting in October, 1880. For a number of years the two Catechisms were widely used; but neither the Westminster Confession nor the Canons of the Synod of Dort has ever been used to any extent. They were printed by the Mission. There are no copies of the translation of the Westminster Confession in stock. . . . There was no second edition. Our Mission has published three editions of the Shorter Catechism: the original translation, made by Dr. Hepburn about 1875 or 1876; a revised edition, also by Dr. Hepburn, some years later; a second revised edition by Dr. Alexander and Mr. MacNair, some six or seven years ago. There was also a translation published by Mr. Tamura." (Letter from the Rev. Dr. William Imbrie, Tokyo, March 15, 1901.) "I translated the Westminster Confession of Faith into the Japanese language in the year 1880, at the request of the Presbyterian Mission in Eastern Japan. There were 500 copies published at the expense of the Mission,

and a sufficient number circulated. I also translated the Shorter Catechism, which has been widely circulated. The Larger Catechism has not yet been translated, to my knowledge. In connection with Dr. Verbeck I also translated the Book of Discipline. The Form of Government was much altered to suit the conditions in Japan, and translated into the Japanese; by whom or when I know not. I may say that the Westminster Confession of Faith was never acceptable to the Presbyterian Church in Japan, and after a great deal of discussion the Apostles' Creed with a short prelude was adopted as their Confession in 1890." (Letter from Dr. J. C. Hepburn, East Orange, N. J., March 13, 1901.)

There are copies of the Japanese versions of the Westminster Confession and of the Canons of Dort in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, the gift of the Rev. James W. Doughty, of Hiroshima, Japan.

[K. *Chinese*. 1881] [In Chinese characters:] Sing Dao Chee Yao Shu.

That is to say: "Statement of the Cardinal Doctrines of the Faith." $7\frac{3}{8} \times 5$ inches (block of type). Besides the outside title given above, there is an inside title-page, bearing the same title down the centre; and on the right of it (in Chinese) the date, "The Year of our Lord 1881"; and on the left of it (also in Chinese), at the top, "The Seventh Year of Kwangsü," and at the bottom, "Printed at the Chinese-American Book Establishment in Shanghai." The back of this title-page is blank. The text fills 99 pages: the 100th page is blank.

This version appears to have been begun by Dr. Culbertson. It was at all events brought to a completion by a Committee appointed by the Synod of China (of the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A.), and printed at the Mission Press, Shanghai, in 1881. It is a good translation and is used by all the Presbyterian Missions in China, especially in training native workers. Dr. P. F. Price, of Sinchang, for example, writes (March 22, 1901): "We have persistently taught the Confession to those who can understand it, and require of our office-bearers not a nominal but an actual knowledge of its contents. I require of my own students to commit it to memory, and the results of the use of the Standards in teaching have encouraged us to hold to them more tenaciously and tenderly than ever." Besides the Confession, the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, Form of Government, Book of Discipline and Directory for Worship of the American Presbyterian Church have all been translated into Chinese (the Shorter Catechism and Form of Government by the Rev. Dr. W. A. P. Martin). Copies of the whole series are in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, the gift of the Rev. Dr. G. F. Fitch, of the Mission Press, Shanghai.

[L. *Arabic*. 1883] [In Arabic characters:] Nizâmu 'lkanîsati 'lmashihiyyati | 'lmutadamminu | 'l'ikrâra bi'l'imâni | wamulḥataṣarahu 'alâ sûrati su'âlin wajawâbin | wakawânîna siyâsati 'lkanîsati | watartîba 'l'ibâdati ma'a sûrati 'l'ahdi 'alladhî yata'ahadu | bihi 'ldâhilûna 'ilâ sharkati 'lkanîsati. | Bayrût 1883. |

Small 8vo, pp. 97, $5\frac{3}{8} \times 3\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type). The back of the title is blank and the last page is blank: the last twenty pages (78-97) are occupied with the Shorter Catechism. The text of the Confession begins on p. 3 without preliminary of any kind and runs to p. 77: it is accompanied by proof-references only, at the foot of each page. There is no binding or cover of any kind: but the sewed sheets only. The edition has never been published, and only 50 trial copies were prepared.

The history of this translation has been kindly communicated by the Rev. Dr. H. H. Jessup, of Beirut, as follows. On January 17, 1881, the Syria Mission requested the Rev. C. V. A. Van Dyck, D.D., the translator of the Scriptures into Arabic, to translate into Arabic the Confession of Faith of the Presbyterian Church; and Dr. Van Dyck reported the completion of the translation in August, 1881, and on December 18, 1882, the addition to it of a translation of the Form of Government, whereupon he was authorized to print at once. On August 22, 1883, the Press Committee having stated that unavoidable delay had occurred in printing the Confession of Faith and reporting progress, it was voted "that their report be accepted and that they be instructed to print tentatively 50 copies of the present translation and to correspond with neighboring Missions, that an expression of approval may be obtained, and that an opportunity may be afforded missionaries to suggest modifications in the translation." These 50 copies were printed and copies were sent to Egypt, Damascus and Latakiah, to the Missions of the United Presbyterian, Irish Presbyterian and the Reformed Presbyterian Churches, all of whom approved the translation. "As, however, there was a general expectation that the General Assembly in America would soon order a revision of the Confession, it was thought best to postpone publication until this question should be definitely settled." Accordingly there have been printed only the original 50 trial copies.

The Larger Catechism has not yet been translated into Arabic. The Form of Government in Arabic was duly published in 1894. The Arabic Shorter Catechism has gone through many editions: there are copies of the first edition (1885) without and of the sixth (1898) with proofs in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton. There are copies also of the Form of Government and of the Confession of Faith in this library. All these were presented by the Rev. Dr. Henry H. Jessup, of Beirut.

[M. Benga. 188-] . . .

There exists in manuscript a translation of the Confession into Benga, made by the late Rev. Cornelius de Heer, of the (then) "Gaboon and Corisco Mission" (which is now the "West Africa Mission"). All efforts to obtain funds to have it printed have hitherto failed. Meanwhile it has been used in MS. for the instruction of students and native pastors. The following specimen passage of this translation (chap. I, § 1) has been kindly furnished by Mrs. de Heer:

I. Tombekete bwe ya mwanyo, na behavu bea ivela na ibandamidě, salakate bwamu, iyowě, na ngudi ya Anyamě sasě nonaně, dikango bato ba diyepě na ponda; ndi be 'bě twětwe n' ivě ja yowěyowě tě ya Anyambě na ya npango uwaju, e di na mala o iyonga; ovaně vākāna o begombe beitě, na betingidi bea mangā-mangā, e tândākiděndi Upangiya ka levidě Mā mětě, na ka paknwa tyātyi aju upango t' umwaju mně; na mbuhwěmbnhwě, o pělě ya itatidi na ihamanidi via pákwěpákwě viyamu wa, n' itědě na iyādiyě ja tyātyi yěmiděngo pě wa oviya ibeva ja mehoni, na ekola ya Setan na ya he, ka vėkě mā upango tě mwěhěpi o bo lěnděkě: bo pangakě Malěndwě ma Hole ma diyaka mala mětě wa; meala tě mea boho meně mea Anyambě me ma levakidě upango mwaju o bato bajn bajadi me diyendi mea dā kya-tėkaně.

Mrs. de Heer (September 9, 1901) writes: "We hoped much from its introduction among our native pastors and elders placed in charge of organizations constantly increasing in numbers. It seemed so essential that foundations should be carefully laid in the very outset." "We have long had the Catechism in the Benga," she adds, "and scores have committed it to memory." This translation of the Catechism was the work of the Rev. John Menaul. The Shorter Catechism has been translated also into Mpongwe.

The place of the Confession of Faith as a text-book is perhaps partly supplied by the Rev. Dr. Henry R. Weed's well-known *Questions on the Confession of Faith and Form of Government of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of Amer-*

ica, with a Selection of the Scripture Proofs, which was translated into the Benga language by the Rev. Cornelius de Heer and published in a volume containing, with it, a Benga translation of Dr. Archibald Alexander's *Brief Compend of Bible Truth*. Dr. Weed's *Questions* occupy the latter half of the volume (pp. 137-237), and have the following Benga title-page (in addition to an English one): Nyuwe | o | Imēmē J' Ikamide | na | Jângā Ja Ipangiyedi | Ja Tyâtyi Ea Presbyterian | Na Ndaga Ja Masulē Ja Bo Pânâkwe | Ja Matëndwē Ma Hole. | Lëndwēngo Na | Henry R. Weed, D.D. | Pendwēngo N' Ukalo Mwa Benga | Na | Rev. C. De Heer, | Gaboon and Corisco Mission. | New York : | Edward O. Jenkins' Sons, Printers, | 20 North William Street | [no date]. Pages 143-213 contain the Questions on the Confession of Faith ; pp. 215-231 those on the Form of Government ; pp. 231-233 those on the Ninth Chapter of the Directory for Worship ; and pp. 233-237 the Questions and Counsel prepared by Dr. Ashbel Green for the students of Princeton College during the revival of 1815. As is well known, these Questions on the Confession presuppose the Confession in the hands of the learner, and accordingly do not provide the answers but expect them to be derived from the Confession. Nevertheless, as many of them are so framed as to suggest the answer, and as there are others interspersed, not to be answered from the Confession, to which answers are given, the book in the hands of a careful teacher may be made very much a substitute for the Confession as an instrument of instruction.

[N. Gujarati. 1888] Westminster | Confession of Faith. || [In Gujarati language and characters : Westminster Vishvās-nāmū : | Translated from English into Gujarātī by Rev. J. v. S. Taylor. | Revised by members of the Presbytery of Kāthiāwār and Gujarāt, and published for the Irish Presbyterian Mission. | Printed at the Mission Press. | Surat : | 1888. | Price 8 annas.]

12mo ; pp. 384 ; 5 $\frac{1}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type), printed in Gujarati characters throughout. Pages 1-91 contain the Confession of Faith, with proof-references (not the passages) in double column at the foot of each page ; pp. 93-384 contain these proof-texts, quoted *in extenso*.

This translation was the last work of the Rev. Joseph van Someren Taylor, confessedly the best Gujarati scholar of his day in the Province, and in it is embodied the fruit of his ripe scholarship. He had completed his first draught of the translation in India, and had taken it home with him on his furlough in 1880. While staying in Edinburgh, he was on the morning of the 2d of June, 1881, looking over the MS. with a view to its correction and revision, when he was suddenly attacked with a rush of blood to his brain and passed away within fifteen or twenty minutes. After considerable delay the MS. was sent out to Gujarat and a Committee was appointed to revise it carefully and prepare it for publication. It appeared from the Mission press at Surat in 1888.

There is a copy of this version in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, for which it is indebted to the kindness of the Rev. George P. Taylor, of Ahmadabad, who writes of the version as follows (February 4, 1901): "The majesty of the style" of the English original is well preserved in this Gujarati translation, which is admirable throughout. It is our text-book for the classes of Systematic Theology attended by the students of the 2d, 3d and 4th years of the Stevenson Divinity College. In each of these years one-third of the Confession of Faith is taken up and very carefully expounded, so that at the end of the four-years' course the students will have made a full study of the entire Confession. In these classes it has been my practice to

dictate to the students a synopsis of Dr. A. A. Hodge's Commentary on the Confession."

[O. *Persian*. 189-]. . . .

There is a manuscript translation into Persian, which has not been printed. The Rev. J. L. Potter, of Tcheran, writes in a letter of June 20, 1901, as follows: "A few years ago I translated the Westminster Confession of Faith into Persian, by direction of the Station, and the MS. copy was used as a basis for the Elders of the native Church to request the Eastern Persian Presbytery to receive the Church under its care. Having examined the Confession and approved it, they made the request and the Church was taken under care of Presbytery. It has not been printed, and there was some discussion at one meeting of our Presbytery as to the technical terms in the translation of the section as to the Trinity."

Into none of the other languages spoken in Persia has the Confession of Faith been translated. The Shorter Catechism has been issued in Persian, Syriac, Azerbaijan Turkish, and both Turkey and Ararat Armenian: and the Larger Catechism has been translated into Azerbaijan Turkish, but not printed.

[P. *Spanish*. 1896 and 1897] Constitución | de la | Iglesia Presbiteriana | en los | Estados Unidos de America, | conteniendo | La Confesión de Fe, Forma de | Gobierno, Libro de Disciplina y | Directorio para el culto Publico | de Dios, | según fueron ratificados y adoptados por | el Sinodo de Nueva York y el de Filadelfia | en al año de Nuestro Señor 1788, | y corregidos en los años de | 1805-1892. | La Obra de Tratados en Español, | Albuquerque, New Mexico, | 1896.

Small 8vo, pp. 154 [4 = "Indice"], 5 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). Pages 1 and 2 are blank. Page 4 (back of title) contains a "Prefacio," giving an account of this edition and commending the book. Pages 5-58 contain the Confession of Faith: the text is printed with the proof-texts, by references only, interjected at the proper places in its midst: an occasional footnote occurs, some of which (*e.g.*, at Conf. xxviii, 7, xxix, 4) belong to the English, but at least one (at Conf. vi, 1, on God's permission of sin) is new to this book. Pages 59-126 contain the "Forma de Gobierno y Formas de Procedimientos de la Iglesia Presbiteriana en los Estados Unidos de America; reformados en 1805-1806;" and pages 127-152, the "Directorio para el Culto de Dios en la Iglesia Presbiteriana en los Estados Unidos de America; reformando en 1789-1886." On p. 153 occurs the Constitutional Rule adopted in 1893. Page 154 is blank: and the "Indice" closes the book, occupying 4 unnumbered pages.

This version was made by the Rev. Plutarco Arellano, under the supervision of the Rev. Dr. Hubert W. Brown. It is based on the earlier version of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. Thompson (see above, No. I): and appears to have been made from the English issue of the Board of Publication of 1894 (see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January, 1902, No. lxviii). It is printed in an inexpensive form at the press of the Rev. John Menaul, now of Albuquerque, New Mexico.

Mr. Arellano was educated at the Theological Seminary of the Mexican Presbyterian Church at Tlalpan, entered the ministry in 1885 and has been pastor successively in Chilpancingo, Vera Cruz and Mexico City. He is at present the Business Manager of the Mission Press at Mexico City and co-redactor of the Mission paper, *El Furo*. He has made a translation of the

Larger Catechism also, which, revised by the Rev. C. C. Millar and Rev. Hubert W. Brown, is just issued from the press. The Shorter Catechism has been repeatedly issued. The first translation of it was published in Philadelphia in 1860.* That incorporated in Dr. Thompson's edition of the Confession (above, No. I) was largely the work of the Rev. Thomas F. Wallace, and was issued separately in Mexico City, 1882. The latest edition is the work of the Rev. H. B. Pratt and bears the title: El | Catecismo Menor | de la | Asamblea de Westminster | Formulando en 1646 | Nuevamente Traducido al Castellano | Laredo, Texas, E. U. A. | 1899. |

The relation of the two texts of the Confession in Spanish may be observed from the following specimens :

DR. THOMPSON'S TEXT, 1880.

I, 1. Aunque la luz de la naturaleza y las obras de la Creacion y de la Providencia, manifiestan la bondad, sabiduría y poder de Dios, de tal manera que los hombres quedan sin excusa; sin embargo, no son suficientes para dar aquel conocimiento de Dios y de su voluntad, que es necesario para la salvacion; por cuya razon plugo á Dios en varios tiempos, y de diversas maneras, revelarse ó declarar su voluntad á sa iglesia; y ademas para mejor conservar y propagar la verdad, y para el mejor consuelo y establecimiento de la iglesia contra la corrupcion de la carne, la malicia de Satanás y del mundo, le plugo ponerlo todo en escrito; por lo cual, las Sagradas Escrituras son muy necesaria; y mas, puesto que han cesado ya los modos anteriores par los cuales Dios reveló su voluntad á su pueblo.

MR. ARELLANO'S TEXT, 1896.

I, 1. Aunque la luz de la naturaleza y las obras de creación y de providencia manifiestan la bondad, sabiduria y poder de Dios de tal manera que los hombres quedan sin excusa, sin embargo, no son suficientes para dar aquel conocimiento de Dios y de su voluntad que es necesario para la salvación; par lo que plugo á Dios en varios tiempos y de diversas maneras, revelarse á si mismo y declarar su voluntad á su Iglesia, y además, para conservar y propagar mejor la verdad y para el mayor consuelo y establecimiento de la Iglesia contra la corrupción de la carne, malicia de Satanás y del mundo, le plugo dejar esa revelación par escrito, por todo lo cual las Santas Escrituras son muy necesarias, y tanto más cuanto que han cesado ya los modos anteriores cuales Dios reveló su voluntad á su Iglesia.

The text of 1896, in a still further revised form, is incorporated in the translation of Dr. A. A. Hodge's *Commentary on the Confession of Faith*, which appeared in Mexico in 1897 with the following title: "Comentario | de | La Confesion de Fe | de Westminster | de la Iglesia Presbiteriana. | por el | Rev. Archibald Alexander Hodge | doctor en teologia y en leges | y profesor de teologia | en el Seminario Teológico de Princeton. | Traducido par el | Rev. Plutarco Arellano. | Mexico, | Imprenta Universal de David C. Smith, | 1897. |" Large 8vo, pp. xxii, 397: p. vii has a brief note by the translator, and pp. iii and iv a preface to the Spanish edition by Dr. Hubert W. Brown. Oddly enough the edition of the Commentary used for the translation was the first, of 1869 (see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January, 1902, p. 107, No. lix), although the second edition had been in the market since 1885 (see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January, 1902, p. 108, No. lxiii).

This translation of the Confession is in constant use in the training of candidates for the ministry in Mexico, and its value is testified to by all the

* There is an earlier Shorter Catechism in Spanish, by R. Young (Edinburgh [1855]).

missionaries. The Rev. A. T. Graybill, for example, writes: "We emphasize these translations of our Standards as the most effective means of teaching our theological students the doctrines of the Bible, as well as the most effective means of building up intelligent Christian character among the young and adult members of our congregations." (Letter of February 22, 1901.)

There are copies both of the edition of 1896 and of the Commentary of 1897 in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, for which it is indebted to the kindness of the Rev. Messrs. H. W. Brown and A. T. Graybill.

PRINCETON.

BENJAMIN B. WARFIELD.

THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW

No. 51—July, 1902.

I.

THE EPISTEMOLOGICAL ARGUMENT FOR THEISM.

IT is not difficult to understand the influence exerted by the Kantian philosophy during the last few decades. To an individual or a generation, engrossed in the study of science and indisposed to metaphysical speculation, averse to materialism and skepticism and moving in the direction of faith, the standpoint of Kant offers much attraction. It combines two signal advantages. It authenticates the concepts employed in science; it provides an independent basis for religion. In both these respects its superiority as a working philosophic theory to positivism is obvious. The late Professor Huxley enthusiastically extolled Hume as of all philosophers the most satisfactory to a scientific mind. But Hume deprives science of its metaphysical foundations; he denies philosophical validity to the idea of causation, and resolves the universe into unrelated atoms. It seems infelicitous that a speculation which invalidates the notions indispensable to scientific reasoning should be regarded with approval by men devoted to the interpretation of nature. The Kantian doctrine is preferable in that it expressly vindicates the concepts which underlie our mathematical and our inductive science.

The other advantage mentioned is of even greater consequence. "Our most holy religion," says Hume, in the *Essay on Miracles*, "is founded on faith, not on reason." Kant uses similar language: "I must abolish knowledge, to make room for belief." His meaning, however, is entirely different. To Hume, religion is a superstition, a product of custom and imagination; to Kant,

III.

THE PRINTING OF THE WESTMINSTER CONFESSION.

IV. IN MODIFICATION.

IT is not merely in its pure form, as it came from the hands of the Assembly of Divines, that the Westminster Confession has been put into circulation. Perhaps we may even say that during these later years it is not in its pure form that it has been most widely influential. If we wish to attain a complete view of the extent of its dissemination we must attend therefore as well to the modifications of it which have been published. With the nature of these modifications we have here nothing directly to do. We have merely to note the formal fact that modified forms of the Westminster Confession have been produced and sent out into the world.

These modified forms are not very numerous; but they began to be made very early in the history of the document, and they have usurped its place in the case of a very large portion of its constituency. Indeed, it was only in a modified form that the Westminster Confession received the authorization of the very body at whose behest it was prepared. That it was put into circulation in an unmodified form at all was due to the Scotch Church "stealing a march," so to speak, on the English Parliament. And it might almost be said that it is only in a modified form that it is in use to-day outside the limits of immediate Scotch influence. In all the large American Presbyterian Churches, for example, it is not the Westminster Confession precisely as the Assembly of Divines framed it, but the Westminster Confession in some respects modified, that has been adopted as their standard of faith. We must certainly bear in mind that there are modifications and modifications. Some may merely touch the periphery of the circle of doctrines which the document teaches, and may affect even its external form in only a minute manner. Some, while introducing a considerable amount of change in its form, may penetrate very little or not at all into the substance of its doctrine. Others may profoundly affect its whole point of view and revolutionize its

whole teaching. As a matter of fact, the Westminster Confession has been made the subject of modifications of all these sorts. But it is chiefly the less serious varieties of modification that have been introduced into it; and it is in its most slightly modified forms that its wider influence has been gained.

The production of modified forms of the Westminster Confession is of course the result of the existence from the very time of its publication of bodies of Christians who felt that it was expected of them to adopt it as the expression of their faith, but who found it in this or that point unacceptable to them, and were led to cut the knot by so far modifying it as to adapt it to their uses. It must be remembered that the Westminster Confession was the product of a national, or perhaps it would be speaking more properly to say of an international, movement. It was not the construction of a chance body of Christians voluntarily gathered together with a view to formulating their peculiar tenets. It was drawn up by a Synod appointed by the Parliament of England and assisted by delegates from Scotland, the task of which was to prepare a scheme of uniformity in religion for the Three Kingdoms. It came into the world, therefore, as a national Confession. As such it was adopted by the Church of Scotland, and as such it was published by the Parliament of England. It was impossible for any body of Christians in the Three Kingdoms to avoid attending to it.

Moreover, it did in effect express the reasoned faith of the great mass of British Protestants. It was impossible for any body of them to refuse to take some account of it without bringing their orthodoxy under the suspicion of their brethren. A certain moral pressure was thus brought to bear upon the Protestant bodies of Great Britain and its colonies by the confessed excellence and generally representative character of the document, which almost compelled them to give it at least a modified acceptance. But fairly representative as it was of the substance of the general Protestant faith, there were minor points of teaching in the document against which this or the other party was bearing passionate protest. It was the very essence of the Independent contention that was struck at in the Westminster doctrine of Church organization and government. And what was the distinction of the Christian congregations who spoke of themselves as those "baptized upon profession of their faith," except their peculiar views on the subjects and mode of baptism? As it was inevitable that these Christians should have to face the unspoken demand that they should orient themselves with respect to the Westminster Confession, it was equally inevitable that they should

wish to set forth forms of it in which their peculiar views should find recognition or at least meet with no open contradiction. Thus, from the first, Independent and Baptist recensions of the Westminster Confession, at least, were foregone conclusions—unless, indeed, the document should fall dead from the press. And the early production of these recensions is the proof that, despite the untoward turn of circumstances which rendered impossible of attainment the main object of the Assembly of Divines—the institution of uniformity of religion in the Three Kingdoms on a sound Reformed basis—the Westminster Confession did not fall dead from the press. Every great branch of Non-Conformists in England adjusted itself to it and gave it, in a form adapted to its special opinions on minor matters, the cordial testimony of public acceptance. Thus the Westminster Confession in its substance became in fact practically the common Confession of the entirety of British non-prelatical Christianity.

The earliest modification of the Westminster Confession was the work of the English Parliament itself, acting in the Independent interest, and was produced even before the Confession was authoritatively published in England. It was thus and thus only in fact that the Confession was offered to the English Churches by the constituted authorities. The edition of the Confession published by Parliament at the end of June, 1648, under the title of *Articles of Christian Religion, approved and passed by both Houses of Parliament, after advice had with the Assembly of Divines by authority of Parliament sitting at Westminster*—the only edition of the Confession published by the authority of the State—is in effect the Independent recension of the Confession. The growing Independent influence had sufficed to secure that all that was offensive to that party should be excised from the document before it was put forth as the lawfully ordained public Confession of Faith of the Church of England. The chief bone of contention here concerned, of course, the organization of the churches into a Church, provided with a series of courts clothed with authoritative jurisdiction. With this was involved the whole subject of Church discipline. And more remotely there came to be connected with it the question of a limited toleration, not so much of divergencies in doctrine as of differences in Church organization, government and forms of worship. To meet the case thus raised the Parliament simply struck out of the document the whole series of sections treating of Church government and discipline. Other changes were made: but they were minor and in a true sense incidental.

It was accordingly upon this Parliamentary recension that the

Independent divines built when, ten years later (1658), they met at the Savoy to frame a Declaration of their faith. They introduced many minor variations in phraseology, recast a whole chapter—that on Repentance—and indeed inserted a whole new chapter—on the Gospel; and here and there they sharpened or heightened the expression of the doctrines taught in the document. But only in the two points of Church government and “discipline” and of “toleration” did they modify greatly its teaching. Their modified Confession had little prolonged circulation or influence, it is true, among the Independent Churches of England; these are found generally continuing to use the unaltered Westminster formularies. But in the New World it made for itself a richer history. Adopted both by the Massachusetts (1680) and Connecticut (1708) Churches as their standard of belief, it constituted for many years the public Confession of American Congregationalists, and indeed lighted the pathway of these Churches down almost to our own day. It is interesting to observe, however, that the American Congregationalists in adopting the Savoy recension resiled from its introduction into the document of the principle of “toleration,” thus bidding us to take note that its introduction by the English Independents was rather incident to their position than a settled principle of Independent belief. Independents suffering disabilities and Independents in position to inflict disabilities for religion’s sake, took opposite views of the relation of the civil magistrate to religious teaching. It was reserved to Presbyterians, after all, to make the “intolerant” teaching of the Westminster Confession a really constraining ground for modifying the document. The Independent modifications turned, as on their hinge, rather on matters concerned with Church courts: all else was incidental to this and liable to variations and the shadows cast by turning.

Meanwhile the English Baptists had been defining their relation to the Westminster Confession and had published a modification of it of their own (1677). As good Independents, they naturally took their start from the Savoy Declaration (1658), still further interpolating and filing it, and, of course, incorporating into it their own views as to baptism. It cannot be said that this Baptist recension exhibits quite the same degree of skill and learning that characterized the work done by the Savoy Synod: but it does exhibit equal fervor of religious feeling and equal devotion to the Reformed faith. In it the influence of the Independent recension of the Westminster Confession attained its height, and through it perhaps the Westminster teaching itself has reached its widest dissemination. For no more than its parent document did

this Baptist recension remain the property of its English framers : it too crossed the sea, and in 1742 became the standard expression of the faith of the American Baptists, who have grown into a great host. If the Westminster divines had done nothing else than lay down the lines upon which the great Baptist denomination has built its creed, its influence on the Christian faith and life of the masses would have been incalculably great.

In the new conditions of political life in free America the definition of the Westminster Confession of the relations of the civil magistrate to the Church could not fail to be thrown forward into a fierce light. As we have seen, the English Independents had already, somewhat incidentally, excised the "intolerant" features of the Confession and had been followed in this by the Baptists: though the American Congregationalists, occupying themselves the seat of the civil magistrate, had restored the objectionable principle. The fact is that in the seventeenth century "toleration" was rather a sentiment of the oppressed than a reasoned principle of Christian ethics: while unrestricted "religious liberty" had scarcely risen on the horizon of men's thoughts. Whatever was done toward freeing the Westminster Confession from "intolerant principles" in that age was therefore fitful and unstable, and rather a measure of self-protection than the consistent enunciation of a thoroughly grasped fundamental principle. Thus it happened that the American Presbyterians were the first to prepare modifications of the Westminster Confession which turned on the precise point of the duty of universal toleration, or rather of the fundamental right of unrestricted religious liberty. The first of these modifications in the interests of the principle of religious freedom and the equality of all forms of religious faith before the law, was that made by the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America in 1788. The Associate-Reformed Church followed in the same pathway in 1799; and the United Presbyterian Church has continued this testimony in its own way ever since its formation in 1858. Thus it has come about that practically the whole body of American Presbyterians has cleansed the Westminster Confession from every phrase which could by any form of interpretation be made to favor intolerance and has substituted the broadest assertion of religious liberty.

It will have been observed that no one of the modifications thus far adverted to in any way affected the scheme of doctrine of the Confession. The Independents, Baptists, American Presbyterians alike gave the heartiest assent to the Reformed faith as set forth in this Confession; and it was only because they recognized in its form of sound words the expression of their fundamental

belief that they busied themselves with adjusting it in minor matters to their opinions and practices. The opening nineteenth century saw the rise, however, in what was then the extreme western portion of the United States, of a body of Christians who by inheritance were so related to the Westminster Confession that they found it difficult to discard it altogether, but who in their fundamental theology had drifted away from the Reformed faith, to which it gives so clear and well-compacted an expression. By this combination of circumstances there was produced at last a modification of the Westminster Confession, which was directed not to the adjustment of details of teaching that lay on the periphery of its system of doctrine, but to the dissection out of it of its very heart. An Arminianized Westminster Confession is something of a portent: yet it is just this that the Cumberland Presbyterians sought to frame for themselves (1814), and to which, having in a fashion framed it, they clung for nearly three-quarters of a century.

Of course the Confession thus formed was never satisfactory even to its framers. To Arminianize the Westminster Confession with any thoroughness would leave to it only the general literary tone of its phraseology and its outlying definitions of secondary importance, while all that is really distinctive of it as a Confession of Faith would be extirpated. It required, however, about seventy years for the Arminian leaven placed in the Confession by the Cumberland Presbyterians to leaven the whole lump. The first reworking they gave it, though definitely directed to eliminating from it its formative doctrine—the Reformed doctrine of the sovereignty of God—left the larger part of the document intact. Every direct statement of the doctrine of the divine determination of human destiny was expunged, but the general tone of the document remained untouched. The result was felt by the Cumberland Presbyterians themselves to be eminently unsatisfactory. They perceived that the casting out of what they called “the boldly defined statements” of foreordination was insufficient for their end, and only succeeded in bringing the document into conflict with itself; for, as they truly said, “the objectional doctrine with its logical sequences pervaded the whole system of theology formulated in that book.” They perceived equally that their own Arminianizing principle was not given its full logical development by the substitution of statements announcing it for the Reformed statements expunged from the Confession. It was thus inevitable that the Confession prepared by them in 1814 should sooner or later be further “modified,” and the revolution then begun be made complete. The time seemed to be ripe for this early

in the ninth decade of the century : and in 1883 an entirely new Confession was adopted by the Cumberland Presbyterians which is so drastic a "modification" of the Westminster Confession as to retain nothing of its most distinctive character and very little even of its secondary features. In this document "modification" has stretched beyond its tether and become metamorphosis.

In the course of the two hundred and fifty years that have elapsed since its formulation the Westminster Confession has thus been sent out into the world in some half-dozen modifications. Some of these modifications concern so small a portion and so subordinate an element in the document that it becomes doubtful whether the publications in which they are embodied should not be rather treated as editions than as modifications of it. The Parliamentary edition of 1648 and the Confessions of the American Presbyterian Churches belong to this class : and we have accordingly listed them among the editions of the Westminster Confession in the bibliographies published in *THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW* for October, 1901, and January, 1902. That we include them also in the list of modifications presently to be given is in the interests of a complete enumeration of these modifications in one place and need create no confusion. Others of these modifications, while so far transforming the document that they cannot be treated as mere editions of it, are yet fully conservative of the whole system of doctrine taught in it and retain its general structure and the greater part of its very phraseology. In this class belong the Savoy Declaration of 1658 and its descendants in the Boston Confession of 1635 and the Saybrook Confession of 1708, on the one hand, and in the Baptist Confession of 1677 on the other. The Cumberland Presbyterian recensions stand in a class by themselves as an extreme case of modification, striking at the very heart of the Confession and able to result in nothing other than its destruction.

In the following notes we have brought together as full an account of these several modifications as seemed necessary in order to trace the diffusion of the Westminster Confession in the new forms thus given it. We have not attempted to record all the editions in which the several modifications have been issued ; but have contented ourselves with referring the reader, when possible, to sources of information in which they can be traced. Only in the case of the Cumberland Presbyterian Confessions, whose history has not hitherto been thoroughly worked out, have we sought fullness of record.

NOTES TOWARD A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE
WESTMINSTER CONFSSION.

IV. MODIFICATIONS.*

- [a. *The Parliamentary Recension, 1648*] “ARTICLES | of | Christian Religion, | Approved and Passed by both Houses | of PARLIAMENT, | After Advice had with the Assembly | of | DIVINES | by Authority of Parliament sitting at | Westminster. | London: | . . . June 27, 1648 ”—(SCHAFF).

4to, pp. —. For an account of this edition, see MITCHELL, *The Westminster Assembly, etc.*, pp. 379 and 526; and *Minutes*, p. 412 sq. (especially 416); SHAW, *History of the English Church During the Civil Wars, etc.*, I, 365; SCHAFF, *Creeeds of Christendom*, I, 753, and especially 758-9. There are copies in the British Museum, “116, f. 19”; E. 449”; “T. $\frac{1013}{18}$ ”; and also in the Bodleian. Cf. the account of it given in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, October, 1901, pp. 221-224 (No. 8).

The dealing of the Parliament with the work of the Westminster Assembly constitutes a very excellent anemometer for measuring how the political wind was from time to time blowing. When the text of the Confession was reported to the Commons, the Independent influence was rising; delays in dealing with it were made; and by the time that the work of reviewing it was completed, the Independents were strong enough to secure the discarding from the document of all in it that provided for church courts and church discipline. The Parliamentary edition of the Confession published in the midsummer of 1648 is, therefore, distinctively the Independent recension of the formulary, and was received as such by the Independent party. The Independent divines met at the Savoy ten years later, accordingly, speak of it as their own recension and make complaint that it had been practically superseded by the Presbyterian recension in the use of the Churches. The account they give of the proceedings of Parliament in framing their redaction of the document is worth quoting. The Parliament, they say, “thought it not convenient to have matters of *Discipline* and *Church-Government* put into a *Confession of Faith*, especially such particulars thereof, as there were, and still are controverted and under dispute by men Orthodox and sound in Faith. The 30th cap. therefore of that Confession, as it was presented to them by the Assembly, which is of *Church-Censures*, their *Use*, *Kindes*, and in *whom placed*: As also cap. 31. of *Synods and Councils*, by *whom* to be called, of *what force* in their *decrees* and *determinations*. And the 4th paragr. of the 20th cap. which determines what *opinions* and practices *disturb the peace* of the Church, and how such disturbers ought to be *proceeded against* by the *Censures of the Church*, and punished by the *Civil Magistrate*. Also a great part of the 24th cap. of *Marriage* and *Divorce*. These were such doubtful assertions, and so unsuitable to a Confes-

* Our indebtedness for aid in making out these notes has been, more than in former portions of our task, rather to books than to individuals. We have freely used the material offered us in SCHAFF'S *Creeeds of Christendom* and WILLISTON WALKER'S *Creeeds and Platforms of Congregationalism*; as well as in the introductions and prefaces to the editions of the modifications recorded. For the descriptions of the editions of the Cumberland Presbyterian Confession we are indebted especially to the kindness of the Rev. Prof. J. V. STEPHENS, D.D., of Lebanon, Tenn., who has with great generosity supplied us with ample materials for a tolerably complete history of these formularies: for much guidance in studying the United Presbyterian Confession we are indebted to the Rev. Dr. JAMES HARPER, of Xenia, Ohio. Other obligations are acknowledged in the course of the notes themselves.

sion of Faith, as the *Honorable Houses* in their great Wisdom thought fit to lay them aside: There being nothing that tends more to heighten dissentings among Brethren, then to determine and adopt the *matter* of their *difference*, under so high a title, as to be an *Article of our Faith*." (Preface to the *Savoy Declaration*—written by John Owen—as given by WILLISTON WALKER, *The Creeds and Platforms of Congregationalism*, New York: 1893, p. 363.)

The changes made by the Parliament for their recension are enumerated by Dr. Mitchell (*loc. cit.*), and are set down in the margin of Mr. Wm. Carruther's edition of the original text of the Westminster Confession (see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, October, 1901, p. 658, No. 137). They are as follows:

Chap. xx, § 4. Omit the whole section.

Chap. xxiii, § 4. Instead of "to pay them tribute and other dues," read "to pay them their dues." Instead of "the magistrate's just and legal authority," read "the magistrates' just and legal authority." Instead of "obedience to him," read "obedience to them." Omit "much less hath the Pope . . . other pre-tence whatsoever."

Chap. xxiv, § 4. Omit "The man may not marry . . . them of her kin."

Chap. xxiv, § 5. Omit the whole section.

Chap. xxiv, § 6. Omit the whole section.

Chap. xxx. Omit the whole chapter.

Chap. xxxi. Omit the whole chapter.

This Parliamentary recension of the Confession was printed only in one edition and appears to have had little circulation. It was returned to, however, by the Savoy divines in 1658, and through their rehabilitation of it obtained a new life and influence in both England (in the Baptist Creed of 1677) and in America (through the Boston and Saybrook recensions of the Savoy Declaration).

[b. *The Savoy Recension, 1658*] "A | Declaration | of the | Faith and Order | Owned and practised in the | Congregational Churches | in | England; | Agreed upon and consented unto | By their | Elders and Messengers | in | Their Meeting at the Savoy, October 12. 1658. | ——— | ——— | London: | Printed by John Field, and are to be sold by | John Allen at the Sun Rising in Pauls | Church-yard, 1658"—(WALKER).

4to, pp. [xxx], 64. Four editions appeared at London in 1659; others followed in 1677, 1688, 1729; Ipswich, 1745; Oswestry, 1812. There are copies of the early editions in the libraries of the Massachusetts Historical Society, of Harvard University and Princeton Theological Seminary (the edition: London | Printed for D. L. | And are to be sold in Paul's Churchyard, Fleet | Street, and Westminster Hall, 1659). It has been reprinted in HANBURY'S *Memorials*, iii, 517-548, and WILLISTON WALKER'S *The Creeds and Platforms of Congregationalism*, 354-408. Compare also A. H. QUINT, *Congregational Quarterly*, July and October, 1866 (viii, 241 *sq.*, 341 *sq.*), and SCHAFF, *Creeds of Christendom*, iii, 707-729. WILLISTON WALKER, *op. cit.*, pp. 340 *sq.*, gives a list of the editions and some record of the best literature upon it, and an excellent account of its history. There is a Latin version, by Prof. Johannes Hoornbeek, Utrecht, 1662.

When Independency became ascendant in England the Congregationalist divines naturally desired to put forth a confessional statement which would more closely express their views than the Westminster formularies did, and the more so that the Parliamentary recension of the Westminster statement had obtained no circulation and only the Scotch editions of the Westminster Confession and those taken from them were accessible. Accordingly in 1658 a movement was set on foot, emanating apparently from those especially in the confidence of Cromwell, to call the Inde-

pendent Churches of the kingdom into conference for the purpose of framing a statement of their faith. The Synod, consisting of Messengers of about one hundred and twenty churches, met at the Savoy on September 29, 1659, and the duty of preparing and proposing a Confession was entrusted to a committee consisting of Thomas Goodwin, John Owen, Philip Nye, William Bridge, Joseph Caryl and William Greenhill, every one of whom except Owen had been a member of the Westminster Assembly. It was natural that the Westminster Confession, and that in its Parliamentary form, should be made the basis of their work: and they in fact confined themselves to preparing a revised edition of that formulary. They themselves give a very lucid account of their procedure, in the preface which they prefixed to the document—written, it is said, by John Owen. They say:

“In drawing up this *Confession of Faith*, we have had before us the *Articles of Religion*, approved and passed by both Houses of *Parliament*, after advice had with an *Assembly of Divines*, called together by them for that purpose. To which Confession, for the substance of it, we fully assent, as do our Brethren of *New England*, and the Churches also of *Scotland*, as each in their general Synods have testified.

“A few things we have added for obviating some erroneous opinions, that have been more broadly and boldly here of late maintained by the Asserters, than in former times; and made some other additions and alterations in *method*, here and there, and some clearer explanations, as we found occasion.

“We have endeavored throughout, to hold to such Truths in this our Confession, as are more properly termed *matters of Faith*; and what is of *Church-order* we dispose in certain Propositions by it self. To this course we are led by the Example of the Honorable *Houses of Parliament*, observing what was established, and what omitted by them in that *Confession* the Assembly presented to them. . . . So that there are two whole Chapters, and some Paragraphs in other Chapters in their Confession, that we have upon this account omitted; and the rather do we give this notice, because that Copy of the Parliaments, followed by us, is in few men's hands; the other as it came from the *Assembly*, being approved of in *Scotland*, was printed and hastened into the world before the *Parliament* had declared their Resolutions about it; which was not till *June 20. 1648.* and yet hath been, and continueth to be the Copy (ordinarily) onely sold, printed and reprinted for these *eleven years.*

“After the 19th *cap. of the Law*, we have added a *cap. of the Gospel*, it being a Title that may not well be omitted in a Confession of Faith: In which Chapter, what is dispersed, and by intimation in the Assemblies Confession with some little addition, is here brought together, and more fully under one head.

“That there are not Scriptures annexed as in some Confessions (though in divers others it's otherwise) we give the same account as did the *Reverend Assembly* in the same case: which was this; *The Confession being large, and so framed, as to meet with the common errors, if the Scriptures should have been alleadged with any clearness, and by shewing where the strength of the proof lieth, it would have required a volume.*” (*A Declaration of the Faith and Order Owned and Practiced in the Congregational Churches in England.* . . . London, 1658, pp. xx-xxii; as reprinted by WILLISTON WALKER in *The Creeds and Platforms of Congregationalism*, New York, 1893, pp. 362-3.)

The Savoy Declaration is thus put forward distinctly as merely a recension of the Westminster Confession, and as omitting from it only matters of Discipline and Church Government, conceived as having no proper place in a Confession of Faith. It is represented as not only preserving but emphasizing its whole doctrinal scheme, and as retouching its doctrinal definitions only for the sake of giving more distinct explanations of the doctrines there expounded or of bringing them

into more pointed opposition to errors grown more rampant since their first enunciation.

The text of the Savoy Declaration in its relation to the Westminster Confession can be most conveniently studied in its reprint by Professor WILLISTON WALKER (*op. cit.*) who has carefully indicated by black-faced type and footnotes all its variations from the earlier document. Cf. also Dr. Quint's and Dr. Schaff's presentations (*opp. cit.*). The following list of the variations will enable the reader to reconstruct the Declaration from the Westminster Confession, and to form an estimate of the amount and nature of the modifications made by it.

Chap. i, § 2. Omit "The Gospels according to."

Chap. i, § 2. Add "the" before "inspiration."

Chap. i, § 8. Omit "the" from "time of *the* writing."

Chap. i, § 10. Instead of "the Holy Spirit speaking in the Scripture," read "the holy Scripture delivered by the Spirit; into which Scripture so delivered, our Faith is finally resolved."

Chap. ii, § 2. Instead of "the alone foundation," read "the alone Fountain."

Chap. ii, § 2. Instead of "whatsoever . . . Obedience he is pleased to require of them," read "whatsoever . . . Obedience, as Creatures, they owe unto the Creator, and whatever he is further pleased to require of them."

Chap. ii, § 3. Add at end: "Which Doctrine of the Trinity is the foundation of all our Communion with God, and comfortable Dependence upon him."

Chap. iii, § 6. Last clause, insert "or" between "redeemed by Christ" and "effectually called."

Chap. iv, § 1. Insert "out" between "make" and "of nothing."

Chap. v, § 1. Instead of "to" before "his infallible" read "unto."

Chap. v, § 4. Insert "in" after "Providence" (by mere printer's slip?).

Chap. v, § 4. Instead of "it" before "extendeth," read "his determinate Counsel."

Chap. v, § 4. Instead of "and that not by a bare permission, but such as hath joined with it a most wise and powerful binding and otherwise ordering and governing of them," read "(and that not by a bare permission) which also he most wisely and powerfully boundeth, and otherwise ordereth and governeth."

Chap. v, § 4. Insert "most" before "holy ends."

Chap. v, § 5. Instead of "unto" after "support," read "upon."

Chap. vi, § 1. Instead of "Our first parents, being seduced by the subtilty and temptation of Satan, sinned in eating the forbidden fruit. This their sin God was pleased, according to his wise and holy counsel, to permit, having proposed to order it to his own glory," read "God having made a Covenant of Works and Life, thereupon, with our first parents and all their posterity in them, they being seduced by the subtilty and temptation of Satan, did wilfully transgress the Law of their Creator, and break the Covenant in eating the forbidden fruit."

Chap. vi, § 2. After "By this sin they," add "and we in them."

Chap. vi, § 2. After "fell from," omit "their."

Chap. vi, § 3. After "They being the Root," insert "and by God's appointment standing in the room and stead."

Chap. vi, § 3. After "was imputed and," omit "the same death in sin and."

Chap. vii, § 1. Instead of "never have any fruition of him as their blessedness and reward," read "never have attained the reward of life."

Chap. vii, §§ 5 and 6. Substitute for these two sections the following: "5. Although this Covenant hath been differently and variously administered in respect of Ordinances and Institutions in the time of the Law, and since the coming of Christ in the flesh; yet for the substance and efficacy of it, to all its spiritual and saving ends, it is one and the same; upon the account of which various dispensations, it is called the Old and New Testament."

Chap. viii, § 1. After "only begotten Son," add "according to a Covenant made between them both."

Chap. viii, § 3. After "the Divine," add "in the Person of the Son."

Chap. viii, § 3. Add "also" before "put all Power."

Chap. viii, § 4. After "did perfectly fulfil it," add "and underwent the punishment due to us, which we should have borne and suffered, being made sin and a curse for us."

Chap. viii, § 4. Instead of "endured," read "enduring."

Chap. viii, § 5. Instead of "Justice of His Father," read "Justice of God."

Chap. viii, § 6. Instead of "unto the Elect," read "to the Elect."

Chap. ix, § 1. Instead of "natural liberty, that is neither," read "natural liberty and power of acting upon choice, that it is neither."

Chap. ix, § 1. Instead of "determined to good," read "determined to do good."

Chap. ix, § 4. Instead of "which was good," read "which is good."

Chap. x, § 3. Omit "through the Spirit."

Chap. x, § 4. Instead of "yet they never truly come unto Christ," read "yet not being effectually drawn by the Father, they neither do nor can come unto Christ."

Chap. xi, § 1. Instead of "but by imputing the obedience and satisfaction of Christ unto them," read "but by imputing Christ's active obedience unto the whole Law, and passive obedience in his death for their whole and sole righteousness."

Chap. xi, § 3. Omit "thus" before "justified."

Chap. xi, § 3. After "justified and did," add "by the sacrifice of himself, in the blood of his Cross, undergoing in their stead the penalty due unto them."

Chap. xi, § 3. Instead of "His Father's justice," read "God's justice."

Chap. xi, § 4. Add "personally" after "justified."

Chap. xi, § 5. Instead of "and not have the light," read "and in that condition they have not usually the light."

Chap. xiii, § 1. Instead of "who," read "that."

Chap. xiii, § 1. Insert "united to Christ" before "effectually called."

Chap. xiii, § 1. Transpose "through the vertue of Christ's death and resurrection" immediately after "created in them."

Chap. xiii, § 1. Insert "also" before "further."

Chap. xiii, § 1. Add "through the same vertue" after "personally."

Chap. xiii, § 1. Insert "all" before "true holiness."

Chap. xiv, § 1. Instead of "sacraments and prayer," read "Seals, prayer and other means."

Chap. xiv, § 3. Instead of "This Faith . . . but gets the victory," read "This Faith, although it be different in degrees, and may be weak or strong, yet it is in the least degree of it different in the kind or nature of it (as is all other saving grace) from the faith and common grace of temporary believers; and therefore, though it may be many times assailed and weakened, yet it gets the victory."

Chap. xv. The whole Chapter is rewritten so as to run as follows :

"OF REPENTANCE UNTO LIFE AND SALVATION.

"Such of the Elect as are converted at riper years, having sometime lived in the state of nature, and therein served divers lusts and pleasures, God in their effectual calling giveth them Repentance unto life.

"II. Whereas there is none that doeth good, and sinneth not, and the best of men may through the power and deceitfulness of their corruptions dwelling in them, with the prevalency of temptation, fall into great sins and provocations; God hath in the Covenant of Grace mercifully provided, that Believers so sinning and falling, be renewed through repentance and Salvation.

"III. This saving Repentance is an Evangelical Grace, whereby a person being by the holy Ghost made sensible of the manifold evils of his sin, doth by Faith in

Christ humble himself for it with godly sorrow, detestation of it, and self-abhorrence, praying for pardon and strength of Grace, with a purpose, and endeavor by supplies of the Spirit, to walk before God unto all well-pleasing in all things.

“IV. As Repentance is to be continued through the whole course of our lives, upon the account of the body of death, and the motions thereof; so it is every mans duty to repent of his particular known sins particularly.

“V. Such is the provision which God hath made through Christ in the Covenant of Grace, for the preservation of Believers unto salvation, that although there is no sin so small, but it deserves damnation; yet there is no sin so great, that it shall bring damnation on them who truly repent; which makes the constant preaching of Repentance necessary.”

Chap. xvi, § 1. Instead of “intention” read “intentions.”

Chap. xvi, § 7. Insert “to” before “others.”

Chap. xvii, § 2. Omit “flowing” after “election” (printer’s slip?).

Chap. xvii, § 2. After “Jesus Christ” add “and union with him, the oath of God.”

Chap. xvii, § 2. Instead of “the spirit” read “his spirit.”

Chap. xvii, § 3. Instead of “Nevertheless” read “And though.”

Chap. xvii, § 3. Instead of “come to be deprived of some measure of their graces and comforts,” read “come to have their graces and comforts impaired.”

Chap. xvii, § 3. Add at end: “yet they are and shall be kept by the power of God through faith unto salvation.”

Chap. xviii, § 1. Instead of “hypocrites” read “temporary believers.”

Chap. xviii, § 1. Instead of “estate” read “state.”

Chap. xviii, § 1. Instead of “a state of grace” read “the state of grace.”

Chap. xviii, § 2. Instead of “founded upon . . . day of redemption,” read “founded on the blood and righteousness of Christ, revealed in the Gospel, and also upon the inward evidence of those graces and to which promises are made, and on the immediate witness of the spirit, testifying our Adoption, and as a fruit thereof, leaving the heart more humble and holy.”

Chap. xviii, § 4. Omit “and” after “contenance.”

Chap. xviii, § 4. For “never utterly” read “neither utterly.”

Chap. xix, § 1. After “God gave to Adam a Law,” add “of universal obedience written in his heart, and a particular precept of not eating the Fruit of the Tree of Knowledge of good and evil.”

Chap. xix, § 2. Instead of “This Law . . . delivered by God,” read “This Law so written in the heart. continued to be a perfect Rule of righteousness after the fall of man, and was delivered by God.”

Chap. xix, § 3. Omit “as a church under age.”

Chap. xix, § 3. Instead of “All which ceremonial laws are now abrogated under the new Testament,” read “All which Ceremonial Laws being appointed onely to the time of Reformation, are by Jesus Christ the true Messiah and onely Law-giver, who was furnished with power from the Father for that end, abrogated and taken away.”

Chap. xix, § 4. Omit “as a body politic.”

Chap. xix, § 4. Instead of “not obliging any other, now, further than the general equity thereof may require,” read “not obliging any now by vertue of that institution, their general equity onely being still of moral use.”

Chap. xix, § 7. Instead of “requireth” read “required.”

Chap. [xx]. At this point an entire new chapter is inserted as follows :

“OF THE GOSPEL AND OF THE EXTENT OF THE GRACE THEREOF

“The Covenant of Works being broken by sin, and made unprofitable unto life, God was pleased to give unto the Elect the promise of Christ, the seed of the woman, as the means of calling them, and begetting in them Faith and Repent-

ence : In this promise the Gospel, as to the substance of it, was revealed, and was therein effectual for the conversion and salvation of sinners.

“II. This promise of Christ, and salvation by him, is revealed onely in and by the word of God ; neither do the works of Creation or Providence, with the Light of Nature, make discovery of Christ, or of Grace by him, so much as in a general or obscure way ; much less that men destitute of the revelation of him by the Promise or Gospel, should be enabled thereby to attain saving Faith on Repentance.

“III. The revelation of the Gospel unto sinners, made in divers times, and by sundry parts, with the addition of Promises and Precepts for the obedience required therein, as to the Nations and persons to whom it is granted, is merely of the Sovereign will and good pleasure of God, not being annexed by vertue of any promise to the due improvement of mens natural abilities, by vertue of common light received without it, which none ever did make or can so do : And therefore in all ages the Preaching of the Gospel hath been granted unto persons and nations, as to the extent or straitning of it, in great variety, according to the counsel of the will of God.

“IV. Although the Gospel be the onely outward means of revealing Christ and saving Grace, and is as such abundantly sufficient thereunto ; yet that men who are dead in trespasses, may be born again, quickened or regenerated, there is moreover necessary an effectual irresistible work of the holy Ghost upon the whole soul, for the producing in them a new spiritual life, without which no other means are sufficient for their conversion unto God.”

Chap. xx [xxi], § 1. Instead of “the curse of the moral law” read “the rigor and curse of the Law.”

Chap. xx [xxi], § 1. Add “fear and” before “sting of death.”

Chap. xx [xxi], § 1. Add “for the substance of them” after “Believers under the Law.”

Chap. xx [xxi], § 1. Add “the whole Legal administration of the Covenant of Grace” after “the yoke of the Ceremonial Law.”

Chap. xx [xxi], § 2. Instead of “or beside it in matters of faith or worship” read “or not contained in it.”

Chap. xx [xxi], § 3. Instead of “lust do thereby destroy” read “lust, as they do thereby pervert the main designe of the Grace of the Gospel to their own destruction ; so they wholly destroy.”

Chap. xx [xxi], § 4. Omit the whole section.

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 1. Insert “just” before “good.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 1. Instead of “limited to” read “limited by.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 2. Instead of “creature” read “creatures.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 3. Instead of “religious” read “natural.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 3. Instead of “and that” read “but that.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 3. Instead of “and if vocal in a known tongue” read “and when with others in a known tongue.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 5. The section is recast as follows : “The reading of the Scriptures, Preaching, and hearing the word of God, singing of Psalms, as also the administration of Baptism and the Lord’s Supper, are all parts of religious worship of God, to be performed in obedience unto God with understanding, faith, reverence, and godly fear : Solemn Humiliations, with Fastings and Thanksgiving upon special occasions, are in their several times and seasons to be used in a holy and religious maner.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 6. Insert “in” before “truth.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 6. Instead of “or wilfully” read “nor wilfully.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 7. Omit “due” before “proportion.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 7. Add “by Gods appointment” before “be set apart.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 7. Instead of “in his word” read “by his word.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 7. Instead of “by a positive” read “in a positive.”

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 7. Add at the end "the observation of the last day of the week being abolished."

Chap. xxi [xxii], § 8. Omit "of" after "ordering."

Chap. xxii [xxiii], § 1. Omit "upon just occasion."

Chap. xxii [xxiii], § 1. Insert "in truth, righteousness and judgment" after "swearing."

Chap. xxii [xxiii], § 2. Instead of "and dreadful" read "or dreadful."

Chap. xxii [xxiii], § 3. Add "warranted by the Word of God" after "Whosoever taketh an oath."

Chap. xxii [xxiii], § 3. Instead of "imposed by lawful authority" read "lawfully imposed by Authority."

Chap. xxii [xxiii], § 5. Add "which is not to be made to any Creature, but to God alone" after "A vow."

Chap. xxii [xxiii], § 6. Omit the entire section.

Chap. xxii [xxiii], § 7 [6]. Omit "No man may . . . In which respects."

Chap. xxiii [xxiv], § 1. Instead of "them that are good" read "them that do good."

Chap. xxiii [xxiv], § 1. Instead of "managing" read "management."

Chap. xxiii [xxiv], § 2. Omit "piety."

Chap. xxiii [xxiv], § 3. Substitute for this section the following: "III. Although the Magistrate is bound to encourage, promote, and protect the professor and profession of the Gospel, and to manage and order civil administrations in a due subserviency to the interest of Christ in the world, and to that end to take care that men of corrupt minds and conversations do not licentiously publish and divulge Blasphemy and Errors in their own nature, subverting the faith, and inevitably destroying the souls of them that receive them: Yet in such differences about the doctrines of the Gospel, or ways of the worship of God, as may befall men exercising a good conscience, manifesting it in their conversation, and holding the foundation, not disturbing others in their ways or worship that differ from them; there is no warrant for the Magistrate under the Gospel to abridge them of their liberty."

Chap. xxiv [xxv], title. Omit "and divorce."

Chap. xxiv [xxv], § 3. Omit "only" before "in the Lord."

Chap. xxiv [xxv], § 3. Omit "notoriously."

Chap. xxiv [xxv], § 3. Instead of "heresies" read "Heresie."

Chap. xxiv [xxv], § 4. Omit last sentence: "The man may not . . . of her own."

Chap. xxiv [xxv], §§ 5, 6. Omit both sections entirely.

Chap. xxv [xxvi], § 2. Substitute for the section the following: "II. The whole body of men throughout the world, professing the faith of the Gospel and obedience unto God by Christ according unto it, not destroying their own profession by any Errors everting the foundation, or unholiness of conversation, are, and may be called the visible Catholique Church of Christ, although as such it is not intrusted with the administration of any Ordinances, or have any officers to rule or govern in, or over the whole Body."

Chap. xxv [xxvi], §§ 3, 4. Omit both sections entirely.

Chap. xxv [xxvi], § 5, (3). Instead of "nevertheless there shall be always a Church on earth to worship God according to his will," read "Nevertheless Christ always hath had, and ever shall have a visible Kingdom in this world, to the end thereof, of such as believe in him, and make profession of his name."

Chap. xxv [xxvi], § 6, (4). Add at the end "whom the Lord shall destroy with the brightness of his coming."

Chap. xxv [xxvi], § (5). Add at the end of the chapter the following section: "V. As the Lord in his care and love toward his Church, hath in his infinite wise providence exercised it with great variety in all ages, for the good of them that

love him, and his own Glory : so according to his promise, we expect that in the later days, Antichrist being destroyed, the Jews called, and the adversaries of the Kingdom of his dear Son broken, the Churches of Christ being enlarged, and edified through a free and plentiful communication of light and grace, shall enjoy in this world a more quiet, peaceable and glorious condition than they have enjoyed."

Chap. xxvi [xxvii], § 1. Omit "by" before "Faith."

Chap. xxvi [xxvii], § 1. Add "although they are not made thereby one person with him" after "by his Spirit and [by] faith."

Chap. xxvi [xxvii], § 1. Omit "with him" after "fellowship."

Chap. xxvi [xxvii], § 2. Instead of "Saints by profession" read "All saints."

Chap. xxvi [xxvii] § 2. Insert "though especially to be exercised by them in the relations wherein they stand, whether in Families or Churches, yet," after "which communion."

Chap. xxvi [xxvii], § 3. Omit the entire section.

Chap. xxvii [xxviii], § 1. Instead of "instituted by God" read "instituted by Christ."

Chap. xxvii [xxviii], § 1. Instead of "to represent Christ" read "to represent him."

Chap. xxvii [xxviii], § 1. Omit "as also to put a visible difference between those that belong, unto the Church and the rest of the world."

Chap. xxvii [xxviii], § 1. Instead of "to engage them" read "to engage us."

Chap. xxvii [xxviii], § 2. Instead of "the effects" read "and effects."

Chap. xxvii [xxviii], § 4. Instead of "the Supper of the Lord" read "the Lord's Supper."

Chap. xxvii [xxviii], § 4. Instead of "ordained" read "called."

Chap. xxviii [xxix], § 1. Omit "not only for the solemn admission of the party baptized into the visible Church but also."

Chap. xxviii [xxix], § 1. Instead of "unto him" read "unto the party baptized."

Chap. xxviii [xxix], § 1. Instead of "sacrament" read "Ordinance."

Chap. xxviii [xxix], § 2. Instead of "sacrament" read "Ordinance."

Chap. xxviii [xxix], § 2. Omit "thereunto" at end.

Chap. xxviii [xxix], § 4. Add at end "and those only."

Chap. xxviii [xxix], § 7. Omit at beginning "The Sacrament of."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 1. Instead of "Church" read "Churches."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 1. Add "and shewing forth" after "remembrance."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 1. Add "of" after "sealing."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 1. Omit "as members of his mystical body" at the end.

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 2. For "sins" read "sin."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 2. For "commemoration" read "memorial."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 2. For "abominably" read "abominable."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 2. For "one" read "own."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 3. Omit "to declare his word of institution to the people."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 7. For "Bread and Wine" read "Bread or Wine."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 8. Omit "although ignorant . . . Wherefore."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 8. Instead of "against Christ" read "against him."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 8. Add at end "yea, whosoever shall receive unworthily, are guilty of the Body and Blood of the Lord, eating and drinking Judgement to themselves."

Chap. xxx. Omit whole chapter.

Chap. xxxi. Omit whole chapter.

Chap. xxxii [xxxii], title. Instead of "men" read "man."

Chap. xxxii [xxxii], § 1. Instead of "torments" read "torment."

Chap. xxxiii [xxxiii], § 2. Instead of "refreshing which shall come from" read "glory with everlasting reward in."

Chap. xxxiii [xxxii], § 3. Omit "day of" before "Judgement."

It was the misfortune of the Savoy Declaration to be published at the end instead of at the beginning of the dominance of Independency in England, and it quickly passed out of sight. The attacks upon it by Baxter and Du Moulin seemed only like slaying the dead. But in New England it was destined to have the career denied it in the land of its birth. The Congregationalists of New England, after adapting it to their own views with regard to the relations of Church and State, erected it into as much a norm of sound doctrine as it was possible for Independents to possess; and for many years it continued to be the recognized standard of the Congregationalists of America. The forms in which it was given this important position are to be immediately enumerated. Even in England also a much wider influence than could have been hoped for it in its original form was obtained for it in a derived form,—in that Confession of Faith prepared by the Baptists in 1677, and ever since more widely honored by the Baptist Churches of both England and America than any other formulary. Of this, too, we shall shortly give some account.

[bb. *The Boston form of the Savoy Recension*, 1680] "A | Confession | of | Faith | Owned and consented unto by the | Elders and Messengers | of the Churches | Assembled at Boston in New England, | May 12, 1680. | Being the second Session of that | Synod. | ——— | Eph. iv. 5 | Col. ii. 5 | ——— | Boston; | Printed by John Foster. 1680"—(WALKER).

8vo, $5\frac{1}{4} \times 3\frac{1}{4}$ inches, pp. vi, 65, with *Cambridge Platform*. Subsequent editions are numerous, *e. g.*, Boston, 1699, 1725, 1750, 1757: also in the *Magnalia*, London, 1702; Hartford, 1853-5; the *Results of Three Synods*, etc., Boston, 1725; *The Original Constitution, Order and Faith of the New England Churches*, etc., Boston, 1812; *The Cambridge and Saybrook Platforms*, etc., Boston, 1829; *Ratio Disciplina* by T. C. Upham, Portland, 1829; *Report on Congregationalism*, etc., Boston, 1846; *The Cambridge Platform*, etc., by Nath. Emmons, Boston, 1855. A full list of editions is given by WILLISTON WALKER, *The Creeds and Platforms of Congregationalism* (New York, 1893), p. 409: he also reprints the whole preface from the *editio princeps* and gives an illuminating historical account: see him also, p. 410, for a list of the relevant literature.

The task laid on that assembly of the Massachusetts Churches which has been called the "Reforming Synod" of 1679-1680, so far as doctrine is concerned, consisted chiefly in bearing testimony to the unpolluted faith of the second generation of the Massachusetts Churches. In the circumstances in which it wrought, it was inevitable that the Synod should turn to the Savoy Declaration for an expression of the faith which they held in common with their British brethren: and the more so that the two leading members of the Committee to which the task of drawing up the Confession was entrusted, Mather and Oates, had been in England at the time that the Savoy Declaration had been framed and were in close touch with its authors. It was the Savoy Declaration, therefore, only slightly altered to adjust it to the New England theory of the relation of the Church and State, that was reported to the Synod and adopted by it as the creed of the Massachusetts Churches. How the whole matter stood with them will be best set forth by a short extract from the Preface prefixed to the Confession, when it was printed.

"There have been those who have reflected upon these *New English Churches* for our defect in this matter [that is to say in published creeds], as if our Principles were unknown; whereas it is well-known, that as to matters of Doctrine we agree with other Reformed Churches: Nor was it that, but what concerns Worship

and Discipline, that caused our Fathers to come into this wilderness, whiles it was a land not sown, that so they might have liberty to practice accordingly. And it is a ground of holy rejoycing before the Lord, that now there is no advantage left for those that may be disaffected toward us, to object anything of that nature against us. For it hath pleased the only wise God so to dispose in his Providence, as that the Elders and Messengers of the Churches in the Colony of *Massachusetts* in *New England*, did, by the Call and Encouragement of the honoured General Court, meet together *Sept.* 10, 1679. This Synod at their Second Session, which was *May* 12, 1680, consulted and considered of a Confession of Faith. That which was consented unto by the Elders and Messengers of the *Congregational Churches* in *England*, who met at the *Savoy* (being for the most part, some small variations excepted, the same with that which was agreed upon first by the Assembly at *Westminster*, and was approved of by the Synod at *Cambridge* in *New England*, Anno 1648, as also by a *General Assembly* in *Scotland*) was twice publicly read, examined and approved of: that little variation which we have made from the one, in compliance with the other may be seen by those who please to compare them. But we have (for the main) chosen to express our selves in the words of those Reverend Assemblies, hut so we might not only with one heart, but with one mouth glorifie God, and our Lord Jesus Christ" (*Preface*, etc., as given by WALKER, *op. cit.*, p. 439).

This Confession was reported to the General Court of Massachusetts and (January 11, 1680) approved by that body and ordered "to be printed for the benefit of these churches in present and after times." By certain local churches (*e. g.*, the Old South of Boston and the First of Cambridge) it was utilized as a local creed. It was accepted as the faith of the churches of Connecticut in 1708. As late as 1865 it was reaffirmed as substantially embodying the faith to which these churches are pledged, by a Council, as representative of American Congregationalism as any body of delegates can be. At present it is perhaps practically forgotten in the Congregational Churches: and since 1884 has fallen into desuetude even in the Old South Church of Boston.

As the Preface itself witnesses, the only variation of importance from the Savoy Declaration which the document registers is a return to the teaching of the Westminster Confession in the matter of the relation of Church and State. The following are the divergences from the Savoy Declaration, in detail (the chapter and section numbers are those of the Westminster Confession: those enclosed in square brackets alone being those of the Savoy Declaration):

Chap. v, § 1. West. and Savoy, "even to the least": Boston, "even unto the least."

Chap. v, § 1. Savoy, "according unto": West. and Bost., "according to."

Chap. xiii, § 1. Savoy, "They that are united to Christ, effectually called": West. and Bost., "They who are effectually called."

Chap. xiii, § 2. West. and Savoy, "abideth": Bost., "abide."

Chap. xvii, § 2. West. and Savoy, "and of the seed": Bost., "and the seed."

Chap. xix, § 2. West. and Savoy, "upon Mount Sanaï": Bost., "on Mount Sanaï."

Chap. xix, § 3. Savoy, omit "as a church under age": Westminster and Boston, insert.

Chap. xxiii [xxiv], § 3. Boston here rejects the new section framed at the Savoy and inserts a new § 3, based in part on Westminster, Chap. xx, § 4, which had been omitted by the Parliamentary and Savoy recensions alike. This new Boston section runs as follows: "III. They who upon pretense of Christian liberty shall oppose any lawful power, or the lawful exercises of it, resist the Ordinance of God, and for their publishing of such opinions, or maintaining of such practices as are contrary to the Light of Nature, or to the known Principles of Christianity, whether concerning faith, worship, or conversation, or to the power of godliness,

or such erroneous opinions or practices, as either in their own nature, or in the manner of publishing or maintaining them, are destructive to the external peace and order which Christ hath established in the Church, they may lawfully be called to account, and proceeded against by the censures of the Church, and by the power of the civil Magistrate; yet in such differences about the Doctrines of the Gospel, or Ways of the Worship of God, as may befall men exercising a good conscience, manifesting it in their conservation, and holding the foundation, and duly observing the Rules of peace and order, there is no warrant for the Magistrate to abridge them of their liberty."

Chap. xxvi [xxvii], § 2. Into this new section framed at the Savoy, Boston inserts the words "they and their children with them" after the word "conversation"—"doubtless," as Dr. Walker says, "influenced by the Halfway Covenant."

Chap. xxvi [xxvii], § 2. Boston adds at end, "Although as such it is not intrusted with any Officers to rule or govern over the whole body."

Chap. xxviii [xxix], § 2. Savoy omits "thereunto" at end: Westminster and Boston insert.

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 1. Westminster and Savoy, "unto the end": Boston, "to the end."

Chap. xxix [xxx], § 3. Savoy omits "to declare his word of institution to the people": Westminster and Boston insert.

Chap. xxxii [xxx], § 1. Westminster and Savoy, "for souls": Boston, "of souls."

[bbb. The Saybrook form of the Boston-Savoy Recension, 1708]

A | Confession | of | Faith | Owned and Consented to by
the | Elders and Messengers | Of the Churches | In the Col-
ony of Connecticut in | New England. | Assembled by Dele-
gation | at Say-Brook | September 9th, 1708 | ——— | Eph.
iv. 5 | Col. ii. 5 | | | ——— | New-
London in N. E. | Printed by Thomas Short, | 1710.

16mo, 5 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{4}$ inches, pp. 116. Subsequent editions are: New London, 1760; Bridgeport, 1810; Hartford, 1831, 1838; in *Congregational Order*, etc., Middletown, 1843. Copies of the edd. of 1710 and 1810 and of the *Congregational Order* are in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton. For the editions and literature see WILLISTON WALKER, *op. cit.*, p. 464: in the subsequent pages he gives a full historical account and reprints the *Preface* (pp. 517-520).

A movement for a united Confession of Faith for the churches of the colony of Connecticut was definitely inaugurated "at a meeting of Sundry Elders" as early as 1703 (Walker, p. 493), and when the Synod of Saybrook was called in 1708 the provision of such a Confession was naturally made one of its duties. Of course it was the Confession of the Massachusetts Churches since 1680 that was recommended by it for this end. In the *Preface* prepared for the document, after a sketch of the history of creeds in general, the attitude of the Synod is outlined as follows:

"Among those of latter times Published in our Nation most worthy of Repute and acceptance we take to be the Confession of Faith, *Composed by the Reverend Assembly of Divines Convened at Westminster*, with that of the *Savoy*, in the substance and in expressions for the most part the same: the former professedly assented and attested to, by the Fathers of our Country by Unanimous Vote of the Synod of Elders and Messengers of the Churches met at *Cambridge* the last of the *6th Month*, 1648. The latter owned and consented to by the Elders and Messengers of the Churches assembled at *Boston*, May 12th, 1680. The same we doubt

not to profess to have been the constant Faith of the Churches in the Colony from the first Foundation of them. And that it may appear to the Christian World, that our Churches do not maintain differing Opinions in the Doctrine of Religion, nor are desirous for any reason to conceal the Faith we are persuaded of: The Elders and Messengers of the Churches in this *Colony of Connecticut in New England* by virtue of the Appointment and Encouragement of the Honourable the General Assembly, Convened by Delegation at *Say Brook, Sept. 9th, 1708*. Unanimously agreed, that the Confession of Faith owned and Consented unto by the Elders and Messengers of the Churches Assembled at *Boston in New England, May 12th, 1680*. Being the second Session of that Synod, be Recommended to the Honourable the General Assembly of this Colony at their next Session, for their Publick Testimony thereto, as the Faith of the Churches of this Colony, which Confession together with the heads of Union and Articles for the Administration of Church Government herewith emitted were Presented unto and approved and established by the said General Assembly at *New Haven on the 14th of October, 1708*. This Confession of Faith we offer as our firm Perswasion well and fully grounded upon the Holy Scripture, and Commend the same unto all and particularly to the people of our Colony to be examined, accepted and constantly maintained" (Preface, etc., in WALKER, *op. cit.*, pp. 518-519).

The General Court of the Colony, meeting at New Haven, October 1708, ordained that "all the Churches within this government that are or shall be thus united in doctrine, worship, and discipline, be, and for the future shall be owned and acknowledged established by law." Accordingly the symbols adopted at Saybrook were printed once and again (1710, 1760) at the expense of the colony and distributed throughout the colony. This establishment continued in effect until it was silently repealed by the omission of all reference to it in the revision of the statutes in 1784.

The Saybrook Confession doubtless was not intended to differ in any respect from that of the Boston Synod. But during the process of printing—it was the first book printed in Connecticut—certain slight variations crept in. The following list will indicate these (the chapter and section numbers follow those of the Westminster Confession, those included in square brackets alone being those of the Savoy Declaration):

Chap. ii, § 2. Westminster, Savoy, Boston, "not standing"; Saybrook, "nor standing."

Chap. v, § 6. Westminster, Savoy, Boston, at end, "others": Saybrook, "them" — "a change," comments Dr. Walker, "of some importance."

Chap. viii, § 7. Westminster, Savoy, Boston, "proper to": Saybrook, "proper in."

Chap. xi, § 1. Savoy, Boston, "obedience unto": Saybrook, "obedience to."

Chap. xii, § 1. Saybrook omits "in" after "vouchsafeth."

Chap. xvi, § 5. Saybrook reads "judgements" for "judgement" at end.

Chap. xviii, § 3. Westminster, Savoy, Boston, "his calling": Saybrook, "their calling."

Chap. [xix, § 2. "on" as in Boston.]

Chap. [xix, § 3. Add "as a church under age" as in Boston.]

Chap. xix, § 3. Saybrook reads "worshiping".

Chap. [xx, title. Saybrook reads "Graces."

Chap. [xxiii [xxiv], § 3. As in Boston.]

Chap. xxiv [xxv], § 2. Saybrook omits "of" after "preventing."

Chap. xxv [xxvi], § 1. Saybrook omits "is" before "the Spouse."

Chap. xxv [xxvi], § 1. Saybrook adds "and" after "all."

Chap. [xxvi [xxvii], § 2. Insert "they and their children after them" as in Boston].

Chap. [xxvi [xxvii], § 2. Insert sentence at end as in Boston.]

Chap. [xxviii [xxix], § 2. Add "thereunto" as in Boston.]

Chap. [xxix [xxx], § 3. Add sentence as in Boston ; but with "instruction" instead of "institution," by printer's error.]

[c. *The Baptist Recension, 1677*] A | Confession | of | Faith, | put forth by the Elders and Brethren | of many | Congregations | of | Christians | (Baptized upon *Profession* of their Faith) | in | London and the Countrey. | The Third Edition. | [Texts here from Rom. x. 10 and John v. 39] | London: Printed by S. Bridge in Austin Fry- | ers, for Eben. Tracy at the Three Bibles on | London Bridge. Will. Marshall at the Bible | in Newgate-Street. And John Marshall at the | Bible in Grace-Church-Street, 1699.

24mo, pp. [24 ; unnumbered, for title, preface and contents], 106 [2] ; 4¼ x 2½ inches (block of type). Earlier editions appeared 1677, 1688, 1689, and later editions 1719, 1720, 1791 +. It was adopted in America by the Baptist Association that met in Philadelphia, September 25, 1742, and was shortly afterwards printed by Benjamin Franklin : then in the following edition : "A | Confession of Faith, | put forth | by the | elders and brethren | of many Congregations of Christians ; | (Baptized upon Profession of their Faith) | in London and the Country | — | Adopted by the Baptist Association met at | Philadelphia | September 25, 1742. | With two additional articles, viz : Of Imposition of Hands, | and Singing of Psalms in Public Worship. | A new edition. | [Texts from Ro. x. 20, and Jno. v. 39] | Burlington, | Printed for W. W. Woodward, Philadelphia, | By S. C. Ustick, | 1810." | 24mo, pp. ix, 71 + 40 (the last forty pages containing "A Short Treatise Concerning our Discipline"). An edition was printed at Pittsburgh (S. Williams), 1831. It has been reprinted by CROSBY, *Hist. of English Baptists*, etc. (London, 1740), III. Append. ii, pp. 56—iii : and by UNDERHILL, *Confessions of Faith in illustration of the History of the Baptist Church of England in the Seventeenth Century* (Knolleys Society, London, 1854), pp. 169—246. See SCHAFF, *Creeeds of Christendom*, I, 855—6, and III, 738, where are given large extracts from it, illustrating its relation to the Westminster Confession. It was translated into Welsh, 1721, and again by the Rev. Joshua Thomas, of Leominster (the painstaking and careful historian of the Baptists), in 1791. In his preface, Mr. Thomas speaks of the Confession of 1677 as differing in nothing, so far as substance is concerned, from the earlier Baptist Confession of 1644, fourth ed. 1652, but altered in form, "in order to make it more like the Confessions of Faith of the Presbyterians and of the Independents, except in the matter of Baptism and a few other things": "it was printed in Welsh," he adds, "in 1721 : Since then seventy years have elapsed. . . . The present edition is altogether a new translation."

This Confession, both in England and America, is still in high repute among the Baptists. It was greatly esteemed by the late Charles Spurgeon, who published it in cheap form for use among his followers. This "Spurgeon's Edition" has been admirably reprinted in America in a beautiful little pamphlet, as follows :

Thirty-two Articles of Christian | Faith and Practice : | Baptist Confession of Faith, | With Scripture Proofs, | Adopted by | The Ministers and Messengers | of the | General Assembly, | which met in London in 1689. | With a | Preface by the Rev. C. H. Spurgeon. | Wharton, Barron & Company, | 10 E. Fayette St., Baltimore, Md. | 1890.

16mo, pp. 44. The laudatory preface by Mr. Spurgeon is dated in 1855, which

doubtless marks the date of the first issue "in a cheap form" of "this most excellent list of doctrines."

In the preface prefixed to the Baptist Confession its authors explain that the older Confession, "put forth about the year 1643" was no longer "commonly to be had" and the time had arrived for a republication of the faith of the Baptist churches; and "finding no defect in this regard"—that is, in regard to the expression of the great truths of the Gospel—"in that fixed on by the Assembly, and after them by those of the Congregational way, we did readily conclude it best to retain the same *Order* in our present Confession"; and also to follow the example of "those of the Congregational way" in departing very little from the very words of the Assembly's Confession. In effect this Confession is nothing other than the Savoy Declaration somewhat freely interpolated with additional sentences and clauses, and adapted to the use of the Baptists by an adjustment of its doctrine of Baptism. The minor alterations introduced run through the whole document and are very numerous; but not only do they not change its substance but they leave it the same Confession even in form.

We shall not attempt to mark here all the changes, but the following list will indicate their nature by a sufficient display of samples, and will include all of any real significance. The numbering of the chapters will follow those of the Savoy Declaration which this Confession simply repeats:

Chap. i, §1. Prefix "The Holy Scripture is the only sufficient, certain and infallible Rule of all Saving Knowledge, Faith and Obedience;"

Chap. ii, § 1. Remodel at opening, thus: "The Lord our God is but one only living, and true God; whose subsistence is in and by himself, infinite in being and perfection, whose Essence cannot be comprehended by any but himself; a most pure spirit, etc."

Chap. ii, § 3. Remodel, thus: "In this Divine and Infinite Being there are three subsistences, the Father, the Word (or Son), and Holy Spirit, of one substance, power and eternity, each having the whole Divine Essence, yet the Essence undivided, the Father is of none. . . . proceeding from the Father and the Son, all infinite, without beginning, therefore but one God, who is not to be divided in Nature and Being but distinguished by several peculiar, relative Properties, and personal Relations; which Doctrine. . . ."

Chap. iii, § 1. Remodel, thus: "God hath *decreed* in himself, from all eternity, by the most wise and holy Council of his own Will, freely and unchangeable (*sic*), all things whatsoever comes (*sic*) to pass; yet so as thereby is God neither the Author of sin, nor hath fellowship with any therein, nor is violence offered to the will of the Creature, nor yet is the liberty, or contingency of second Causes taken away, but rather established, in which appears his Wisdom in disposing all things, and Power, and Faithfulness in accomplishing his *Decree*."

Chap. iii, § 3. Expanded as follows: "By the *Decree* of God, for the manifestation of his glory, some Men and Angels are pre-destinated or fore-ordained to Eternal Life, through Jesus Christ, to the praise of his glorious grace; others being left to act in their sin to their just condemnation, to the praise of his glorious justice."

Chap. iii, § 5. The closing clause is modified thus: "Without any other thing in the creation as a condition or cause moving him thereunto."

Chap. iii, § 7. Omitted, and § 8 made § 7.

Chap. iv, § 1. Transpose "in the beginning" to the commencement of the paragraph and omit "out of nothing."

Chap. v, § 5. Add at end: "So that whatsoever befalls any of his Elect is by his appointment, for his glory, and their good."

Chap. vi, § 1. Rewritten, with a return to the Westminster Confession at the end, thus: "Although *God created Man* upright, and perfect, and gave him a

righteous Law, which had been unto Life had he kept it, and threatened Death upon the breach thereof; yet he did not long abide in this honour; Satan using the subtilty of the Serpent to seduce *Eve*, then by her seducing *Adam*, who without any compulsion, did wilfully transgress the Law of their *Creation*, and the Command given unto them, in eating the forbidden Fruit; which *God* was pleased according to *his* wise and holy *Council* to permit, having purposed to order it, to *his* own glory."

Chap. vi, § 3. Add at end: "being now conceived in *Sin*, and by nature children of Wrath, the servants of *Sin*, the subjects of *Death*, and all other miseries, spiritual, temporal and eternal, unless the *Lord Jesus* set them free."

Chap. vi, § 6. Omit altogether.

Chap. vii, § 2. Omit altogether.

Chap. vii, §§ 4, 5. Replaced by a new § 3, thus: "This *Covenant* is revealed in the Gospel; first, of all to *Adam* in the promise of Salvation by the Seed of the Woman, and afterward by further steps, until the full discovery thereof was completed in the New Testament; and it is founded in that *Eternal Covenant* transaction, that was between the *Father* and the *Son* about the Redemption of the *Elect*; and it is alone by the Grace of this *Covenant*, that all of the Posterity of fallen *Adam*, that ever were saved, did obtain Life and blessed Immortality; *Man* being now utterly incapable of acceptance with *God* upon those terms on which *Adam* stood in his state of Innocency."

Chap. viii, § 6. Instead of "work of Redemption . . . wrought" read "Price of Redemption . . . paid."

Chap. viii, § 8. Add at end: "and all by free, and absolute Grace, without any condition foreseen in them, to procure it."

Chap. [viii, §§ 9, 10.] Two sections added, thus: "§ 9. This Office of Mediator between God and Man, is proper onely to Christ, who is the Prophet, Priest, and King of the Church of God; and may not be either in whole or any part thereof transferr'd from him to any other. § 10. This number and order of Offices is necessary; for in respect of our ignorance, we stand in need of his prophetic Office; and in respect of our alienation from God and imperfection of the best of our services, we need his Priestly Office, to reconcile us, and present us acceptable unto God: and in respect of our averseness, and utter inability to return to God, and for our rescue and security from our spiritual adversaries, we need his Kingly Office, to convince, subdue, draw, uphold, deliver, and preserve us to his Heavenly Kingdom."

Chap. x, § 1. Omit "all" and "and those only."

Chap. x, § 3. Restore the Westminster clause: "through the Spirit."

Chap. xiii, § 3. Add at end: "pressing after an Heavenly Life, in Evangelical Obedience to all the Commands which *Christ*, as *Head* and *King*, in his *Word* hath prescribed to them."

Chap. xvii, § 1. Instead of "They" at the beginning read "Those"; instead of "his" before "Beloved" read "the"; add after "Spirit," "and given the precious Faith of his Elect unto"; and add at end: "seeing the Gifts and Callings of God are without Repentance (whence he still hegets and nourisheth in them Faith, Repentance, Love, Joy, Hope, and all the Graces of the Spirit unto immortality) and though many storms and floods arise and beat against them, yet they shall never be able to take them off that Foundation and Rock which by Faith they are fastned upon; notwithstanding, through unbelief and the temptations of Satan, the sensible sight of the light and love of God, may for a time be clouded and obscured from them, yet he is still the same, and they shall be sure to be kept by the Power of God unto Salvation, where they shall enjoy their purchased Possession, they being engraven upon the Palm of his Hands, and their Names having been written in the Book of Life from all Eternity."

Chap. xvii, § 3. Substitute for the new closing clause of Savoy the following:

“yet they shall renew their repentance and be preserved, through faith in Christ Jesus, to the end.”

Chap. xxiii, § 3. Instead of “neither may any man . . .” to the end, read : “for that by rash, false, and vain Oaths, the Lord is provoked, and for them this land mourns.”

Chap. xxiii, § 4. Omit all after “reservation.”

Chap. xxiii, §§ 5, 6. Compressed (with some minor adjustments) into one § 5.

Chap. xxiv, § 3. Substitute the following : “*Civil Magistrates* being set up by God, for the ends aforesaid, subjection in all lawful things commanded by them, ought to be yielded by us in the Lord, not only for Wrath, but for Conscience-sake; and we ought to make Supplications and Prayers for Kings, and all that are in Authority, that under them we may live a quiet and peaceable Life, in all godliness and honesty.”

Chap. xxiv, § 4. Omit altogether.

Chap. xxvi, § 1. Instead of “which is invisible” read “which (with respect to the internal work of the Spirit and Truth of Grace) may be called Invisible.”

Chap. xxvi, § 2. Instead of “The whole body of men” read “All persons.”

Chap. xxvi, § 2. Instead of “Catholique Church of Christ” read “Saints.”

Chap. xxvi, § 2. For “although . . .” to the end, substitute “and of such ought all particular Congregations to be constituted.”

Chap. xxvi, § 4. Instead of the opening sentence, read : “The Lord Jesus Christ is the Head of the Church, in whom, by the appointment of the Father, all Power for the Calling, Institution, Order, or Government of the Church is invested in a supreme and sovereign manner, neither can the Pope,” etc., as in Savoy.

Chap. xxvi, § 5. Omit, and insert eleven new sections, §§ 5-15, in which the whole Independent doctrine of the Church is developed : § 5. The constitution of particular churches by the call of individuals by the Spirit and the command of the Lord that they company together ; § 6. The character of the members as “Saints by calling” ; § 7. The endowment of each particular church for its function ; § 8. The officers of each church ; § 9. The mode of induction into office ; § 10. The work of the pastor ; § 11. Lay preaching ; § 12 The right of discipline ; § 13. The duty of patience ; § 14. Communion among the churches ; § 15. Advisory Councils. The whole chapter is reprinted by SCHAFF, *op. cit.*, III, pp. 738-741, and may be there consulted.

Chap. xxvii, § 2. Returns to Westminster at beginning, reading “Saints by Profession,” instead of “All Saints” with Savoy.

Chap. xxvii, § 2. After “which Communion” insert “according to the Rule of the Gospel.”

Chap. xxvii, § 2. After “extended to all” insert “the Household of Faith, even all.”

Chap. xxvii, § 2. Add at end : “Nevertheless their Communion one with another as Saints, doth not take away or infringe the Title or Propriety which each man hath in his goods and possessions”—thus returning to Westminster, § 3 *ad fin.*

Chap. xxviii. Entirely rewritten, with new title, thus :

“OF BAPTISM AND THE LORD’S SUPPER.

“§ 1. Baptism and the Lord’s Supper, are Ordinances of positive and sovereign Institution, appointed by the Lord Jesus the only Law-giver, to be continued in his Church to the end of the world.

“§ 2. These holy Appointments are to be administered by those only, who are qualified and thereunto called according to the Commission of Christ.”

Chap. xxix, § 1. Instead of “Sacrament” read “Ordinance.”

Chap. xxix, § 1. Instead of “and seal . . . regeneration,” read “of his fellowship with him, in his Death and Resurrection ; of his being Engrafted into him.”

Chap. xxix, § 1. Omit the clause “which Ordinance . . .” to the end.

Chap. xxix, § 2 *sq.* The order of the sections is so altered that § 2 of the Savoy becomes § 3; § 3 becomes § 4; § 4 becomes § 2, while §§ 5, 6, 7 are omitted. The whole runs as follows in its remodeled form:

"§ 2. Those who do actually profess Repentance toward God, Faith in, and Obedience to our Lord Jesus, are the only proper subjects of the Ordinance.

"§ 3. The outward Element, to be used in this Ordinance, is Water, wherein the Party is to be baptized, in the Name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Spirit.

"§ 4. Immersion, or Dipping of the Person in Water, is necessary to the due Administration of this Ordinance."

Chap. xxx, § 1. Remodel at the beginning so as to read: "The Supper of the Lord Jesus, was instituted by him, the same Night wherein he was betrayed, to be observed. . . ."

Chap. xxx, § 1. Instead of "the sealing of all benefits thereof unto true believers" read "Confirmation of the Faith of Believers in all the Benefits thereof."

Chap. xxx, § 2. Instead of "Sacrament" read "Ordinance."

Chap. xxx, § 4. Omit down to "The denial"

In the American form of this Confession—as set forth under the authorization of the Baptist Association, met at Philadelphia, September 25, 1742—there were inserted into it two additional chapters. One of these, "Of Singing of Psalms in Public Worship," was given place as chapter xxiii; the other, "Of Laying on of Hands," as chapter xxxi—the chapter numbers throughout being adjusted to these insertions. The former treats the "singing the praises of God" as a duty enjoined on the Church: by the "laying on of hands" is meant just "confirmation."

[d. *American Presbyterian Recension*, 1789] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America | containing | the | Confession of Faith, | the | Catechisms, | the | Government and Discipline, | and the | Directory for the worship of God, | Ratified and adopted by the Synod of New York | and Philadelphia, held at Philadelphia | May the 16th, 1788, and continued by adjourn- | ments until the 28th of the same month. | Philadelphia: | Printed by Thomas Bradford, | In Front-street, fourth Door below Market-street. | M DCC LXXXIX.

12mo, pp. [vii], 205; 5½ x 2¾ inches (block of type.) Numerous subsequent editions, which are listed in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for January, 1902, pp. 76 *sq.*, which see.

The preparation of a "Constitution" for itself by the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America was a measure undertaken preparatory to the division of the Synod, which had hitherto been the governing body of the young Church, and the erection of a General Assembly, which latter body met for the first time in 1789. The original Synod had in 1729 adopted the Westminster Confession and Catechisms under the terms of a "Declaratory Act," announcing "the said Confession and Catechisms to be the confession of their faith, excepting only some clauses in the twentieth and twenty-third chapters, concerning which clauses the Synod do unanimously declare, that they do not receive those articles in any such sense as to suppose the civil magistrate hath a controlling power over Synods with respect to the exercise of their ministerial authority, or power to persecute any for their religion, or in any sense contrary to the Protestant succession to the throne of Great Britain" (*Records of the Presbyterian Church*, 1729, p. 93). As the time approached, however, for the constitution of the General Assembly,

“the Synod took into consideration the last paragraph of the twentieth chapter of the Westminster Confession of Faith; the third paragraph of the twenty-third chapter; and the first paragraph of the thirty-first chapter; and having made some alterations, agreed that the said paragraphs, as now altered, be printed for consideration. . . . And the Synod agreed that when the above alterations in the Confession of Faith shall have been finally determined on by the body, . . . the said Confession thus altered . . . shall be styled ‘The Confession of Faith . . . of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America’” (*Records*, etc., 1787, pp. 539-40). Accordingly the next year the proposed alterations were consummated, and it was ordered “that the Westminster Confession of Faith, as now altered, be printed in full . . . as making a part of the Constitution” (*Records*, etc., 1788, p. 546). The volume of 1789 was the result, and this altered form of the Westminster Confession has remained ever since the Confession of Faith of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, and has as such also naturally become the Confession of Faith of its daughter Church, the Presbyterian Church in the United States.

The following are the modifications thus made by the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America :

Chap. xx, § 4. Omit at the end, “and by the power of the Civil Magistrate.”

Chap. xxiii, § 3. The entire section is remodeled so as to read : “Civil magistrates may not assume to themselves the administration of the Word and Sacraments; or the power of the keys of the kingdom of heaven; or, in the least interfere in matters of faith. Yet as nursing fathers, it is the duty of civil magistrates to protect the Church of our common Lord, without giving the preference to any denomination of Christians above the rest, in such a manner that all ecclesiastical persons whatever shall enjoy the full, free, and unquestioned liberty of discharging every part of their sacred functions, without violence or danger. And, as Jesus Christ hath appointed a regular government and discipline in his Church, no law of any commonwealth should interfere with, let, or hinder, the due exercise thereof, among the voluntary members of *any* denomination of Christians, according to their own profession and belief. It is the duty of civil magistrates to protect the person and good name of all their people, in such an effectual manner as that no person be suffered, either upon pretense of religion or of infidelity, to offer any indignity, violence, abuse, or injury to any other person whatsoever: and to take order, that all religious and ecclesiastical assemblies be held without molestation or disturbance.”

Chap. xxx, § 1 Add “: and it belongeth to the overseers and other rulers of the particular churches, by virtue of their office, and the power which Christ has given them for edification and not for destruction, to appoint such assemblies; and to convene together in them, as often as they shall judge it expedient for the good of the Church.”

Chap. xxxi, § 2. Omit the entire section.

In addition to these modifications, the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America (but not its daughter Church, the Presbyterian Church in the United States, commonly known as “the Southern Presbyterian Church”) in 1886-7 struck out the last clause of chap. xxiv, § 4: “The man may not . . . of her own”; the object being “to remove any obstacle that may have existed to the marrying of a deceased wife’s sister,” but the real effect being to remove the erection of affinity into a bar to marriage of precisely the same reach as consanguinity.

[e. *Associate Reformed Recension*, 1799] The | Constitution | and | Standards | of the | Associate-Reformed Church | in North America. | New York : | Printed by T. & J. Swords, No. 99 Pearl-street. | 1799.

8vo, pp. 614, 6½ x 3½ inches (block of type). There are numerous subsequent

editions, for which see the list in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January, 1902, p. 116 *sq.*

On the constitution of the Synod of the Associate-Reformed Church. October 31, 1782, the Westminster Confession and Catechisms were declared to be its doctrinal standards; but a "Declaratory Act" was added excluding from this adoption "the following sections of the Confession of Faith, which define the power of civil government in relation to religion, Chap. xx, § 4; Chap. xxiii, § 3; Chap. xxxi, § 2," (Scouller's *History of the United Presbyterian Church*, etc., p. 165). At the Synod's meeting, May, 1799, the sections thus excepted were modified, as well as Larger Catechism Q. 109, and the Confession and Catechisms thus modified were declared to be the doctrinal standards of that Church, in the terms of the following act: "The Westminster Confession of Faith, with the Catechisms, Larger and Shorter, having been formerly received by the Synod, with a reservation for future discussion of the doctrine respecting the power of the civil magistrate in matters of religion; and the said doctrine being now modified in a manner more agreeable to the Word of God, to the nature of the Christian Church, and to the principles of civil society, The Synod do explicitly receive the aforesaid Confession and Catechisms, with the doctrine concerning the civil magistrate as now stated in the twentieth, twenty-third, and thirty-first chapters of the Confession, as the system of doctrine which is built upon the foundation of the Apostles and Prophets, Jesus Christ himself being the chief corner-stone. And the Synod do hereby declare, that the aforesaid Confession and Catechisms, as herein received, contain the true and genuine doctrine of the Associate-Reformed Church; and that no tenet contrary thereto, or any part thereof, shall be countenanced in this Church" (*The Constitution*, etc., p. 8).

The modifications thus made in the Westminster Confession by the Associate-Reformed Church of North America are the following:

Chap. [xx, § 4. For "power" read "powers" in first line: doubtless unintentional preservation of a bad reading.]

Chap. xx, § 4. Modify the last sentence, so as to read: "And for their publishing of such opinions, or maintaining of such practices, as are contrary to the light of nature, or to the known principles of Christianity, whether concerning faith, worship, conversation, or the order which Christ hath established in his Church, they may be lawfully called to account, and proceeded against by the censures of the church: and in proportion as their erroneous opinions or practices, either in their own nature, or in the manner of publishing or maintaining them, are destructive to the external peace of the Church, and of civil society, they may be also proceeded against by the power of the civil magistrate."

Chap. [xxiii, § 3. Omit "the" before "administration of the word": doubtless unintentional variation.]

Chap. xxiii, § 3. Modify from the first clause on—from the word "yet"—so as to read as follows: "yet, as the gospel revelation lays indispensable obligations upon all classes of people who are favoured with it, magistrates, as such, are bound to execute their respective offices in a subserviency thereto, administering government on Christian principles, and ruling in the fear of God, according to the directions of his word; as those who shall give an account to the lord Jesus, whom God hath appointed to be the judge of the world

Hence, magistrates, as such, in a Christian country, are bound to promote the Christian religion, as the most valuable interest of their subjects, by all such means as are not inconsistent with civil rights; and do not imply an interference with the policy of the church, which is the free and independent Kingdom of the Redeemer; nor an assumption of dominion over conscience."

Chap. xxxi, § 2. Substitute the following: "The ministers of Christ, of themselves, and by virtue of their office; or they with other fit persons, upon delegation from their churches, have the exclusive right to appoint, adjourn, or dissolve such

Synods or Councils: though, in extraordinary cases, it may be proper for magistrates to desire the calling of a Synod of ministers and other fit persons, to consult and advise with about matters of religion; and in such cases, it is the duty of the churches to comply with their desire.”

At the same time there was an amendment made of a single word in the 109 Q. of the Larger Catechism: “tolerating a false religion” being altered into “authorizing a false religion.”

[f. *The United Presbyterian Recension*, 1858] The Confession of Faith agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at Westminster, as received by the United Presbyterian Church of North America, with references to the proofs from the Holy Scriptures. Philadelphia: William S. Young, 1023 Race Street. Pittsburgh: William S. Rentoul. 1859.

18mo, pp. 94. See THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January, 1902, 119, No. lxxxiv.

The | Subordinate Standards | of the | United Presbyterian Church | of | North America. | Published by authority of the General Assembly. | [Copyright secured according to law.] | Pittsburgh: | United Presbyterian Board of Publication. | 1867.

16mo, pp. v, 593 + 76 + 24 + 12. Many other editions; see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January 1902, p. 119, No. lxxxv *sq.*

The United Presbyterian Church of North America is the result of a union effected in 1858 between the two churches known as The Associate-Reformed Church and The Associate Presbyterian Church. This union brought into one General Assembly the great body of American “Seceders.” The Associate-Reformed Church had modified the Westminster Confession (see above under e) at Chap. xx, § 4, xxiii, 3, xxx, 2. The Associate Presbyterian Church had retained the Westminster Confession unaltered, but in its “Testimony” had, without passing judgment on the doctrine of the Confession, expressed its own view of the relation of Church and State in a manner which shows that it was much the same as that of the Associate-Reformed.

In this document, which was a term of communion, it had said: “We do therefore assert, that, as the kingdom of Christ is spiritual, acknowledging no other laws and no other rulers than he has appointed in it, so the civil magistrate, as such, is no ruler in the Church of Christ; and has no right to interfere in the administration of its government. He is bound to improve every opportunity which his high station and extensive influence may give him, for promoting the faith of Christ, for opposing the enemies of this faith, for supporting and encouraging true godliness, and for discouraging whatever in principle or practice, is contrary to it. But to accomplish these ends it is not warrantable for him to use any kind of violence either towards the life, the property or the consciences of men. He ought not to punish any as heretics or schismatics, nor ought he to grant any privileges to those whom he judges professors of the true religion, which may hurt others in their natural rights. His whole duty as a magistrate respects men, not as Christians, but as members of civil society. The appointed means for promoting the kingdom of Christ are all of a spiritual nature. . . . If any article of our Confession of Faith seems to give any other power to the civil magistrate, in matters of religion, than what we have now declared to be competent to him, we are to be considered

as receiving it only in so far as it agrees with other articles of the same Confession, in which the spiritual nature of the Church is asserted, and the keys of the kingdom of heaven denied to belong to the civil magistrate; and in so far as it agrees with this declaration of our principles."

When the two Synods came together it was agreed that the Westminster Confession should be printed intact, while modifications of it at xx, 4, xxiii, 3, xxxv, 2, should be printed in a parallel column alongside of these sections of the original. Misunderstanding was further guarded against by publishing in "The Testimony of the United Presbyterian Church"—which is of equal authority with the Confession itself—not only an article on "The Headship of Christ," in which the spiritual nature of the Church is insisted upon, but also (in the Introduction) a comprehensive Declaration covering the whole subject. This Declaration is as follows: "To these Westminster Standards (including the Confession of Faith, Catechisms—Larger and Shorter—the Form of Presbyterian Church Government, and Directory for the Public Worship of God), we, as a church, declare our adherence, as containing a true exhibition of our faith as a branch of the Church of Christ. In making this declaration of adherence, we are not to be understood as giving our unqualified approbation of the principles respecting the power of the civil magistrate, as they are set forth in chap. 20th, sec. 4th; chap. 23d, sec. 3d; chap. 31st, sec. 2d, of the Westminster Confession. The language there employed has been variously interpreted, and by many thought to be inconsistent with that 'liberty of conscience' and that 'distinct government in the hands of church officers' which the Confession itself recognizes. For this reason we have deemed it a duty, without passing any judicial opinion in relation to the meaning of these parts of the Confession, to exhibit in a parallel column the acknowledged doctrine of this Church—leaving it to every reader to form his own opinion as to the agreement or disagreement between the views thus set forth. This course we have been led to adopt, from a desire to avoid doing violence to that feeling of veneration, which all true Presbyterians cherish for this standard of faith to which the Church, under God, is so much indebted; and, at the same time, to discharge a duty that is resting upon us, to exhibit clearly and fully what we believe to be the principles of divine truth on this subject" (*Subordinate Standards*, etc., p. 540).

It might have been expected that, for these new statements of doctrine, to be printed alongside of the text of the Confession at the designated points, the sections prepared by the Associate-Reformed Church in 1799 would be adopted. On the contrary, however, entirely new sections were drawn up, in which (especially in that printed alongside of xxiii, 3) the influence of the modifications prepared by the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America in 1788 is apparent. These United Presbyterian modifications are as follows (we have used the edition of *The Subordinate Standards*, etc., printed in 1867):

Chap. xx, § 4. "And because the powers which God hath ordained, and the liberty which Christ hath purchased, are not intended by God to destroy, but mutually to uphold and preserve one another; they who upon pretense of Christian liberty, shall oppose any lawful power, or the lawful exercise of it, whether it be civil or ecclesiastical, resist the ordinance of God. And for the publishing of such opinions, or maintaining such practices as are contrary to the light of nature or to the known principles of Christianity, whether concerning faith, worship or conversation, or to the power of godliness; or such erroneous opinions or practices as, either in their own nature or in the manner of publishing or maintaining them, are destructive to the external peace and order which Christ has established in the Church; they ought to be called to account and proceeded against by the censures of the Church

if they belong to her Communion, and thus be amenable to her own spiritual authority. And as the civil magistrate is the minister of God for good to the virtuous, and a revenger to execute wrath upon him that doeth evil, he is therefore bound to suppress individuals and combinations, whatever may be their avowed objects, whether political or religious, whose principles and practices, openly propagated and maintained, are calculated to subvert the foundations of properly constituted society."

Chap. xxiii, § 3. "The civil magistrate may not assume to himself the administration of the Word and Sacraments, or the power of the keys of the Kingdom of heaven, or in the least interfere to regulate matters of faith and worship. As nursing fathers, magistrates are bound to administer their government according to the revealed principles of Christianity, and improve the opportunities which their high station and extensive influence afford in promoting the Christian religion as their most valuable interest and the good of the people demand, by all such means as do not imply any infringement of the inherent rights of the Church; or any assumption of dominion over the consciences of men. They ought not to punish any as heretics or schismatics. No authoritative judgment concerning matters of religion is competent to them, as their authority extends only to the external works or practices of their subjects as citizens, and not as Christians. It is their duty to protect the Church, in such a manner that all ecclesiastical persons shall enjoy the full, free and unquestioned liberty of discharging every part of their sacred functions without violence or danger. They should enact no law which would in any way interfere with, or hinder the due exercise of government or discipline established by Jesus Christ in His Church. It is their duty, also, to protect the person, good name, estate, natural and civil rights of all their subjects, in such a way that no person be suffered upon any pretence to violate them; and to take order that all religious and ecclesiastical assemblies be held without molestation or disturbance. God alone being Lord of the conscience, the civil magistrate may not compel any under his civil authority to worship God contrary to the dictates of their own consciences, yet it is competent in him to restrain such opinions, and punish such practices, as tend to subvert the foundations of civil society and violate the common rights of men."

Chap. xxxi, § 2. "We declare that as the Church of Jesus Christ is a kingdom distinct from and independent of the State, having a government, laws, office-bearers and all spiritual powers peculiar to herself, for her own edification; so it belongs exclusively to the ministers of Christ, together with other fit persons, upon delegation from their churches, by virtue of their office and the intrinsic power committed to them, to appoint their own assemblies and to convene together in them, as often as they shall judge it expedient for the good of the Church."

In Q. 109 of the Larger Catechism, the alteration made by the Associate-Reformed Synod of 1799 is not retained, but the Westminster "tolerating" is reverted to.

[g. *The Cumberland Recension*, 1814] [g^l. 1815] The | Constitu-
tion | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church, | in the |
· United States of America: | containing | the Confession of
Faith, a Catechism, | the Government and Discipline, | and
the Directory for the | Worship of God. | Ratified and
adopted by the Synod of Cumber- | land, held at Sugg's
Creek, in Tennessee | State, April the 5th, 1814, and con-
tinued by | adjournments, until the 9th of the same month. |

Nashville, T. | Printed by M. & J. Norvell, | for the Publishers. | 1815.

12mo, pp. vi, 154; $5\frac{3}{4} \times 2\frac{5}{8}$ inches (block of type); neatly bound in leather. There is a page of errata on the back of the title-page: then come the address "To the Christian Reader," occupying two pages; a Table of Contents occupying two pages; and then the Text of the Confession with the proof-references (but not the passages) inserted at the end of each chapter. The Catechism is a modified Shorter Catechism: the Westminster Larger Catechism was not retained in the Cumberland formularies. There are copies of this edition in the libraries of Prof. J. V. Stephens, D.D., of Lebanon, Tenn., and of the Rev. Henry C. McCook, D.D., of Philadelphia. A description of this edition has been printed by Dr. McCook in the *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society* for December, 1901 (vol. I, No. 2), p. 209. Compare also the full account of its origin given by Prof. Stephens in an article, entitled *The Evolution of the Confession of Faith of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church*, printed in the *Cumberland Presbyterian Quarterly* for April, 1902.

The Cumberland Presbytery, which was constituted in 1810, retained the standards of the Presbyterian Church as its constitution, with an express permission, however, of liberty in the matter of Predestination. The compact entered into by the founders of this new body, February 4, 1810, included the following paragraph: "All candidates for the ministry who may hereafter be licensed by this Presbytery, and all licentiates and probationers who may hereafter be ordained by this Presbytery, shall be required, before such licensure and ordination, to receive and adopt the Confession and Discipline of the Presbyterian Church, except the idea of fatality, which seems to be taught under the mysterious doctrine of Predestination. It is to be understood, however, that such as can clearly receive the Confession without exception, shall not be required to make any" (*A Circular Letter* issued by order of the Cumberland Presbytery in 1810, pp. 11, 12; cf. Stephens, *l.c.*). At the spring meeting of the Presbytery, 1813, provision was made for its division into three Presbyteries and the formation of a Synod, to convene for the first time in the ensuing October, and Messrs. Finis Ewing and Robert Donnell were appointed "a committee to draft a complete, though succinct account of the rise, doctrines, etc., of the Cumberland Presbytery." On October 6 the report of this committee was made to the Synod, and the report was approved and ordered to be printed in the Third American edition of *Buck's Theological Dictionary*, where it duly appeared on the issue of that book (Philadelphia: W. W. Woodward, 1814, pp. 386-389). In this report the declaration of the relation of the new church to the Presbyterian standards made by the Cumberland Presbytery in 1810 was repeated, but the indeterminate position there taken up as to the doctrine of Predestination is evacuated by the addition of the positive declaration that the Cumberland Presbyterians "dissent from the Confession . . . in 1st. That there are no eternal reprobates.—2d. That Christ died not for a part only, but for all mankind.—3d. That all infants, dying in infancy, are saved through Christ and the sanctification of the Spirit.—4th. That the Spirit of God operates on the world, or as co-extensively as Christ has made atonement, in such a manner as to leave all men inexcusable." There is the germ of a new creed here; and of a new creed which should not run on precisely the same lines with the Westminster Confession. In the presence of this declaration of doctrine the retention of the unaltered Westminster Standards as the norm of doctrine of the Church were a gross inconsistency. We cannot be surprised, therefore, to learn that at the same meeting the Synod made provision for the drafting of a new creed. On October 7, 1813, the following minute was adopted: "After much deliberation the Synod came to the following resolu-

tion, to wit: The period having come when a distinct Confession of Faith, Catechism and Discipline appear to be necessary for the distinct society of the Cumberland Presbyterians; *Resolved, therefore*, that William McGee, Robert Donnell, Thomas Calhoun and Finis Ewing be appointed a committee to draw up and prepare for the press a Confession, Catechism and Discipline in conformity to the avowed principles of this body, to be ready by the next meeting of this body."

"This committee," we are told, "simply read over the Westminster Confession, item by item, changing or expunging such expressions as did not suit them. This process was repeated" (Foster, *A Sketch of the History of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church*, in the "American Church History Series," xi, 305). The report was made to the Synod at a meeting held in April, 1814: "The committee appointed by the Synod for the purpose of compiling a Confession upon the avowed principles of this body, being enquired at, reported that they have complied with the order and proceeded to read." The result was the adoption of the above-named Confession by a unanimous vote. "Messrs. Finis Ewing and Hugh Kirkpatrick have mutually agreed to print the Confession of Faith of the Cumberland Presbyterians, at eighty-seven and one-half cents per copy, upon good writing paper, neatly bound and lettered, to which the Synod was unanimously agreed."

In the preface of this book, addressed "to the Christian reader," the Synod said: "With respect to the Confession, it will be seen the Synod have adopted many whole chapters of the old [Westminster] almost verbatim. In others they have retained part and expunged part, sometimes adding a section, or a part of a section, to make the sense more full and more compatible with their ideas of the gospel. They have endeavored to erase from the old Confession the idea of fatality *only*, which has long since appeared to them to be taught in a part of that book. But, notwithstanding the Synod have ventured to model, to expunge and to add to the Confession of the General Presbyterian Church, yet they are free to declare that they think, in the main, that to be an admirable work, especially to be performed so shortly after Roman superstition and idolatry had almost covered the whole Christian world."

[g². 1821] The | Constitution | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church, | in the | United States of America : | containing | The Confession of Faith, A Catechism, the | Government and Discipline, and | the Directory for the | Worship of God. | Ratified and adopted by the Synod of Cumberland, held | at Sugg's Creek, in Tennessee State, April the 5th, | 1814, and continued by adjournments, until the 9th of | the same month. | Russellville : | Printed by Charles Rhea, | for the Publishers. | 1821.

8vo, pp. 4 unnumbered, with the one at the back of title-page blank, 137, and 3 unnumbered at the back of the book, containing table of contents; 6½ x 3¼ inches (block of type); neatly printed and bound in leather. This is substantially a reprint of the 1815 edition in somewhat larger type. The same rule is followed in reference to the proof-texts. Russellville is a small town in Kentucky, about 140 miles southwest of Louisville. There are copies in the libraries of Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn., and Dr. McCook, of Philadelphia. A description of this edition has been printed by Dr. McCook, *loc. cit.*, p. 210.

[g³. 1830] The | Constitution | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian | Church, | in the U. States of America : | containing | The

Confession of Faith ; A Catechism ; | The Government and Discipline ; A | Directory for the Worship of God. | Second Edition. | Revised and Adopted by the | General Assembly at Prince- | ton, Ky. May 1829. | Fayetteville : | Printed by Ebenezer and J. B. Hill. | 1830.

Pp. iv, 177, and 3 unnumbered at back, containing table of contents ; 4 x 2½ inches (block of type) ; bound in leather ; proof-texts, as in former editions, only cited. The place of printing, Fayetteville, is a small town in Tennessee, about 75 miles south of Nashville. This edition owes its origin to the division of the Synod and the organization of a General Assembly, which took place in 1829. It is called the "second edition," doubtless in contrast to the Synodical editions, which together are counted as one, because the first edition, that is form, of the "Constitution." At the meeting in 1829 a Committee was appointed "to revise and prepare for publication those parts of the Form of Government of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church, which require alteration, in order to adapt them to the constitution of a General Assembly." This Committee submitted a report which was approved ; and the Rev. Robert Donnell and Samuel Harris were appointed "to superintend the publication of 5000 copies," the edition appearing in 1830. This edition differs from the former in the "Form of Government," where Chap. x, "Of the Synodical Assembly," is so modified as to make the Synod a subordinate instead of the highest Church court, and two chapters are added, one on "The General Assembly" and one on "Commissioners to the General Assembly."

There is a copy of this edition in the library of Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn. ; and a description of it is published by Dr. McCook in the *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society* for March, 1902 (vol. I, No. 3), p. 2 4.

[g^d. 1834] The | Constitution | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church, | in the | United States of America : | containing | The Confession of Faith, The Catechism, and A | Directory for the Worship of God : | together with the | Form of Government and Discipline, | As Revised and Adopted by the General Assembly | at Princeton, Ky. May, 1829. | Third Edition. | Nashville : | Printed by James Smith | 1834.

16mo, pp. 334, and 3 unnumbered at the back, containing the table of contents ; 4½ x 3 inches (block of type) ; well printed and bound in leather. In the heading of the "Preface" the words "to the First Edition" are omitted ; and the note, previously occurring at the bottom of the first page of the address "To the Christian Reader," explaining the omission of the Larger Catechism no longer appears. This is the first edition in which the proof-texts are printed in full (and not merely cited by reference, as in earlier editions, except in part of chap. xvii, on the Perseverance of the Saints, in which chapter some of the texts are given at large in the earlier editions). In both the 1834 and the 1837 editions Mr. Smith added a note of explanation in reference to "the keys of the kingdom," as found in the Confession of Faith, chap. xxx, section ii. The General Assembly approved the note as it appeared in the 1834 edition. The same note appeared in all subsequent editions, so far as is known, until the Revised Confession appeared (1883).

No authority can be found authorizing Mr. Smith to print an edition of the Confession, though it is probable that the General Assembly did give its sanction, from the fact that Mr. Smith was at that time editing and printing the

Church paper. He was well prepared, in those days, with a steam press to do good work. Mr. Smith was of Scotch descent; a very able minister, and died in Scotland during the Civil War, whither he had gone by the appointment of President Lincoln upon some mission.

There are copies of this edition in the library of Dr. Stephens, Lebanon, Tenn., and in the Library of Congress, Washington (kindly reported by Allen R. Boyd, Esq., Secretary of the Library); and a description of it is printed by Dr. McCook, *l.c.*, p. 254.

[g⁵. 1837] The | Constitution | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church, | containing | The Confession of Faith, Catechism, | and A Directory for the Worship of God: | together with the | Form of Government and Discipline, | As Revised and Adopted by the General | Assembly at Princeton, Ky. | May 1829. | Fourth Edition. | Nashville: | Printed at Smith's Steam Press. | 1837.

Pp. 296, and 3 unnumbered at the back, containing the table of contents; $4\frac{9}{16} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type); well printed and bound in leather. This is a reprint of the 1834 edition. Observe the omission from the title-page, of the words "in the United States of America." There is a copy of this edition in the library of Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn., and it is described by Dr. McCook, *l.c.*, pp. 254-255.

[g⁵. 1843] The | Constitution | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America. | Containing | The Confession of Faith; the Catechism; | and A Directory for the Worship of God. | Together with the Form of | Government and Discipline. | Revised and Adopted by the General Assembly, | at Princeton, Ky., May, 1829. | Pittsburgh: | Printed by Arthur A. Anderson. | 1843.

Pp. 178, and 12 pages at the back of the book, containing "General Rules for Judicatories" and table of contents; $4\frac{3}{8} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). The prefatory matter is identical with that of the editions of 1830, 1834, 1837, except that references to Mr. Smith's History in two footnotes in the edition of 1837 are omitted. The footnote on the Larger Catechism reappears. The main difference between this edition and its immediate predecessors is indicated by a footnote on p. 80: "*Note.* The reader will perceive that we have merely given the chapter and verse in the Scripture references. 1st. Because in reading the references it is more satisfactory to us to have the Bible in our hand, and from the references to turn to the chapter and verse, and examine it in its connection. It is a little additional labor, but the compensation to the reader is ample. 2d. We asked the opinion of several brethren who unhesitatingly said it was the better way, not only for the reason mentioned, but in order to reduce the price of the book in these hard times and secure for it a better circulation." To whom the "we" (the publishers) in this note refers cannot positively be determined, though it is altogether likely that the Rev. Dr. Milton Bird was the responsible publisher of this edition as of the immediately subsequent one: and it is also probable that he was acting in this under the authority of the Synod of Pennsylvania. The Rev. Dr. B. W. McDonold, in his *History of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church*, p. 313, says: "For several years each Synod made its own arrangements about having the Confession of

Faith and Catechism published." This and the immediately subsequent editions are the only ones we have met with which seem to fall under this statement.

There is a copy of this edition in the library of Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.; and Dr. McCook describes it, *l.c.*, p. 255.

[g⁷. 1844] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America | Revised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly, at Princeton, Ky., May, 1829. | Stereotyped by J. A. James. | Pittsburgh: | Published by Milton Bird. | A. A. Anderson, Printer. | 1844.

Pp. x, 286; $4\frac{1}{8} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). The proof-texts are printed in full. This seems to be the first edition of the Cumberland Confession that was printed from stereotyped plates. The Board of Publication of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church, which was organized in 1847, acquired these plates and issued editions from them. Certainly as many as four editions were issued by the Board from them, viz.—1848, [1850], [1851], [1855], as given below. This is the first edition bearing the title "The Confession of Faith," etc.

There is a copy of this edition in the library of Rev. Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.; and another was reported to us by the Robert Clark Co., Cincinnati, Ohio (letter of January 22, 1902).

[g⁸. 1848] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America | Revised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly at Princeton, Ky., May, 1829 | Stereotyped by J. A. James | Published | By Cumberland Presbyterian Board | Of Publication | 1848.

Pp. x, 286; $4\frac{1}{8} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type); neatly printed and bound in leather. Proof-texts are printed in full. This edition is from the same plates as that mentioned immediately previously. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.; and it is listed by Dr. McCook, as cited, p. 256. See below under g¹¹ as to place of publication.

[g⁹. 1850] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America | Revised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly, at Princeton, Ky., May, 1829 | Stereotyped by J. A. James | Published | By Cumberland Presbyterian Board | of Publication. | [No date].

Pp. x, 286; $4\frac{1}{8} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). This edition is printed from the same plates from which the immediately preceding editions were printed. Like the edition of 1848, it has nothing to show where the printing was done, but evidently Louisville was the place. It will also be observed that this imprint has no date. The annual report of the Board for 1849-50 shows that an edition of 5000 copies of the Confession had been got out. Whether this was done in 1849 or 1850 cannot be positively determined, but probably it was done in 1850, and there is reason to believe that this edition is the one thus mentioned. There is a copy of it in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[g¹⁰. 1851] The | Confession of Faith | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition].

There is a copy of this issue in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, of

Lebanon, Tenn. The condition of the plates as revealed in the printing shows it to be a later issue than that of [1850], from which it otherwise differs in no respect : it also seems inferrible from the report of the Board of 1851 that such an edition was issued—though that fact is not affirmed ; the number of copies reported in stock, however, as compared with earlier reports, appears to imply that a new issue had been made.

[g¹¹. 1855] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Pres-
byterian Church | in the | United States of America | Re-
vised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly, At Prince-
ton, Ky., 1829. | Stereotyped by J. A. James. | Published |
By Cumberland Presbyterian Board | Of Publication | [No
date].

There is a copy of this edition in the library Dr. Stephens, Lebanon, Tenn. The date of its issue is determined from the report of the Board. The Board of Publication of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church was at its organization located at Louisville, Ky., and had its work done in that city by contract. Doubtless both this and the editions mentioned immediately before it (which do not record the place of publication) were issued from that place.

[g¹². 1860] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Pres-
byterian Church | in the | United States of America. | Re-
vised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly at Princeton,
Ky., May, 1829. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Board of Publication
of the Cumberland | Presbyterian Church. | 1860.

Pp. iv, 272 ; $4\frac{1}{2} \times 2\frac{5}{8}$ inches (block of type); excellent job of printing and binding. The proof-texts are printed in full. On the back of the title-page is found : "Printed by A. A. Stitt | Southern Methodist Publishing House, | Nashville, Tenn." | The Board of Publication, then located at Nashville, reported in 1860 that new plates of the Confession had been made and that 1008 copies had been printed from these plates. Great pains were taken to procure an exact set of plates on this occasion. All the imprints of this Confession from 1860 to 1880—of which there were at least eleven—were made from these plates.

A copy of this edition is in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[g¹³. 1861] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Pres-
byterian Church | in the | United States of America. | Re-
vised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly, at Princeton,
Ky., May, 1829. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Board of Publication
of the Cumberland | Presbyterian Church. | 1861.

Pp. iv, 272 ; $4\frac{1}{2} \times 2\frac{5}{8}$ inches (block of type); excellent job of printing and binding. From the same plates as the immediately preceding edition. There are copies in the libraries of the Rev. Drs. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn., and McCook, of Philadelphia ; and it is described by Dr. McCook in the *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society* for December, 1901 (I, ii), p. 211.

[g¹⁴. 1864] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Pres-
byterian Church | in the | United States of America. | Re-
vised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly, at Prince-

ton, Ky., May, 1829. | Pittsburgh : | Board of Publication of the Cumberland | Presbyterian Church. | 1864.

32mo, $4\frac{9}{16}$ x $2\frac{1}{16}$ inches (block of type), pp. 272. Pages iii-iv contain the "Preface"; pages 5-7, the "Contents"; p. 8 is blank; pages 9-167 contain "The Confession of Faith" with proof-texts in full; pages 168-189, the "Catechism"; pp. 190-234, the "Form of Government and Discipline"; pages 239-242, the "Form of Process"; pages 243-272, the "Directory for the Worship of God." The Publication work of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church was carried on at Pittsburgh during the course of the Civil War: this is one of the issues of the Confession made in this period. There are copies of this edition in the libraries of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, and of Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[g¹⁵. 1866] [The | Confession of Faith | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition] | Pittsburgh : | Board of Publication of the Cumberland | Presbyterian Church. | 1866.]

No copy of this issue has turned up: but its manufacture is reported in the Report of the Board of Publication for 1866. So the Rev. Dr. Stephens reports. It is possible, of course, that this issue was taken from the plates without changing the date-line (1864).

[g¹⁶. 1867] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America. | Revised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly, at Princeton, Ky., May, 1829. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Board of Publication of the Cumberland | Presbyterian Church. | 1867.

Pp. iv, 272; $4\frac{1}{2}$ x $2\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). This imprint is made from the same plates described in No. 12. The imprints of 1864 and [1866] at Pittsburgh were also made from the same plates. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[g¹⁷. 1868] The | Confession of Faith | etc. [as in the preceding edition,] | Nashville, Tenn.: | Board of Publication of the Cumberland | Presbyterian Church. | 1868.

From the same plates as the preceding edition. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[g¹⁸. 1869] The | Confession of Faith | etc. [as in the preceding edition] | Nashville, Tenn.: | Board of Publication of the Cumberland | Presbyterian Church. | 1869.

A reprint of the preceding edition: the report of the Board of Publication shows that 1000 copies were printed off in 1869. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[g¹⁹. 1870] The | Confession of Faith | etc. [as above], | 1870.

From the same plates. A "Manual" of fourteen pages was bound in at the end of this edition, and this is continued in all succeeding editions, except that of 1872 (g²⁰ below, p. 417), from which the "Manual" is dropped. There is a copy of this edition in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[g²⁰. 1872] The | Confession of Faith, | etc. [as above]. | 1872.

From the same plates. In the library of Dr. Stephens. The "Manual" is omitted.

[g²¹. 1874] The | Confession of Faith | etc. [as above], 1874.

From the same plates. In the library of Dr. Stephens. The "Manual" is restored.

[g²². 1875] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | in the United States of America. | etc. [as in the immediately preceding editions]. Nashville, Tenn., | Cumberland Presbyterian Publishing House. | T. C. Blake, D.D., Publishing Agent. | 41 Union St. | 1875.

32mo, pp. 286: same contents as the immediately preceding editions, including addition at end of a "Manual | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church, | adopted by the | General Assembly | at Murfreesboro, Tennessee, May, 1869" | pp. 273-286. There is a copy in Dr. Stephens' library and there is also a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia, Pa., who has also described it, *loc. cit.*, p. 211. This appears to be the first edition bearing the name of Mr. Blake on the title-page.

[g²³. 1878] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America. | etc. [as in the immediately preceding editions]. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Cumberland Presbyterian Publishing House. | T. C. Blake, D.D., Publishing Agent. | 41 Union Street. | 1878.

32mo, pp. iv, 5, 286. There is a copy in the Library of Congress, Washington, D.C.; and another in Dr. Stephens' library.

[g²⁴. 1879] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | of the | United States of America. | Revised and Adopted by the General Assem- | bly, at Princeton, Ky., May, 1829. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Board of Publication, C. P. Church. | 1879.

32mo, pp. iv, 286; $4\frac{2}{15} \times 2\frac{2}{15}$ inches (block of type). Same contents as in preceding edition. There are copies in the libraries of the Theological Seminary at Princeton and of Dr. Stephens, Lebanon, Tenn.

[g²⁵. 1880] The | Confession of Faith | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | of the | United States of America. | etc. [as in the immediately preceding edition]. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Board of Publication, C. P. Church. | 1880.

32mo, pp. iv; 286; $4\frac{2}{15} \times 2\frac{2}{15}$ inches (block of type). Same contents as in preceding edition. There are copies in the libraries of the Theological Seminary at Princeton, and of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, Lebanon, Tenn.

In the list above given we have probably been able to enumerate most, if not all, of the issues of the first form of the Cumberland Confession of Faith. We have been enabled to do so chiefly by a very full catalogue and description of editions put at our disposal by the Rev. Dr. J. V. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn., from whose notes we have drawn with the utmost freedom. Dr. Stephens has

copies of the following issues in his library, viz.:—1815, 1821, 1830, 1834, 1837, 1843, 1844, 1848, 1850, 1851, 1855, 1860, 1861, 1864, 1867, 1868, 1869, 1870, 1872, 1874, 1875, 1878, 1879, 1880,—that is, of all the issues noted above, except that of 1866. We have also enjoyed the benefit of communications from Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia, and have availed ourselves of the two papers he has printed on the subject in successive numbers of the *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society* (I, ii and iii). The latter of these papers is based on information furnished chiefly by the Rev. W. A. Provine, of Columbia, Tenn.

The history of the formation of this Confession has already been outlined in the notes under its initial issue, supplemented by those under the immediately subsequent issues. The Constitution completed for the first Assembly (1829), and published in its perfected form in 1830, continued to be of force in the Cumberland Presbyterian Church until 1883, when a revised Constitution was adopted.

The following are the principal changes introduced by the Cumberland revision of 1813–1814 into the Westminster Confession. That is, of course into the Confession of Faith of the Presbyterian Church of the United States of America—for it was this recension of the Westminster Confession that was in the hands of the fathers of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church and from it that they marked their divergences. No attempt has been made to record all the variations that appear in the printed text. Many changes of punctuation occur,—apparently, however, only accidentally; and it is hard to believe that some of the changes in words also are not accidental. The list given below contains all the changes that are of significance and a sufficient number of the more minute variations to serve as a sample of the whole. The text used for the comparison is that of the issue of 1880.

Chap. i, § 1, last clause. Instead of “the Holy Scripture” read “the whole Scripture.”

Chap. i, § 2, first clause. Instead of “Scripture” read “Scriptures.”

Chap. i, § 3. Omit “of” before “no authority.”

Chap. i, § 5. Omit “the” before “efficacy.”

Chap. i, § 8. Omit “to be” before “translated.”

Chap. ii, § 3. Omit the whole of last sentence: “The Father is of none . . . the Son.”

Chap. iii, § 1. Remodel so as to read: “God did, by the most wise and holy counsel of his own will, determine to act or bring to pass what should be for his own glory.”

Chap. iii, § 2. Remodel so as to read: “God has not decreed anything respecting his creature man, contrary to his revealed will or written word; which declares his sovereignty over all his creatures, the ample provision he has made for their salvation, his determination to punish the finally impenitent with everlasting destruction, and to save the true believer with an everlasting salvation.”

Chap. iii, § 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8. Omit entirely: but a very long note is attached to the end of § 2 arguing the whole question of the Decree of God: this note may be found extracted in SCHAFF’S *Creeeds of Christendom*, iii, 772–3.

Chap. v, § 1. Omit “actions.”

Chap. v, § 1. Omit “according to his infallible foreknowledge, and the free and immutable counsel of his own will.”

Chap. v, § 2. Omit entirely.

Chap. v, § 3, [2]. Instead of “without, above, and against,” read “with and above”—and observe that the proof-text for “without” is retained for “with”!

Chap. v, § 4. Omit entirely.

Chap. v, § 5, [3]. Insert "the" before "manifold."

Chap. v, § 5, [3]. Omit "or" before "to discover."

Chap. v, § 5, [3]. Instead of "occasions of" read "occasions to."

Chap. v, § 6, [4]. Omit "and exposeth them to such objects as their corruption makes occasion of sin."

Chap. v, § 6, [4]. Omit "the" before "softening."

Chap. vi, § 1. Instead of "permit, having purposed to order it to his own glory," read "overrule, through Christ, for his own glory, and the good of them that believe."

Chap. vi, § 3. Instead of "the guilt of sin was imputed" read "by their sin all were made sinners."

Chap. vi, § 5. Instead of "This corruption of nature, during this life, doth remain in those" read "The remains of corrupt nature are felt by those."

Chap. vi, § 6. Omit "both original and actual."

Chap. vii, § 3. Omit "and promising to give unto all those that are ordained unto life, his Holy Spirit to make them willing and able to believe."

Chap. viii, § 1. Insert "has" before "pleased."

Chap. viii, § 1. Omit "in his eternal purpose."

Chap. viii, § 1. Omit "and ordain."

Chap. viii, § 1. Insert "who verily was foreordained before the foundation of the world" before "to be the Mediator."

Chap. viii, § 1. Instead of "unto whom he did from all eternity give a people to be his seed" read "unto whom he promised a seed."

Chap. viii, § 1. Insert after "called" "by his word and Spirit."

Chap. viii, § 1. Insert after "justified" "by his grace."

Chap. viii, § 2. Instead of "two" read "these" before "whole."

Chap. viii, § 5. Instead of "whom the Father hath given unto him" read "who come to the Father by him."

Chap. viii, § 8. Remodel at the opening so as to read thus: "Jcsus Christ, by the grace of God, has tasted death for every man, and now makes intercession for transgressors; by virtue of which, the Holy Spirit is given to convince of sin, and enable the creature to believe and obey; governing the hearts of believers by his word and Spirit. . . ."

Chap. ix, § 3. Add at end "without Divine aid."

Chap. ix, § 4. Instead of "not only will that which is good, but doth also that which is evil," read "will do that which is good."

Chap. x, § 1. Instead of "hath predestinated unto life" read "calls, and who obey the call."

Chap. x, § 1. Omit "in his appointed and accepted time."

Chap. x, § 1. Instead of "effectually to call by his word and Spirit" read "to bring."

Chap. x, § 2. Omit "effectual."

Chap. x, § 2. Omit "and special."

Chap. x, § 2. Instead of "thing" read "good."

Chap. x, § 2. Instead of "passive therein" read "dead in sin."

Chap. x, § 2. Instead of "quickened and renewed" read "enlightened."

Chap. x, § 3. Instead of "Elect" read "All."

Chap. x, § 3. Instead of "other elect persons" read "others."

Chap. x, § 3. Insert before "who are incapable," "who have never had the exercise of reason, and."

Chap. x, § 4. Omit entirely.

Chap. xi, § 1. Instead of "effectually calleth" read "calleth (and who obey the call)."

Chap. xi, § 4. Instead of "God did, from all eternity decree to justify all the elect," read "God, before the foundation of the world, determined to justify all true believers."

Chap. xi, § 5. Instead of "can" read "will."

Chap. xiii, § 4. Omit entirely.

Chap. xiv, § 1. Instead of "whereby the elect are enabled to believe to the saving of their souls," read "whereby sinners are united to Christ."

Chap. xiv, § 3. Omit "many to" in the second clause.

Chap. xiv, § 3. Instead of "through Christ" read "of Christ."

Chap. xvi, § 7. Instead of "men" at opening read "man."

Chap. xvi, § 7. Instead of "they are therefore sinful, and cannot please God, or make a man meet to receive grace from God," read "they therefore cannot merit the favor of God."

Chap. xvi, § 7. Omit "and" before "yet."

Chap. xvi, § 7. Omit "more sinful, and."

Chap. xvii, § 1. Remodel at the opening so as to read: "They whom God hath justified and sanctified, he will also glorify; consequently the *truly* regenerated soul will never totally . . ."

Chap. xvii, § 2. Omit "of the saints" at opening.

Chap. xvii, § 2. Remodel at the beginning so as to read: "Depends on the unchangeable love and power of God; the merits, advocacy and intercession of Jesus Christ; the abiding . . . "*"

Chap. xvii, § 3. Add at the beginning: "Although there are examples in the Old Testament of good men having egregiously sinned, and some of them continuing for a time therein; yet now since life and immortality are brought clearer to light by the Gospel, and especially since the effusion of the Holy Ghost on the day of Pentecost, we may not expect the true Christian to fall into such gross sins."

Chap. xvii, § 3. Instead of "and of the world, the prevalency of corruption remaining in them and the neglect . . ." read "the world, and the flesh, the neglect . . ."

Chap. xvii, § 3. Instead of "means of their preservation" read "means of grace."

Chap. xvii, § 3. Instead of "grievous sins" read "sin."

Chap. xvii, § 3. Omit "for a time continue therein, whereby they."

Chap. xvii, § 3. Omit "have their hearts hardened" and insert "have" after the next "and."

Chap. xvii, § 3. Omit "hurt and scandalize others, and bring temporal judgments upon themselves," and insert at end "but the real Christian can never rest satisfied therein."

Chap. xix, § 3. Omit "to" before "the people."

Chap. xx, § 1. Insert "of" before "which" at opening of second sentence.

Chap. xxviii, § 6. Omit last clause, "to such . . . appointed time."

Chap. xxviii, § 7. Add at end: "There being no example for the repetition of Christian baptism."

Chap. xxix, § 2. Omit "of" between "offering up" and "himself."

Chap. xxix, § 2. Instead of "for all the sins of the elect" read "of the sins of all the world."

The Cumberland Confession of 1815 was obviously not adapted permanently to satisfy the Church. The process by which it was formed was too hasty and superficial to result in anything more than a makeshift. The document actually produced was clearly neither one thing nor the other. All the expressions in the Westminster Confession, explicitly enunciating Predestination had been expunged: but much implying it was left. It is not remarkable that

*There is a longish note attached to this section; it is given in full by SCHAFF, *loc. cit.*, p. 775.

agitations for a "revision" of it marked the history of the Cumberland Church from almost the beginning. What is remarkable is that they were so slow in making headway. Even as late as 1841 the Assembly refused to consider a proposition for a revision. Again in 1845 it declined to listen to a memorial looking to that end brought in from the Synod of West Tennessee. In 1853-1854 the work of revision was actually attempted, but failed in its later stages. Renewed efforts to secure revision were made in 1868. It was not until 1881, however, that it was finally taken in hand and carried through. At the Assembly of 1881, met at Austin, Tex., two committees were appointed, the one to draw up the draft of the revised Confession, the other to review and revise the work of the first. They met duly at Lebanon, Tenn., and after completing their work, published it in pamphlet form and in the Church journals, "that criticism might be made by those desiring to do so." These criticisms were considered by the committees at subsequent meetings and their perfected work reported to the Assembly of 1882. This Assembly reviewed the work carefully, and after amending it transmitted it to the Presbyteries for approval or disapproval. Their verdict proving favorable, the new Confession was formally adopted at the Assembly of 1883, met at Nashville, Tenn. For a succinct account of the agitations looking towards the revision and of the history of the preparation of this revision, see the paper of Prof. John V. Stephens, D.D., in the *Cumberland Presbyterian Quarterly* for April, 1902, already cited.

The following list of editions of this new Cumberland Confession has been drawn up largely from materials kindly furnished by Dr. Stephens. Dr. Stephens possesses copies of the issues of 1882, 1882, 1884, 1884, 1885, 1891, 1893, 1898 and 1901.

[gg. *The Cumberland Reconstruction (Second Form)*, 1883] [gg¹. 1882] [The Revised Confession of Faith in First Draught, 1882].

When the committee appointed in 1881 had completed the new Confession in first draught, the results of their labors were published in pamphlet form and in the weekly papers of the Church for information, "that criticism might be made by those desiring to do so." So we are informed by the Preface to the Revised Version. This publication was accordingly made either late in 1881 or early in 1882. There is a copy of it in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, Lebanon, Tenn.

[gg². 1882] [The Revised Confession of Faith in its perfected form, 1882.]

The General Assembly of 1882 received the Revised Confession in draught from the hands of its committee, and after introducing a number of changes into it, mostly verbal, transmitted the book to the Presbyteries for their approval or disapproval. This implies its printing in the form given it by the amendments of the Assembly. See Stephens, as cited, and McCook, *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society*, March, 1902 (I, iii), p. 253, note †. There is a copy of this issue in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens.

[gg³. 1883] [The Revised Confession of Faith, etc. 1883.]

"The General Assembly of 1883, after declaring the Revised Confession adopted, instructed the Board of Publication 'to bring out a cheap edition of the Revised Confession of Faith for distribution among the churches, and that they do not stereotype said Confession until after the next meeting of the General Assembly.' Accordingly on August 16, 1883, the following

announcement appeared in the *Cumberland Presbyterian*: 'The Revised Confession of Faith and the Catechism of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church is now ready for sale. The editing and printing are finely done. They are bound in paper: and sell at ten cents per copy' (STEPHENS, *l. c.*). No copy of this edition has come into our hands.

[gg⁴. 1884] New (Revised) | Confession of Faith | and | Catechism | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church, | A.D. 1883. | Belfast: | Published for the Committee. | 1884. | University Printing House, Upper Arthur Street.

Pp. 40; 5 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 3 $\frac{5}{8}$ inches (block of type); bound in paper. The occasion for the publication of this edition was the application of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church for membership in the "Alliance of the Reformed Churches Throughout the World Holding the Presbyterian System." This application came before the Alliance at its Third General Council, held at Belfast, Ireland, June 24–July 3d, 1884. The debate on the subject is reported in the published volume of *Minutes and Proceedings*, Belfast, 1884. This edition was printed by "The Committee" for the use of the members of the Council in considering the application for membership. There is a copy in the library of Prof. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[gg⁵. 1884] Confession of Faith | and | Government | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church | (Revised). | Adopted 1883. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Cumberland Presbyterian Publishing House. | 1885.

16mo; pp. 158; 4 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 5 inches (block of type). This edition was actually published in December, 1884, but (according to a custom not very rare) bears on the title-page the date of the approaching year. The history of its issue and its peculiarities as an edition appear from the following note of Prof. Stephens (*loc. cit.*): "The General Assembly of 1884 instructed the Board of Publication to publish the new book in permanent form 'as soon as possible, and that Revs. S. G. Burney, T. C. Blake and C. H. Bell, and ruling elder John Frizzell, shall read the proof of the same.' By an oversight of the Assembly, no 'Preface' and no 'Introductory Statement on Church Government' had been prepared for the Revised Confession. The Rev. T. C. Blake, D.D. [a member of the Editing Committee just mentioned], prepared a 'Preface,' and the Rev. S. G. Burney, D.D. [the Chairman of the Editing Committee appointed to supervise the publication of this edition], prepared an 'Introductory Statement on Church Government.' But on account of certain expressions used by these gentlemen, which the Board thought ought not to be printed in the book without the approval of the Assembly, the publication of the Revised Confession was delayed. It was not until December 25, 1884, that the announcement was made by the Board, 'We are now filling orders for the Revised Confession.'" The edition thus published contained neither a "Preface" nor an "Introductory Statement": those prepared by individual members of the Editing Committee being held over for submission to the Assembly of 1885. Its most distinguishing peculiarity is, however, the presence at the end of the Catechism of an additional question and answer, made by the Rev. T. C. Blake without authorization from the Assembly. This runs: "106. What does the conclusion of the Lord's Prayer teach us? The conclusion of the Lord's Prayer—which is, For thine is the kingdom, and the power, and the glory, for ever, Amen—teaches us to take our encouragement in prayer from God only, and in our prayers to praise him, ascribing kingdom, power and glory to him; and in testimony of our desire and assurance to be heard, we say, Amen."

There is a copy of this edition in the Library of Congress, Washington, D.C., and another in the possession of the Rev. Dr. J. V. Stephens, Lebanon, Tenn.

[gg⁶. 1885] Confession of Faith | and | Government | of the |
Cumberland Presbyterian Church | (Revised). | Adopted
1883. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Cumberland Presbyterian Publish-
ing House. | 1885.

Pp. vi, 161; 4 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 inches (block of type). The disagreement in the Board of Publication concerning the "Preface" and "Introductory Statement," which had delayed the issue of the edition of 1884 and had led it at length to be put forth without these additions, was brought before the Assembly of 1885. The Assembly ordered the "Preface" and "Introductory Statement on Church Government," which have been included in all subsequent editions, to be inserted without referring them to the Presbyteries. The Assembly ordered that the unauthorized Question 106 in the Catechism as published in the preceding issue be dropped. The present edition, published after the meeting of the Assembly of 1885 and embodying its directions, is really the *editio princeps*, in the sense of the first authoritative edition of the new Cumberland Confession: the text of the Confession seems to be from the same plates, however, as the preceding. There is a copy of it in the library of Prof. J. V. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[gg⁷. 1891] Confession of Faith, | etc. [as in the immediately
preceding edition] | Nashville, Tenn.: | . . . | 1891.

This is an imprint from the same plates as the immediately preceding edition. There is a copy in the library of Prof. Stephens, Lebanon, Tenn.

[gg⁸. 1893] Confession of Faith | and | Government | of the |
Cumberland Presbyterian Church | (Revised). | Adopted
1883. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Cumberland Presbyterian Publish-
ing House. | 1893.

16mo, pp. vi, 196; 4 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 3 inches (block of type). Copyright certificate on the back of title, dated 1884. Contains: Preface, pp. iii-vi; Table of Contents, pp. 3-6; Introduction, pp. 7-9 (p. 10 blank); Confession of Faith, pp. 11-62, with proof-texts at large; Catechism, pp. 63-77, without proof references; Introductory Statement on Church Government, pp. 78-80; Constitution, pp. 81-106; Rules of Discipline, pp. 107-128; General Regulations, pp. 129-136; Directory for Worship, pp. 137-150; Rules of Order, pp. 151-161 (p. 162 blank); Indexes, pp. 163-196. It is from the same plates as the immediately preceding edition, with the addition of Indices. There is a copy in the library of Princeton Theological Seminary, and another in the library of Prof. Stephens, of Lebanon, Tenn.

[gg⁹. 1896] Confession of Faith | and | Government | of the |
Cumberland Presbyterian Church | (Revised). | Adopted
1883. | Nashville, Tenn.: | Cumberland Presbyterian Publish-
ing House. | 1896.

16mo, pp. vi, 196, 4 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 3 inches (block of type). Contents as in the immediately preceding issue, from the same plates used in which it is taken. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, of Philadelphia, who has described it in the *Journal of the Presbyterian Historical Society* for December, 1901 (I, ii), p. 211.

[**gg**¹⁰. 1898] Confession of Faith, | etc. [as in the immediately preceding editions] | Nashville, Tenn.: | . . . | 1898.

This is an imprint from the same plates as the immediately preceding edition. There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Stephens, Lebanon, Tenn.

[**gg**¹¹. 1899] [Confession of Faith, | etc. [as in the immediately preceding editions] | Nashville, Tenn.: | . . . | 1899.]

The Records of the Publishing House show that an issue was made in 1899, but no copy of it has fallen in our way. It is, of course, possible that it was taken from the plates without changing the date-line (1898).

[**gg**¹². 1901] Confession of Faith | and | Government | of the | Cumberland Presbyterian Church. | (Revised.) | Adopted 1883. | Nashville, Tennessee: | Cumberland Presbyterian Publishing House. | 1901.

16mo, pp. vi, 205 (beginning with 3; *i.e.*, there are no pages 1, 2); $4\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 inches (block of type); copyright certificate on the back of the title-page bearing date of 1884. Contains: Preface, pp. iii-vi; Contents, pp. 3-6; Introduction, pp. 7-9; p. 10 blank; Confession of Faith, pp. 11-66, with proof-texts at large; Catechism, pp. 67-82, without proofs; Introductory Statement on Church Government, pp. 83-85; Constitution, pp. 86-113; Rules of Discipline, pp. 114-136; General Regulations, pp. 137-145; Directory for Worship, pp. 146-160; Rules of Order, pp. 161-171; p. 172 blank; Indexes, pp. 173-205.

This edition marks a new beginning in the manufacture of the Cumberland Confession. From 1884 the same plates had been in use: for this edition new plates have been made. In its contents it differs from its immediate predecessors only in the incorporation of an amendment of § 47 of the "Constitution," declared to have been duly adopted by the Church, at the Assembly of 1901, by which Ruling Elders and Deacons are permitted to be elected for a term of years instead of for life, when the particular churches so desire.

There is a copy of this edition in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton.

In the recasting of their earlier Confession for the formation of the document the editions of which have just been enumerated, the Cumberland Presbyterians subjected their original Confession to an exceedingly drastic process. Its formal division into chapters was obliterated, and the paragraphs numbered consecutively from 1 to 115; but the new document is more informally divided into essentially the same series of topics, following the same order, with one important exception. There are 36 of these topics as over against the 33 chapters of the Westminster Confession, the increase of number being due to dividing the material falling in the earlier document under the head of "Effectual Calling" into two topics bearing the titles respectively of "Divine Influence" and "Regeneration"; and similarly making two topics of "Sanctification" and "Growth in Grace," and of "Religious Worship" and "The Sabbath Day." The single alteration in the order of these topics concerns precisely the *ordo salutis*. The Westminster Confession, in accordance with a distribution of the material common (though not by any means universal) among the Reformed Divines, treats first of the benefits conferred by God on the Covenanted, and then of the duties required by Him of them: this Confession reverses this, and places Repentance and Faith (and in that order—again reversing the order of the Westminster Confession) before all the saving acts of God except Vocation—thus seeking, apparently, an order of chronological occurrence. It is,

however, in the sequence of these saving acts themselves that the real divergence shows itself. These are given in the Westminster Confession, of course, in the necessarily Reformed sequence, Effectual Calling, Justification, Adoption, Sanctification; while in the Cumherland Confession they take the equally necessary Arminian order, Divine Influence, Justification, Regeneration, Adoption, Sanctification. The fundamental nature of the revision is already suggested by this fact. It was undertaken professedly, as the Preface informs us, "to eliminate all the features of hyper-Calvinism"—it would be as well to leave off the qualification implied by "hyper—"—"from the Westminster Confession"; and "to set forth more clearly and logically the system of theology helieved and taught by the Cumherland Presbyterian Church." In a word it was supposed that the alterations formerly made in the Westminster Confession were insufficient completely to transform it from a Calvinistic into as high an Arminian document as was desired—though it must be recognized that the Cumherland Presbyterians scarcely allow that they go the whole way with Arminianism, inasmuch as they still teach the doctrine of Perseverance. And it was felt that as it was Arminianism that was to be taught consistency required a more drastic treatment of the document. This is certainly given it in the new creed. In the process of Arminianizing the Confession, however, much more is done. The text is greatly curtailed and compressed, and not, it must be confessed, to the advantage of the style: almost all the fine old flavor has been evaporated and a new tone of somewhat hrusque and dry plainness substituted in its stead. Enough of the phraseology of the Westminster Confession is retained perhaps to keep it in the class of modifications of that document: but it certainly is an extreme instance of modification that is here presented.

The greatness of the alteration that has been made by this recension renders it impossible to record here the changes introduced. They are pervasive; and the whole document would need to be quoted to exhibit them. We must confine ourselves therefore to a sample or two of how the new document deals with the doctrines.

"DECREES OF GOD.

"8. God, for the manifestation of his glory and goodness, by the most wise and holy counsel of his own will, freely and unchangeably ordained or determined what he himself would do, what he would require his intelligent creatures to do, and what should be the awards, respectively, of the obediant and the disohedient.

"9. Though all divine decrees may not be revealed to men, yet it is certain that God has decreed nothing contrary to his revealed will or written word. . . ."

"DIVINE INFLUENCE.

"38. God the Father, having set forth his Son Jesus Christ as a propitiation for the sins of the world, does most graciously vouchsafe a manifestation of the Holy Spirit with the same intent to every man.

"39. The Holy Spirit, operating through the written word, and through such other means as God in his wisdom may choose, or directly, without means, so moves upon the hearts of men as to enlighten, reprove and convince them of sin, of their lost estate, and of their need of salvation; and, by so doing, inclines them to come to Christ.

"40. This call of the Holy Spirit is purely of God's free grace alone, and not because of human merit, and is antecedent to all desire, purpose, and intention on the part of the sinner to come to Christ; so that while it is possible for all to be saved with it, none can be saved without it.

"41. This call is not irresistible, but is effectual in those only who, in penitence and faith, freely surrender themselves wholly to Christ, the only name whereby man can be saved. . . ."

"46. While there is no merit in faith, yet it is the condition of salvation. It is not of the nature of good works, from which it must be distinguished. . . ."

"48. All those who truly repent of their sins, and in faith commit themselves to Christ, God freely justifies. . . ."

"49. . . . Though of free grace alone, it [Justification] is conditioned upon faith, and is assured to none but penitent and true believers. . . ."

"51. Those who believe in the Lord Jesus Christ are regenerated, or born from above, renewed in spirit, and made new creatures in Christ. . . ."

"56. . . . A state of sinless perfection in this life is not authorized by the Scriptures (*sic*), and is a dogma of dangerous tendency. . . ."

"60. Those whom God has justified, he will also glorify; consequently, the truly regenerated soul will not totally fall away from a state of grace, but will be preserved to everlasting life. . . ."

"CIVIL GOVERNMENT.

"85. God, the Supreme Lord and King of all the World, has ordained civil officers to be under him over the people, for his own glory and the public good; and to this end, has armed them with power for the defence of the innocent and the punishment of evil-doers.

"86. It is lawful for Christians to accept civil offices when called thereunto, in the management wherof they ought especially to maintain piety, justice and peace, according to the wholesome laws of each Commonwealth.

"87. Civil officers may not assume to themselves the administration of the word and the Sacraments, or in the least interfere in matters of faith; yet it is their duty to protect the Church of our common Lord, without giving preference to any denomination of Christians. And as Jesus Christ has appointed a government and discipline in his Church, no law of any Commonwealth should interfere therewith, but should provide that all religious and ecclesiastical assemblies shall be held without molestation or disturbance.

"88. It is the duty of the people to pray for magistrates, to obey their lawful commands, and to be subject to their authority for conscience' sake."

Besides the literature cited in the course of the notes above, the following may be profitably consulted on the Cumberland Presbyterian Creeds:—SCHAFF'S *Creeds of Christendom*, I, § 99, pp. 813 sq., III, pp. 771 sq.; DAVIDSON'S *History of the Presbyterian Church in Kentucky* (New York, 1847), pp. 223 sq.; McDONOLD'S *History of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church* (Nashville, 1888), pp. 98 sq. and 458 sq.; FOSTER'S *Sketch of the History of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church* (New York, 1894), Vol. XI of the "American Church History Series," pp. 303 sq.; CHRISMAN'S *Origin and Doctrines of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church* (Nashville, 1875); HOWARD'S *Creed and Constitution of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church* (Nashville, 1885); MILLER'S *Doctrine and Genius of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church* (Nashville, 1892). Further bibliographies are given by Schaff and Foster.

THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW

No. 52—October, 1902.

I.

PERSONALITY THE SUPREME CATEGORY OF PHILOSOPHY.

MODERN philosophy began with an emphatic assertion of dualism. The primary contrast in our experience between subject and object, self and not-self, mind and matter, was construed, by both the great men with whom modern philosophy took its rise, as an opposition not to be overcome.

Although Descartes started from the assumption of the competency of pure thought to explain reality, independently of observation—his principle being that everything must be true which is clearly and distinctly conceived—he failed to deal satisfactorily with the question as to the relation between the material and the spiritual. To him the world seemed to fall apart into two alien and unrelated realms. Mind has as its essential attribute thought, and matter has as its essential attribute extension; these predicates do not imply each other, but are mutually exclusive, and hence the substances to which they belong can have no natural basis of connection. On the one hand, Descartes wished to make due provision for the ethical and religious life of man, and, on the other hand, he desired to recognize the reign of law in nature, and the only way of securing these two ends seemed to him to be the making a sharp division between the world of mind, in which the free will of man is supreme, and the world of nature, which is subject to the sway of mechanical laws. Accordingly Descartes held that everything in the universe, except the mind of man, is explicable on mechanical principles; the whole world of nature, including the world of animal life, can be accounted for under laws of matter and motion. The two factors of

III.

THE PRINTING OF THE WESTMINSTER CONFESSION.

V. APPENDICES.

APPENDIX I: ADDITIONAL EDITIONS.

THE following additional editions have come to our knowledge since the lists were printed in *THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW* for October, 1901, and January, April and July, 1902. It will be remembered that the Arabic numerals designate British editions; the Roman, American; while the translations of the Confession are represented by higher-case letters, and modifications of it by lower-case letters.

[13^a. 1650] [The Confession of Faith and the Larger and Shorter Catechisme, etc. . . . Edinburgh, E. Tyler, 1650.]

Dr. Wm. Carruthers writes: "In the sale catalogue of the Rev. Wm. Makellar's books, 1898, the following two entries occur:

"649. Confession of Faith (The) and the Larger and Shorter Catechisme, approved by the Kirk of Scotland. Edinb. by E. Tyler, printer to the King, 1650.

"650. Confession of Faith (The) and the Larger and Shorter Catechisme, approved by the Generall Assembly of the Church of Scotland. Edinb. E. Tyler, printer to the King, 1650."

"I take it these are two copies of the same edition."

[15^a. 1651] The Late | Assembly of Divines | Confession of
| Faith | Examined. | As it was presented by them unto |
the | Parliament. | Wherein | many of their excesses and
defects, of | their confusions and disorders, of their | errors
and contradictions are presented, both | to themselves and
others. || [Motto] || [Bible text] || London, Printed in the year.
1651.

16mo, pp. [32] 335, 5½ x 2¾ inches (block of type). Contains the entire text of the Confession, printed, chapter by chapter, in italic type, to serve, each, as the text of an extended comment conceived in a sharply critical vein. The long dedication to the Parliament (pp. [1-10]) is signed "W. Parker." See also below, p. 581.

[42^a. 1699] [The Confession of Faith, etc. 1699.]

The following Act of the Assembly (communicated by the Rev. G. Lawson

Gordon, River John, Nova Scotia) seems to imply a reissue in 1699 of the folio edition of 1690 :

“Acts of the General Assembly : 1699 : ‘It is recommended to all synods and presbyteries to inquire what ministers, probationers, or schoolmasters within their bounds have not subscribed the Confession of Faith, conform to former acts of the General Assembly, as the confession of their faith; that those who have not done it may be put thereto, and that there be a new impression of the Confession of Faith in folio, for that end.’—Act 13.”

[60^a. 1729] [The Confession of Faith, etc.]

24mo, 4 x 2 $\frac{1}{4}$ inches, pp. —. Wants the title of the Confession, but the titles of the Catechisms have the imprint, “Printed Anno Dom., 1729” [with no name or place]. The proof-references are given at the end of each section. It contains the *Sum* with colon in punctuation. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

[64^a. 1736] The | Confession of Faith, | The Larger and Shorter
| Catechisms, . . . [etc., as in title of No. 60, 1728] . . .
| Edinburgh, | Printed by Thomas Lumisden and John |
Robertson, and sold at their Printing-house | in the Fish-
Market. M DCC XXXVI.

8vo, pp. 552 and Table [pp. 23]. Communicated by Dr. Carruthers.

[95^a. 1768] [The | Confession of Faith,] | The | Larger and
Shorter | Catechisms, | with the | Scripture-Proofs at Large.
| Together with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge | (con-
tain'd in the Holy Scriptures, | and held forth in the said
Con- | fession and Catechisms) and practical Use thereof. |
Covenants; | National and Solemn League. | Acknowledge-
ment of Sins and | Engagement to Duties. | Directories. | Form
of Church-Government, | &c. | Of | Publick Authority | in
the | Church of Scotland | with | Acts of Assembly and
Parliament, | relative to, and approbative of the same. | Dt.
vi. 6, 7. And these words which I command thee this Day,
shall be | in thy Heart. And thou shalt teach them dili-
gently unto thy Children, | and shalt talk of them when thou
sittest in thy House, and when thou | walkest by the way,
and when thou liest down, and when thou risest up. Printed
in the Year MDCCLXVIII. | [no place.]

Small 8vo, pp. 554 + “Table” [unnumbered]. In the copy examined the title-page is mutilated at the top. Size : from 6 $\frac{3}{4}$ to 7 x 4 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type). The general contents are given on the back of the title-page. There is a separate title to the Confession of Faith : “The | Confession of Faith, | Agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines | at | Westminster, | with the Assistance of | Commis-
sioners | from the | Church of Scotland, | As | A Part of the Covenanted Uniformity
in Religion betwixt the | Churches of Christ in the Kingdoms of Scotland, Eng-
land, | and Ireland. | Approved by the General Assembly 1647 and ratified and
established by | Act of Parliament 1649, as the public and avowed Confession of |
the Church of Scotland. | With the Proofs from the Scripture.” On the back of
this page, which is numbered (20), is to be found “The Contents” of the Confes-

sion tabulated chapter by chapter. In this "The Contents" there stands the title of chapter "III Of God's Eternal Decree," whereas in the caption of the chapter itself it is "Of God's Eternal Decrees." The Confession of Faith occupies pp. 21-164; the references to proof-texts are made by letters in the italic type of the same size as text. The proof-texts are in parallel columns. The separate titles are not dated. There is a copy of this edition in the possession of the Rev. N. F. Gillespie, of Houston, Texas; and the above description of it has been kindly furnished by the Rev. S. M. Tenney, of that place. Mr. Tenney has placed in our hands a very full collation of the edition, from which it appears to have been carelessly manufactured and to present a number of printer's errors. The Rev. J. Sturrock, of Edinburgh, also has a copy of this edition.

[96^a. 1770] The | Confession of Faith, | the | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the | Scripture-Proofs at Large, | together with | [etc. as in 1728] || Deut. vi. 6, 7. . . . || Printed in the year MDCCLXX | [no place.]

8vo, pp. 554 + Table [pp. 22]. 6 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 4 $\frac{1}{4}$ inches (block of type.) Contains all the usual documents: proof-texts at large at the bottom of the page. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia. Reported by Dr. Louis F. Benson.

[98^a. 1771] The | Confession of Faith, | the | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | [etc., as above, No. 96^a] | Printed in the year M.DCC.LXXI | [no place.]

8vo, pp. 549 + Table [pp. 17]; 7 x 3 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type). There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia. Reported by Dr. Louis F. Benson. This may possibly be the same as No. 98.

[104^a. 1803] The | Confession of Faith; | The | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, | with the | Scripture-proofs at large: | Together with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge, | contained in the Holy Scriptures, and held forth in the said | Confession and Catechisms, and Practical Use thereof; | Covenants, | National and Solemn League; | Acknowledgment of Sins, and | Engagement to Duties; | Directories for publick and family Worship; | Form of Church-Government, &c. | With acts of Assembly and Parliament, relative to, and | approbative of, the same. || Deut. vi. 6, 7. And these words, || Edinburgh: | Printed by Sir D. H. Blair, and J. Bruce, | Printers to the King's Most Excellent Majesty. | 1803.

12mo, pp. 600 and Table [pp. 23]. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia (kindly reported by Rev. Dr. Louis F. Benson); also one in the possession of Dr. John W. Scott, Lexington, Ky.; and another is reported by Dr. Wm. Carruthers, London. Nos. 105 and 106, although agreeing exactly, page by page, with this copy, have been recomposed. The portion of the note under No. 105 referring to the earliest known edition published by Blair and Bruce must of course be transferred to this edition.

[106^a. 1827] The | Confession of Faith, [etc., as in No. 106] Edinburgh: | Printed by Sir D. Hunter Blair and

M. S. Bruce, | Printers to the King's Most Excellent Majesty. | 1827.

8vo, pp. 600 and Table [pp. 23]; 5 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches. Reported by Dr. Carruthers and Mr. Sturrock. Notice "M. S. Bruce" in the imprint, instead of "M. T. Bruce," as in the following issues.

[106^b. 1831] The | Confession of Faith, [etc., as in No. 106]
 Edinb^{urgh}: | Printed by Sir D. Hunter Blair and M.
 T. Bruce, | Printers to the King's Most Excellent Majesty.
 | 1831.

8vo, pp. 600 and Table; 6 x 3 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches. Reported by Dr. Carruthers and Mr. Sturrock.

[106^c. 1836] The | Confession of Faith, [etc., as in No. 106]
 Edinb^{urgh}: | Printed by Sir D. Hunter Blair and M.
 T. Bruce, | Printers to the King's Most Excellent Majesty. |
 1836.

12mo, pp. 600 and Table [pp. 23]. The Table is without pagination, except that on pp. 21, 22, there occur the wrong numbers, 24, 25. Reported by the Rev. G. Lawson Gordon, River John, Nova Scotia,

[106^d. 1840] The | Confession of Faith; | with the | Scripture-
 proofs at Large. | Published by Authority. || Deut. vi. 6, 7.
 || [Royal Arms] || Edinb^{urgh}: | Printed by Anderson &
 Bryce; | for^e the | Sabbath School Union for Scotland, | 13,
 Queen-Street. | 1840.

12mo; 5 $\frac{7}{8}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type); pp. [iv]. 152. The four preliminary pages include a bastard-title with its back blank, and the proper title-page, on the back of which is the license for printing, signed by And. Rutherford, January 3d, 1840. Then follows the body of the book, opening with a new title-page to the Confession with its back blank, the table of Contents of the Confession with its back blank, and the Confession itself, beginning on p. [5] with still a new half-title, and running to p. 145. Page 146 is blank: pp. 147 to 152 are occupied with an Appendix, containing (1) the Act of the Assembly, Aug. 27, 1647, approving the Confession; (2) the Act of Parliament, Feb. 7, 1649, ratifying the Confession and Catechism; (3) the Act of June 7, 1690, ratifying the Confession. The type is clear and good: and the proof-texts are in two columns at the foot of the page. There is a copy in the library of the Princeton Theological Seminary, kindly presented by the Rev. John Sturrock, Edinb^{urgh}.

[112^a. 1846] The Scriptural Unity of the Protestant Churches
 exhibited in their published Confessions and Articles of Faith.
 Second Edition. London, 1846.

8vo, pp. 123. Contains Articles of the Irish Church, pp. 1-28; Articles of the English Church and as revised by the Westminster Assembly, pp. 29-57; the Westminster Confession, pp. 58-118; the Declaration of Faith of the Independent Union of England and Wales, 1838, pp. 119-123. Reported by Dr. Carruthers.

[124^a. 1863]. The | Westminster Confession of Faith | critically
 compared with | The Holy Scriptures | and found wanting; |

or, | A new Exposition of | the Doctrines of | The Christian Religion, | in harmony with the Word of God, | and not at variance with modern science. | By James Stark, | M.D. Edin., Fel. Roy. Soc. Ed., Fel. Roy. Scot. Soc. Arts, | Cor. Mem. Zool. Soc. Lond., Hon. Mem. Epid. Soc. Lond., | Fel. Roy. Col. Phys. Ed., Lic. Roy. Col. Surg. Ed., | &c., &c. | London : | Longman, Green, Longman, Roberts & Green. | 1863.

Small 8vo, 6 x 3½ inches (block of type) ; pp. viii, 367. Prints the entire text, passage by passage, with an accompanying adverse discussion. See also below, p. 581.

[128^a. 1878] The Confession of Faith, [etc., as in 1749 ed.] . . .
Edinburgh : | Johnstone, Hunter & Co. | 1878.

Reported by Dr. Carruthers.

[132^a. 1886] The Confession of Faith, [etc., as in ed. of 1728]
. . . . Edinburgh : | Johnstone, Hunter & Co. | 1886.

Reported by the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, Philadelphia.

[134^a. 1889] The Confession of Faith ; | agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines at Westminster, | with the assistance of | Commissioners from the Church of Scotland. | Approved by the General Assembly, 1647, | and | Ratified and Established by Acts of Parliament 1649 and 1690, | as | the public and avowed Confession of the Church of Scotland. || Amos iv. 6, Deut. vi. 6, 7, 2 Tim. i. 12. || A New Edition, with proofs of Scripture following every section. | Edinburgh. | 1889.

8vo, pp. 126. Three pages prefixed, on "The Confession of Faith : Why Circulate and Study It?" signed by J. M. [oir] P. [orteus]. Reported by Dr. Carruthers.

[vii^a. 1851] The | Confession of Faith, | [etc., as in the edition of 1829] . . . | Philadelphia : | William S. Young, 173 Race Street. | 1851.

12mo, pp. 564 ; 6 x 3½ inches (block of type), as in No. vii. There are copies in the libraries of Rev. S. M. Tenney, Houston, Texas, and of the Theological Seminary at Princeton (the gift of Mr. Tenney). Mr. Tenney has kindly sent us a long list of the readings of this edition, where it differs with certain others with which he has compared it. Most of these concern punctuation or capitalization : the following are more substantial. Ch. xiii, § 2, "remnants" (95 has "remnant :" 103, "remains"). Ch. xviii, title, omits art. (so 103) ; § 1, "the state of grace" (so 95 and 103). Ch. xxii, 6, "the obtaining" (so 95 and 103). Ch. xxvi, title, omit article (so 103, but not 95). Ch. xxix, 2, "one offering" (so 95 and 103) : others read "once." Ch. xxx, 2, "the like offenses" (so 95 and 103). Ch. xxxii, title, "men" (so 95 and 103). These notes will naturally apply to all the issues from these plates.

[ix^a. 1859] The | Confession of Faith, | [etc., as in the edition of 1829] . . . | Philadelphia : | William S. Young, 1023 Race Street. | 1859.

12mo, pp. 564, etc., as in vii. There is a copy in the Public Library at Lexington, Ky.

[xxv^a. 1823] [Stereotype Edition.] | The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the | United States of America : | containing the | Confession of Faith, the Catechisms, | and | the Directory for the Worship of God ; | together with the | Plan of Government and Discipline, | as amended and ratified by the General Assembly, | at their sessions in May, 1821. | Newark : | Published by Benjamin Olds. | 1823.

12mo, pp. 466 (exclusive of title). Large paper ; block of type, 5 x 2½ inches. There is a copy in the library of the Theological Seminary at Princeton.

[xi^a. 1841] The | Constitution | of the | Presbyterian Church, | in the | United States of America, | containing | The Confession of Faith, The Catechisms and the | Directory for the Worship of God | Together with the | Plan of Government and Discipline, | As ratified by the General Assembly, at their sessions | in May, 1821; and amended in 1833. | Philadelphia : | Ed. Barrington and Geo. D. Haswell, | 293 Market Street. | 1841.

12mo, pp 466 ; 5 x 2½ inches (block of type). There is a copy in the possession of the Rev. S. M. Tenney, of Houston, Texas, which was purchased in 1851. The existence of this dated edition renders it probable that the undated edition of the same imprint (No. xxxiv) was issued subsequently to 1841.

The back of the title-page bears the certificates of the Synodical Committee of the Synod of Delaware, dated June 16, 1834, and of the Synod of Philadelphia, dated August 22, 1834, as well as the copyright certification, signed by D. Caldwell, of date June 2, 1821.

The pagination is as follows : "The Confession of Faith," pp. 1-138 ; "The Larger Catechism," pp. 139-319 ; "The Shorter Catechism," pp. 320-341 ; "The Form of Government," pp. 342-390 ; "The Discipline," pp. 391-421 ; "The Directory," pp. 422-450 ; "Appendix. General Rules for Judicatories," pp. 451-457 ; "Index," pp. 459-466.

Each chapter of the Confession has the first word printed in large capitals, heavy type. On the title-page, the word "Catechisms" appears without the first *s*—"Catechims." Mr. Tenney has kindly communicated to us the following list of the peculiarities of the text of this edition, which doubtless applies also to the other issues of this type :

Chap. 1. ¶ 2 has the words "Of the Old Testament" and "Of the New Testament" printed in heavy large capitals, and the names of the individual books printed in italics of small pica type, with the exception that under the New Testament "The Gospels according to" is not in italics ; a further peculiarity is that with older editions this has the Roman numerals for designating particular epistles printed before and not after the name of epistle.

Chap. 2. ¶ 3 omits the article *the* in the expression "In the unity."

Chap. 5. ¶ 5 has "depandance."

Chap. 7. ¶ 3 has "covenant of Grace," and "freely offereth" for "freely offered."

¶ 5 has "Gospel," not "gospel": the use of the capital in this word is uniform throughout the edition.

Chap. 8. ¶ 4 has "maketh" where other editions have "making."

Chap. 9. ¶ 3 reads, "being altogether averse from that *which is* good," where others omit *which is*.

Chap. 10. ¶ 1 has "a heart of flesh;" other editions have "an heart of flesh."

Chap. 11. ¶ 2 has "yet is not alone;" other editions have "yet is *it* not alone."

Chap. 13. ¶ 1 has "farther" for "further."

Chap. 18. ¶ 3, though the clause "before he be partaker of it" is followed by a colon, the next clause begins with a capital, "Yet, being," etc. This same usage occurs in the beginning of the last clause of the paragraph; though in the midst of a sentence, it begins, "So far is it," etc.

Chap. 19. ¶ 1 has "Adam" in italics; ¶ 2 has "Sinai" in italics; and ¶ 3 has "Israel" in italics. ¶ 7 has "aforementioned" for "forementioned."

Chap. 20. ¶ 1 has "The Liberty of Christians is further," etc., for "the liberty," etc. ¶ 2 has "and *have* left it free" for "and *hath* left it free."

Chap. 23. ¶ 3 has "any" in the clause "members of any denomination" printed in italics. ¶ 4 has "pope," not "Pope."

Chap. 24. ¶ 2 has "a holy seed," not "an holy seed."

Chap. 25. ¶ 6 has "Rome" in italics, and "pope," not "Pope."

Chap. 25. ¶ 6 begins the second clause "*ye* notwithstanding," for "yet notwithstanding."

Chap. 29. ¶ 2 has "once offering," not "one offering up of himself." ¶ 3 has "a holy use," not "an holy use."

Chap. 30. ¶ 3 has "*this* covenant" for "if they should suffer *his* covenant."

Chap. 32. The title reads "Resurrection *from* the Dead," not "Resurrection of the Dead." ¶ 1, though in the midst of a sentence, begins the clause "and the souls of the wicked," etc., with a capital—"And the," etc. ¶ 2 shows a like usage in beginning the second clause—"And all the dead," etc.

Chap. 33. ¶ 2 has "But the wicked, who know," etc., for "but the wicked," etc. ¶ 3 has "So will he have that day," for "so will he have," etc.

[xlv^a. 1847] The Constitution of the Presbyterian Church, etc.
Philadelphia: Brower, Hughes & Co., 1847.

16mo, sheep. A copy has been reported to us by the Robert Clarke Co., Cincinnati, O.

APPENDIX II: CORRECTIONS AND IMPROVEMENTS.

The following corrections and improvements of the Bibliographies, as printed, have been gathered since their printing. As will be seen, they concern chiefly the British editions, and have been furnished us very largely through the kindness of Dr. William Carruthers, of London, and the Rev. John Sturrock of Edinburgh.

[2. December, 1646] The humble | Advice | of the | Assembly
| of | Divines, | Now by authority of Parliament | Sitting at
Westminster, | concerning a Confession of Faith, Presen- |
ted by them lately to both Houses | of Parliament. ¶ A certain
number of Copies are Ordered to | be Printed only for the
use of the Mem- | bers of both Houses and of the Assembly

of | Divines, to the end that they may advise | thereupon. |
London, | Printed for the Company of Stationers.

This corrected title has been kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers. The copy in the British Museum bearing the press mark 873, a (44) appears really to be of No. 5 below, the edition of Evan Tyler, 1647. The size is $6\frac{1}{2}$ x $3\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type).

In our notes on this edition, on p. 616, lines 6 and 7 from the bottom of the text proper have been interchanged in printing.

In the copy of this edition owned by the Rev. John Sturrock of Edinburgh, there is a MS. note on the blank page on the back of which the Parliamentary order is printed as follows: "Frances Baron of Graye Friars delivered to me by Mr. Byfield December 19. Saturday. 1646, etc." This is contemporary evidence to the issue of the edition in December, 1646.

[3. May, 1647].

This size is 6 x $3\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type). (Mr. Sturrock.)

Dr. Carruthers writes: "This is printed, as regards the text of the Confession, from the same type as No. 2. Many places have the lines overrun to find spaces for the reference letters to the proofs."

Dr. Carruthers writes further: "Nos. 1, 2 and 3, I have compared verbally. They are printed from the same type. The spelling has been modified chiefly in the second issue, and the third retains the modifications, though some further changes are made in it. The changes in the words are few and trifling. In chap. ii, § 2, about the middle, 'what ever himself pleaseth' is in the second and third 'whatsoever,' etc. In chap. ix, § 4, Edition 1 has 'to will, and do'; Edd. 2 and 3 'to will, and to do.' Edd. 1 and 2 have at chap. xiii, § 2, 'there abiding still'; Edd. 3 has 'there abideth still.' In chap. xvi, § 6, Ed. 1 begins 'Notwithstanding'; Edd. 2 and 3 prefix 'Yet.' In chap. xvii, § 2, Edd. 1 has 'The Perseverance'; the others, 'This Perseverance.' The only change in the words between Editions 2 and 3 is the change of 'abiding' in Edd. 1 and 2 to 'abideth' in Ed. 3. The other changes are only in the spelling. Edition No. 4 is an independent edition; the type does not, as far as I can see, appear to have been used again. Nos. 5 and 7 are from the same type, and I suppose both were printed in Edinburgh."

[4. August, 1647] The Humble | Advice | Of The | Assembly |
Of | Divines, | Now by Authority of Parliament | sitting at
Westminster; | Concerning | A Confession of Faith: | With
the Quotations and Texts of | Scripture annexed. | Presented
by them lately to both Houses of Parliament. | A certain
number of Copies are ordered to be Printed only for the | use
of the Members of both Houses, and of the Assembly of Di-
vines, to the end that they may advise thereupon. | Printed
at London: | And | Re-printed at Edinburgh by Evan Tyler,
Printer to the | Kings most Excellent Majestie. 1647.

4to, pp. [4] 56; $6\frac{5}{8}$ x $4\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type). On the back of the title-page is the order of the House of Commons of April 29, 1647, for the printing of 600 copies, signed "H Elsynge Cler. Parl. D. Com." P. 3 is blank, but on the back (p. 4) is the order of the General Assembly dated Edin. 9 Aug. 1647, Sess 5^a, for printing 300 copies for the use of the General Assembly, and that no person presume to reprint the same.

This edition was set up from a copy of No. 3 (edition of May, 1647, with proof-

texts); and the type was not employed for any later edition. Two errors appear in this edition, which were continued in E. Tyler's next edition (No. 5) and in the Scottish editions printed since, viz.: Chap. ix, end of § 1, "to *do* good;" and chap. xiii, middle of § 2, "abideth."

Besides the copies noted, there are copies of this edition in the libraries of the Rev. Dr. Louis F. Benson, of Philadelphia, of Dr. Wm. Carruthers, London, and of the New College, Edinburgh. We are indebted both to Dr. Benson and Dr. Carruthers for full descriptions.

[5. 1647].

The size is 6 x 3 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

Dr. Carruthers writes: "In addition to the errors in the first edition printed by Tyler (of 300 copies; No. 4 above), this contains these:

"Chap. viii. ¶ 5, 'offered *up* unto God.'

"Chap. xx. ¶ 4, first line, 'Power' should be *powers*.

"Chap. xxi. ¶ 1, line 8, 'to his own will,' read 'by his own,' etc.

"Chap. xxi. ¶ 1, line 11, 'representations,' read 'representation.'

"Chap. xxiii. ¶ 3, last line, 'mine' for 'minde.'

"There are besides several errors in the proofs." The following accidental peculiarities are also noted by Dr. Carruthers, who remarks further that they are common to this edition and No. 7, 1648, which was printed from the same type, viz.: "Page 37, last line, 'Pra.yer' is printed in both with a stop between the *a* and *y*; 'Civil,' p. 41, § 1, line 2, has an italic *C* in both; 'wicked,' p. 56, line 8, has the *d* imperfect in both copies; 'strengthen,' p. 33, line 3 from bottom, has the *g* omitted in both; p. 30, 3d line from bottom of text, there is a defect in the word 'their' in both."

There is also a copy of this edition in the library of the Rev. Dr. Henry C. McCook, Philadelphia.

[6. 1648].

Measures 5 $\frac{1}{4}$ x 3 inches (block of type). The Confession occupies pp. 48 (sigs. A to C). The references are appended at the end of each paragraph, not in the margin. (Rev. John Sturrock.)

[7. 1648] The Humble | Advice | of the | Assembly | of |
Divines | Now by Authority of Parliament | sitting at West-
minster, | Concerning | A Confession of Faith: | with the
Quotations and Texts of | Scripture annexed. | Presented by
them lately to both houses of Parliament. | London | Printed
for Robert Bostock, dwelling at the Sign of the Kings | head
in Pauls Churchyard, MDCXLVIII.

Size, 6 $\frac{1}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type).

Dr. Carruthers writes: "At the end, on page 56, it is subscribed:

"Charles Herle, Prolocutor.

"Cornelius Burges, Assessor.

"Herbert Palmer, Assessor.

"Henry Robroughe, Scriba.

"Adoniram Byfield, Scriba.

"Imprimatur, James Cranford.

"December 7, 1647.

"Finis."

"This edition (No. 7) is from the same type as No. 5. The great majority of

the pages are exactly the same—in two or three the lines are overrun to get rid of crowding—pp. 1, 5, 6, 8, 9, 12 and 13—but injured and imperfect letters occur in the same place in both editions. Two different *o*'s are used, and they occur in the same places; compare p. 32. See also note on No. 5. I showed these peculiarities to the Librarian who has the charge of this portion of the British Museum Catalogue, and he agrees that this is so. He has added to the Catalogue by inserting 'printed from the type of Evan Tyler, Edinburgh.' I think it was printed in Edinburgh, but the type may have been sent up in its forms to London."

[8. 1648] ARTICLES | of | Christian Religion | Approved and
Passed by both Houses | of PARLIAMENT, | After Advice
had with the Assembly | of | DIVINES, | By Authority of
Parliament sitting at | Westminster. | London: | Printed for
Edward Husband, Printer to the Honorable House of | Com-
mons, and are to be sold at his shop at the Sign of the |
Golden Dragon in Fleetstreet, near the Inner- | Temple.
June 27. 1648.

4to, pp. 50 (exclusive of title); $6\frac{1}{4} \times 3\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type). On the page facing the title are printed the two orders of Parliament of June 20th and June 21st. The references are in the margin and here and there run across the page. Full title kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers and Mr. Sturrock. For the action of Parliament of 1560, adverted to on p. 622, second paragraph, see also Alex. Chalmers' *Life of Reynolds*, prefixed to the *Collected Works of Edward Reynolds* (I, p. lv).

[9. 1648].

Insert "und" before "jetzund" in the title, line first. Compare the fuller description in the PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for April, 1902, pp. 259 sq. [A].

[10. 1649].

Size, $4\frac{1}{2} \times 2$ inches (block of type). The preliminary pages contain "The Act of the General Assembly approving the Confession of Faith, Edinburgh, 27 August. 1647," signed by A. Ker. The references are printed in very small type and are placed in the margin, running into the page in a few places. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

[11. 1649].

Dr. Carruthers writes that the press mark in the British Museum should read, "E 1419 and 1412 a 13."

[12. 1649].

Dr. Carruthers writes: "David Laing had a perfect copy of the Elzevir edition, which was sold in 1879 at the sale of his books for £35. It became the property of the Rev. Wm. Makellar, and was sold as lot 648 at the sale of his books on November 10, 1898."

[13. 1650].

Size, $4 \times 1\frac{1}{2}$ inches. The smallest edition in Mr. Sturrock's collection. His copy wants the title of the Confession. There are (4) preliminary pages containing the "Act of Assembly," etc. The Confession occupies 94 pp.

- [15. 1651] The | Confession | of | Faith, | And the | Larger and Shorter | Catechisme, | First agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines at | Westminster, | And now approved by the | General Assemblie of the Kirk of | Scotland to be a part | of Uniformity in religion | between the Kirks of | Christ in the three | Kingdoms. | Together with the Solemn League and | Covenant of the three Kingdoms. | First Printed at *Edenburg* and now re- | printed at *London* for the Compa- | ny of Stationers. 1651.

Full title kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers, from a copy in his own possession. Size, 24mo, $4\frac{1}{4} \times 1\frac{7}{8}$ inches (block of type). The Directory has the imprint: "London, printed by T. R. and E. M., for the Company of Stationers, 1651." The references are in the margin and occasionally run through the page. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

- [16. 1652].

Size, $4\frac{1}{2} \times 2$ inches (block of type). The Directory, etc., has the imprint "London. Printed by I. M., for the Company of Stationers, 1652." (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

- [17. 1652] The | Confession | of | Faith, | and the | Larger and Shorter | Catechisms; | First agreed upon by | the Assembly of Di- | vines at Westminster, | And now approved | by the Generall As- | sembly of the Kirk of | Scotland, to be a part | of Uniformity in Religi- | on between the Kirks of | Christ in the three Kingdomes. | Edinburgh, | Printed by the Heirs of | George Anderson, 1652. |

Full title kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

- [21. 1656].

The last line of the title is omitted by Dr. Schaff. It reads: "*Anno Dom. MDCLVI.*" The size is $5 \times 2\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type). The references are in the margin and run here and there across the page.

The remark made at the end of the first paragraph on the initials with which the Preface is signed is meaningless: of course "G" is the Latin initial for "William." Compare the fuller description in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for April, 1902, p. 262 (No. B).

- [23. 1658].

Dr. Carruthers writes:

"There is a curious blunder in the line in the title: 'Lately Published with the Scriptures at large, for.' It should be: 'Lately published. With,' etc. This is the first edition with 'the Scriptures at large.'"

- [24. 1658].

Size, $6\frac{3}{4} \times 4\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type).

There is a copy of this edition in the possession of the Rev. Dr. E. R. Craven, of Philadelphia, who reports that there are on p. 42 *four* lines of text of the Confession at the top of the page, while No. 25 has only *three* lines.

[25. 1658] The | Confession | of | Faith, | Together with | The Larger and Lesser | Catechisms. | Composed by the Reverend | Assembly | of | Divines, | Sitting at Westminster, | Presented to both Houses of | Parliament. || Again Published with the Scriptures at large, and the | Emphases of the Scriptures in a different Character. | To which is annexed two sheets of Church-Government with the | Scriptures at large. [The Second Edition.] || Deut. 6. 6, 7. . . . || London, Printed by E. M. for the Company of Stationers, and are to be sold | by John Rothwel at the Fountain in Cheapside. 1658.

Small 4to; $7\frac{1}{2} \times 4\frac{7}{8}$ inches (block of type). The back of title is blank. Then follows, in 12 unnumbered pages, the ordinance for calling the Assembly and a list of those actually attendant, the twelfth page (which would otherwise be blank) being occupied with a list of "Books Printed for John Rothwel at the Fountain in Cheapside." The epistle "To the Christian Reader; Especially heads of Families" follows, on 7 unnumbered pages; then "the contents of the Chapters in the Confession of Faith," occupying 2 unnumbered pages. A blank page follows; then follows, on numbered pages 1-4, A. Ker's "A Grave and Serious Advice;" and Manton's epistle to the "Christian Reader" follows on 6 unnumbered pages. The next page (unnumbered) contains "Errata in the Scriptures of the Confession of Faith;" and the next is blank. This preliminary matter makes 36 pp. in all (including title-page). The Confession follows in 118 pp. The pagination is right up to p. 56, which closes sig. H. The pagination of sig. I is confused, beginning with 47 and ending with 44. Sig. K begins with p. 55 and the pagination then runs smoothly to p. 108 (really 118), on which the Confession closes with the signatures of the officers of the Assembly and the imprimatur of James Cranford, as in No. 23. The title-page to the Larger Catechism follows, with its back blank. The text of the Larger Catechism follows. Sigs. A to N are paged consecutively from 151 to 254. Sig. P follows immediately (there is no sig. O, though there is no break in the text), beginning the pagination with 105; this new paging runs smoothly to the end of sig. Y, p. 163, which carries us into the middle of Q. 36 of the Shorter Catechism. The Larger Catechism had closed on p. 155 (p. 156 is blank), and the Shorter Catechism had opened (without separate title-page) on p. 157. With sig. Z, in the midst of Q. 36 of the Shorter Catechism, a new pagination begins with p. 139. The Shorter Catechism closes on p. 164. The Advice on Church Government begins on p. 165, on the third page of sig. Cc, which Sig. ends with p. 170. Sig. Dd begins again with a new pagination—201—which is continued to the first page of sig. Ee (p. 207): but the second page of sig. Ee is numbered 300, and the volume ends at the close of the "Doctrinall part of the Ordination of Ministers," on p. 302. This description is taken from a copy kindly presented by Dr. Wm. Carruthers, and agrees with his description in his bibliography of the Shorter Catechism cited in this REVIEW, Oct., 1901, p. 631. Dr. Craven's copy has twenty additional (unnumbered) pages at the end, in which is included a "Table": Mr. Sturrock's copy has this "Table" (pp. 7) at the end, to which is prefixed a declaration regarding the permanent establishment of Presbyterian Government: and the copy now described looks as if it may have lost something from the end. The preliminary matter seems to differ slightly in the several copies. The body of the book appears to be identical in all. This edition is not rare: besides those mentioned, there are copies in the libraries of Princeton Theological Seminary; of Dr. Wm. Carruthers, London; of the Public Library at Cincinnati, O.; and of the Rev. Dr. Louis F. Benson, of Philadelphia.

[27. 1660] The | Confession | of | Faith | and the | Larger and Shorter | Catechism, | First agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines at | Westminster. | And now approved by the | General Assembly of the Kirk of | Scotland, to be a part of Uni- | formity in religion between the Kirks of Christ in the three Kingdoms. | First printed at Edinburgh and now reprinted at London | for the Company of Stationers, 1660.

Full title kindly communicated by Dr. Carruthers. The Rev. Mr. J. Sturrock's copy contains also the "Directory" and "Church Government," pp. 91.

[30 and 31. 1671] The | Confession | of | Faith | And the | Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | First agreed upon by the | Assembly of Divines at | Westminster. | And now approved by the | General assembly of the Kirk of | Scotland to be a part of Unifor- | mity in Religion, between the | Kirks of Christ in the three | Kingdoms. | Edinbourg, | Printed by George Swintoun and | Thomas Brown, and are to be sold | by James Glen and David | Trench. Anno Dom. 1671.

12mo, pp. 196 (errore 116). To this is added: "The | Summe | of saving | Knowledge, | With the | Practical use thereof. | John 6. 37 | All that the Father &c. [3 lines] || Edinburgh, | Printed by George Swintoun and Thomas | Brown, and are to be sold by James | Glen and David Trench, 1671": no pagination [pp. 56]. The signature is continuous from the Shorter Catechism, the title being on I 3. Dr. Carruthers, who has supplied the above titles, writes: "This is the same copy (B. M. 3504. 19) which I quote in *The Shorter Catechism*, p. 45." It seems, accordingly, that No. 30 is the same as No. 31.

[35. 1687] The | Confession | of | Faith, And the larger and shorter | Catechisms. | First agreed upon by the Assembly of | Divines at Westminster. | And now appointed by the General | Assembly of the Kirk of Scot- | land, to be a part of Uniformity | in religion between the Kirks of | Christ in the three Kingdoms. | Together with the Directions of the General Assembly | Concerning secret and private worship: And | the Summe of saving knowledge, with | the practical use thereof. | Glasgow, Printed by Robert Sanders, 1687.

Full title supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[36. 1688].

Mr. Sturrock writes: "There are no separate titles for the Catechisms, and the head-line throughout the volume is '*The Confession of Faith*.'"

[37. 1688] The | Confession | of | Faith. | And the | Larger and Shorter | Catechism; | First agreed upon by | the Assembly of | Divines at | Westminster. | And now approved by the | General Assembly of the Kirk | of Scotland, to be a part of the Uniformity | in Religion between the Kirks | of

Christ in the three | Kingdoms. | The former Editions being very | full of faults in every page, are now | faithfully corrected for the Bene- | fit of the Reader. | Printed in the year 1688. |

Full title supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[38. 1689] The | Confession | of | Faith, | and the | Larger and Shorter | Catechism, | First agreed upon by the As- | sembly of Divines at | Westminster : | And now approved by the | General Assembly of the | Kirk of Scotland, to be a part | of Uniformity in Religion between | the Kirks of Christ in the three | Kingdoms. | Together with the sum of saving | knowledge, and the practical use thereof. | Edinburgh, Printed by John Reid, Anno Dom. | MDCLXXXIX.

Full title supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[39. 1690] The | Confession | of | Faith, | And the Larger and Shorter | Catechisms. | First agreed upon by the Assembly of Di- | vines at Westminster. | And now appointed by the General | Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland, to | be a part of uniformity in Religion, | between the Kirks of Christ in the | three Kingdoms. | Together with | the Directions of the General Assembly concerning | secret and private worship ; and the sum of | saving knowledge, with the practical | Use thereof. | Glasgow, | Printed by Robert Sanders, one | of His Majesties Printers, 1690.

Full title supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[40. 1690] Act | Ratifying the | Confession of Faith, | And Settling | Presbyterian | Church-government. | Edinburgh, the Seventh Day of June, 1690. | [Royal Arms] | Edinburgh | Printed by the Heir of Andrew Anderson, Printer to | the King and Queens most Excellent Majesties, | Anno Dom. 1590. |

The Confession is printed at length. After the Finis : "Extracted forth of the Records of Parliament, by me Th. Burnet, Cls. Reg." There is a copy in the possession of Mr. Sturrock.

[41. 1693].

The Rev. J. Sturrock writes : "24mo. Similar to the Latin edition of Sanders, 1670 ; with Scripture references after each section. This is evidently the edition Dr. Fleming refers to, printed in Glasgow 'by Robert Sanders, One of His Majesties Printers, 1693'—as it has the error in the title of the Saving Knowledge, which begins at p. 161. The total number of pages is 197. After the Solemn Acknowledgment follow Directory, Church Government, and Directions for Private Worship, and a Postscript of four pages—all without pagination."

- [44. 1703] The | Confession | of | Faith, | And the Larger and Shorter | Catechisms : | First agreed upon by the Assembly of Divines at | Westminster : | And now appointed by the General Assembly | of the Kirk of Scotland, to be a part of Uni- | formity in Religion, between the Kirks of | Christ in the three Kingdoms. | Together with the Directions of the Gene- | ral Assembly concerning secret and pri- | vate Wor- ship : And the sum of saving know- | ledge, with the prac- tical Use thereof. | Glasgow. | Printed by Robert Sanders, One of Her | Majesties Printers. 1703.

The full title has been communicated by Dr. Carruthers from a copy in the Lambeth Palace Library.

- [46. 1708].

There is a copy of this edition in the library of Westminster College, Cambridge.

- [47. 1710] The | Confession | of | Faith, | And the Larger and Shorter | Catechisms : | First agreed upon by the Assemb- | ly of Divines at Westminster : | And now appointed by the General As- | sembly of the Kirk of Scotland, | to be a part of Uniformity in Religion | between the Kirks of Christ in the | three Kingdoms. | Together with the sum of saving knowledge, | and the practical use thereof. | Edinburgh, | Printed by James Watson, | and sold at his | Shop next door the Red Lyon, op- | posite to the Lucken booths. 1710.

24mo, $4\frac{3}{8} \times 2\frac{1}{2}$ inches (block of type), pp. 276. Back of title blank : the text of the Confession begins on p. 3 and ends on p. 67. Contains also the Catechisms, the Sum, the Covenants, the Directories, Church Government, and Postscript. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, to which our attention was called by Dr. Louis F. Benson.

- [50. 1715] The | Confession | of | Faith, | and the | Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | First agreed upon by the Assemb- | ly of Divines at Westminster : | And now Approved by the General As- | sembly of the Kirk of Scotland, | to be a part of Uniformity in Religion | between the Kirks of Christ in the | three Kingdoms, || [An emblem of a rose and thistle bearing a crown] ||. Edinburgh, | Printed by John Moncur, and sold at his Print- | ing-House at the foot of the Ball Cross. 1715.

24mo, $4\frac{5}{8} \times 2\frac{3}{8}$ inches, pp. 310. The back of the title is blank : the Confession begins on p. 66 : contents same as in No. 47, 1710—though it is a very different book. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, to which our attention was drawn by Rev. Dr. Louis F. Benson : there is also a copy in the possession of the Rev. John Sturrock, of Edinburgh.

- [51^a. 1717] The | Confession | of Faith, | [etc., as in No. 51. 1717] . . . || London. Printed for James MacEuen in | Edinburgh. 1717.

This is an issue of No. 51 with a different imprint. There is a copy in the library of Westminster College, Cambridge. Dr. Carruthers supposes the original purpose of this edition of 1717 was for the Scottish publisher, and that this may account for the Scottish complexion of the contents of the book.

[54. 1721] The | Confession | of | Faith, | and the | Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | First agreed upon by the Assem- | bly of Divines at Westminster; | And now approved by the General As- | sembly of the Kirk of Scotland, | to be a Part of Uniformity in Religion, | between the Kirks of Christ in | the Three Kingdoms: | Together with the sum of Saving Knowledge, | and the practical Use thereof. | The former Editions being very full of Faults | in many Pages, are now faithfully corre- | cted for the Benefit of the Reader. | Glasgow. | Printed by James Duncan, Printer to the | City, and are to be sold at his Shop in | the foot of the Salt market, 1721.

12mo, pp. 334: Postscript, pp. 2. Full title kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[56. 1725].

There is a copy in the Public Library of Cincinnati, O. Mr. Sturrock's copy of the volume has pp. xvi, 560.

[57. 1725].

For fuller description and account of editions see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for April, 1902, pp. 263 *sq.* (No. C).

[58. 1727] The | Confession | of | Faith, | Larger and Shorter | Catechisms, | First agreed upon by the Assembly of | Divines at Westminster: | And now appointed by the General | Assembly of the Kirk of Scotland, to | be a part of Uniformity in Religion, | between the Kirks of Christ in the | three Kingdoms. | Together with the Sum of Saving Knowl- edge, and the practical Use thereof. | Glasgow, Printed by James Duncan, and are to be | sold at his Shop in the Salt Market, near | Gibson's Wynd. 1727.

12mo, pp. 334: Postscript, pp. 2. This description is kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[59. 1727] The | Confession | of | Faith, | Agreed upon by | the Assembly of Divines at Westminster, | with the Assistance of | Commissioners from the Church of Scotland, | as | a Part of the Covenanted Uniformity in Religion | betwixt the Churches of Christ in the Three | Kingdoms. | Edinburgh. | Printed by Thomas Lumisden and John Robertson, | and sold at their Printing-house in the Fish-Market, | 1727.

8vo, pp. 44; $5\frac{1}{2} \times 3\frac{3}{4}$ inches (block of type). *Advertisement*: "The Confession

of Faith is now published in this manner without the Scripture Proofs, with a view to its being taught in schools, in the same way as the Shorter Catechism,'” etc. There is a copy in the Rev. J. Sturrock’s library, Edinburgh.

[63. 1735, to be corrected to 1775].

The date of this edition is given erroneously. It should be M.DCC.LXXV, not 1735. In Q. 105 of the Larger Catechism it reads “lawful”: the punctuation in the heading to the “Sum” is wrong: “Catechisms. Agreed.”

[66. 1739] The | Confessions of Faith, Catechisms, Directories,
| Form of Church Govern- | ment, Discipline, &c. | of Pub-
| lick Authority in the | Church of Scotland: | Together with
| The Acts of Assembly, concerning the | Doctrine, Wor-
| ship, Discipline and Go- | vernment of the Church of Scot-
| land. | As also, | A collection of some principal Acts and
| Ordinances of the Parlia- | ments of Scotland and England,
| and | of the General Assembly of | the Church of Scotland,
| in favour of the | Covenanted Reformation. | Edinburgh, |
| Printed by Thomas Lumisden and John | Robertson, and sold
| at their Printing-house in the Fish-Market. | 1739.

The full title has been kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[68. 1743].

Small 8vo, 6 x 3¼ inches (block of type), pp. 567. The “Table” is elaborate and occupies 23 pages. The proofs are in double columns at the foot of the page. It is beautifully printed. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

[69. 1746].

12mo, 4½ x 2½ (block of type). (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

[77. 1752] The | Confession of Faith, | The Larger and Shorter
| Catechisms | with the Scripture-proofs at Large. | Together
| with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge (contain’d | in the
| Holy Scriptures, and held forth in the | said Confession and
| Catechisms) and Practical Use thereof, Covenants Nation- |
| al and Solemn League, Acknowledg- | ment of Sins and
| Engagement to Du- | ties, Directories, Form of Church- |
| Government, &c. | of Publick Authority in the | Church of
| Scotland, | with | Acts of Assembly and Parliament, relative
| to, | and approbative of, the same. || Deut. vi. 6, 7. And
| the words, etc. [four lines]. || Glasgow, | Printed by James
| Knox, and sold at his shop opposite to Gibson’s Land, Salt-
| Mercat. 1752.

Full title kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[81. 1756] The Confession of Faith | The Larger and Shorter
| Catechisms | with the Scripture Proofs at large. | Together
| with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge (contained in the

Holy Scrip- | tures, and held forth in the said Confession and
Catechisms) and Practical Use thereof, Covenants, National |
and Solemn League, Acknowledgment of Sins, and | Engage-
ment to Duties, Directories, Form of Church- | Government,
&c., of Public Authority in the | Church of Scotland | with |
Acts of Assembly and Parliament relative to and ap- | proba-
tive of the same. || Deut. vi. 6, 7. And †these words,
|| Edinburgh; | Printed by E. Robertson, and sold at his |
Printing-House in the Fish Market Close. | MDCCLVI.

Full title kindly supplied by Dr. Carruthers. $6\frac{3}{4} \times 4$ inches (block of type). The "Table" occupies 14 pp.; each part has its separate title-page. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

[83. 1756] The | Confession of Faith, | the Larger and Shorter
Catechisms, | with the Scripture Proofs at Large. | Together
with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge (contain'd | in the
Holy Scriptures, and held forth in the said | Confession and
Catechisms) and Practical | Use thereof, Covenants National
and | Solemn League, Acknowledgment of | Sins and Engage-
ment to Duties, Di- | rectories, Form of Church Govern- |
ment, etc. | Of Public Authority in the | Church of Scotland,
| with | Acts of Assembly and Parliament, relative to, and
| approbative of, the same. || Deut. vi. 6, 7. | Glas-
gow: | Printed by John Robertson Senior, and sold at his |
Shop in the Salt-Mercat. M,DCC,LVI.

8vo, pp. 546 + "Table" [22]; $6\frac{1}{2} \times 3\frac{3}{8}$ inches (block of type). There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

[84. 1757]

Dr. Carruthers writes: "My only memorandum is: The Confession of Faith: and the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, etc. Edinburgh: Printed by E. Robertson. 1757."

[85. 1757].

The separate title-pages have not the *full* imprint, but read, "Glasgow: Printed by Archd. McLean, 1757," lacking Orr's name. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

[87. 1761].

Dr. Carruthers writes: "My mem. is: The Confession of Faith, etc., as in title of 1764. Glasgow: Printed by John Bryce, and are to be sold at his Shop in the Salt-mercat. 1761. 8vo, pp. 560, 72. (These 72 pp. are 'The Form of Process.')" Accordingly Dr. Carruthers' copy is to be identified with No. 87, and not No. 86, as suggested in the notes to No. 86.

[91. 1765].

The imprint is: "Glasgow: Printed by Robert and Andrew Foulis, for John Orr, Bookseller." It is $6\frac{3}{4} \times 4$ inches. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

[92. 1766].

This is similar to 91, but in the imprint the words "Printers to the University" are added after the printers' names, and Orr's name does not appear. The "Contents" are not printed on the back of the title as in 91, but on a separate leaf, after the latter. (Rev. J. Sturrock.)

[96. 1769].

Dr. Carruthers writes: "Glasgow. Printed by John Robertson. 1769."

[97. 1771] The Confession of Faith | [etc., as in ed. 1764]
 Glasgow; | Printed by Robert and Thomas Dun-
 can, and sold at | their shop Pope's Head Salt-Market. |
 MDCCLXXI.

8vo, pp. 632. There are additional copies in the libraries of the Rev. Dr. Louis F. Benson, Philadelphia, and of Dr. Wm. Carruthers, London. Dr. Benson writes: "In my copy the subtitle-pages of the different included documents have different dates, ranging from 1763 to 1771. The imprint of the subtitle to the Confession is 'Glasgow; | Printed in the year M.DCC.LXX. |' That of the Larger Catechism bears the date M.DCC.LXIII. The paging is nevertheless continuous."

[104. 1793] The | Confession of Faith; | The | Larger and
 Shorter Catechisms | with the | Scripture Proofs at Large: |
 Together with | [etc. . . .].

This correction of line divisions has been kindly furnished by the Rev. Dr. Louis F. Benson.

[108. 1842].

Dr. Carruthers writes: "This is: 'Glasgow: Francis Orr & Sons. | 1842 |' 12mo, pp. 370." Mr. Sturrock writes: "Small 8vo, 5 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{2}$ inches, pp. 370 with 'Table.'"

[111. 1845].

Insert in title just before imprint the words: | "Printed by Authority." | There is a copy in the Public Library of Cincinnati, O.

[112. 1845] An | Exposition | of | the Confession of Faith | of
 the | Westminster Assembly of Divines. | By | the Rev.
 Robert Shaw, | Whitburn. | With an Introductory Essay, | by
 the | Rev. William M. Hetherington, LL.D. | Fourth Edition.
 | Johnstone and Hunter: | London, 26 Paternoster Row. |
 Edinburgh, 15 Princes Street. | M.DCCC.L.

12mo, pp. xxxvi, 333. The Preface is dated May 12, 1845. The first edition is entered in the Catalogue of the British Museum with the date of 1845 and the same pagination: it would seem therefore that the fourth edition differs from it only in the title-page. See further below, p. 579. Also compare THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for January, 1902, No. xlv.

[113. 1851].

In footnote of p. 652 read "INNES" instead of "Innis." On p. 653, lines 9 to

11, omit from "Doubtless" to "indeed," and delete footnote *. The edition of 1815, as well as the Kerr of 1793 and the Kincaid of 1781, are right at L. C. Q. 105.

[117. 1855].

At line 2 of notes read "Moncrieff."

[121. 1859]. The | Confession of Faith; | the | Larger and Shorter Catechisms, with Scripture proofs at large, | Together with | The Sum of Saving Knowledge, | (contained in the Holy Scriptures and held forth in the said Confession | and Catechisms) and Practical Use thereof, &c. | Printed by Authority | Glasgow & London, W. R. McPhun. | 1859.

Dr. Carruthers has kindly supplied the full title.

[124. 1863].

In the notes, line 2, read "Moncrieff."

[130. 1881] Subordinate Standards | of the | United Presbyterian Church. | With Basis of Union | and | Summary of Principles. | Printed by Authority. | Published at the | United Presbyterian College Buildings, Edinburgh. | 1880.

Pp. 115. The Confession of Faith appears at pp. 1-34. Full title and information supplied by Dr. Carruthers.

[131. 1881].

A second edition of Mr. Macpherson's Commentary was published in 1882, as we are advised by the dating of the preface ("18 March 1882"): there is no date on the new title-page, which runs: "The Westminster | Confession of Faith. | With Introduction and Notes | By | the Rev. John Macpherson, M.A. | Findhorn. | Second Edition. | Edinburgh: | T. & T. Clark, 38 George Street. | [No date]." The book is made up as follows: General title-page to the series, title-page, contents (1 p.), preface to second edition (1 p.) = 6 unnumbered pages: body of book, pp. 1-171: list of books referred to on p. [172]. This description is from a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Louis F. Benson, of Philadelphia. Some (later) issues of this "second edition" lack the words "second edition" on the title-page.

[137. 1886].

Dr. Carruthers writes (June 6, 1902): "This edition was first issued in 1886. It was recomposed and reissued in 1891—and was stereotyped—but by some mistake the plates were put into the melting and I am now correcting the proofs of a new reissue which will be stereotyped."

[xvi. 1797].

There is a copy in the library of the Rev. Dr. Louis F. Benson. He reports it as having 470 pp. and as differing in its title from the form, printed, as follows: line 1, place a | after "of the"; line 2, read a period after "America"; line 1 on p. 81, place the | after, not before, "journments"; line 2, read a period after "22"; line 3, read periods after "M" and after "C."

[xlii. 1843-52].

There is a copy also in the Public Library of Cincinnati, Ohio.

[lxxi. 1896].

P. 112, line 3 from bottom of first paragraph of "notes," instead of 1889 read 1789.

[B. *Latin*. 1656].

The last line of the title-page should read "*Anno Dom. MDCLVI*," instead of "1656." The Rev. J. Sturrock, of Edinburgh, besides the editio princeps of 1656, possesses copies of the following editions: "Edinburghi, Excudebat Gideon Lithgow, Anno Dom. 1660." 12mo, $4\frac{1}{4} \times 2$ inches (the Confession occupies pp. 46). "Glasguæ, Excudebat Robertus Sanders, Anno Dom. 1670." 12mo, $4\frac{1}{4} \times 2\frac{1}{4}$ inches; Scripture references at the end of each paragraph in the Confession, and of each question in the Catechisms. "Edinburghi, Apud Andrea Anderson Hæredes et Successores, Regiæ Magistatis Typographi, M.DC.XCIV." Pp. 172. Edinburgh, Anderson, 1708, 12mo, pp. 184. Edinburgh, Watson, 1711, 12mo, pp. 180.

[C. *Gaelic*. 1728+].

Mr. Sturrock has a copy of the issue of 1821, p. 265 (in the title-page of which, as we have given it, 1721 is printed by error), which contains only the Confession, Larger Catechism and Sum (lacking the Shorter Catechism). 12mo, pp. 356.

[O. *Persian*. 1892] Christian Confession of Faith | Known in the Western World by the Name | "Westminster Confession of Faith" | Which Mr. Potter with the assistance of Mirza Mohammed Tagee of Shiraz, | in Teheran, from the English Language | made. | Christian year 1902.

This literal translation of the title-page has been kindly sent us by Mr. Potter. The line: "Westminster Confession of Faith" is written in in English. In the same year (1892) Mr. Potter translated into Persian also the new *Articles of the Presbyterian Church of England*.

[a. *The Parliamentary Recension*. 1648.]

For full title and description see above, p. 560 (No. 8).

[c. *The Baptist Recension*. 1677].

The Rev. S. M. Tenney, of Houston, Texas, has kindly communicated a description of the tenth American edition, which should be inserted on p. 400, line 13, immediately before the words "A new edition was printed at Pittsburg, . . ." It is as follows: The tenth American edition appeared in 1823: "A | Confession of Faith; | put forth | By the Elders and Brethren | of many congregations | of Christians. | (Baptised upon profession of their Faith) | In London and the country. | Adopted by the Baptist Association met at Philadel- | phia, Sept. 25, 1742 | With two additional articles, viz.: Of Imposition of Hands, | and Singing of Psalms in Public Worship. | The Tenth Edition | [Texts from Romans x. 20 and John v. 39] | Frankfort: | Printed by J. H. Holeman | 1823 | " 24mo, pp. ix, 69 + 43 + [3]. The Confession occupies pp. 1-69: then pp. 1-43 in new pagination are occupied with "A | Compendium | of | Church Discipline | [etc., etc.] | Frankfort | Printed by J. H. Holeman | 1823 | " The "Preface" to this "Compendium" reads:—"The Philadelphia Baptist Association, at their meeting on the 5th of October, 1795, judging their former treatise of Church Discipline, [Griffith's] to be materially defective, appointed Dr. Samuel Jones to revise the same, or to write a new one. At their meeting on the 3d of October, 1797, they appointed a committee of one person from each Church in the Association, to revise the new treatise,

reported by Dr. Jones. On the 13th of December following, the committee met at Philadelphia, performed the duty assigned them, and published a directory for the use of the churches. The Franklin Baptist Association, at their meeting in Frankfort, on the first Saturday in August last, appointed a committee to republish the 'Baptist Confession of Faith' by subscription; the subscribers thereto having generally desired, that some approved treatise on discipline should be subjoined, the committee have selected that published by the Philadelphia Association as above stated—to which a few notes, etc., are added, and the authorities cited. The committee are aware that the word of God and no human composition, is the standard by which our principles and conduct must be tried, nevertheless, they hope this treatise may be of some use, for the right understanding of God's Word, with regard to the points treated on, and they desire that the Scriptures referred to, may be carefully consulted to see whether these things be true. May the great Head of the Church bless every Christian effort to promote His honor and the welfare of His churches. September, 1823." Following this "Compendium" is an "Appendix" of three unnumbered pages, made up of four items concerning disciplinary forms, etc. The text of the Confession exhibits certain variations from that quoted from the English edition of 1699, *e. g.*, iii, 1, "unchangeably" for "unchangeable," "come" for "comes"; xvii, 1, omit "given"; xviii, 2, "property" for "propriety." In the table of Contents of the Confession (on the back of the last page of the Confession) the title of chap. iii reads "Of God's Decrees," [plural] but in the title over the chapter it reads correctly "Decree" [singular]. The proof-texts to the Confession are cited by reference only.

[g²⁴, 1879, and g²⁵, 1880].

In the titles of these two editions, read "in the | United States of America |" instead of "of the | etc."

APPENDIX III: LITERATURE ON THE CONFESSION.

It does not fall within the limits of our present task to record the literature that has arisen about the Westminster Confession. It may not be out of place, however, to set down in this Appendix a select list of titles which may serve as suggestions to those who would study the document and its history.

The primary sources for the history of the formulation of the Confession are, of course, the Parliamentary *Acts and Journals* and the *Minutes* of the Assembly, supplemented by Rushworth's *Collections*, Baillie's *Letters and Journals*, and Lightfoot's *Journals* (*Works*, Ed. Pittman, Vol. XIII). The relevant portion of the Minutes of the Assembly was printed in 1874, under the editorship of Drs. Mitchell and Struthers: *Minutes of the Sessions of the Westminster Assembly of Divines while engaged in preparing their Directory for Church Government, Confession of Faith, and Catechisms (November, 1644, to March, 1649) from Transcripts of the Originals*, etc. (William Blackwood & Sons, Edinburgh and London, 1874, 8vo, pp. lxxxviii, 556). A classified index of the references to the Confession in these Minutes may be found in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for April, 1901, pp. 251 *seq.* A transcription of the passages in Baillie's letters refer-

ring to the Confession will be found in the same number of this REVIEW, pp. 257 seq.

All the general histories of the times, as well as the general histories of the British Churches, contain, of course, some account of the Westminster Assembly and its work. Perhaps the following may be especially profitably consulted: Gardiner's *Civil Wars* (as per Index); Fuller's *Church History of Britain* (VI, pp. 247 seq.); Marsden's *Later Puritans*; Neal's *History of the Puritans* (Part III); Stoughton's *Ecclesiastical History of England* (Vol. I); Masson's *Life of Milton* (Vols. II and III); McCrie's *Annals of English Presbytery*; Drysdale's *History of Presbyterians in England* (pp. 29 and 347); Shaw's *History of the English Church during the Civil Wars and under the Commonwealth* (Vol. I).

The following are the more important publications devoted specifically to the history of the Assembly and the formulation of the Confession:

Memoirs | of the | Lives and Writings | of those | Eminent Di-
vines, | who convened in | the famous | Assembly at West-
minster, | in the Seventeenth Century. | By James Reid |
Minister of the Gospel. | Paisley | Printed by Stephen and
Andrew Young, | High Street. | 1811.

8vo, 2 vols., pp. xxxvi, 368 and 390. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia.

A History | of the | Westminster Assembly | of | Divines. | Em-
bracing an account of its principal Transactions, | and | Bio-
graphical Sketches | of its | most conspicuous Members. |
Compiled for the Board of Publication from the best authori-
ties. | Philadelphia: | Presbyterian Board of Publication, |
James Russell, Publishing Agent. | 1841.

12mo, pp. 430. No indication of the author is given. There are copies in the libraries of Princeton Theological Seminary and of the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia. The first separate history of the Westminster Assembly.

History | of the | Westminster Assembly | of | Divines. | By |
W. M. Hetherington, D.D., LL.D., | Author of the "History
of the Church of Scotland," | etc., etc. | Fourth Edition, |
with notes and facsimiles of title-pages of the original editions
of | the Confession of Faith; the Catechisms, Larger and
Shorter; | and the Directory for Church Government; and |
Ordination of Ministers. | Edited by the | Rev. Robert Wil-
liamson, | Ascog, Rothesay. | Edinburgh: | James Gemmell,
George IV Bridge. | MDCCCLXXXVIII.

16mo, xix, 480. Earlier edd.: Edinb. 1843, third ed. 1856; N. Y. 1843, 1844, 1868, etc. A fifth edition appeared in 1890. This has long been the chief formal history of the Assembly, and has not yet been superseded.

The Westminster Confession of Faith: A Contribution to the Study of its Historical Relations and to the Defence of its Teaching, being the Substance of a Lecture. Third Edition, with extensive prefatory Observations in Reply to some recent Speeches and Publications of the Rev. Dr. Lee. By the Rev. Alexander F. Mitchell, D.D. Edinburgh, 1867.

8vo, sewed. A valuable pamphlet, although naturally somewhat superseded by Dr. Mitchell's subsequent publications.

The Westminster Assembly | its History and Standards | being | The Baird Lecture for 1882 | By | Alexander F. Mitchell, D.D., LL.D. | Emeritus Professor of Ecclesiastical History, St. Mary's College, St. Andrews; joint editor of "Minutes of the Westminster Assembly," | "Minutes of the Commission of the General Assembly," etc. | Second Edition, Revised by the Author | Philadelphia | Presbyterian Board of Publication | and Sabbath School Work | 1897.

16mo, pp. xxiv, 539. Earlier edd.: London, Nisbet, 1883; Philadelphia, Presbyterian Board, 1884. For the ground it covers, this book supersedes all other works on the subject. Dr. Mitchell's articles on the *Westminster Assembly* and the *Westminster Standards* in Johnson's *Universal Cyclopædia* should also be consulted: also his comprehensive *Introduction* prefixed to the *Minutes* (as above).

Bibliotheca Symbolica Ecclesiæ Universalis. | The Creeds of Christendom, | with | A History and Critical Notes. | By | Philip Schaff, D.D., LL.D., | Professor of Biblical Literature in the Union Theological Seminary, N. Y. | In Three Volumes. | Volume I. | The History of Creeds. | New York: | Harper & Brothers, Publishers. | Franklin Square. | 1878.

8vo. Part vii of the Seventh Chapter treats of the Westminster Standards, pp. 701-816. Pages 753-804 treat of the Confession—including both an analysis and a criticism of its doctrinal teachings, written from the standpoint of the "Mediating theology." Dr. Schaff gives an excellent conspectus of the literature. Dr. Schaff's article on the *Westminster Synode* in Herzog² (xviii, 52 sq.), and, in English, in the *American Presbyterian Review*, 1865, pp. 179 sq., should also be consulted.

The following are some of the more elaborate articles dealing with the formulation of the Confession:

Die Westminster Synode, 1643-1645, von Gen. von Rudloff (in Niedner's *Zeitschrift für die hist. Theol.*, 1850, pp. 238-290).

The Formation of our Standards, by J. B. Bittinger (in *The Presbyterian Quarterly and Princeton Review*, July, 1876, pp. 387 sq.).

Documentary History of the Westminster Assembly, by Prof. C. A. Briggs, D.D. (in *The Presbyterian Review*, January, 1880, pp. 127-163).

The Making of the Westminster Confession, by Prof. Benjamin B. Warfield, D.D., LL.D. (in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, April, 1901, xii, 226 sq.).

An Account of the Scripture Proofs Attached to the Confession of Faith and the Larger Catechism, by the Rev. Samuel T. Lowrie, D.D. (in *The Presbyterian Review*, July, 1888, pp. 443-456).

There should be consulted also the following articles: E. D. Warfield ("The England of the Westminster Assembly," in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, 1898, ix, 44 sq.); R. B. Drummond (*Theological Review*, 15, 189); A. P. Stanley (*Macmillan's Magazine*, 44, 282); J. M. Williams (*Bibliotheca Sacra*, 1890, 47, 625); F. R. Beattie (*Presbyterian Quarterly*, 1899, 13, 189); J. Ritchie Smith (*do.*, 405).

On the subsequent history of the Westminster Confession in the Churches and in the world see:

The | Law of Creeds | in Scotland | A Treatise | on | The Legal Relations of Churches in Scotland, | established and not established, to | their Doctrinal Confessions | By | Alexander Taylor Innes, M.A. | Solicitor before the Supreme Courts of Scotland, and member | of the Faculty of Procurators of Glasgow | William Blackwood & Sons | Edinburgh and London | MDCCCLXVII.

8vo, pp. xv, 495. A new edition has appeared as follows:

The Law of Creeds | in Scotland | A Treatise | on | the relations of Churches in Scotland | established and not established | to the Civil Law | By | A. Taylor Innes | Advocate | William Blackwood & Sons | Edinburgh and London | MCMII.

8vo, pp. xiii, 361. This new edition, while retaining all of permanent value in the first edition, has received such large additions as to make it practically a new work. The work it must be understood is not "a book of Church law." "It is a book of the civil law of Scotland in its relation to the Church." Nevertheless its discussions of the relations of the civil law to the Church in Scotland involve so large a treatment of the Church's relation to its Creed that the book is indispensable to the understanding of the history of the Westminster Confession in Scotland.

Along with Mr. Innes' work should be consulted the very full account of the relations of the various Presbyterian Churches to the Confession, printed as an Appendix (pp. 965-1123) to the *Report of Proceedings of the Second Council of the Alliance of the Reformed Churches holding the Presbyterian System* (Philadelphia [1880]). Also the following articles: John DeWitt, "Place of the Westminster Assembly in Modern History" (PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, 1898, ix, 369); T. Croskery,

“Westminster Theology” (*British and Foreign Evangelical Review*, April, 1886, 35, pp. 201-222); A. M. Fairbairn, “The Westminster Confession and Scotch Theologians” (*Contemporary Review*, December, 1872, 21, pp. 63-84); E. H. Gillett, “The Westminster Confession in England and Ireland” (*American Presbyterian and Theological Review*, Fourth Series, January, 1866, 15, 100-126); B. B. Warfield, “The Presbyterian Churches and the Westminster Confession” (*The Presbyterian Review*, October, 1889, x, pp. 646-657).

The following are the chief publications which deal specifically with the contents of the Confession, either by essaying a formal exposition of it or outlining a method of inculcating its teaching :

Truths | Victory over | Error. | Or, | An Abridgement of the
 Chief Contro- | versies in Religion, which since the | Apos-
 tles days to this time, have been, | and are in agitation,
 between those | of the *Orthodox Faith*, and all Adver- | saries
 whatever; a list of whose | names are set down after the
Epistle | to the Reader. || Wherein, by going through all the
 Chapters of | the *Confession of Faith*, one by one, and pro-
 | pounding out of them, by way of Question, all | the Con-
 troversed Assertions; and answering by | *Yes*, or *No*, there
 is a clear Confirmation of the *Truth*; and an evident Confuta-
 tion of what *Te- | nets* and *Opinions*, are maintain'd by the
Adver- | saries. || A TREATISE. | Most useful for all Per-
 sons who desire to be instru- | cted in the true *Protestant*
Religion, who would | shun in these last Days, and perillous
 Times, | the Infection of *Errors* and *Heresies*, and all dan- |
 gerous *Tenets* and *Opinions*, contrary to the | Word of GOD.
 || Edinburgh, | Printed by JOHN REID, Anno DOM.
 1684.

16mo, pp. [30] 341. Contains: (1) “The Epistle Dedicatory,” dedicating to George Drummond, Lord Provost, and to the Members of the Council of the Ancient City of Edinburgh, and signed by “Geo. Sinclar,” with the date “*Edin.* January 2, 1684,” pp. [3-8]. (2) The epistle “To the Honest Hearted Reader,” unsigned, pp. [9-19]. (3) A page [21] of verses. These are (a) a Latin “Tetrahstichon” and (b) an English poem, of 18 lines, in praise of “Truth’s Victory over Error.” (4) “An Alphabetical List of the Proper and Patronymic names of the Authors, of the old and late Heresies, confuted in the following Treatise,” pp. [23-30]. (5) The Treatise itself, with numbered pages 1-341.

The origin of the book was as follows: “Sinclar published in 1684, as his own composition, a work styled ‘Truth’s Victory over Error,’ with an elaborate preface enumerating his other books. The work was a translation of the Latin lectures delivered by David Dickson, Professor of Divinity in Glasgow. Sinclar’s version reached a second edition in 1688. The first edition to bear Dicksou’s name was issued at Glasgow in 1726.”—[John Anderson in Stephen’s *Dict. of Nat. Biog-*

raphy, lii, p. 294—where see for Sinclar. Cf. same *Dict.*, sub. voc. Dickson, David, xv, 41].

The method of Dickson's treatise is to develop the teaching of the Confession by means of questions, breaking up its affirmations into parts that can be answered yes or no, the answer being supported by texts and then the opponents of these affirmations confuted. *E.g.*, Chap. I, Question 1: "Is the light of Nature, and the works of Creation and Providence, sufficient to give that knowledge of God and of his will, which is necessary to salvation? No. 1 Cor. 1. 21, and 1 Cor. 2. 13, 14. ¶ Well then, do not the Socinians err, who maintain, That those living according to the Law and Light of Nature, may be saved? Yes. ¶ By what reasons are they confuted? . . . [The reasons developed in full]." In this way every affirmation of the Confession is emphasized, developed and defended. The book is thus both an admirable catechetical manual and a full "unterscheidungslehre."

Truth's Victory over Error: | or, The | True Principles | of the |
Christian Religion, | Stated and Vindicated against the fol-
lowing Heresies, *viz.* ||

Arians	Eutychians	Pelagians
Arminians	Erastians	Papists
Anabaptists	Familists	Quakers
Antinomians	Jesuits	Socinians
Brownists	Independents	Sabellians
Donatists	Libertines	Sceptics
Epicureans	Manicheans	Vaninians, &c.

The whole being a Commentary on all the Chapters of | the
Confession of Faith, by way of Question and An- | swer: In
which, the saving Truths of our holy Reli- | gion are con-
firmed and established; and the danger- | ous Errors and Opin-
ions of its Adversaries detected | and confuted. || Written by
the late Reverend and Learned | Mr. David Dickson, | Profes-
sor of Divinity in the University of Edinburgh. | To this
Edition is prefixed, | A Short Account of the Author's Life,
by the late Re- | verend Mr. ROBERT WODROW, Minister of
the Gos- | pel at Eastwood. || Kilmarnock: Printed by John
Wilson. | M,DCC,LXXXVII.

Small 8vo, pp. xxiv, 272. Contains: (1) the poems of p. [21] of the first edition, here on back of title-page. (2) The promised Life of Dickson, pp. iii-xxiv. (3) The Treatise itself, pp. 1-240. (4) The List of Heresies, of pp. [23-30] of ed. 1, here pp. 240-245. (5) "True Christian Love, to which are Added Honey Drops, or Chrystal Streams" (poems), pp. 247-272.

Wodrow opens his "Life" by explaining that the printer desired him to prepare something to take the place of the preface to ed. 1, which was thought unsuitable; and then goes on to give an account of Sinclar's Edition and to express his wonder that any one should care to translate another man's work and publish it with his own *initials*. But there are no "G. S." on the title-page of ed. 1, nor is the Dedication signed G. S., but "Geo. Sinclar."

A | Draught | of an | Overture, | Prepared and Published | by a
Committee | of the | Associate Reformed Synod, | for the

purpose of | Illustrating and Defending | the | Doctrines | of
the | Westminster Confession of Faith, | According to an |
appointment of said Synod. | Philadelphia : | Printed by
Zachariah Poulson, Jun^r. on the | West Side of Fourth Street,
between | Market and Arch-Streets | M DCC LXXXVII.

8vo, pp. viii, 160. The Committee consisted of Rev. Dr. John Mason and Revs. Robert Annan and John Smith, appointed May 16, 1787. The introductory paragraphs consist of notes "on Confessions and their Use." Then the several chapters of the Confession are taken up *seriatim* and expounded. There are appended (p. 138-148) "Thoughts on the Inspiration of the Holy Scriptures," followed by the "Conclusion" and (pp. 158-160) an "Appendix" on New England theology. A new edition appeared in 1855, as follows :

Exposition and Defence | of the | Westminster Assembly's | Con-
fession of Faith : | being the | Draught of an ' Overture ' |
prepared by a Committee | of the Associate Reformed Synod
in 1783. | A new Edition : | with an Introduction and Notes
| by | Rev. David McDill, D.D. | Cincinnati : | Moore,
Wilstach, Keys & Co. | 25 West Fourth Street. | 1855.

16mo, xxxii, 286.

Questions | on the | Confession of Faith | and | Form of Govern-
ment | of the | Presbyterian Church | in the United States of
America, | with a selection of | Scripture Proofs : | Designed
for the Instruction of ; Classes in the | Doctrines of said
Church. | By Henry R. Weed, D.D. | Philadelphia : | Pres-
byterian Board of Publication. | Paul T. Jones, Publishing
Agent. | 1842.

16mo, pp. 103, 4 $\frac{1}{2}$ x 3 $\frac{1}{8}$ inches (block of type). The questions on the Confession of Faith occupy pp. 5-77 ; those on The Form of Government, pp. 79-94 ; 95-97 contain questions on Directory for Worship, ix ; and 97-103 Dr. A. Green's Questions and Counsel. There are three classes of questions : (1) Those which are to be answered from the Confession of Faith. These are printed in Roman type and *have no answers* annexed. (2) Those which are expected to be answered out of general knowledge. These are printed in *italics* and have no answers annexed. (3) Those which are supported with answers. Examples : of (1) " Q. 1. Do the works of creation and Providence teach us that there is a God ? " Of (2) " § 2 Q. 1. *What is the meaning of the different names applied to the sacred writings, viz., THE SCRIPTURES, THE WORD OF GOD, THE BIBLE, &c., and why are the sacred writings so called ?* " Of (3) : " Q. 6. In ' what divers manners ' did God reveal himself to his people before the sacred Scriptures were written ? ANSWER. By angels, dreams, visions, and voices, by Urim and Thummim and by immediate suggestions to the mind. See Num. xii. 6, 8 ; Ex. iii. 1-4. "

A feature of the book is the numerous and well-selected body of proof-texts referred to. The questions are carefully framed and cover the ground faithfully. In the hands of a good teacher the whole Confession could be made known to the student orally : but though many of the questions could be answered by a simple yes or no, this is not uniformly the case and in general the Confession should be in the hands of the pupil. This book has been translated into the Benga language

by the Rev. C. DeHeer: see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, April, 1902, p. 272.

An | Exposition | of | the Confession of Faith | of the | West-
minster Assembly of Divines. | By | the Rev. Robert Shaw,
| Whitburn. | With an Introductory Essay, | by the | Rev.
William M. Hetherington, LL.D. | Fourth Edition. | John-
stone and Hunter: || London, 26, Paternoster Row. | Edin-
burgh, 15, Princes Street. | M.DCCC.L.

12mo. pp. xxxvi, 333. Dr. Hetherington's Essay occupies pp. ix-xxxvi. See for description, THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, Oct., 1901, p. 651, No. 112, and compare Jan., 1902, p. 99, No. xlv, and above, p. 569. The exposition is mainly of practical religious purport.

A | Commentary | on | the Confession of Faith, | With Questions
for Theological Students | and Bible Classes. | By the | Rev.
Archibald Alexander Hodge, D.D., | Author of | "The Atonement,"
and Professor of Didactic and Polemical Theology in
the | Western Theological Seminary of Allegheny, Pa. |
Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, | 1334
Chestnut street. | [no date.]

12mo, pp. 549. For description, see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW for January, 1902, p. 107 (No. lix). A British Edition was issued in 1870 by T. Nelson & Sons, London, Edinburgh and New York: and a Spanish Translation by the Rev. Plutarcho Arellano, in Mexico, in 1897 (see also THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, April, 1902, p. 275, No. P). A revised and enlarged edition (12mo, pp. 559) appeared from the same publishing house in Philadelphia in 1885 and has been reissued in 1901 (see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, January, 1902, p. 108, No. lxiii). The exposition is pre-vaillingly theological.

The Westminster | Confession of Faith. | With Introduction and
Notes | By the Rev. John Macpherson, M.A., | Findhorn. |
Edinburgh: | T. & T. Clark, 38 George Street | 1881.

Small 8vo, or 16mo, pp. 171. One of the series of "Handbooks for Bible Classes" edited by Rev. Marcus Dods, D.D., and Rev. Alexander Whyte, D.D. Introduction = pp. 1-28. The Confession of Faith, printed section by section with comment, pp. 29-168. Index = pp. 167-171. Compare the description in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, October, 1901, p. 656, No. 131, and additional note above, p. 570. The exposition is historico-theological. A second edition appeared in 1882: see above, p. 570.

The | Presbyterian Standards: | An Exposition | of the | West-
minster Confession of Faith | and Catechisms. | By | Rev.
Francis R. Beattie, B.D., Ph.D., D.D., | Professor of System-
etic Theology and Apologetics in Louisville Presby- | terian
Theological Seminary, and Author of "An Examination | of
Utilitarianism," "The Methods of Theism," and | "Radical
Criticism." | Richmond, Va.: | The Presbyterian Committee
of Publication | [no date].

Svo, pp. 431. The book was copyrighted in 1896. The First Chapter, pp. 13-28, contains "a brief description of the great Christian Creeds;" the Second, pp. 29-39, treats of "the nature and uses of Religious Creeds." The exposition begins with Chap. iii and proceeds through Chap. xxxiii. Chap. xxxiv is a "Summary and Conclusion." Follows an Index. It is the Shorter Catechism which is "made the basis of the exposition, but the contents of the Larger Catechism and the Confession of Faith are carefully incorporated throughout." The book is thus not in form an exposition of the Confession, but it essays to expound the doctrinal teaching of the entire body of the Standards. The tone is that of a moderate but convinced Calvinism.

Theology | of | The Westminster Symbols. | A Commentary |
 Historical, Doctrinal, Practical, | on the | Confession of Faith
 and Catechisms and | the Related Formularies of the | Presby-
 terian Churches. | By | Edward D. Morris, D.D., LL.D. |
 Emeritus Professor of Systematic Theology | in Lane Theo-
 logical Seminary. | Columbus, Ohio. | 1900.

Svo, pp. xv, 858. The book opens with a lecture (pp. 1-65) on "Symbolism: Nature and Uses of Creeds: the Creeds of Christendom: the Symbols of Westminster." Lectures 2 to 14 then give Dr. Morris' system of doctrine in the form of a running exposition of the teaching of the Creed. Lecture 15 is devoted to the Westminster Confession: "Estimate of the Assembly: Its Work Reviewed: Specific Excellences and Defects: Authority of the Symbols—Toleration: Continental Relations and Influences: Their Permanency and Propagation: Rule of Subscription: Revision." The work is an able and genial attempt to restate the doctrine of the Symbols in the sense of the moderate Calvinism of the New School of a generation ago.

Along with the Expositions of the Confession may be consulted the following general discussions:

Character and Sources of the Teaching of the Westminster Confession, by John Macpherson, M.A. (in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, 1898, ix, 239 *sq.*).

The Significance | of the | Westminster Standards | as a Creed |
 An Address | delivered before the Presbytery of New York,
 November 8, | 1897, on the occasion of the celebration of the
 | Two Hundred and Fiftieth Anniversary of | the Completion
 of the Westmin- | ster Standards | By | Benjamin B. War-
 field | Professor in the Theological Seminary at Princeton |
 New York | Charles Scribner's Sons | 1898.

12mo, pp. 36.

The | Creed of Presbyterians | By | Rev. Egbert Watson Smith,
 D.D. | Sixth Edition. Seventh Thousand. | New York | The
 Baker & Taylor Company | . . . | [no date, but copy-
 righted 1901].

16mo, pp. viii, 223.

Particular discussions of special Articles of the Confession in-

clude such as the following: James S. Candlish, "The Doctrine of the Westminster Confession on Scripture" (*British and Foreign Evangelical Review*, January, 1877, pp. 164-178); B. B. Warfield, "The Westminster Doctrine of Holy Scripture" (*PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW*, 1893, iv, 582); B. B. Warfield, "The Doctrine of Holy Scripture of the Westminster Divines" (*The Presbyterian Quarterly*, 1894, 19-76); C. C. Tiffany, "The Westminster Confession and the Thirty-nine Articles" (*Andover Review*, August, 1890, xiv, 158-173, on "Election"); B. B. Warfield, "Predestination in the Reformed Confessions" (*PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW*, 1901, xii, 499); J. Forbes, "Predestination and Freewill and the Westminster Confession" (London: Hamilton, 1878, 8vo); C. A. Briggs, "The Westminster Doctrine of the Salvation of Infants" (*Presbyterian Review*, April, 1887, pp. 316-321); Eugene Daniel, "The Westminster Confession's Right to Construe Itself" (*Presbyterian Quarterly*, 1900, xiv, 590); C. A. Briggs, "A Short Declaration of the Westminster Assembly by way of detestation of the Doctrine that God is the Author of Sin" (*Presbyterian Review*, April, 1885, pp. 315-318).

The following titles include some of the chief examples of the more elaborate unfriendly criticism of the Confession:

The Late | Assembly of Divines | Confession of | Faith | Examined. | As it was prefented by them unto | the | Parliament. | Wherein | many of their excesses and defects, of | their confusions and disorders, of their | errors and contradictions are prefented, both | to themselves and to others. || Humanum est errare | abi decipi, &c. | Humanius nihil est quam errantem revocare : | 2 Thessal. 3. 2. For all men have not faith. || London, Printed in the yeer. 1651.

16mo [32], 335. Back of title blank; Dedication to Parliament, pp. [3-12], signed by "W. Parker"; Epistle to the Assembly, pp. [13-16]; Poem on Synod of Dort, pp. [17-32]. Then follows a half-title: "The late | Synods | Confession of Faith | Examined." | The text of the Confession is printed in full, chapter by chapter: and after each chapter follow extended comments, captious and supercritical. See above, p. 551, No. 15^a.

The | Westminster Confession of Faith | critically compared with | the Holy Scriptures | and found wanting; | or, | A new exposition of | the Doctrines of | the Christian Religion, | in harmony with the Word of God, | and not at variance with modern science. | By James Stark, | | London: Longman, Green, Longman, Roberts, & Green. 1863.

8vo, pp. viii, 367. The whole Confession is printed and commented on somewhat captiously. See above, p. 554, No. 124^a.

The | Westminster Confession of Faith | Examined | on | the
 basis of the | Other Protestant Confessions. | By | Joseph
 Taylor Goodsir. | London : | Williams and Norgate, | 14,
 Henrietta Street, Covent Garden. | Edinburgh : 20, South
 Frederick Street. | MDCCLXVIII.

Svo, pp. xxiii, 617. Mr. Goodsir was a clergyman of the Church of Scotland till November 27, 1850, when he demitted the ministry on the ground that he could no longer acknowledge as Scriptural "the form" in which certain important doctrines are set forth in the Confession of Faith. He subsequently lived as a private member of the Congregation of the High Church, Edinburgh (p. 585). The gravamen of his objection to the Confession lay in an assertion of externality in the doctrine of Justification taught in the XV Chapter. Against this "fully developed Lutherano-Calvinism" (p. 14), he drew up an "impugment" in 1855, primarily urging that "it makes Justification or Salvation consist in purely external and extrinsic benefits, to the express and absolutely perfect exclusion of anything internal as an element or condition": and therefore leads to "a theoretical Antinomianism" and "overrides and nullifies logically every injunction to Holiness, whether uttered by the Standards or by God's Word." He developed his views in an extended treatise published in 1866, under the title of *The Biblical and Patristic Doctrine of Salvation*. This was followed two years afterwards by the present copious work, which is rather polemical than constructive. The book, after xxiii pages of introductory explanation, consists of an Introduction, three "Parts" and an "Appendix" of documents. The first Part treats of "The General Character and Influence of the Westminster Confession of Faith;" the second, of "The Doctrine of Justification or Salvation contained in the Westminster Formularies, compared with that of other Reformed and Protestant Creeds;" the third draws "Conclusions as to the real character of the Westminster Doctrine of Justification or Salvation, deduced from the preceding comparison of it with the same doctrine in other Protestant creeds."

The Westminster | Confession of Faith Tested : | or, | The Doc-
 trines of Men compared | with the Doctrines of God, | being
 | an examination of all the doctrines | contained in the third
 chapter of the | Confession, together with an exposition | of
 all the proof-texts of scripture, | chosen in support of these
 doctrines, | by the | Rev. Alexander Stewart, | Minister of
 John Street Evangelical Union Church, | Aberdeen. | London :
 Smart & Allen, Paternoster Row. | Glasgow : T. D. Morrison,
 8 Bath Street. | Edinburgh : A. Muir, 7 Cockburn Street. |
 Aberdeen : John Adam, Market Buildings. | 1870.

16mo, pp. vi, 379. For a short account of the origin of the Evangelical Union in 1843, see Macpherson's *History of the Church of Scotland*, pp. 399-400; Ross' *A History of Congregational Independency in Scotland*, p. 140; Ferguson's *History of the Evangelical Union*. Cf. Schaff Herzog, sub. voc. "Evangelical Union" and "Morison, James." The book is a sustained attack on the doctrine of the absolute decree.

The Principles | of the | Westminster Standards | Persecuting.
 | By | William Marshall, D.D. | Coupar-Angus. | Edin-
 burgh : | William Oliphant & Co. | 1873.

The Obsolescence of the | Westminster Confession | of Faith | By
Robert Mackintosh, B.D. | Author of ' Christ and the Jewish
Law ' | Glasgow | James Maclehose & Sons | 1888.

8vo, pp. 64. There is a copy in the library of the Princeton Theological Seminary.

Whither ? | A Theological Question for the | Times | By | Charles
Augustus Briggs, D.D. | Davenport Professor of Hebrew and
the Cognate Languages in | the Union Theological Seminary
| New York | Charles Scribner's Sons | 1889.

Crown 8vo, pp. xv, 333. "This book," says the Preface, "is a product of more than twenty years of study in the history of Puritan Theology, and especially of the Westminster Divines. . . . This book is historical. It aims to show what the Westminster Standards are, what the Presbyterian Churches have done with them in the past, and to interpret them by copious citations from their authors." It was issued as a campaign document in the controversy about revising the Westminster Standards. A rejoinder to it was published by the Rev. Dr. James McCosh in a pamphlet of the same year bearing the title of *Whither? O Whither? Tell Me Where* (C. Scribner's Sons: New York; 1889; 8vo, pp. [8], 47).

The proposals to revise the Confession of Faith made in the American Church about 1890 and 1900 respectively, brought out a large magazine and pamphlet literature pro and con. For a list of the chief pamphlets of the first attempt see THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, I, p. 698 (October, 1900). The chief magazine articles may be found in the final number of *The Presbyterian Review*, October, 1889, and in THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW and the *Andover Review* of the immediately succeeding years. The following titles probably include the most significant items of this literature :

The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the U. S. of A. By Charles A. Briggs, D.D. (in *The Presbyterian Review*, July, 1889, pp. 464-474). — *The Revision of the Westminster Confession of Faith.* By Philip Schaff, D.D., LL.D. (in *The Presbyterian Review*, October, 1889, pp. 529-532). — *Revision of the Confession of Faith.* By John De Witt, D.D., LL.D. (in *The Presbyterian Review*, October, 1889, pp. 533-589). — *The Presbyterian Churches and the Westminster Confession.* By B. B. Warfield, D.D. (*The Presbyterian Review*, October, 1889, pp. 646-657). — *Creed Revision in the Presbyterian Churches.* By Philip Schaff, D.D., LL.D., Professor of Church History in the Union Theological Seminary at New York. 8vo, pp. vi, 67. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1890). — *The Proposed Revision of the Westminster Standards.* By William G. T. Shedd, D.D. 12mo, pp. iv, 93. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1890.) — *The Revision of the Confession of Faith.* By Francis L. Patton, D.D., LL.D., President of Princeton College. Read before the Presbyterian Social Union, New York, December 2, 1889. 8vo, pp. 15. (New York: 1890.) — *Revision of the Westminster Confession.* By Prof. J. T. Duffield, D.D. Read at the Autumn Meeting of the Presbytery of New Brunswick. 8vo, pp. 8. — *Speech on the Revision of the Confession of Faith.* By Rev. E. R. Craven, D.D. Delivered before the Presbytery of Newark, February 5, 1890. 8vo, pp. 23. (Philadelphia: H. B. Ashmead, 1890.) — *The Good and Evil of Calvinism.* By Howard Crosby. 16mo, pp. 23. (New York: A. D. F. Randolph & Co., 1890.)

—*Will and Providence*. By Howard Crosby. 16mo, pp. 16. (New York: A. D. F. Randolph & Co., 1890.)—*The Critic of the Creeds Reviewed; or, The Good and Evil of Calvinism by Howard Crosby*, reviewed by J. F. Pollock, Pastor of Presbyterian Church, Allentown, Pa. 8vo, pp. 28. (Philadelphia: The James B. Rodgers Printing Co., 1890.)—*Ought the Confession of Faith to be Revised?* A Series of Papers. By John De Witt, D.D., Henry J. Van Dyke, D.D., Benjamin B. Warfield, D.D., William G. T. Shedd, D.D. 12mo, pp. 131. (New York: Anson D. F. Randolph & Co., 1890.)—*On the Revision of the Confession of Faith*. By Benjamin B. Warfield. 12mo, pp. 91. (New York: A. D. F. Randolph & Co., 1890.)—*Is Calvinism Doomed?* A Pulpit Discourse. By Rev. Scott F. Hershey, Ph.D., Pastor of the Sixth Presbyterian Church, Washington, D.C. 8vo, pp. 24. (Washington: J. L. Pearson, 1890.)—*The Bible Doctrine of Election*. A Sermon preached by Rev. J. M. Crowell, D.D. 12mo, pp. 27. (Philadelphia: H. A. Ashmead, 1890.)—*How Shall we Revise the Westminster Confession of Faith?* A Bundle of Papers by Prof. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., Prof. Llewellyn J. Evans, D.D., Rev. Erskine N. White, D.D., Prof. Marvin R. Vincent, D.D., Rev. Charles H. Parkhurst, D.D., Rev. Samuel M. Hamilton, D.D., Rev. Charles L. Thompson, D.D. 12mo, pp. vi, 214. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1890.)—*Notes on Dort and Westminster*. By Prof. D. D. Demarest, D.D. 12mo, pp. 30. (New York: Board of Publication of Reformed Church in America, 1890.)—*The Truth on Trial and Immutable amid the Strife of Tongues*. A Defense of Westminster. Sermon preached by Rev. George S. Bishop, D.D., in the First Reformed Dutch Church, Orange, N. J. 8vo, pp. 15. (New York: Richard Brinkerhoff, 1890.)—*Doymatic Reform in the Presbyterian Church*. A Sermon preached in the First Unitarian Church of Philadelphia. By Joseph May, Pastor of the Church. 12mo, pp. 22. (Philadelphia: Bicking, 1890.)—*Buy the Truth*. Thoughts on Creeds and Creed Revision. By the Rev. James Gibson, D.D., Free West Church, Perth. 12mo, pp. 48. (Edinburgh: John Menzies & Co., 1889.)—*In Defense of the Westminster Confession*. Being an Unspoken Speech. By the Rev. A. D. Campbell, Free Church, Lockerbie. 12mo, pp. 19. (Dumfries: Courier & Herald Offices.)—*Articles on the Relation of the Presbyterian Church of Otago and Southland to the Confession of Faith*. By Adam D. Johnston, Kaihiku. 12mo, pp. 63. (Invercargill: Southland Times Co., 1890.)—*A Friendly Talk About Revision*: Being a Discussion of the Report presented to the last General Assembly. By Edward D. Morris. 8vo, pp. 79. (New York: Anson D. F. Randolph & Co. [1891].)—Along with these should be read also a paper by Prof. Macgregor, D.D., *On the Revision of the Westminster Confession*, printed in the *British and Foreign Evangelical Review* for October, 1877, pp. 692-712; and another on *Salient Points of the Westminster Confession*, by Prof. N. M. Steffens, D.D., printed in *The Presbyterian Quarterly* for January, 1900, pp. 35-47.

The more recent agitation for the revision of the Confession has called out a much less copious pamphlet and magazine literature. Probably the following are the more significant of such publications:

The Creed Revision | Professor John De Witt | Princeton Theological Seminary | Professor Herrick Johnson | McCormick Theological Seminary | Pres't George Black Stewart | Auburn Theological Seminary | Addresses delivered before the Presbyterian Union of New York, | March 4, 1901 | Copyright 1901 by | The Evangelist Publishing Co. | New York.

A Speech, in Support of the Motion | to dismiss the subject of
Con- | fessional Revision Made at Phila- | delphia in the
General Assembly | of the Presbyterian Church, May |
Twenty-Fourth Nineteen Hundred | and One, by the Rev.
John De Witt, | A Commissioner of New Brunswick | Pres-
bytery. | Princeton | The University Press | 1901.

16mo, pp. 16.

Two Views of Creed Revision.—By Prof. Herrick Johnson, D.D.,
LL.D., and Prof. W. Brenton Greene, Jr., D.D.—*Homiletical
Review*, January, 1901.

The very copious newspaper discussion during the course of the
two agitations for the Revision of the Confession, may be con-
veniently consulted in a series of scrap-books preserved in the library
of Princeton Theological Seminary. Most of the pamphlet litera-
ture of this discussion is also preserved in this library.

We may appropriately add a few books printed on the occasion
of the celebration of anniversaries of the formulation of the West-
minster Standards, such as :

Bicentenary | of the | Assembly of Divines at Westminster, |
held | at Edinburgh, July 12 and 15, 1843, | containing a |
full and authentic report of | the Addresses and Conversa-
tions. | With Introductory Sermon | by Rev. Dr. Syming-
ton. | Published under the Sanction of the Assembly. | With
an Introductory Essay to the American Edition | by William
Wilson, A.M. | Cincinnati: | J. A. James, No. 1 Baker
Street. | New York: J. S. Redfield. | 1845.

8vo, pp. xli, 258. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical
Society, Philadelphia. The Scotch edition from which this is taken bears the
same title down through the words "Published under the sanction of the Assem-
bly" and has the imprint: "Edinburgh: | W. P. Kennedy, 15 South St. Andrew St.
| . . . | 1843." It is an 8vo of pp. 135. There are copies of it in the libraries
of Princeton Theological Seminary and of the Presbyterian Historical Society at
Philadelphia. The contemporary American celebration does not seem to have had
its addresses preserved in book-form; they are printed in full, however, in the
columns of *The Presbyterian* (newspaper), published at Philadelphia; a file of
which is preserved in the library of Princeton Theological Seminary.

The | History, Character, | and Results, | of the | West-
minster Assembly of Divines. | A Discourse, | in commemora-
tion of the Bicentenary Anniversary of that | Body. | By
Thomas Smyth, D.D. | Author of Lectures on the Prelatical
Doctrine of Apostolical Succession | Published by
Request. | New York: | Leavitt, Trow & Co., and Robert
Carter. | | London: Wiley and Putnam. | 1844.

8vo, pp. xii, 124. There is a copy in the library of the Presbyterian Historical
Society, Philadelphia.

Memorial Volume | of the | Westminster Assembly. | 1647-1897. | Containing eleven addresses delivered before the General | Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United | States, at Charlotte, N. C., in May, 1897, | in commemoration of | the Two Hundred and Fiftieth | Anniversary of the Westminster | Assembly, | and of the Formation | of the Westminster Standards. | Published by the direction of the General Assembly of 1897. | Richmond, Va.: | The Presbyterian Committee of Publication. | [no date, but copyrighted in 1897.]

12mo, pp. xxxviii, 297.

Addresses | at the | Celebration of the | Two Hundred and Fiftieth Anniversary | of the Westminster Assembly | by the General Assembly | of the | Presbyterian Church in the U. S. A. | Edited by the Rev. Wm. Henry Roberts, D.D., LL.D. | Philadelphia | Presbyterian Board of Publication and | Sabbath School Work | 1898.

12mo, pp. 342.

The Significance | of the | Westminster Standards | as a Creed | An Address | delivered before the Presbytery of New York, November 8, | 1897. . . . | By | Benjamin B. Warfield | Professor in the Theological Seminary at Princeton. | New York | Charles Scribner's Sons | 1898.

12mo, pp. 36.

McCormick Theological | Seminary | The Celebration of the | Two Hundred and Fiftieth Anniversary | of the Adoption of | The Westminster Standards | and the Inauguration of | Rev. J. Ross Stevenson, D.D., | as Professor of Ecclesiastical History | Published by the Board of Directors.

No date; but May, 1898. Small 4to, pp. 82. Contains *inter alia*: "The Westminster Standards as Tested by History," by the Rev. J. Ross Stevenson, D.D., pp. 13-41; "Some Neglected Aspects of the Westminster Standards," by the Rev. J. D. Moffat, D.D., LL.D., pp. 43-60; and "The Value of the Westminster Standards to the Preacher," by the Rev. Prof. George T. Purves, D.D., LL.D., pp. 61-82.

The | Westminster | Confession of Faith | a Doctrinal Creed | for Christendom. | By | William W. Harsha | of the | Presbyterian Theological Seminary | at | Omaha. |

16mo, pp. 31.

Addresses | Delivered before the Synod of California at Oakland, | October 22, Brooklyn Church, in | commemoration of the | 250th Anniversary of the | Westminster Standards | 1897 |

Printed by order of the Synod under the direction of the Rev. William S. Young, | Stated Clerk, Los Angeles, Cal. |

8vo, pp. 32. Contains: "The Place, Personnel and Proceedings of the Westminster Assembly." by Rev. Henry B. Gage; "The Doctrinal Content of the Westminster Confession," by Prof. Henry C. Minton, D.D.; "The Influence of the Westminster Standards in promoting Government by the People," by the Rev. Dr. John Hemphill; and "The Relation of the Westminster Standards to our Modern Civilization," by the Rev. Prof. Wm. Alexander, D.D.

The | Two Hundred and Fiftieth Anniversary | of the Westminster Standards. | The Westminster Standards and the Present Age. | An Address | delivered by | Thos. McDougall | before | the Cincinnati Presbytery, Cincinnati, March 3, 1898; before | The New Albany (Ind.) Presbytery, North Vernon, | April 14, 1898. |

8vo, pp. 21.

See further, THE PRESBYTERIAN AND REFORMED REVIEW, Vol. IX, 178, X, 559 for some account of the literature of this celebration.

The selection of literature here given may be largely supplemented from the notes in Schaff's *Creeds of Christendom* (as cited), the British Museum Catalogue, Poole's *Index*, Innes' *Law of Creeds*, and the histories of Presbyterianism whether in Britain or America. A number of works on special points have been indicated in the Bibliographical Notes attached to the titles of the editions in the preceding articles.

PRINCETON.

BENJAMIN B. WARFIELD.